

This PDF is a selection from an out-of-print volume from the National Bureau of Economic Research

Volume Title: A General Equilibrium Model for Tax Policy Evaluation

Volume Author/Editor: Charles L. Ballard, Don Fullerton, John B. Shoven, and John Whalley

Volume Publisher: University of Chicago Press

Volume ISBN: 0-226-03632-4

Volume URL: <http://www.nber.org/books/ball85-1>

Publication Date: 1985

Chapter Title: Front matter, table of contents, preface

Chapter Author: Charles L. Ballard, Don Fullerton, John B. Shoven, John Whalley

Chapter URL: <http://www.nber.org/chapters/c11212>

Chapter pages in book: (p. -11 - 0)

# A General Equilibrium Model for Tax Policy Evaluation

---

Ballard, Fullerton,  
Shoven, and Whalley

A General Equilibrium Model  
for Tax Policy Evaluation

Charles L. Ballard, Don Fullerton,  
John B. Shoven, and John Whalley

---



National  
Bureau of  
Economic  
Research



National  
Bureau of  
Economic  
Research

Chicago

## A General Equilibrium Model for Tax Policy Evaluation

CHARLES L. BALLARD, DON FULLERTON, JOHN  
B. SHOVEN, AND JOHN WHALLEY

Although market clearing prices have always been central to economic theory, an applied general equilibrium model in which prices simultaneously clear all markets is a relatively new development. Such large-scale models of entire national economies have proved useful in researching fiscal policy because they account for complex interrelationships among several segments of an economy and thus measure the widespread effects of a government's major economic decisions.

This book reports the authors' research on one of the most sophisticated general equilibrium models designed for tax policy analysis. Significantly disaggregated and incorporating the complete array of federal, state, and local taxes, the model represents the U.S. economy and tax system in a large computer package. The authors consider modifications of the tax system, including those being raised in current policy debates, such as consumption-based taxes and integration of the corporate and personal income tax systems. A counterfactual economy associated with each of these alternatives is generated, and the possible outcomes are compared.

The analyses that emerge from the model lead the authors to a number of conclusions that make this book especially relevant to the current concerns of policy makers and researchers. For example, the authors argue that substantial welfare gains for the economy could result from the integration of corporate and personal income taxes. They also show that tax rate increases would not lead to decreases in revenue for the U.S. economy, contrary to the so-called Laffer effect.

(Continued on back flap)

---

# A General Equilibrium Model for Tax Policy Evaluation



A National Bureau  
of Economic Research  
Monograph

---

# A General Equilibrium Model for Tax Policy Evaluation

Charles L. Ballard  
Don Fullerton  
John B. Shoven  
John Whalley



The University of Chicago Press

*Chicago and London*

---

Charles L. Ballard is Assistant Professor of Economics, Michigan State University. Don Fullerton is Associate Professor of Economics, University of Virginia. John B. Shoven is Professor of Economics, Stanford University. John Whalley is Professor of Economics, University of Western Ontario. The latter three authors are also Research Associates of the National Bureau of Economic Research.

The University of Chicago Press, Chicago 60637  
The University of Chicago Press, Ltd., London

© 1985 by The University of Chicago  
All rights reserved. Published 1985  
Printed in the United States of America  
94 93 92 91 90 89 88 87 86 85 5 4 3 2 1

**Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data**  
Main entry under title:

A General equilibrium model for tax policy evaluation.

(A National Bureau of Economic Research monograph)

Bibliography: p.

Includes index.

1. Taxation—United States—Mathematical models.

I. Ballard, Charles L. II. Series.

HJ2381.G46 1985 336.2'00724 84-28096

ISBN 0-226-03632-4

---

## National Bureau of Economic Research

### Officers

Franklin A. Lindsay, *Chairman*  
Richard Rosett, *Vice Chairman*  
Eli Shapiro, *President*  
David G. Hartman, *Executive Director*  
*and Corporate Secretary*  
Charles A. Walworth, *Treasurer*  
Sam Parker, *Director of Finance and*  
*Administration*

### Directors at Large

Moses Abramovitz	Franklin A. Lindsay	Bert Seidman
George T. Conklin, Jr.	Roy E. Moor	Eli Shapiro
Jean A. Crockett	Geoffrey H. Moore	Stephen Stamas
Morton Ehrlich	Michael H. Moskow	Lazare Teper
Edward L. Ginzton	James J. O'Leary	Donald S. Wasserman
David L. Grove	Peter G. Peterson	Marina v.N. Whitman
Walter W. Heller	Robert V. Roosa	
Saul B. Klamon	Richard N. Rosett	

