



National
Bureau of
Economic
Research

Fiscal Federalism: Quantitative Studies

Edited by
Harvey S. Rosen

This Page Intentionally Left Blank

Fiscal Federalism



**A National Bureau
of Economic Research
Project Report**

Fiscal Federalism: Quantitative Studies

Edited by **Harvey S. Rosen**



The University of Chicago Press

Chicago and London

Harvey S. Rosen is professor of economics at Princeton University. He is the editor of *Studies in State and Local Public Finance* (1986), also published by the University of Chicago Press in association with the National Bureau of Economic Research.

The University of Chicago Press, Chicago 60637
The University of Chicago Press, Ltd., London
© 1988 by The National Bureau of Economic Research
All rights reserved. Published 1988
Printed in the United States of America
97 96 95 94 93 92 91 90 89 88 5 4 3 2 1

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Fiscal federalism : quantitative studies / edited by Harvey S. Rosen.
p. cm. — (A National Bureau of Economic Research project report)
"Papers presented at a conference held at Halloran House in New York City, 10–11 April 1987"—P.
Bibliography: p.
Includes index.
ISBN 0-226-72619-3
1. Intergovernmental fiscal relations—United States—Congresses.
I. Rosen, Harvey S. II. National Bureau of Economic Research.
III. Series.
HJ275.F558 1988 87-28726
336.1'85—dc19 CIP

National Bureau of Economic Research

Officers

Richard N. Rosett, *chairman*
George T. Conklin, Jr., *vice-chairman*
Martin Feldstein, *president and chief executive officer*

Geoffrey Carliner, *executive director*
Charles A. Walworth, *treasurer*
Sam Parker, *director of finance and administration*

Directors at Large

Moses Abramovitz
John H. Biggs
Andrew Brimmer
Carl F. Christ
George T. Conklin, Jr.
Kathleen B. Cooper
Jean A. Crockett
George C. Eads

Morton Ehrlich
Martin Feldstein
Edward L. Ginzton
David L. Grove
George Hatsopoulos
Franklin A. Lindsay
Paul W. McCracken
Geoffrey H. Moore
Michael H. Moskow

James J. O'Leary
Robert T. Parry
Peter G. Peterson
Robert V. Roosa
Richard N. Rosett
Bert Seidman
Eli Shapiro
Donald S. Wasserman

Directors by University Appointment

Charles H. Berry, *Princeton*
James H. Duesenberry, *Harvard*
Ann F. Friedlaender, *Massachusetts Institute of Technology*
Jonathan Hughes, *Northwestern*
J. C. LaForce, *California, Los Angeles*
Marjorie McElroy, *Duke*
Merton J. Peck, *Yale*

James L. Pierce, *California, Berkeley*
Andrew Postlewaite, *Pennsylvania*
Nathan Rosenberg, *Stanford*
Harold Shapiro, *Michigan*
James Simler, *Minnesota*
William S. Vickrey, *Columbia*
Burton A. Weisbrod, *Wisconsin*
Arnold Zellner, *Chicago*

Directors by Appointment of Other Organizations

Richard Easterlin, *Economic History Association*
Edgar Fiedler, *National Association of Business Economists*
Robert S. Hamada, *American Finance Association*
Robert C. Holland, *Committee for Economic Development*
James Houck, *American Agricultural Economics Association*
David Kendrick, *American Economic Association*

Rudolph A. Oswald, *American Federation of Labor and Congress of Industrial Organizations*
Douglas D. Purvis, *Canadian Economics Association*
Albert T. Sommers, *The Conference Board*
Dudley Wallace, *American Statistical Association*
Charles A. Walworth, *American Institute of Certified Public Accountants*

Directors Emeriti

Emilio G. Collado
Solomon Fabricant
Frank W. Fetter

Thomas D. Flynn
Gottfried Haberler

George B. Roberts
Willard L. Thorp

Relation of the Directors to the Work and Publications of the National Bureau of Economic Research

1. The object of the National Bureau of Economic Research is to ascertain and to present to the public important economic facts and their interpretation in a scientific and impartial manner. The Board of Directors is charged with the responsibility of ensuring that the work of the National Bureau is carried on in strict conformity with this object.

