STUDIES IN

Income and Wealth

VOLUME ONE
STUDIES IN
Income and Wealth
VOLUME ONE

BY THE CONFERENCE ON RESEARCH
IN NATIONAL INCOME AND WEALTH

NATIONAL BUREAU OF ECONOMIC RESEARCH
NEW YORK • 1937
Officers
JOSEPH H. WILLITS, Chairman
GEORGE SOULE, President
DAVID FRIDAY, Vice-President
SHEPARD MORGAN, Treasurer
JOSEPH H. WILLITS, Executive Director
MARTHA ANDERSON, Editor

Directors at Large
CHESTER I. BARNARD, President,
New Jersey Bell Telephone Company
HENRY S. DENNISON, Dennison Manufacturing Company
GEORGE M. HARRISON, President,
Brotherhood of Railway and Steamship Clerks
OSWALD W. KNAUTH, President, Associated Dry Goods Corporation
HARRY W. LAIDLER, Executive Director,
The League for Industrial Democracy
L. C. MARSHALL, Johns Hopkins University
GEORGE O. MAY, Price, Waterhouse and Company
SHEPARD MORGAN, Vice-President, Chase National Bank
BEARDSLEY RUMIL, Treasurer, R. H. Macy and Company
GEORGE SOULE, Director, The Labor Bureau, Inc.
N. I. STONE, Industrial and Financial Consultant

Directors by University Appointment
WILLIAM L. CRUM, Harvard
WALTON H. HAMILTON, Yale
HARRY JEROME, Wisconsin
HARRY ALVIN MILLIS, Chicago
WESLEY C. MITCHELL, Columbia
JOSEPH H. WILLITS, Pennsylvania

Directors Appointed by Other Organizations
FREDERICK M. FEIKER, American Engineering Council
DAVID FRIDAY, American Economic Association
LEE GALLOWAY, American Management Association
MALCOLM MUIR, National Publishers Association
WINFIELD W. RIEFLER, American Statistical Association
GEORGE E. ROBERTS, American Bankers Association
MATTHEW WOLL, American Federation of Labor

Research Staff
WESLEY C. MITCHELL, Director
ARTHUR F. BURNS
SOLOMON FABRICANT
SIMON KUZNETS
EUGEN ALTSCHUL, DAVID L. WICKENS, Associates

FREDERICK R. MACAULAY
FREDERICK C. MILLS
LEO WOLMAN
ASSOCIATES
RELATION OF THE DIRECTORS
TO THE WORK OF THE NATIONAL BUREAU
OF ECONOMIC RESEARCH

1. The object of the National Bureau of Economic Research is to ascertain and to present to the public important economic facts and their interpretation in a scientific and impartial manner. The Board of Directors is charged with the responsibility of ensuring that the work of the Bureau is carried on in strict conformity with this object.

2. To this end the Board of Directors shall appoint one or more Directors of Research.

3. The Director or Directors of Research shall submit to the members of the Board, or to its Executive Committee, for their formal adoption, all specific proposals concerning researches to be instituted.

4. No study shall be published until the Director or Directors of Research shall have submitted to the Board a summary report drawing attention to the character of the data and their utilization in the study, the nature and treatment of the problems involved, the main conclusions and such other information as in their opinion will serve to determine the suitability of the study for publication in accordance with the principles of the Bureau.

5. A copy of any manuscript proposed for publication shall also be submitted to each member of the Board. If publication is approved each member is entitled to have published also a memorandum of any dissent or reservation he may express, together with a brief statement of his reasons. The publication of a volume does not, however, imply that each member of the Board of Directors has read the manuscript and passed upon its validity in every detail.

6. The results of an inquiry shall not be published except with the approval of at least a majority of the entire Board and a two-thirds majority of all those members of the Board who shall have voted on the proposal within the time fixed for the receipt of votes on the publication proposed. The limit shall be forty-five days from the date of the submission of the synopsis and manuscript of the proposed publication unless the Board extends the limit; upon the request of any member the limit may be extended for not more than thirty days.