### Directors by University Appointment

Marcus Alexis, <i>Northwestern</i>	James L. Pierce, <i>California, Berkeley</i>
Albert Ando, <i>Pennsylvania</i>	Nathan Rosenberg, <i>Stanford</i>
Charles H. Berry, <i>Princeton</i>	James Simler, <i>Minnesota</i>
James Duesenberry, <i>Harvard</i>	James Tobin, <i>Yale</i>
Ann F. Friedlaender, <i>Massachusetts</i> <i>Institute of Technology</i>	John Vernon, <i>Duke</i>
J. C. LaForce, <i>California, Los Angeles</i>	William S. Vickrey, <i>Columbia</i>
Paul McCracken, <i>Michigan</i>	Burton A. Weisbrod, <i>Wisconsin</i>
	Arnold Zellner, <i>Chicago</i>

### Directors by Appointment of Other Organizations

Carl F. Christ, <i>American Economic</i> <i>Association</i>	Rudolph A. Oswald, <i>American</i> <i>Federation of Labor and Congress of</i> <i>Industrial Organizations</i>
Robert S. Hamada, <i>American</i> <i>Finance Association</i>	G. Edward Schuh, <i>American Agricultural</i> <i>Economics Association</i>
Gilbert Heebner, <i>National Association</i> <i>of Business Economists</i>	Albert Sommers, <i>The Conference</i> <i>Board</i>
Robert C. Holland, <i>Committee for</i> <i>Economic Development</i>	Dudley Wallace, <i>American Statistical</i> <i>Association</i>
Stephan F. Kaliski, <i>Canadian Economics</i> <i>Association</i>	Charles A. Walworth, <i>American Institute</i> <i>of Certified Public Accountants</i>
Douglas C. North, <i>Economic History</i> <i>Association</i>	

### Directors Emeriti

Arthur Burns	Thomas D. Flynn	Boris Shishkin
Emilio G. Collado	Gottfried Haberler	Willard L. Thorp
Solomon Fabricant	George B. Roberts	Theodore O. Yntema
Frank Fetter	Murray Shields	



---

## **Relation of the Directors to the Work and Publications of the National Bureau of Economic Research**

1. The object of the National Bureau of Economic Research is to ascertain and to present to the public important economic facts and their interpretation in a scientific and impartial manner. The Board of Directors is charged with the responsibility of ensuring that the work of the National Bureau is carried on in strict conformity with this object.

2. The President of the National Bureau shall submit to the Board of Directors, or to its Executive Committee, for their formal adoption all specific proposals for research to be instituted.

3. No research report shall be published by the National Bureau until the President has sent each member of the Board a notice that a manuscript is recommended for publication and that in the President's opinion it is suitable for publication in accordance with the principles of the National Bureau. Such notification will include an abstract or summary of the manuscript's content and a response form for use by those Directors who desire a copy of the manuscript for review. Each manuscript shall contain a summary drawing attention to the nature and treatment of the problem studied, the character of the data and their utilization in the report, and the main conclusions reached.

4. For each manuscript so submitted, a special committee of the Directors (including Directors Emeriti) shall be appointed by majority agreement of the President and Vice Presidents (or by the Executive Committee in case of inability to decide on the part of the President and Vice Presidents), consisting of three Directors selected as nearly as may be one from each general division of the Board. The names of the special manuscript committee shall be stated to each Director when notice of the proposed publication is submitted to him. It shall be the duty of each member of the special manuscript committee to read the manuscript. If each member of the manuscript committee signifies his approval within thirty days of the transmittal of the manuscript, the report may be published. If at the end of that period any member of the manuscript committee withholds his approval, the President shall then notify each member of the Board, requesting approval or disapproval of publication, and thirty days additional shall be granted for this purpose. The manuscript shall then not be published unless at least a majority of the entire Board who shall have voted on the proposal within the time fixed for the receipt of votes shall have approved.

5. No manuscript may be published, though approved by each member of the special manuscript committee, until forty-five days have elapsed from the transmittal of the report in manuscript form. The interval is allowed for the receipt of any memorandum of dissent or reservation, together with a brief statement of his reasons, that any member may wish to express; and such memorandum of dissent or reservation shall be published with the manuscript if he so desires. Publication does not, however, imply that each member of the Board has read the manuscript, or that either members of the Board in general or the special committee have passed on its validity in every detail.

6. Publications of the National Bureau issued for informational purposes concerning the work of the Bureau and its staff, or issued to inform the public of activities of Bureau staff, and volumes issued as a result of various conferences involving the National Bureau shall contain a specific disclaimer noting that such publication has not passed through the normal review procedures required in this resolution. The Executive Committee of the Board is charged with review of all such publications from time to time to ensure that they do not take on the character of formal research reports of the National Bureau, requiring formal Board approval.

7. Unless otherwise determined by the Board or exempted by the terms of paragraph 6, a copy of this resolution shall be printed in each National Bureau publication.

