This PDF is a selection from a published volume from the National Bureau of Economic Research

Volume Title: Education, Skills, and Technical Change: Implications for Future US GDP Growth

Volume Authors/Editors: Charles R. Hulten and Valerie A. Ramey, editors

Volume Publisher: University of Chicago Press

Volume ISBNs: 978-0-226-56780-8 (cloth); 978-0-226-56794-5 (electronic); 0-226-56780-X (cloth)

Volume URL: http://www.nber.org/books/hult-12

Conference Date: October 16-17, 2015

Publication Date: December 2018

Chapter Title: Front matter, prefatory note

Chapter Author(s): Charles R. Hulten, Valerie A. Ramey

Chapter URL: http://www.nber.org/chapters/c14521

Chapter pages in book: (p. i - x)

# **Education, Skills, and Technical Change**



# Studies in Income and Wealth Volume 77

National Bureau of Economic Research Conference on Research in Income and Wealth



Edited by Charles R. Hulten and Valerie A. Ramey

The University of Chicago Press

Chicago and London

The University of Chicago Press, Chicago 60637
The University of Chicago Press, Ltd., London
© 2019 by the National Bureau of Economic Research
All rights reserved. No part of this book may be used or reproduced
in any manner whatsoever without written permission, except in the
case of brief quotations in critical articles and reviews. For more
information, contact the University of Chicago Press, 1427 E. 60th St.,
Chicago, IL 60637.

Published 2019

Printed in the United States of America

28 27 26 25 24 23 22 21 20 19 1 2 3 4 5

ISBN-13: 978-0-226-56780-8 (cloth) ISBN-13: 978-0-226-56794-5 (e-book)

DOI: https://doi.org/10.7208/chicago/9780226567945.001.0001

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Education, Skills, and Technical Change: Implications for Future U.S. GDP Growth (Conference) (2015: Bethesda, Maryland) | Hulten, Charles R., editor. | Ramey, Valerie A. (Valerie Ann), editor.

Title: Education, skills, and technical change: implications for future US GDP growth / edited by Charles R. Hulten and Valerie A. Ramey.

Other titles: Studies in income and wealth; v. 77.

Description: Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 2019. | Series: Studies in income and wealth; v. 77 | "This volume contains revised versions of the papers presented at the Conference on Research in Income and Wealth titled "Education, Skills, and Technical Change: Implications for Future U.S. GDP Growth," held in Bethesda, Maryland, on October 16–17, 2015"—Publisher info. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2018013221 | ISBN 9780226567808 (cloth : alk. paper) | ISBN 9780226567945 (e-book)

Subjects: LCSH: Labor supply—Effect of education on—United States—Congresses. | Labor supply—Effect of technological innovations on—United States—Congresses. | Education—Effect of technological innovations on—United States—Congresses. | Gross domestic product—Social aspects—United States—Congresses. | Human capital—United States—Congresses.

Classification: LCC HD5724 .E28 2019 | DDC 338.973—dc23 LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2018013221

 This paper meets the requirements of ANSI/NISO Z39.48-1992 (Permanence of Paper).

#### National Bureau of Economic Research

#### Officers

Karen N. Horn, chair Kelly Horak, controller and assistant John Lipsky, vice chair corporate secretary

James M. Poterba, president and chief
executive officer

Alterra Milone, corporate secretary
Denis Healy, assistant corporate secretary

Robert Mednick, treasurer

#### **Directors at Large**

Mohamed El-Erian Karen Mills Peter C. Aldrich Elizabeth E. Bailev Jacob A. Frenkel Michael H. Moskow John H. Biggs Robert S. Hamada Alicia H. Munnell John S. Clarkeson Peter Blair Henry Robert T. Parry Karen N. Horn James M. Poterba Kathleen B. Cooper Charles H. Dallara Lisa Jordan John S. Reed

George C. Eads John Lipsky Marina v. N. Whitman Jessica P. Einhorn Laurence H. Meyer Martin B. Zimmerman

#### **Directors by University Appointment**

Timothy Bresnahan, Stanford
Pierre-André Chiappori, Columbia
Alan V. Deardorff, Michigan
Ray C. Fair, Yale
George Mailath, Pennsylvania
Marjorie B. McElroy, Duke
Joel Mokyr, Northwestern
Cecilia Rouse, Princeton

Edward Foster, Minnesota Richard L. Schmalensee, Massachusetts
John P. Gould, Chicago Institute of Technology

Mark Grinblatt, California, Los Angeles
Bruce Hansen, Wisconsin–Madison
Benjamin Hermalin, California, Berkeley

Ingo Walter, New York
David B. Yoffie, Harvard

#### **Directors by Appointment of Other Organizations**

Jean-Paul Chavas, Agricultural and Applied

Economics Association

Robert Mednick, American Institute of
Certified Public Accountants

Martin J. Gruber, American Finance Peter L. Rousseau, American Economic Association Association

Philip Hoffman, Economic History Gregor W. Smith, Canadian Economics

Association Association

Arthur Kennickell, American Statistical William Spriggs, American Federation

Association of Labor and Congress of Industrial Jack Kleinhenz, National Association for Organizations

Business Economics Bart van Ark, The Conference Board

#### **Directors Emeriti**

George Akerlof George Hatsopoulos John J. Siegfried
Jagdish Bhagwati Saul H. Hymans Craig Swan
Don R. Conlan Rudolph A. Oswald
Franklin Fisher Andrew Postlewaite