7. A copy of this resolution shall, unless otherwise determined by the Board, be printed in each copy of every Bureau publication.

(Resolution of October 25, 1925, revised February 6, 1933)
## CONTENTS

Prefatory note vii
Foreword ix

### Part One

**CONCEPTS OF NATIONAL INCOME**

M. A. Copeland

I National Income and Social Income 3
II Distinctions in Income Concepts 8
   1 Income 'derived from' vs income 'received or receivable in' an area 8
   2 The receipt and accrual bases for reporting income 8
   3 Bases of valuation 9
III Main Breakdowns of Social Income 12
   1 By type of payment or distributive share 12
   2 By industry 12
   3 By area 13
   4 By income class 13
   5 By object of expenditure 14
IV Chief Items of Estimate 14
V Some Moot Questions 20
   1 The gross value product 20
   2 Additions to surplus 21
   3 Damages to persons 23
   4 Net value products of financial enterprises 23
   5 Income from abroad 26
   6 The government net value product 27
   7 Secondary distribution and transfer items 29
   8 Deflation 30
VI Summary ix
Discussion

I SIMON KUZNETS
1 The productivity basis of national income estimates 35
2 Income paid out, income produced and business savings 37
3 Entrepreneurial withdrawals and savings 41
4 Immigrants' entrance capital and remittances 42
5 Interest on government debt 43
6 Adjustment for price changes 44

II CLARK WARBURTON
1 Use of terms 'income paid out' and 'income produced' 45
2 Terminology for methods of measurement 46
3 Relief payments 47

III M. A. COPELAND
1 The productivity basis of national income estimates 48
2 Income paid out, income produced and business savings 49
3 Entrepreneurial withdrawals and savings 51
4 Immigrants' entrance capital and remittances 53
5 Interest on government debt 54
6 Adjustments for price changes with special reference to inventory valuations 56
7 Income and capital changes 58

Part Two

ACCOUNTING METHODOLOGY IN THE MEASUREMENT OF NATIONAL INCOME

CLARK WARBURTON

I Terminology and Inclusiveness of Items 67
1 Relation of terminology to the character of items listed and evaluated 67
2 Use of terms 'national income' and 'national product' 69
3 Inclusiveness of items 69
II Measurement of the Value of Final Products 70
1 Final products in definitions of national income 70
2 Usefulness of measuring the value of final products 72
3 Technical problems 74
III Influence of Accounting Methods and Social Arrangements upon the Measurement of the Income and Expenditures of a Community 75
CONTENTS

IV Treatment of Government Revenues and Services in the Measurement of National Income 83
1 Value of final products provided by governments 83
2 Collective income of governments 84
3 Effect of methods of handling government revenues and services upon estimates of total national income 87
4 Incidence of taxation as a criterion of methodology in national income estimates 89

V Available Income and its Relation to National Income 93

VI Treatment of Capital Gains in the Measurement of National Income 97

VII Relation of Total Savings of Individuals and Social Groups to Capital Formation 101
1 Commissions 102
2 Fraudulent securities 104
3 Capital gains 104
4 Life insurance premiums and benefits 106
5 Gross vs. net savings and capital formation 107
6 Savings and capital formation in 1929 107

Part Three

ON THE TREATMENT OF CORPORATE SAVINGS IN THE MEASUREMENT OF NATIONAL INCOME

SOLOMON FABRICANT

I Nature of the Problem 113
II Segregation of Corporate Savings 114
III The Fiscal Period 117
IV The Time-Allocation of Revenue and Cost 120
V Price Changes 128
1 Current prices 128
2 Constant prices 130
3 Relative price changes 132
VI Capital vs. Revenue Items 134
VII Problems of Duplication and Omission 137
VIII Conclusion 141
## CONTENTS

