The Economics of Artificial Intelligence
National Bureau of Economic Research

Officers
Karen N. Horn, chair
John Lipsky, vice chair
James M. Poterba, president and chief executive officer
Robert Mednick, treasurer
Kelly Horak, controller and assistant corporate secretary
Alterra Milone, corporate secretary
Denis Healy, assistant corporate secretary

Directors at Large
Peter C. Aldrich
Elizabeth E. Bailey
John H. Biggs
John S. Clarkeson
Kathleen B. Cooper
Charles H. Dallara
George C. Eads
Jessica P. Einhorn
Mohamed El-Erian

Diana Farrell
Jacob A. Frenkel
Robert S. Hamada
Peter Blair Henry
Karen N. Horn
Lisa Jordan
John Lipsky
Laurence H. Meyer
Karen Mills
Michael H. Moskow
Alicia H. Munnell
Robert T. Parry
James M. Poterba
John S. Reed
Marina v. N. Whitman
Martin B. Zimmerman

Directors by University Appointment
Timothy Bresnahan, Stanford
Pierre-André Chiappori, Columbia
Alan V. Deardorff, Michigan
Edward Foster, Minnesota
John P. Gould, Chicago
Mark Grinblatt, California, Los Angeles
Bruce Hansen, Wisconsin–Madison
Benjamin Hermalin, California, Berkeley
Samuel Kortum, Yale

Diana Farrell
Jacob A. Frenkel
Robert S. Hamada
Peter Blair Henry
Karen N. Horn
Lisa Jordan
John Lipsky
Laurence H. Meyer
Karen Mills
Michael H. Moskow
Alicia H. Munnell
Robert T. Parry
James M. Poterba
John S. Reed
Marina v. N. Whitman
Martin B. Zimmerman

Directors by Appointment of Other Organizations
Jean-Paul Chavas, Agricultural and Applied Economics Association
Martin J. Gruber, American Finance Association
Philip Hoffman, Economic History Association
Arthur Kennickell, American Statistical Association
Jack Kleinhenz, National Association for Business Economics

Robert Mednick, American Institute of Certified Public Accountants
Peter L. Rousseau, American Economic Association
Gregor W. Smith, Canadian Economics Association
William Spriggs, American Federation of Labor and Congress of Industrial Organizations
Bart van Ark, The Conference Board

Directors Emeriti
George Akerlof
Jagdish Bhagwati
Don R. Conlan
Ray C. Fair

Franklin Fisher
Saul H. Hymans
Rudolph A. Oswald
Andrew Postlewaite

John J. Siegfried
Craig Swan
Relation of the Directors to the
Work and Publications of the
National Bureau of Economic Research

1. The object of the NBER is to ascertain and present to the economics profession, and to the public more generally, important economic facts and their interpretation in a scientific manner without policy recommendations. The Board of Directors is charged with the responsibility of ensuring that the work of the NBER is carried on in strict conformity with this object.

2. The President shall establish an internal review process to ensure that book manuscripts proposed for publication DO NOT contain policy recommendations. This shall apply both to the proceedings of conferences and to manuscripts by a single author or by one or more co-authors but shall not apply to authors of comments at NBER conferences who are not NBER affiliates.

3. No book manuscript reporting research shall be published by the NBER until the President has sent to each member of the Board a notice that a manuscript is recommended for publication and that in the President’s opinion it is suitable for publication in accordance with the above principles of the NBER. Such notification will include a table of contents and an abstract or summary of the manuscript’s content, a list of contributors if applicable, and a response form for use by Directors who desire a copy of the manuscript for review. Each manuscript shall contain a summary drawing attention to the nature and treatment of the problem studied and the main conclusions reached.

4. No volume shall be published until forty-five days have elapsed from the above notification of intention to publish it. During this period a copy shall be sent to any Director requesting it, and if any Director objects to publication on the grounds that the manuscript contains policy recommendations, the objection will be presented to the author(s) or editor(s). In case of dispute, all members of the Board shall be notified, and the President shall appoint an ad hoc committee of the Board to decide the matter; thirty days additional shall be granted for this purpose.

5. The President shall present annually to the Board a report describing the internal manuscript review process, any objections made by Directors before publication or by anyone after publication, any disputes about such matters, and how they were handled.

6. Publications of the NBER issued for informational purposes concerning the work of the Bureau, or issued to inform the public of the activities at the Bureau, including but not limited to the NBER Digest and Reporter, shall be consistent with the object stated in paragraph 1. They shall contain a specific disclaimer noting that they have not passed through the review procedures required in this resolution. The Executive Committee of the Board is charged with the review of all such publications from time to time.

