This PDF is a selection from an out-of-print volume from the National Bureau of Economic Research

Volume Title: Consumer Credit Costs, 1949–59

Volume Author/Editor: Paul F. Smith

Volume Publisher: Princeton University Press

Volume ISBN: 0-691-04116-4

Volume URL: http://www.nber.org/books/smit64-1

Publication Date: 1964

Chapter Title: Front matter, Consumer Credit Costs, 1949-59

Chapter Author: Paul F. Smith

Chapter URL: http://www.nber.org/chapters/c1718

Chapter pages in book: (p. -24 - 0)

, ,

Consumer Credit Costs, 1949-59

NATIONAL BUREAU OF ECONOMIC RESEARCH STUDIES IN CONSUMER INSTALMENT FINANCING

- 1. Personal Finance Companies and Their Credit Practices Ralph A. Young and associates
- 2. Sales Finance Companies and Their Credit Practices Wilbur C. Plummer and Ralph A. Young
- 3. Commercial Banks and Consumer Instalment Credit John M. Chapman and associates
- 4. Industrial Banking Companies and Their Credit Practices Raymond J. Saulnier
- 5. Government Agencies of Consumer Instalment Credit Joseph D. Coppock
- 6. The Pattern of Consumer Debt, 1935-36: A Statistical Analysis Blanche Bernstein
- 7. The Volume of Consumer Instalment Credit, 1929-38
- Duncan McC. Holthausen with Malcolm L. Merriam and Rolf Nugent
- 8. Risk Elements in Consumer Instalment Financing David Durand
- 9. Consumer Instalment Credit and Economic Fluctuations Gottfried Haberler
- 10. Comparative Operating Experience of Consumer Instalment Financing Agencies and Commercial Banks, 1929–41 Ernst A. Dauer
- 11. Consumer Credit Costs, 1949-59 Paul F. Smith

CONSUMER CREDIT COSTS

1949–59

BY

PAUL F. SMITH UNIVERSITY OF PENNSYLVANIA



A STUDY BY THE NATIONAL BUREAU OF ECONOMIC RESEARCH

> PUBLISHED BY PRINCETON UNIVERSITY PRESS PRINCETON, NEW JERSEY

> > 1964

Copyright © 1964, by National Bureau of Economic Research All Rights Reserved L. C. Card No. 63-23413

Printed in the United States of America

NATIONAL BUREAU OF ECONOMIC RESEARCH 1964

OFFICERS

Albert J. Hettinger, Jr., Chairman Arthur F. Burns, President Frank W. Fetter, Vice-President Donald B. Woodward, Treasurer Solomon Fabricant, Director of Research Geoffrey H. Moore, Associate Director of Research Hal B. Lary, Associate Director of Research William J. Carson, Executive Director

DIRECTORS AT LARGE

Robert B. Anderson, New York City Wallace J. Campbell, Nationwide Insurance Erwin D. Canham, Christian Science Monitor Solomon Fabricant, New York University Marion B. Folsom, Eastman Kodak Company Crawford H. Greenewalt, E. I. du Pont de Nemours & Company Gabriel Hauge, Manufacturers Hanover Trust Company A. J. Hayes, International Association of Machinists Albert J. Hettinger, Jr., Lazard Frères and Company Nicholas Kelley, Kelley Drye Newhall Maginnes & Warren H. W. Laidler, League for Industrial Democracy Charles G. Mortimer, General Foods Corporation George B. Roberts, Larchmont, New York Harry Scherman, Book-of-the-Month Club Boris Shishkin, American Federation of Labor and Congress of Industrial Organizations George Soule, South Kent, Connecticut Joseph H. Willits, Langhorne, Pennsylvania Donald B. Woodward, A. W. Jones and Company

DIRECTORS BY UNIVERSITY APPOINTMENT

V. W. Bladen, Toronto Francis M. Boddy, Minnesota Arthur F. Burns, Columbia Lester V. Chandler, Princeton Melvin G. de Chazeau, Cornell Frank W. Fetter, Northwestern R. A. Gordon, California Harold M. Groves, Wisconsin Gottfried Haberler, Harvard Maurice W. Lee, North Carolina Lloyd G. Reynolds, Yale Paul A. Samuelson, Massachusetts Institute of Technology Theodore W. Schultz, Chicago

Willis J. Winn, Pennsylvania

DIRECTORS BY APPOINTMENT OF OTHER ORGANIZATIONS Percival F. Brundage, American Institute of Certified Public Accountants Nathaniel Goldfinger, American Federation of Labor and Congress of Industrial Organizations Harold G. Halcrow, American Farm Economic Association Murray Shields, American Management Association Williad L. Marcine, Commit Account of the State of Committee State of Committe

Willard L. Thorp, American Economic Association W. Allen Wallis, American Statistical Association

Harold F. Williamson, Economic History Association

Theodore O. Yntema, Committee for Economic Development

DIRECTORS EMERITI

Shepard Morgan, Norfolk, Connecticut

Jacob Viner, Princeton, New Jersey RESEARCH STAFF

Moses Abramovitz Gary S. Becker William H. Brown, Jr. Gerhard Bry Arthur F. Burns Phillip Cagan Joseph W. Conard Frank G. Dickinson James S. Earley Richard A. Easterlin Solomon Fabricant Albert Fishlow Milton Friedman

Victor R. Fuchs H. G. Georgiadis Raymond W. Goldsmith Challis A. Hall, Jr. Millard Hastay Daniel M. Holland Thor Hultgren F. Thomas Juster C. Harry Kahn Irving B. Kravis Hal B. Lary Robert E. Lipsey Ruth P. Mack N. I. Stone, New York City

Jacob Mincer Ilse Mintz Geoffrey H. Moore Roger F. Murray Ralph L. Nelson G. Warren Nutter Richard T. Selden Lawrence H. Seltzer Robert P. Shay George J. Stigler Norman B. Ture Herbert B. Woolley Victor Zarnowitz

RELATION OF THE DIRECTORS TO THE WORK AND PUBLICATIONS OF THE NATIONAL BUREAU OF ECONOMIC RESEARCH

1. The object of the National Bureau of Economic Research is to ascertain and to present to the public important economic facts and their interpretation in a scientific and impartial manner. The Board of Directors is charged with the responsibility of ensuring that the work of the National Bureau is carried on in strict conformity with this object.

2. To this end the Board of Directors shall appoint one or more Directors of Research.

3. The Director or Directors of Research shall submit to the members of the Board, or to its Executive Committee, for their formal adoption, all specific proposals concerning researches to be instituted.

4. No report shall be published until the Director or Directors of Research shall have submitted to the Board a summary drawing attention to the character of the data and their utilization in the report, the nature and treatment of the problems involved, the main conclusions, and such other information as in their opinion would serve to determine the suitability of the report for publication in accordance with the principles of the National Bureau.

5. A copy of any manuscript proposed for publication shall also be submitted to each member of the Board. For each manuscript to be so submitted a special committee shall be appointed by the President, or at his designation by the Executive Director, consisting of three Directors selected as nearly as may be one from each general division of the Board. The names of the special manuscript committee shall be stated to each Director when the summary and report described in paragraph (4) are sent to him. It shall be the duty of each member of the committee to read the manuscript. If each member of the special committee has not signified his approval within thirty days of the transmittal of the report and manuscript, the Director of Research shall then notify each member of the Board, requesting approval or disapproval of publication, and thirty additional days shall be granted for this purpose. The manuscript shall then not be published unless at least a majority of the entire Board and a two-thirds majority of those members of the Board who shall have voted on the proposal within the time fixed for the receipt of votes on the publication proposed shall have approved.

6. No manuscript may be published, though approved by each member of the special committee, until forty-five days have elapsed from the transmittal of the summary and report. The interval is allowed for the receipt of any memorandum of dissent or reservation, together with a brief statement of his reasons, that any member may wish to express; and such memorandum of dissent or reservation shall be published with the manuscript if he so desires. Publication does not, however, imply that each member of the Board has read the manuscript, or that either members of the Board in general, or of the special committee, have passed upon its validity in every detail.

7. A copy of this resolution shall, unless otherwise determined by the Board, be printed in each copy of every National Bureau book.

> (Resolution adopted October 25, 1926, as revised February 6, 1933, and February 24, 1941)

Contents

	ACKNOWLEDGMENTS	xv
	FOREWORD, by Robert P. Shay	xvii
1.	INTRODUCTION AND SUMMARY Summary	1 4
2.	Consumer Finance Companies Extent of Specialization Gross Finance Charges Components of Finance Charges Operating Expenses Nonoperating Expenses Lender's Rate of Profit Comparison of Companies with Highest and Lowest Finance Charges Comparison of High- and Low-Profit Companies	6 7 10 10 15 21 23 27
3.	SALES FINANCE COMPANIES Diversification of Lending Activities Gross Finance Charges Components of Finance Charges Operating Expenses Nonoperating Expenses Lender's Rate of Profit Comparison of High- and Low-Profit Companies	28 28 30 32 34 36 41 44
4.	COMMERCIAL BANKS Diversification of Lending Activities Gross Finance Charges Components of Finance Charges Operating Expenses Nonoperating Expenses Lender's Rate of Profit Comparison of Banks with Highest and Lowest Finance Charges	47 47 48 49 52 54 59 62
5.	FEDERAL CREDIT UNIONS Uses of Funds Finance Charges Components of Finance Charges Operating Expenses Sources of Funds	64 65 67 68 69 71

	Nonoperating Expenses	72
	Net Income	72
	Disposition of Net Income	75
6.	COMPARISON OF COST OF PROVIDING CONSUMER CREDIT AT FOUR	
	Types of Financial Institutions	77
	Variations in Operating Expenses	79
	Variations in Nonoperating Expenses	85
	Rate of Profits	96
7.	Trends in Cost of Providing Consumer Credit	98
	Operating Expenses	100
	Nonoperating Expenses	103
	Lender's Rate of Profit	109
	APPENDIXES	
A.	Description of Samples and Adjustments in Data	117
	Consumer Finance Companies	117
	Sales Finance Companies	120
	Commercial Banks	122
	Federal Credit Unions	124
В.	SUPPLEMENTARY TABULATIONS FOR CONSUMER FINANCE COMPANIES	127
С.	SUPPLEMENTARY TABULATIONS FOR SALES FINANCE COMPANIES	135
D.	SUPPLEMENTARY TABULATIONS FOR COMMERCIAL BANKS	143
E.	SUPPLEMENTARY TABULATIONS FOR FEDERAL CREDIT UNIONS	1 49
In	Index	

.

Tables

1.	Uses of Funds by Consumer Finance Companies, End of 1959	7
2.	Components of Gross Finance Charges on Consumer Credit at	
	Consumer Finance Companies, 1959	11
3.	Losses and Provision for Losses on Consumer Credit at Consumer	
	Finance Companies, Selected Years	12
4.	Sources of Funds for Consumer Finance Companies, End of 1959	17
5.	Cost of Nonequity Funds at Consumer Finance Companies, 1949–59	18
6.	Factors in Consumer Finance Company Profits, 1949-59	20
7.	Comparison of Consumer Finance Companies with Highest and	
	Lowest Average Finance Charges, 1949-59	25
8.	Comparison of Selected High- and Low-Profit Consumer Finance	
	Companies, 1949–59	26
9.	Uses of Funds by Sales Finance Companies, End of 1959	29
	Components of Gross Finance Charges on Consumer Credit at	
	Sales Finance Companies, 1959	33
11.	Sources of Funds for Sales Finance Companies, End of 1959	38
12.	Cost of Nonequity Funds at Sales Finance Companies, 1949-59	40
13.	Factors in Sales Finance Company Profits, 1949-59	43
	Selected Ratios of High- and Low-Profit Sales Finance Companies,	
	195659	45
15.	Uses of Funds by Commercial Bank Sample, End of 1959	48
16.	Components of Gross Finance Charges on Consumer Credit at	
	Commercial Banks, 1959	51
17.	Operating Expenses at Commercial Banks, by Type of Consumer	
	Credit, 1957–59	54
18.	Sources of Funds for Commercial Banks, End of 1959	56
1 9 .	Cost of Nonequity Funds at Commercial Banks, 1955-59	58
20.	Factors in Commercial Bank Profits, 1955-59	60
21.	Comparison of Commercial Banks with Highest and Lowest Average	
	Finance Charges on Consumer Credit, 1955-59	63
22.	Number and Distribution of Federal Credit Unions by Asset Size,	
	End of 1959	65
23.	Uses of Funds by Federal Credit Unions, End of 1959	66
	Components of Finance Charges on Consumer Credit at Federal	
	Credit Unions, 1959	69
25.	Sources of Funds for Federal Credit Unions, 1959	71
26.	Selected Earning Ratios for Federal Credit Unions, 1949-59	74
27.	Return from Use of Nonequity Funds at Federal Credit Unions,	
	1949–59	75

28.	Net Income and Dividends at Federal Credit Unions, 1949-59	76
29.	Components of Gross Finance Charges on Consumer Credit, by	
	Type of Lender, 1959	78
30.	Annual Operating Expenses by Type of Institution and Selected	
	Types of Credit, 1959	83
31.	Average Cost of Funds by Source and Type of Institution, 1959	88
32.	Sources and Uses of Funds by Type of Institution, 1959	90
33.	Cost of Nonequity Funds by Type of Institution, 1959	93
34.	Factors in Lender's Profits by Type of Institution, 1959	94
35.	Average Finance Charges on Consumer Credit, 1949, 1955, and 1959	99
36.	Operating Expenses on Consumer Credit, by Type of Expense and	
	Institution, 1949–59	104
37.	Comparison of Return on Consumer Assets and All Earning Assets	
	by Type of Institution, 1949–59	110
38.	Cost of Nonearning Assets by Type of Institution, 1949-59	112

.

Appendix Tables

A-1.	Comparison of Consumer Finance Company Sample with Esti-	
	mates for All Companies, 1955	119
A-2.	Comparison of Sales Finance Company Sample with Estimates	
	for All Companies, 1955	121
A-3.	Comparison of Commercial Bank Sample with Data for All Com-	
	mercial Banks, End of 1959	123
A-4.	Adjustments in Published Data for Federal Credit Unions, 1959	125
B-1 .	Distribution of Sources and Uses of Funds of Consumer Finance	
	Companies, End of Year, 1948-59	128
B-2.	Distribution of Sources and Uses of Funds of Consumer Finance	
	Companies, Averages of Beginning and End of Year, 1949-59	130
B-3 .	Distribution of Earnings and Expenses of Consumer Finance	
	Companies, 1949–59	132
B-4 .	Components of Gross Finance Charges on Consumer Credit at	
	Consumer Finance Companies, 1949-59	133
B-5.	Selected Ratios for Consumer Finance Companies, 1949-59	134
	Distribution of Sources and Uses of Funds of Sales Finance Com-	
	panies, End of Year, 1948–59	136
C-2.	Distribution of Sources and Uses of Funds of Sales Finance Com-	
	panies, Averages of Beginning and End of Year, 1949-59	138
C-3.	Distribution of Earnings and Expenses of Sales Finance Compa-	
0.01	nies, 1949–59	140
C-4.	Components of Gross Finance Charges on Consumer Credit at	1.0
	Sales Finance Companies, 1949–59	141
C-5.	Selected Ratios for Sales Finance Companies, 1949–59	142
	Distribution of Sources and Uses of Funds of Commercial Banks,	
~ n	End of Year, 1954–59	144
D-2	Distribution of Sources and Uses of Funds of Commercial Banks,	
	Averages of Beginning and End of Year, 1955–59	145
D-3	Distribution of Earnings and Expenses of Commercial Banks,	1 12
0 0.	1955-59	146
D-4	Components of Gross Finance Charges on Consumer Credit at	140
2	Commercial Banks, 1955–59	147
D-5	Selected Ratios for Commercial Banks, 1955–59	148
E-1.	Distribution of Sources and Uses of Funds of Federal Credit	1-10
	Unions, End of Year, 1949–59	150
E-2.	Distribution of Sources and Uses of Funds of Federal Credit	150
	Unions, Average of Beginning and End of Year, 1949–59	151
	omons, reverage of beginning and the of reat, 1949-39	151

E-3.	Distribution of Earnings and Expenses of Federal Credit Unions,	
	1949–59	152
E-4.	Components of Gross Finance Charges on Consumer Credit at	
	Federal Credit Unions, 1949-59	154
E-5.	Selected Ratios for Federal Credit Unions, 1949-59	155

.

Charts

1.	Gross Finance Charges on Consumer Credit at Consumer Finance	
	Companies, 1930-41 and 1949-59	9
2.	Operating Expenses on Consumer Credit at Consumer Finance Companies, 1949-59	14
3.	Distribution of Nonoperating Expenses on Consumer Credit at	
	Consumer Finance Companies, 1949–59	16
4.	Gross Finance Charges on Consumer Credit at Sales Finance Com- panies, by Type of Credit, 1949-59	31
5.	Operating Expenses on Consumer Credit at Sales Finance Compa- nies, 1949–59	35
6.	Distribution of Nonoperating Expenses on Consumer Credit at Sales Finance Companies, 1949–59	37
7.	Gross Finance Charges on Consumer Credit at Commercial Banks, by Type of Credit, 1955–59	50
8.	Operating Expenses on Consumer Credit at Commercial Banks, 1955-59	53
9.	Distribution of Nonoperating Expenses on Consumer Credit at Commercial Banks, 1955-59	55
10.	Individual Company Variations in Operating Expenses, 1959	86
11.	Average Finance Charges, Total Expenses, and Operating Expenses on Consumer Credit, by Type of Institution, 1949–59	101
12.	Operating Expenses on Consumer Credit as Percentage of Finance Charges, by Type of Institution, 1949-59	102
13.	Salary Expenses Per \$100 of Average Outstanding Consumer Credit and Hourly Wage Rate, 1950–59	106
14.	Nonoperating Expenses on Consumer Credit, by Type of Expense, 1949–59	108
15.	Financial Advantage of Use of Nonequity Funds, by Type of Insti- tution, 1949-59	114
16.	Return on Equity Funds by Type of Institution, 1949–59	115

N N ,

Acknowledgments

I AM particularly indebted to John M. Chapman of Columbia University and to Geoffrey H. Moore and Robert P. Shay of the National Bureau staff for their help in planning the study and advice on the analysis and presentation of the results. Other members of the National Bureau staff who reviewed earlier drafts and made thoughtful suggestions are Reuben Kessel, Anna J. Schwartz, and F. Thomas Juster. Robert W. Johnson of Michigan State University contributed helpful comments. I am also indebted to members of the Advisory Committee of the Consumer Credit Study, listed in the Foreword, who aided in the planning of the investigation and offered critical comments on drafts of this report, and to the reading committee of the National Bureau's Board of Directors, Francis M. Boddy, Wallace J. Campbell, and A. J. Hayes.

Special acknowledgment is due the financial institutions which contributed data to the study. Particular mention should be made of the help given by William S. Germer and H. F. Wright, Jr., of the First Pennsylvania Bank and Trust Company, Ernst A. Dauer of Household Finance Corporation, M. R. Neifeld and Charles A. Loeffler of Beneficial Management Corporation, R. F. Murphy of General Motors Acceptance Corporation, and George F. Dimmler, formerly of C. I. T. Financial Corporation. Roland M. Gardner and other staff members of the Bureau of Federal Credit Unions advised on the use of the credit union data.

Statistical and accounting assistance was capably given by Florence Liang of the National Bureau and V. N. Vora of the University of Pennsylvania. Christine Culbert, of the National Bureau editorial staff, provided editorial assistance. H. Irving Forman drew the charts. • . .

Foreword

PAUL F. SMITH'S study represents an extension of the survey of financial structure and operating characteristics of consumer credit agencies and commercial banks in the National Bureau's earlier Studies in Consumer Instalment Financing. The tenth volume of that series, *Comparative Operating Experience of Consumer Instalment Financing Agencies and Commercial Banks*, 1929–41 by Ernst A. Dauer, published in 1944, is the direct predecessor to this volume.