**Part Four**

**CHANGING INVENTORY VALUATIONS AND THEIR EFFECT ON BUSINESS SAVINGS AND ON NATIONAL INCOME PRODUCED**

*Simon Kuznets*

I National Income Produced, in Current Prices 145
II The Inventory Valuation Problem 146
III Factors Determining the Size of Discrepancy Resulting from Changing Inventory Valuation 148
IV National Income Produced, in Constant Prices 150
V Magnitude and Effect of the Adjustment for Recent Years 152
VI Broader Aspects of the Problem 154

**Discussion**

I M. A. Copeland 157
II Milton Friedman 159
III Arthur W. Margret 162
IV Simon Kuznets 165

**Part Five**

**PUBLIC REVENUE AND PUBLIC EXPENDITURE IN NATIONAL INCOME**

*Gerhard Colm*

I Concept and Measurement of National Income 175
   1 The social product 176
   2 The measurable part of the social product 179
   3 The measurement of national income 180
   4 Some special problems in measuring national income 181
II Public Revenue in National Income 185
   1 Income vs. non-income taxes 185
   2 Shifting of non-income taxes 188
   3 Tax incidence and the calculation of real national income 191
III Public Expenditure in National Income 194
   1 Government cost services 194
   2 Transfer expenditures in general 195
CONTENTS

3 Debt service 197
4 Subsidies 199
5 Debt redemption and capital transactions 202
6 Government expenditures in the ‘value added’ and ‘social heap’ approach 204

IV Public Borrowing in National Income 206
V The Estimate of the National Income Sum 209
VI The Relationship between Public and Private Spheres in the Economy 214

Appendix
A Government Expenditure (Federal, State and Local) including Social Security Insurance 222
B Government Expenditures (Federal, State and Local) including Social Security Insurance but excluding War Liquidation, Interest on the Public Debt, and Colonial Service 223
C Diagrams Illustrating Various Theoretical Points 224
1 Government Service Financed by Income Tax 224
2 Government Service Financed by a Business Tax, not Shifted 225
3 Government Service Financed by a Business Tax, Shifted 226
4 Government Service ('Cost Service') Financed by a Business Tax 227

Discussion
I J. M. Clark 228
II Simon Kuznets 230
1 The measurable part of the social product 230
2 Disposable income 231
3 Functions of government and the classification of expenditures 233
4 Alternative treatments of government revenue and expenditures 236

III Mabel Newcomer 238
IV Gerhard Colm 240
Part Six

THE DISTINCTION BETWEEN 'NET' AND 'GROSS' IN INCOME TAXATION

CARL SHOUP

I Topic Selected for Discussion 251

II Business Expenses 253
   1 Capital losses 256
   2 Depreciation 256
   3 Depletion 259

III Personal Expenses 261
   1 Food 262
   2 Clothing 263
   3 Shelter 263
   4 Medical expenses 265
   5 Expenses of training for a profession 267
   6 Interest 268
   7 Taxes 268
   8 Bad debts 268
   9 Casualty and theft losses 269
   10 Charitable contributions 269

IV Summary 269

Appendix
A Personal Expense and Unwise Business Expense: Effect on National Income Total 271

B Deductions for Depletion 272
   1 Properties not representing discoveries made since the income tax law took effect 272
   2 Properties representing discoveries made since the income tax law took effect 274
   3 Discovery depletion 274
   4 Percentage depletion 277

Discussion
I ROY BLOUGH 282
   1 Tax deductions in computing taxable income 282
   2 Tax deductions in computing national income 283
   3 Taxable income and national income 290

II WILLIAM W. HEWETT 291
   1 The distinction between theoretical, legal and taxable income 293
PREFATORY NOTE

In 1935 the National Bureau of Economic Research invited the Departments of Economics in six universities to join with it in developing a program of cooperative research. The acceptance of this invitation led to the forming of a Universities-National Bureau Committee to consider plans and procedures. To make a practical trial of what might be accomplished, this Committee selected two fields of research that can be cultivated most efficiently through the systematic cooperation of numerous agencies. Accordingly two ‘Conferences’ were organized, one on Price Research, the other on Research in National Income and Wealth. Both were set up as independent bodies that should seek to enlist the individuals and organizations, public or private, that are contributing most to knowledge in their respective fields.