7. NBER working papers and manuscripts distributed on the Bureau’s web site are not deemed to be publications for the purpose of this resolution, but they shall be consistent with the object stated in paragraph 1. Working papers shall contain a specific disclaimer noting that they have not passed through the review procedures required in this resolution. The NBER’s web site shall contain a similar disclaimer. The President shall establish an internal review process to ensure that the working papers and the web site do not contain policy recommendations, and shall report annually to the Board on this process and any concerns raised in connection with it.

8. Unless otherwise determined by the Board or exempted by the terms of paragraphs 6 and 7, a copy of this resolution shall be printed in each NBER publication as described in paragraph 2 above.
Contents

Acknowledgments xi

Introduction 1
Ajay Agrawal, Joshua Gans, and Avi Goldfarb

I. AI AS A GPT

Erik Brynjolfsson, Daniel Rock, and Chad Syverson
Comment: Rebecca Henderson

2. The Technological Elements of Artificial Intelligence 61
Matt Taddy

Ajay Agrawal, Joshua Gans, and Avi Goldfarb
Comment: Andrea Prat

4. The Impact of Artificial Intelligence on Innovation: An Exploratory Analysis 115
Iain M. Cockburn, Rebecca Henderson, and Scott Stern
Comment: Matthew Mitchell
5. Finding Needles in Haystacks: Artificial Intelligence and Recombinant Growth
Ajay Agrawal, John McHale, and Alexander Oettl

6. Artificial Intelligence as the Next GPT: A Political-Economy Perspective
Manuel Trajtenberg

II. Growth, Jobs, and Inequality

7. Artificial Intelligence, Income, Employment, and Meaning
Betsey Stevenson

8. Artificial Intelligence, Automation, and Work
Daron Acemoglu and Pascual Restrepo

9. Artificial Intelligence and Economic Growth
Philippe Aghion, Benjamin F. Jones, and Charles I. Jones
Comment: Patrick Francois

10. Artificial Intelligence and Jobs: The Role of Demand
James Bessen

11. Public Policy in an AI Economy
Austan Goolsbee

12. Should We Be Reassured If Automation in the Future Looks Like Automation in the Past?
Jason Furman

13. R&D, Structural Transformation, and the Distribution of Income
Jeffrey D. Sachs

14. Artificial Intelligence and Its Implications for Income Distribution and Unemployment
Anton Korinek and Joseph E. Stiglitz

15. Neglected Open Questions in the Economics of Artificial Intelligence
Tyler Cowen
III. Machine Learning and Regulation

16. Artificial Intelligence, Economics, and Industrial Organization
   Hal Varian
   Comment: Judith Chevalier
   399

17. Privacy, Algorithms, and Artificial Intelligence
   Catherine Tucker
   423

18. Artificial Intelligence and Consumer Privacy
   Ginger Zhe Jin
   439

19. Artificial Intelligence and International Trade
   Avi Goldfarb and Daniel Trefler
   463

20. Punishing Robots: Issues in the Economics of Tort Liability and Innovation in Artificial Intelligence
   Alberto Galasso and Hong Luo
   493

IV. Machine Learning and Economics

21. The Impact of Machine Learning on Economics
   Susan Athey
   Comment: Mara Lederman
   507

22. Artificial Intelligence, Labor, Productivity, and the Need for Firm-Level Data
   Manav Raj and Robert Seamans
   553

   Paul R. Milgrom and Steven Tadelis
   567

24. Artificial Intelligence and Behavioral Economics
   Colin F. Camerer
   Comment: Daniel Kahneman
   587

Contributors
Author Index
Subject Index
This volume contains chapters and ideas discussed at the first NBER Conference on the Economics of Artificial Intelligence, held in September 2017 in Toronto. We thank all the authors and discussants for their contributions. Funds for the conference and book project were provided by the Sloan Foundation, the Canadian Institute for Advanced Research, and the Creative Destruction Lab at the University of Toronto. At the Sloan Foundation, Danny Goroff provided guidance that improved the overall agenda. The NBER digitization initiative, under the leadership of Shane Greenstein, was a key early supporter. We thank our dean, Tiff Macklem. In addition, Jim Poterba at the NBER has been generous, giving us the flexibility needed to bring this project together. Special thanks are due to Rob Shannon, Denis Healy, Carl Beck, and Dawn Bloomfield for managing the conference and logistics and to Helena Fitz-Patrick for guiding the book through the editorial process. Finally we thank our families, Gina, Natalie, Rachel, Amelia, Andreas, Belanna, Ariel, Annika, Anna, Sam, and Ben.