### Relation of the Directors to the Work and Publications of the National Bureau of Economic Research

- 1. The object of the NBER is to ascertain and present to the economics profession, and to the public more generally, important economic facts and their interpretation in a scientific manner without policy recommendations. The Board of Directors is charged with the responsibility of ensuring that the work of the NBER is carried on in strict conformity with this object.
- 2. The President shall establish an internal review process to ensure that book manuscripts proposed for publication DO NOT contain policy recommendations. This shall apply both to the proceedings of conferences and to manuscripts by a single author or by one or more co-authors but shall not apply to authors of comments at NBER conferences who are not NBER affiliates.
- 3. No book manuscript reporting research shall be published by the NBER until the President has sent to each member of the Board a notice that a manuscript is recommended for publication and that in the President's opinion it is suitable for publication in accordance with the above principles of the NBER. Such notification will include a table of contents and an abstract or summary of the manuscript's content, a list of contributors if applicable, and a response form for use by Directors who desire a copy of the manuscript for review. Each manuscript shall contain a summary drawing attention to the nature and treatment of the problem studied and the main conclusions reached.
- 4. No volume shall be published until forty-five days have elapsed from the above notification of intention to publish it. During this period a copy shall be sent to any Director requesting it, and if any Director objects to publication on the grounds that the manuscript contains policy recommendations, the objection will be presented to the author(s) or editor(s). In case of dispute, all members of the Board shall be notified, and the President shall appoint an ad hoc committee of the Board to decide the matter; thirty days additional shall be granted for this purpose.
- 5. The President shall present annually to the Board a report describing the internal manuscript review process, any objections made by Directors before publication or by anyone after publication, any disputes about such matters, and how they were handled.
- 6. Publications of the NBER issued for informational purposes concerning the work of the Bureau, or issued to inform the public of the activities at the Bureau, including but not limited to the NBER Digest and Reporter, shall be consistent with the object stated in paragraph 1. They shall contain a specific disclaimer noting that they have not passed through the review procedures required in this resolution. The Executive Committee of the Board is charged with the review of all such publications from time to time.
- 7. NBER working papers and manuscripts distributed on the Bureau's web site are not deemed to be publications for the purpose of this resolution, but they shall be consistent with the object stated in paragraph 1. Working papers shall contain a specific disclaimer noting that they have not passed through the review procedures required in this resolution. The NBER's web site shall contain a similar disclaimer. The President shall establish an internal review process to ensure that the working papers and the web site do not contain policy recommendations, and shall report annually to the Board on this process and any concerns raised in connection with it.
- 8. Unless otherwise determined by the Board or exempted by the terms of paragraphs 6 and 7, a copy of this resolution shall be printed in each NBER publication as described in paragraph 2 above.

## **Contents**

]	Prefatory Note	ix
	Introduction Charles R. Hulten and Valerie A. Ramey	1
I. THE MACROECONG AND REAL GDP C	OMIC LINK BETWEEN EDUCATION GROWTH	
]	Educational Attainment and the Revival of US Economic Growth Dale W. Jorgenson, Mun S. Ho, and Jon D. Samuels	23
:	The Outlook for US Labor-Quality Growth Canyon Bosler, Mary C. Daly, John G. Fernald, and Bart Hobijn Comment on Chapters 1 and 2: Douglas W. Elmendorf	61
]	The Importance of Education and Skill Development for Economic Growth in the Information Era Charles R. Hulten	115
II. Jobs and Skills	REQUIREMENTS	
•	Underemployment in the Early Careers of College Graduates following the Great Recession Jaison R. Abel and Richard Deitz	149

5.	The Requirements of Jobs: Evidence from a Nationally Representative Survey Maury Gittleman, Kristen Monaco, and Nicole Nestoriak	183
III. SKILLS, INEQUAL	ITY, AND POLARIZATION	
6.	Noncognitive Skills as Human Capital Shelly Lundberg Comment: David J. Deming	219
7.	Wage Inequality and Cognitive Skills: Reopening the Debate Stijn Broecke, Glenda Quintini, and Marieke Vandeweyer Comment: Frank Levy	251
8.	Education and the Growth-Equity Trade-Off Eric A. Hanushek	293
9.	Recent Flattening in the Higher Education Wage Premium: Polarization, Skill Downgrading, or Both? Robert G. Valletta Comment: David Autor	313
IV. THE SUPPLY OF S	KILLS	
10.	Accounting for the Rise in College Tuition Grey Gordon and Aaron Hedlund Comment: Sandy Baum	357
11.	Online Postsecondary Education and Labor Productivity Caroline M. Hoxby Comment: Nora Gordon	401
12.	High-Skilled Immigration and the Rise of STEM Occupations in US Employment Gordon H. Hanson and Matthew J. Slaughter <i>Comment</i> : John Bound	465
	Contributors	501
	Author Index	505
	Subject Index	513

# **Prefatory Note**

This volume contains revised versions of the papers presented at the Conference on Research in Income and Wealth titled "Education, Skills, and Technical Change: Implications for Future U.S. GDP Growth," held in Bethesda, Maryland, on October 16–17, 2015.

We gratefully acknowledge the financial support for this conference provided by the Bureau of Economic Analysis. Support for the general activities of the Conference on Research in Income and Wealth is provided by the following agencies: Bureau of Economic Analysis, Bureau of Labor Statistics, Bureau of the Census, Board of Governors of the Federal Reserve System, Statistics of Income/Internal Revenue Service, and Statistics Canada.

We thank Charles R. Hulten and Valerie A. Ramey, who served as conference organizers and as editors of the volume.

#### Executive Committee, December 2016

John M. Abowd Barry Johnson Katharine Abraham (chair) André Loranger Susanto Basu Brian Moyer Andrew Bernard Valerie A. Ramey Ernst R. Berndt Mark J. Roberts Carol A. Corrado Peter Schott John C. Haltiwanger Daniel Sichel Michael W. Horrigan William Wascher Ronald Jarmin