*(Resolution adopted October 25, 1926, as revised through September 30, 1974)*

---

# Contents

	Preface	ix
1.	<b>Introduction</b>	1
2.	<b>General Equilibrium Analysis of Tax Policies</b>	6
3.	<b>The Single Period Submodel</b>	25
	<i>Appendix: Glossary of Notation</i>	49
4.	<b>Data on Intermediate Production and Value Added</b>	55
	<i>Appendix A: Correspondences between Our Producer Goods and Bureau of Economic Analysis (BEA) Categories</i>	85
	<i>Appendix B: Correspondences between Our Consumer Goods and Bureau of Economic Analysis (BEA) Categories</i>	87
5.	<b>Data on Household Income and Expenditure, Investment, the Government, and Foreign Trade</b>	90
	<i>Appendix: Correspondences between Our Consumer Goods and Bureau of Labor Statistics (BLS) Categories</i>	110
6.	<b>Adjustments to the Data Set and Specification of Parameters</b>	113
7.	<b>Dynamic Considerations</b>	140
8.	<b>Integration of the Corporate and Personal Income Taxes</b>	153

9.	<b>Replacing the Personal Income Tax with a Progressive Consumption Tax</b>	171
10.	<b>The Relationship between Tax Rates and Government Revenue</b>	188
11.	<b>Alternative Models of the Foreign Sector</b>	203
12.	<b>Concluding Remarks</b>	235
	References	245
	Index	261

---

# Preface

In economics, as in other fields, beliefs are reinforced or amended as successive researchers replicate or refute previous findings. For any particular contribution, the reader's confidence in the results depends fundamentally on his ability to reproduce them, regardless of whether he chooses to do so. When a large simulation model is summarized for the constrained space of a journal article, however, the reader may learn no more than the general approach of the model. The summary may be viewed as cryptic, and the model may be viewed as a black box. Confidence is accordingly limited. These considerations may have led Donald McCloskey to ask:

What is legitimate simulation? Between A. C. Harberger's modest little triangles of distortion and Jeffrey Williamson's immense multi-equation models of the American or Japanese economies since 1870 is a broad range. Economists have no vocabulary for criticizing any part of the range. They can deliver summary grunts of belief or disbelief but find it difficult to articulate their reasons in a disciplined way. (1983, p. 502)

The purpose of this book is to provide all of the equations, data, and procedures that would be required to replicate the findings of one such simulation model. This numerical general equilibrium model of the United States tax system has been used in a number of previous journal articles to evaluate a number of tax issues and proposed tax reforms, but its detail has not yet been made generally available. We hope that this detail on particular procedures, equations, and data will be useful to other researchers pursuing similar objectives, and we hope that its availability will increase confidence in these previously published results. This considerable modeling detail is preceded by a general discussion of tax

issues and methodology, and it is followed by updated results on the issues addressed in several of the previous papers.

Since its beginning in 1976, work on various aspects of this model has been supported by the Treasury Department's Office of Tax Analysis, by several grants from the National Science Foundation, and by the National Bureau of Economic Research. We are very grateful for this financial assistance, as we are for data, suggestions, and other contributions of a great many other researchers. Individuals at the Commerce Department's National Income Division were particularly helpful. The model originated with work for the Treasury Department, and it is still being operated there, so it is sometimes known as the Treasury general equilibrium model. It is also known as GEMTAP, for general-equilibrium-model taxation analysis package.

Some of the papers using this model have been coauthored by Charles Becker, Antonio Borges, Shantayanan Devarajan, Roger H. Gordon, Lawrence H. Goulder, Yolanda K. Henderson, Timothy J. Kehoe, A. Thomas King, Andrew B. Lyon, and Richard A. Musgrave. Additional research assistance has been provided by Thomas Kronmiller, Radwan Shaban, and Janet Stotsky. All of these individuals have made substantial contributions toward this book.

In addition to many seminar participants and anonymous referees, we are grateful for suggestions made by Alan J. Auerbach, J. Gregory Ballentine, Peter Baltaxe, Alan Blinder, George Borts, Miachel Boskin, David F. Bradford, Peter Diamond, Larry Dildine, Daniel Feenberg, Martin Feldstein, Harvey Galper, Mart Gertler, Malcolm Gillis, Ronald E. Grieson, Robert E. Hall, Arnold C. Harberger, Glenn Harrison, Robert H. Haveman, Charles R. Hulten, Dale W. Jorgenson, Michael Kaufman, Wouter Keller, Jon Kesselman, Nicholas Kiefer, Mark Killingsworth, Larry Kimbell, Mervyn A. King, Laurence Kotlikoff, Arthur B. Laffer, Charles McLure, Peter Mieszkowski, Hudson Milner, Franco Modigliani, John R. Piggot, Sherman Robinson, Harvey S. Rosen, Herbert Scarf, Jaime Serra-Puche, Joel Slemrod, Nicholas H. Stern, Wayne Thirsk, and Norman B. Ture.

Successive versions of this manuscript were typed by Althea Chaballa and Patrick Higgins. The long hours and outstanding work that they gave to this project have made our tasks much easier.