The cordial participation by many active workers in these two experiments, the readiness with which they pooled their several contributions, and revealed their future plans, their eagerness to achieve a common understanding on matters concerning which they had held conflicting opinions have been most gratifying to all concerned. Among the tangible results has been the planning of certain researches that are now in progress and that promise to substitute definite data for guesswork on fundamental issues. Not less necessary for the growth of knowledge, though perhaps less easy for laymen to grasp, have been the efforts of the cooperating specialists to clarify the concepts with which they work and to define their technical terms in ways that are precise on the one hand and on the other hand are adapted to practical work with the available materials.

This volume presents the Income Conference’s striving for clarification of working ideas. Every candid investigator who has
tried to make, or to use properly, estimates of national income realizes how difficult it is to know just what the results mean. Those who have not wrestled long with the highly technical problems that crop up in such work can scarcely appreciate their intricacy, or how considerable are the differences in results that are produced by the use of slightly different definitions. No step toward the improvement of income estimates in this country and abroad is more important than the efforts made by the writers of the following papers to reach a common understanding of their concepts and their statistical operations.

WESLEY C. MITCHELL
DIRECTOR OF RESEARCH
FOREWORD

This volume is the first in a series of studies by the Conference on Research in National Income and Wealth. The Conference held its first meeting in January 1936, at the invitation of the National Bureau of Economic Research; and became a permanent body by its own decision, to pursue the following aims:

(1) To exchange information among the various organizations and individuals carrying on or planning studies in the field, to prevent overlapping, to establish conditions for more intelligent division of work, and to facilitate cooperative activity;
(2) To agree upon the most appropriate concepts, terminology and methods of exposition;
(3) To work out plans for research, calling attention to the particular segments of the field that demand more primary data or more analytical study;
(4) To stimulate cooperative research in the field by initiating and sponsoring cooperative studies, and by using the facilities of the Conference to assist in their prosecution.

At its first meeting the Conference included representatives from the Departments of Economics of the following universities: Chicago, Columbia, Harvard, Minnesota, Pennsylvania and Wisconsin; from the Research Divisions of the United States Bureau of Foreign and Domestic Commerce, and the United States Bureau of Agricultural Economics; the Division of Research and Statistics of the United States Treasury; the United States Bureau of Labor Statistics; the Industrial Section of the National Resources Committee; the Central Statistical Board; the Division of Research and Statistics, Board of Governors of the Federal Reserve System; the National Industrial Conference Board; Dun and Bradstreet; and the National Bureau of Economic Re-
search. The Conference was later joined by representatives from the United States Bureau of the Census, the Brookings Institution, the Research Division of the Federal Deposit Insurance Corporation, the American Statistical Association, and the Department of Economics of the University of Cincinnati.

This volume contains the reports presented, under arrangements made through the Conference, at the meetings of the American Economic and American Statistical Associations in December 1936 at Chicago, as well as the reports presented at the second meeting of the Conference in January 1937 at New York. It includes also the discussion to which these reports gave rise, both at the Association and Conference meetings and subsequently by correspondence.

From time to time the Conference will probably find it advisable to publish the studies growing out of its activity. Such studies may be in the nature of reports on various problems in the field prepared by individual students; tabulations and analyses of new primary data prepared at the initiative of the Conference; or cooperative studies undertaken or sponsored by the Conference.

The editing of the reports and the discussion was done by Milton Friedman, and was reviewed by the editorial committee of the Conference: Simon Kuznets, Chairman; M. A. Copeland and A. W. Marget.

SIMON KUZNETS, CHAIRMAN
M. A. COPELAND   G. C. MEANS
W. L. CRUM       R. R. NATHAN
H. M. GROVES     O. C. STINE

EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE