Economic Analysis of Environmental Problems
NATIONAL BUREAU OF ECONOMIC RESEARCH
UNIVERSITIES–NATIONAL BUREAU CONFERENCE SERIES

1. Problems in the Study of Economic Growth (in mimeograph)
2. Conference on Business Cycles
3. Conference on Research in Business Finance
4. Regularization of Business Investment
5. Business Concentration and Price Policy
6. Capital Formation and Economic Growth
7. Policies to Combat Depression
8. The Measurement and Behavior of Unemployment
9. Problems in International Economics
10. The Quality and Economic Significance of Anticipations Data
11. Demographic and Economic Change in Developed Countries
12. Public Finances: Needs, Sources, and Utilization
13. The Rate and Direction of Inventive Activity: Economic and Social Factors
14. Aspects of Labor Economics
15. Investment in Human Beings
16. The State of Monetary Economics
17. Transportation Economics
18. Determinants of Investment Behavior
20. Issues in Defense Economics
21. The Role of Agriculture in Economic Development
22. The Technology Factor in International Trade
23. The Analysis of Public Output
24. International Mobility and Movement of Capital
25. Conference on Secular Inflation
26. Economic Analysis of Environmental Problems
NATIONAL BUREAU OF ECONOMIC RESEARCH

OFFICERS
Arthur F. Burns, Honorary Chairman
J. Wilson Newman, Chairman
Moses Abramovitz, Vice Chairman
John R. Meyer, President
Thomas D. Flynn, Treasurer
Douglas H. Eldridge, Vice President-Executive Secretary
Gary Fromm, Director, NBER-Washington
Victor R. Fuchs, Vice President-Research;
Co-director, NBER-West
Edwin Kuh, Director, Computer Research Center
Robert E. Lipsey, Vice President-Research
Harvey J. McMains, Vice President; Director, NBER-New York
Sherman J. Maisel, Co-director, NBER-West
Geoffrey H. Moore, Vice President-Research
Edward K. Smith, Vice President

DIRECTORS AT LARGE
Atherton Bean, International Multifoods Corporation
Andrew F. Brimmer, Harvard University
Arthur F. Burns, Board of Governors of the Federal Reserve System
Wallace J. Campbell, Foundation for Cooperative Housing
Erwin D. Canham, Christian Science Monitor
Emilio G. Collado, Exxon Corporation
Solomon Fabricant, New York University
Frank L. Fernbach, United Steelworkers of America
Eugene P. Foley, Monrose Securities, Inc.
David L. Grove, International Business Machines Corporation
Walter W. Heter, University of Minnesota
Vivian W. Henderson, Clark College

John R. Meyer, Harvard University
Geoffrey H. Moore, National Bureau of Economic Research
J. Wilson Newman, Dun & Bradstreet, Inc.
James J. O'Leary, United States Trust Company of New York
Rudolph A. Oswald, American Federation of Labor and Congress of Industrial Organizations
Alice M. Rivlin, Congressional Budget Office
Robert V. Routs, Brown Brothers Harriman & Co.
Ell Shapiro, The Travelers Corporation
Arnold M. Soloway, Jamaica Way Tower, Boston, Massachusetts
Laszlo Tepeter, International Ladies' Garment Workers' Union
Theodore O. Yntema, Oakland University

DIRECTORS BY UNIVERSITY APPOINTMENT
Moses Abramovitz, Stanford
Gardner Ackley, Michigan
Charles H. Berry, Princeton
Francis M. Boddy, Minnesota
Otto Eckstein, Harvard
Walter D. Fisher, Northwestern
R. A. Gordon, California, Berkeley
J. C. LaForce, California, Los Angeles

Robert J. Lampman, Wisconsin
Maurice W. Lee, North Carolina
Almarin Phillips, Pennsylvania
Lloyd G. Reynolds, Yale
Robert M. Solow, Massachusetts Institute of Technology
Henri Theil, Chicago
William S. Vickrey, Columbia

DIRECTORS BY APPOINTMENT OF OTHER ORGANIZATIONS
Eugene A. Birnbaum, American Management Association
Thomas D. Flynn, American Institute of Certified Public Accountants
Nathaniel Goldfinger, American Federation of Labor and Congress of Industrial Organizations
Harold G. Haisrow, American Agricultural Economics Association
Walter E. Hoadley, American Finance Association

