OFFICERS

W. LEONARD CRUM, Chairman
N. I. STONE, President
C. REINOLD NOYES, Vice-President
SHEPARD MORGAN, Treasurer
W. J. CARSON, Executive Director
MARTHA ANDERSON, Editor

DIRECTORS AT LARGE

CHESTER I. BARNARD, President,
New Jersey Bell Telephone Company
DAVID FRIDAY, Consulting Economist
OSWALD W. KNAUTH, President,
Associated Dry Goods Corporation
HARRY W. LAIDLER, Executive Director,
League for Industrial Democracy
SHEPARD MORGAN, Vice-President, Chase National Bank
GEORGE E. ROBERTS, Economic Adviser, National City Bank
BEARDSLEY RUMIL, Treasurer, R. H. Macy and Company
STANLEY RUTTENBERG, Congress of Industrial Organizations
HARRY SCHERMAN, President, Book-of-the-Month Club
GEORGE SOULE, Director, The Labor Bureau, Inc.
N. I. STONE, Consulting Economist
Haberler, Gottfried, 1900--

Consumer instalment credit and economic fluctuations, by Gottfried Haberler ... (New York, National bureau of economic research, 1942)

xix p., 1 l., 239 p. incl. tables, diagrs. 22 cm. (Half-title: Financial research program of the National bureau of economic research. Studies in consumer instalment financing: no. 9)

Series title in part on t.p.

1. Instalment plan. 2. Business cycles. 3. Title.

Library of Congress HF566.H24

MATERIAL SUBMITTED BY PUBLISHER.
DIRECTORS BY UNIVERSITY APPOINTMENT

E. W. Bakke, Yale
C. C. Balderston, Pennsylvania
W. Leonard Crum, Harvard
E. E. Day, Cornell

Guy Stanton Ford, Minnesota
H. M. Groves, Wisconsin
Wesley C. Mitchell, Columbia
Theodore O. Yntema, Chicago
E. W. Zimmermann, North Carolina

DIRECTORS APPOINTED BY OTHER ORGANIZATIONS

Spencer Miller, Jr., American Federation of Labor
C. Reinold Noyes, American Economic Association
Winfield W. Riefler, American Statistical Association

RESEARCH STAFF

Wesley C. Mitchell, Director

Moses Abramovitz
Arthur F. Burns
Solomon Fabricant
Milton Friedman
Thor Hultgren
Simon Kuznets

Frederick R. Macaulay
Frederick C. Mills
Geoffrey H. Moore
Raymond J. Saulnier
Leo Wolman
Ralph A. Young
Relation of the Directors to the Work of the National Bureau of Economic Research

1. The object of the National Bureau of Economic Research is to ascertain and to present to the public important economic facts and their interpretation in a scientific and impartial manner. The Board of Directors is charged with the responsibility of ensuring that the work of the Bureau is carried on in strict conformity with this object.

2. To this end the Board of Directors shall appoint one or more Directors of Research.

3. The Director or Directors of Research shall submit to the members of the Board, or to its Executive Committee, for their formal adoption, all specific proposals concerning researches to be instituted.

4. No report shall be published until the Director or Directors of Research shall have submitted to the Board a summary drawing attention to the character of the data and their utilization in the report, the nature and treatment of the problems involved, the main conclusions and such other information as in their opinion would serve to determine the suitability of the report for publication in accordance with the principles of the Bureau.

5. A copy of any manuscript proposed for publication shall also be submitted to each member of the Board. For each manuscript to be so submitted a special committee shall be appointed by the President, or at his designation by the Executive Director, consisting of three Directors selected as nearly as may be one from each general division of the Board. The names of the special manuscript committee shall be stated to each Director when the summary and report described in paragraph (4) are sent him. It shall be the duty of each member of the committee to read the manuscript. If each member of the special committee signifies his approval within thirty days, the manuscript may be published. If each member of the special committee has not signified his approval within thirty days of the transmittal of the report and manuscript, the Director of Research shall then notify each member of the Board, requesting approval or disapproval of publication, and thirty additional days shall be granted for this purpose. The manuscript shall then not be published unless at least a majority of the entire Board and a two-thirds majority of those members of the Board who shall have voted on the proposal within the time fixed for the receipt of votes on the publication proposed shall have approved.

6. No manuscript may be published, though approved by each member of the special committee, until forty-five days have elapsed from the transmittal of the summary and report. The interval is allowed for the receipt of any memorandum of dissent or reservation, together with a brief statement of his reasons, that any member may wish to express; and such memorandum of dissent or reservation shall be published with the manuscript if he so desires. Publication does not, however, imply that each member of the Board has read the manuscript, or that either members of the Board in general, or of the special committee, have passed upon its validity in every detail.

7. A copy of this resolution shall, unless otherwise determined by the Board, be printed in each copy of every National Bureau book.

(Resolution adopted October 25, 1926, and revised February 6, 1933 and February 24, 1941)
Financial Research Program: Committee

In the conduct of this and other studies under its program of research in finance the National Bureau of Economic Research has benefited from the advice and guidance of its Committee on Research in Finance. The functions of this committee are to review and supervise the specific research plans of the staff of the Financial Research Program. The membership includes:

**Winfield W. Riefler**, Chairman—Institute for Advanced Study

**Ralph A. Young**, Secretary—University of Pennsylvania; Director, Financial Research Program

**William J. Carson**—University of Pennsylvania; Executive Director, National Bureau of Economic Research

**Leon Fraser**—President, First National Bank of the City of New York

**David Friday**—Consulting Economist; Director, National Bureau of Economic Research

**E. A. Goldenweiser**—Director, Division of Research and Statistics, Board of Governors of the Federal Reserve System

**F. Cyril James**—Principal and Vice-Chancellor, McGill University

**Walter L. Mitchell, Jr.**—Director of Surveys, Research and Statistical Division, Dun and Bradstreet, Inc.

**Wesley C. Mitchell**—Columbia University; Director of Research, National Bureau of Economic Research

**Shepard Morgan**—Vice-President, Chase National Bank; Treasurer, National Bureau of Economic Research

**Raymond J. Saulnier**—Barnard College, Columbia University; Research Staff, National Bureau of Economic Research

**Woodlief Thomas**—Assistant Director, Division of Research and Statistics, Board of Governors of the Federal Reserve System

**Donald S. Thompson**—Chief, Division of Research and Statistics, Federal Deposit Insurance Corporation

**Robert B. Warren**—Institute for Advanced Study

**John H. Williams**—Littauer School, Harvard University; Vice-President, Federal Reserve Bank of New York

**Leo Wolman**—Columbia University; Research Staff, National Bureau of Economic Research

**Donald Woodward**—Research Assistant to the President, Mutual Life Insurance Company
Consumer Instalment Credit and Economic Fluctuations

BY GOTTFRIED HABERLER

REPRINTED WITH THE PERMISSION OF
NATIONAL BUREAU OF ECONOMIC RESEARCH, NEW YORK

UNIVERSITY MICROFILMS, INC.
A SUBSIDIARY OF XEROX CORPORATION
ANN ARBOR, MICHIGAN
1966

Financial Research Program
Studies in Consumer Instalment Financing

NATIONAL BUREAU OF ECONOMIC RESEARCH
Preface

The present volume is the ninth of the studies in consumer instalment financing prepared under the Financial Research Program of the National Bureau of Economic Research. Other studies deal with the types of institutions engaged in consumer instalment lending and the economic and legal conditions affecting their activities; with estimates of the volume of consumer instalment credit during the period 1929-38; with the statistical pattern of consumer debt as of 1935-36; and with statistical tests of the relation of borrower characteristics and contract terms to credit risk. The entire series has been prepared as one phase of a broad program of financial research, launched in 1938 under grants from the Association of Reserve City Bankers and the Rockefeller Foundation.

The present volume was first projected as the capstone study of the consumer instalment credit investigation, and therefore its preparation was not undertaken until the collection and analysis of basic materials for other studies were well advanced. In February 1939 Gottfried Haberler, on leave of absence from Harvard University, joined the financial research staff to initiate the inquiry. Until October he gave his full time to the work, and thereafter carried his study to completion along with the performance of his regular university duties. During the period in which he was a full-time member of our staff he collaborated also in directing the collection and analysis of material for the other studies. His own needs for data gave his research colleagues many leads for inquiry, and his suggestions for study stimulated much significant analysis that otherwise might have been overlooked.
Despite the efforts that were made to provide an adequate body of factual material for Dr. Haberler's use, there remained many gaps in data that could not be filled. It was not feasible, for example, except for a few series, to carry our monthly estimates of the volume of instalment credit farther back than 1929, and therefore he was handicapped in his study by the shortness of the time period for which credit series were available. Also, it was not possible to develop time series showing the specific uses which consumers have made of instalment credit funds; such series might have facilitated comparisons of fluctuations in instalment credit and the production of particular consumer goods. Nor could comprehensive series of instalment credit terms and charges be provided over any extended period of time. These gaps in the available data indicate but a few of the obstacles to inquiry in this field. Dr. Haberler has taken the facts that we were able to assemble and, as the only feasible method of approach, has subjected them to theoretical analysis based on carefully and critically selected hypotheses. To this task, directed toward the questions of how consumer instalment credit affects economic fluctuations and whether it tends to accentuate economic instability, he has brought a rich knowledge of business cycle theories and of general economics.

The publication of this study is especially timely. On August 9, 1941, the President, with a view to restraining instalment credit during the period of national emergency, issued an Executive Order authorizing the Board of Governors of the Federal Reserve System to regulate the terms and conditions under which such credit shall be extended to consumers. Shortly afterward the Board issued a comprehensive regulation, known as Regulation W and effective as of September 1, 1941, with the threefold objective of: checking demand for consumer goods manufactured from materials essential to national defense; restraining the inflationary influence of instalment credit during the period of the emergency; and developing a backlog of consumer credit demand for the post-emergency period. This regulation rep-
represents the first concrete social recognition of the role of instalment credit in economic fluctuations, and therefore it has a far-reaching significance in addition to its immediate objectives. Dr. Haberler's analysis should be extremely helpful to those who desire to obtain specific background for evaluating the possible effectiveness of this regulation.

RALPH A. YOUNG

Director, Financial Research Program

February 1942
Author’s Acknowledgments

I am greatly indebted to many scholars for helpful suggestions and constructive criticism of the manuscript in various stages. Several specific instances are mentioned in footnotes throughout the book. A great debt of gratitude is due to members of the research staff of the National Bureau of Economic Research. Moses Abramovitz, Simon Kuznets, and especially Arthur F. Burns and W. C. Mitchell contributed many useful suggestions. Raymond J. Saulnier worked carefully through large parts of the manuscript and uncovered many slips. Winfield W. Riefler’s critical sense, David Durand’s statistical resourcefulness and Duncan McC. Holthausen’s knowledge of statistical facts saved me from many pitfalls and misinterpretations of the material. Bonnar Brown, Seymour E. Harris, Albert G. Hart, M. R. Neifeld, Hans Neisser, C. Reinold Noyes, Rolf Nugent, W. C. Plummer and Beardsley Ruml read the manuscript and offered constructive criticism. Helpful suggestions on various aspects of the subject were received also from Dorothy S. Brady, Fred V. Chew, William T. Foster, Arthur W. Newton and Joseph L. Snider. Elizabeth Todd was not only in complete charge of the editorial work but rewrote many passages and helped to rearrange the material in a logical order. Without her patient work the book would be longer but less readable.

My greatest obligation, however, is due to Ralph A. Young, Director of the Financial Research Program of the National Bureau of Economic Research. Without his unremitting encouragement, coordinating effort, unfailing counsel and great knowledge of persons, facts and figures in all fields of consumer instalment credit, this book could not have been written. When listening patiently to unending—partly un-
answerable—queries concerning the availability (or more frequently unavailability) of statistical material and other factual evidence, and the validity of possible hypotheses, he must sometimes have felt like the sage in the proverb: one theorist can ask more questions than a hundred experts can possibly answer.

In spite of generous help the author must assume full responsibility for all shortcomings of the book; these may be due sometimes to his holding out against, sometimes to his giving in to, friendly criticism.

An effort has been made to restrict the use of highly technical terms and to make the argument everywhere understandable for the non-technical reader, although this has made many passages longer and less elegant than they might otherwise be. Some technical material has been relegated to the Appendices.

The manuscript was completed in the Autumn of 1941, but the passages and data in Chapter 6 and Appendix C concerning the new regulation of instalment credit, initiated by the President's Executive Order of August 9, 1941, have been brought up to date as of April 1942.

Gottfried Haberler
Harvard University
Table of Contents

**Preface**  ix

**Author’s Acknowledgments**  xii

**List of Tables**  xvii

**List of Charts**  xviii

**Summary**  1

1. **Types and Institutions of Instalment Credit**  (18-29)
   Meaning of Consumer Instalment Credit  18
   Types and Agencies of Consumer Instalment Credit  22

2. **Ways in Which Instalment Credit May Influence Economic Stability**  (30-52)
   Changes in Aggregate Expenditure  30
   *The Supply Situation*  33
   *The Demand Situation*  39
   Shifts in Relative Demand for Particular Commodities  50

3. **Measurement of Instalment Credit for Cyclical Analysis**  (53-80)
   Typical Interrelationships of the Various Measures  54
   Cyclical Behavior of the Various Measures  62
   Economic Significance of the Various Magnitudes  69

4. **Causes of Instalment Credit Fluctuations**  (81-115)
   Trend Factors  82
   Cyclical Factors  84
   *Analysis of Supply*  89
   *Analysis of Demand*  98
   Concluding Remarks  114
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

## 5. ECONOMIC CONSEQUENCES OF INSTALMENT CREDIT FLUCTUATIONS (116-57)
- Effects of a Structural Expansion 117
- Effects of a Cessation or Curtailment of Structural Growth 122
- Effects of Structural Credit Expansion on Particular Industries 127
- Effects of Cyclical Fluctuations 132
- Comparative Quantitative Importance 145

## 6. THE PROBLEM OF CONTROL OF INSTALMENT CREDIT (158-75)
- Nature of the Problem 158
- Methods of Credit Control 161
- Purpose and Effectiveness of Control 165

### APPENDIX A—FURTHER OBSERVATIONS ON THE RELATIONS BETWEEN CONSUMER SAVING AND INSTALMENT CREDIT (179-94)
- The Concepts of Saving and Investment 179
- Possible Effects of Instalment Credit on Consumer Saving 186
- Supplementary Data on Consumer Saving 189

### APPENDIX B—A MATHEMATICAL ANALYSIS OF THE RELATIONSHIP OF NEW CREDITS, TOTAL CREDITS OUTSTANDING AND NET CREDIT CHANGE—by Paul A. Samuelson (197-205)

### APPENDIX C—TEXTS OF DOCUMENTS REGARDING GOVERNMENT REGULATION OF CONSUMER INSTALMENT CREDIT (209-32)
- Executive Order No. 8843 209
- Foreword 215
- Regulation W 215
- Supplement to Regulation W 229
- Appendix to Regulation W 232

### INDEX 233
List of Tables

1. Principal Sources of Funds of Instalment Credit Agencies in Various Years During 1929-40, in Percent of Total Assets 36-37
2. Timing and Amplitude of Movements in End-of-Month Outstandings in Consumer Instalment Credit, 1929-40 68
3. Monthly Instalment Payments Required on Sample Automobile and Refrigerator Contracts, Under Different Interest Rates 101
4. Monthly Instalment Payments Required on an Original Unpaid Balance of $100, Under Different Interest Rates and Contract Lengths 102
5. Volume of Life Insurance Policy Loans, Year-End Outstandings and Annual Change in Outstandings, 1930-36 111
6. Annual Net Change in Consumer Instalment Credit in Relation to Other Magnitudes, 1929-40 146-48

A-1. Debt and Savings Data on Non-Relief Families that Increased Their Instalment Debt During the Year 1935-36, by Income Level 191
A-2. Debt and Savings Data on Non-Relief Families that Decreased Their Instalment Debt During the Year 1935-36, by Income Level 192
A-3. Percentage Distribution of Non-Relief Families Reporting a Net Surplus, a Net Deficit or No Change in Assets and Liabilities, During the Year 1935-36, by Income Level 193
List of Charts

I. Monthly New Credits, Repayments and Net Credit Change, and End-of-Month Total Outstandings, for Two Types of Retail Establishments, 1926-40 56

II. Monthly New Credits, Repayments and Net Credit Change, and End-of-Month Total Outstandings, for Two Types of Cash-Lending Institutions, 1929-40 57

III. Monthly New Credits Extended by Automobile Dealers, 1932-40, and End-of-Month Total Outstandings Computed on the Basis of Varying Contract Lengths 61

IV. Monthly New Credits, Repayments and Net Credit Change, and End-of-Month Total Outstandings, for Five Types of Retail Establishments Combined, 1929-40 65

V. Monthly Net Credit Change and End-of-Month Total Outstandings for Four Types of Cash-Lending Institutions Combined, 1929-40 66

VI. End-of-Month Total Outstandings in Consumer Instalment Credit, 1929-40 67

VII. Hypothetical End-of-Month Total Outstandings in Consumer Instalment Credit, and Corresponding Monthly Net Credit Change 74

VIII. Indices of Finance and Insurance Charges Applicable in Albany, N. Y., to a $600 New Chevrolet with 33½ Percent Down Payment and 12-Month Contract, 1924-41 91

IX. Average Duration of Instalment Indebtedness to Five Types of Retail Establishments, 1928-40 93

X. Substandard Automobile and Diversified Paper Held by Reporting Sales Finance Companies, in Percent of Annual Volume, 1925-40 94

XI. Annual Instalment Sales in Percent of Annual Total Sales of Each of Five Types of Retail Establishments, 1925-40 137

XII. Indices of Annual Instalment and Cash Sales of New Passenger Automobiles, 1928-40 139

XIII. Indices of Monthly Automobile and Furniture Production (1935-39 average = 100) and of Monthly New Credits Extended by Automobile and Furniture Dealers (1935-38 average = 100), 1926-40 156
LIST OF CHARTS

XIV. Estimated Series on Instalment Financing of New Passenger Automobiles, 1940-41, and Corresponding Series under the Assumed Operation of Regulation W 168

B-I. The "Straight Line" and "Sinking Fund" Amortization Functions 199

B-II. Ideal Relationship of New Credits, Total Outstanding Credit and Net Credit Change 204