Smith explores the interrelations between rates of charge and major cost components of four major types of financial institutions: consumer finance companies, sales finance companies, commercial banks, and federal credit unions. These institutions extend a wide range of consumer credit in varying forms. His study presents comparative cost data for the eleven years, 1949 through 1959. An earlier report, dealing with 1959 alone, was published in the September 1962 issue of the Journal of Finance and reprinted as Occasional Paper 83 by the National Bureau under the title Cost of Providing Consumer Credit: A Study of Four Major Types of Financial Institutions. This work is part of a broad study of consumer credit, which is designed to assess its role in the functioning of the economy of the United States.

Since 1941 there have been striking changes in the holdings of consumer credit outstanding. When the Dauer study was completed, sales finance companies were the largest holders of consumer instalment credit outstanding, followed closely by commercial banks and retail outlets. By the end of 1959 commercial banks had become the predominant holders of consumer credit followed by sales finance companies and retail outlets. Credit unions showed marked gains during the intervening years. The striking growth of consumer credit stimulated widespread interest in the costs of providing credit among institutional sources. The difficulties of cost allocations and the lack of uniform cost accounting procedures have long delayed the acquisition of cost data for consumer credit operations among the major types of credit institutions. By working with small samples of companies with comparable cost accounting procedures, Smith has succeeded in isolating consumer credit costs and, in some cases, he supplies separate cost estimates by type of credit. Although the data cannot be considered representative of all institutions within each of the major types, they are certainly typical of many large credit suppliers within the finance company and bank groups, and they do cover all credit unions.

Special acknowledgment should be made to the Advisory Committee

of the Consumer Credit Study, which assisted in drafting plans for this investigation, conferred with staff and authors at several stages of the work, and reviewed the final manuscript. Individuals who served on this committee are: Paul W. McCracken, chairman, University of Michigan; Gordon E. Areen, Associates Investment Company; Frank Barsalou, Pacific Finance Corporation; Dorothy S. Brady, University of Pennsylvania; John M. Chapman, Columbia University; Mona Dingle, Division of Research and Statistics. Board of Governors of the Federal Reserve System; Bertrand Fox, Harvard University; Raymond W. Goldsmith, Yale University; Robert E. Lewis, First National City Bank of New York; Roger F. Murray, National Bureau of Economic Research; Roland I. Robinson, Michigan State University; Herbert Stein, Committee for Economic Development; Van Buren Thorne, Jr., General Motors Acceptance Corporation; and William L. Wilson, C. I. T. Financial Corporation. Others who formerly served on the advisory committee are George Dimmler, George W. Omacht, Sidney E. Rolfe, and LeRoy A. Weller.

The National Bureau also wishes to express its thanks to those organizations that cooperated in providing materials for this study:

Other projects in the Consumer Credit Study are closely related to the material in this volume. An analysis of the rate structure in auto-

FOREWORD

mobile financing by Robert P. Shay will provide detailed estimates of the cost to consumers of financing the purchase of new and used automobiles. Wallace P. Mors is investigating economic aspects of the regulatory policies of states toward consumer credit. The effects of credit use upon the management of consumer finances are being studied by F. Thomas Juster. Richard T. Selden is conducting an investigation of the flow of funds from their sources through financial markets to their ultimate use by consumers. Finally, the impact of consumer indebtedness upon unemployed families is being appraised by Philip A. Klein.

The Consumer Credit Study was made possible by research grants to the National Bureau from four finance companies: Associates Investment Company, C. I. T. Financial Corporation, General Motors Acceptance Corporation, and Pacific Finance Corporation. In addition, the Wharton School of Finance and Commerce of the University of Pennsylvania permitted use of the author's time and facilities made available through a chair in consumer credit given to the University by the Family Finance Corporation.

These institutions are, of course, not to be held responsible for any of the statements made or views expressed here.

> ROBERT P. SHAY Director, Consumer Credit Study

х.

٠

Consumer Credit Costs, 1949-59