2. The President of the National Bureau shall submit to the Board of Directors, or to its Executive Committee, for their formal adoption all specific proposals for research to be instituted.

3. No research report shall be published by the National Bureau until the President has sent each member of the Board a notice that a manuscript is recommended for publication and that in the President's opinion it is suitable for publication in accordance with the principles of the National Bureau. Such notification will include an abstract or summary of the manuscript's content and a response form for use by those Directors who desire a copy of the manuscript for review. Each manuscript shall contain a summary drawing attention to the nature and treatment of the problem studied, the character of the data and their utilization in the report, and the main conclusions reached.

4. For each manuscript so submitted, a special committee of the Directors (including Directors Emeriti) shall be appointed by majority agreement of the President and Vice Presidents (or by the Executive Committee in case of inability to decide on the part of the President and Vice Presidents), consisting of three Directors selected as nearly as may be one from each general division of the Board. The names of the special manuscript committee shall be stated to each Director when notice of the proposed publication is submitted to him. It shall be the duty of each member of the special manuscript committee to read the manuscript. If each member of the manuscript committee signifies his approval within thirty days of the transmittal of the manuscript, the report may be published. If at the end of that period any member of the manuscript committee withholds his approval, the President shall then notify each member of the Board, requesting approval or disapproval of publication, and thirty days additional shall be granted for this purpose. The manuscript shall then not be published unless at least a majority of the entire Board who shall have voted on the proposal within the time fixed for the receipt of votes shall have approved.

5. No manuscript may be published, though approved by each member of the special manuscript committee, until forty-five days have elapsed from the transmittal of the report in manuscript form. The interval is allowed for the receipt of any memorandum of dissent or reservation, together with a brief statement of his reasons, that any member may wish to express; and such memorandum of dissent or reservation shall be published with the manuscript if he so desires. Publication does not, however, imply that each member of the Board has read the manuscript, or that either members of the Board in general or the special committee have passed on its validity in every detail.

6. Publications of the National Bureau issued for informational purposes concerning the work of the Bureau and its staff, or issued to inform the public of activities of Bureau staff, and volumes issued as a result of various conferences involving the National Bureau shall contain a specific disclaimer noting that such publication has not passed through the normal review procedures required in this resolution. The Executive Committee of the Board is charged with review of all such publications from time to time to ensure that they do not take on the character of formal research reports of the National Bureau, requiring formal Board approval.

7. Unless otherwise determined by the Board or exempted by the terms of paragraph 6, a copy of this resolution shall be printed in each National Bureau publication.

(Resolution adopted October 25, 1926, as revised through September 30, 1974)

Contents

	Acknowledgments	ix
	Introduction	1
	Harvey S. Rosen	
1.	Decentralization in the Public Sector: An Empirical Study of State and Local Government	5
	John Joseph Wallis and Wallace E. Oates <i>Comment: James R. Hines, Jr.</i>	
2.	Federal Assistance and Local Services in the United States: The Evolution of a New Federalist Fiscal Order	33
	Robert P. Inman <i>Comment: Thomas Romer</i>	
3.	The Effects of Jurisdiction Types and Numbers on Local Public Finance	79
	Jeffrey S. Zax <i>Comment: Alan J. Auerbach</i>	
4.	Tax Deductibility and Municipal Budget Structure	107
	Douglas Holtz-Eakin and Harvey S. Rosen <i>Comment: Ronald C. Fisher</i>	
5.	Federal Deductibility of State and Local Taxes: A Test of Public Choice by Representative Government	137
	Lawrence B. Lindsey <i>Comment: Daniel Feenberg</i>	

6.	Eliminating State and Local Tax Deductibility: A General Equilibrium Model of Revenue Effects	177
	George R. Zodrow	
	<i>Comment:</i> Don Fullerton	
7.	Income Originating in the State and Local Sector	215
	Charles R. Hulten and Robert M. Schwab	
	<i>Comment:</i> Helen F. Ladd	
	Contributors	255
	Index	257