Philip M. Klutznick, Committee for Economic Development
Paul W. McCracken, American Statistical Association
Roy E. Moore, National Association of Business Economists
Douglas C. North, Economic History Association
Willard L. Thorp, American Economic Association
Robert M. Will, Canadian Economics Association

DIRECTORS EMERITI
Percival F. Brundage
Frank W. Feitel
Gottfried Haberler
Albert J. Heitinger, Jr.
George B. Roberts
Murray Shields
Boris Shibskin
Joseph W. Willits

SENIOR RESEARCH STAFF
Gary S. Becker
Charlotte Boschan
Philip Cagan
Stanley Diller
Solomon Fabricant
Milton Friedman
Gary Fromm
Victor R. Fuchs
J. Royce Gian
Raymond W. Goldsmith
Michael Grossman
F. Thomas Juster
John F. Kain
John W. Kendrick
Irving B. Kravis
Edwin Kuh
William M. Landes
Hal B. Lardy
Robert E. Lipsey
Sherman J. Maisel
Benoit B. Mandelbrot
John R. Meyer
Robert T. Michael
Jacob Minzer
Lisa Mintz
Geoffrey H. Moore
M. Ishaq Nadiri
Nancy Ruggles
Richard Ruggles
Anna J. Schwartz
Edward K. Smith
George J. Stigler
Robert J. Willis
Victor Zarnowitz
Relation of the National Bureau Directors to Publications Reporting Conference Proceedings

Since the present volume is a record of conference proceedings, it has been exempted from the rules governing submission of manuscripts to, and critical review by, the Board of Directors of the National Bureau.

(Resolution adopted July 6, 1948, as revised November 21, 1949, and April 20, 1968)
RESOURCES FOR THE FUTURE, INC.
1755 Massachusetts Avenue, N.W., Washington, D.C. 20036

Board of Directors:
Gilbert F. White, Chairman, Harrison Brown, Roberto de O. Campos,
Edward J. Cleary, Joseph L. Fisher, Luther H. Foster, F. Kenneth Hare,
Charles J. Hitch, Charles F. Love, Laurence I. Moss, Frank Pace, Jr.,
Emanuel R. Piore, Stanley H. Ruttenberg, Lauren K. Soth, Janez
Stanovnik, Maurice F. Strong, Julia D. Stuart, P. F. Watzek

Honorary Directors: Horace M. Albright, Erwin D. Canham, Hugh L.
Keenleyside, Edward S. Mason, William S. Paley, John W. Vanderwilt

Acting President: Marion Clawson

Secretary-Treasurer: John E. Herbert

Resources for the Future is a nonprofit corporation for research and
education in the development, conservation, and use of natural resources
and the improvement of the quality of the environment. It was established
in 1952 with the cooperation of the Ford Foundation. Part of the work of
Resources for the Future is carried out by its resident staff; part is
supported by grants to universities and other nonprofit organizations.
Unless otherwise stated, interpretations and conclusions in RFF
publications are those of the authors; the organization takes responsibility
for the selection of significant subjects for study, the competence of the
researchers, and their freedom of inquiry.
Funds for the economic research conference program of the National Bureau of Economic Research are supplied by the National Science Foundation.
UNIVERSITIES-NATIONAL BUREAU COMMITTEE
FOR ECONOMIC RESEARCH

This committee is a cooperative venture of universities and the National Bureau. Its guiding objective is the encouragement of economic research on problems susceptible of objective treatment and of sufficiently broad scope to merit attention by institutions serving a scientific and public interest.

Participating universities and their present representatives are:

Brown, Jerome Stein
Buffalo, Daniel Hamberg
California (Berkeley), Daniel McFadden
California (Los Angeles), J. C. LaForce
Carnegie-Mellon, Robert Lucas
Chicago, Lester G. Telier
Columbia, Robert Mundell
Cornell, Ta Chung Liu
Duke, T. Dudley Wallace
Harvard, John V. Lintner
Illinois, George G. Judge
Indiana, Franz Gehrels
Iowa State, Dudley G. Lueckett
Johns Hopkins, Carl F. Christ
Maryland, Barbara Bergman
Massachusetts Institute of Technology, Richard S. Eckaus
McGill, A. Vicas
Michigan, Harold T. Shapiro
Michigan State, Victor Smith
Minnesota, James M. Henderson
New School for Social Research, Thomas Vietorisz
New York, M. Ishaq Nadiri
North Carolina, Henry A. Latane
Northwestern, Robert Eisner
Ohio State, Jon Cunyngham
Pennsylvania, Jere R. Behrman
Pittsburgh, S. H. Chou
Princeton, Edwin S. Mills
Purdue, Patrick H. Hendershot
Queen's, Martin F. J. Prachowny
Rochester, Walter Y. Oi
Stanford, Moses Abramovitz
Texas, David A. Kendrick
Toronto, Richard Bird
Vanderbilt, Anthony Tang
Virginia, Richard T. Selden
Washington (St. Louis), Werner Hochwald
Washington (Seattle), Richard W. Parks
Wisconsin, Leonard W. Weiss
Yale, Richard Ruggles

The National Bureau of Economic Research representative is
Robert E. Lipsey

Members at large are:
Irma Adelman
Daniel Creamer
George J. Stigler
Walter S. Salant

Secretary:
Christine Mortensen

The officers of the Universities-National Bureau Committee are: Edwin S. Mills (Princeton University), Chairman; Leonard W. Weiss (University of Wisconsin), Vice Chairman; and Christine Mortensen (National Bureau of Economic Research), Secretary. The members of the Executive Committee are: Irma Adelman (University of Maryland), Richard Bird (University of Toronto), Robert Eisner (Northwestern University), Robert E. Lipsey (National Bureau of Economic Research), Dudley G. Lueckett (Iowa State University), Edwin S. Mills, and Leonard W. Weiss.
# Contents

## Introduction

*Edwin S. Mills*  
1

## Theoretical Analysis

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Topic</th>
<th>Author(s)</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Optimum Investment in Social Overhead Capital</td>
<td>Hirofumi Uzawa</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comment: Robert Dorfman</td>
<td></td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Macroeconomic Aspects of Environmental Policy</td>
<td>Karl Göran-Mäler</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comment: Colin Wright</td>
<td></td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comment: Robert Haveman</td>
<td></td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Instruments for Environmental Policy</td>
<td>Wallace Oates and William Baumol</td>
<td>95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comment: Charles Upton</td>
<td></td>
<td>128</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Resource Allocation Effects of Environmental Policies</td>
<td>George Tolley</td>
<td>133</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comment: Gardner Brown, Jr.</td>
<td></td>
<td>163</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Empirical Analysis of Domestic Problems

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Topic</th>
<th>Author(s)</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Operational Problems in Large Scale Residuals Management Models</td>
<td>Walter Spoford, Clifford, Clifford, Russell and Robert Kelly</td>
<td>171</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comment: J. Hayden Boyd</td>
<td></td>
<td>234</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*xi*
# CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Author(s)</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Input-Output Analysis and Air Pollution Control</td>
<td>Robert Kohn</td>
<td>239</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comment: Frederick Peterson</td>
<td></td>
<td>272</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Studies of Residuals Management in Industry</td>
<td>Blair Bower</td>
<td>275</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comment: Paul MacAvoy</td>
<td></td>
<td>321</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acute Relationships Among Daily Mortality, Air Pollution, and Climate</td>
<td>Lester Lave and Eugene Seskin</td>
<td>325</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comment: Thomas Hodgson</td>
<td></td>
<td>347</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“People or Ducks?' Who Decides?</td>
<td>John Jackson</td>
<td>351</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comment: Richard Quandt</td>
<td></td>
<td>389</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

International and Comparative Analysis

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Author(s)</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>On the Economics of Transnational Environmental Externalities</td>
<td>Ralph C. d'Arge</td>
<td>397</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix—A Note on Transfrontier Externalities Transactions Costs, and Long-Run International Adjustment Firms and Factors of Production:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Production: Ralph C. d'Arge and</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>William Schulze</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comment: Larry Westphal</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Management of Environmental Quality: Observations on Recent Experience in the United States and the United Kingdom</td>
<td>Maynard Hufschmidt</td>
<td>435</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comment: A. Myrick Freeman</td>
<td></td>
<td>453</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Index</td>
<td></td>
<td>461</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Economic Analysis of Environmental Problems