Money in Historical Perspective
A National Bureau of Economic Research Monograph
ANNA J. SCHWARTZ is research associate emerita with the National Bureau of Economic Research. MICHAEL D. BORDO is professor of economics at the University of South Carolina and a research associate at the National Bureau of Economic Research. MILTON FRIEDMAN is a senior research fellow at the Hoover Institution.
National Bureau of Economic Research

Officers
Richard N. Rosett, chairman
George T. Conklin, Jr., vice-chairman
Martin Feldstein, president
Geoffrey Carliner, executive director
Charles A. Walworth, treasurer
Sam Parker, director of finance and administration

Directors at Large
Moses Abramovitz                        David L. Grove                        James J. O'Leary
Andrew Brimmer                           George Hatsopoulos                     Robert T. Parry
Carl F. Christ                            Walter W. Heller                      Peter G. Peterson
George T. Conklin, Jr.                   Saul B. Klaman                         Robert V. Roosa
Jean A. Crockett                         Franklin A. Lindsay                   Richard N. Rosett
Morton Ehrlich                            Roy E. Moor                           Bert Seidman
Martin Feldstein                         Geoffrey H. Moore                     Eli Shapiro
Edward L. Ginzton                        Michael H. Moskow                      Donald S. Wasserman

Directors by University Appointment
Charles H. Berry, Princeton
James Duesenberry, Harvard
Ann F. Friedlaender, Massachusetts Institute of Technology
Jonathan Hughes, Northwestern
J. C. LaForce, California, Los Angeles
Marjorie McElroy, Duke
Merton J. Peck, Yale

Directors by Appointment of Other Organizations
Richard Easterlin, Economic History Association
Edgar Fiedler, National Association of Business Economists
Robert S. Hamada, American Finance Association
Robert C. Holland, Committee for Economic Development
James Houck, American Agricultural Economics Association
David Kendrick, American Economic Association
Rudolph A. Oswald, American Federation of Labor and Congress of Industrial Organizations
Douglas D. Purvis, Canadian Economics Association
Albert T. Sommers, The Conference Board
Dudley Wallace, American Statistical Association
Charles A. Walworth, American Institute of Certified Public Accountants

Directors Emeriti
Arthur F. Burns                           Frank W. Fetter                        George B. Roberts
Emilio G. Collado                         Thomas D. Flynn                         Willard L. Thorp
Solomon Fabricant                         Gottfried Haberler
Relation of the Directors to the
Work and Publications of the
National Bureau of Economic Research

1. The object of the National Bureau of Economic Research is to ascertain and to
present to the public important economic facts and their interpretation in a scientific and
impartial manner. The Board of Directors is charged with the responsibility of ensuring
that the work of the National Bureau is carried on in strict conformity with this object.

2. The President of the National Bureau shall submit to the Board of Directors, or to
its Executive Committee, for their formal adoption all specific proposals for research to
be instituted.

3. No research report shall be published by the National Bureau until the President has
sent each member of the Board a notice that a manuscript is recommended for publication
and that in the President’s opinion it is suitable for publication in accordance with the
principles of the National Bureau. Such notification will include an abstract or summary
of the manuscript’s content and a response form for use by those Directors who desire a
copy of the manuscript for review. Each manuscript shall contain a summary drawing
attention to the nature and treatment of the problem studied, the character of the data
and their utilization in the report, and the main conclusions reached.

4. For each manuscript so submitted, a special committee of the Directors (including
Directors Emeriti) shall be appointed by majority agreement of the President and Vice
Presidents (or by the Executive Committee in case of inability to decide on the part of the
President and Vice Presidents), consisting of three Directors selected as nearly as may be one
from each general division of the Board. The names of the special manuscript committee
shall be stated to each Director when notice of the proposed publication is submitted to
him. It shall be the duty of each member of the special manuscript committee to read the
manuscript. If each member of the manuscript committee signifies his approval within
thirty days of the transmittal of the manuscript, the report may be published. If at the end
of that period any member of the manuscript committee withholds his approval, the Pres-
ident shall then notify each member of the Board, requesting approval or disapproval of
publication, and thirty days additional shall be granted for this purpose. The manuscript
shall then not be published unless at least a majority of the entire Board who shall have
voted on the proposal within the time fixed for the receipt of votes shall have approved.

5. No manuscript may be published, though approved by each member of the special
manuscript committee, until forty-five days have elapsed from the transmittal of the re-
port in manuscript form. The interval is allowed for the receipt of any memorandum of
dissent or reservation, together with a brief statement of his reasons, that any member
may wish to express; and such memorandum of dissent or reservation shall be published
with the manuscript if he so desires. Publication does not, however, imply that each
member of the Board has read the manuscript, or that either members of the Board in
general or the special committee have passed on its validity in every detail.

6. Publications of the National Bureau issued for informational purposes concerning
the work of the Bureau and its staff, or issued to inform the public of activities of Bureau
staff, and volumes issued as a result of various conferences involving the National Bureau
shall contain a specific disclaimer noting that such publication has not passed through the
normal review procedures required in this resolution. The Executive Committee of the
Board is charged with review of all such publications from time to time to ensure that
they do not take on the character of formal research reports of the National Bureau,
requiring formal Board approval.

7. Unless otherwise determined by the Board or exempted by the terms of paragraph
6, a copy of this resolution shall be printed in each National Bureau publication.

(Resolution adopted October 25, 1926, as revised through September 30, 1974)
Contents

Preface ix
Acknowledgments xi
Introduction by Michael D. Bordo and Milton Friedman xiii

I. Money and Banking in Historical Perspective

   with Milton Friedman

II. Monetary Policy

   with Phillip Cagan
   with Phillip Cagan

   with Michael D. Bordo

    with Michael D. Bordo


    with Milton Friedman

III. INTERNATIONAL MONETARY ARRANGEMENTS


Appendix: Publications of Anna J. Schwartz 407
References 413
Index 429
It is a pleasure to issue this collection of articles by Anna Jacobson Schwartz. For more than five decades, Anna has contributed to our understanding of the economy. Her studies of monetary policy, banking, and the gold standard have added significantly to our knowledge of these important topics. It is indeed fortunate for NBER that she has been associated with us since 1941.

These articles were presented to Anna at a conference held in her honor in New York City on October 6, 1987. They maintain the high level of scholarship all Bureau publications hope to achieve. In one important respect, however, some of these articles depart from the Bureau's firm tradition of avoiding policy recommendations. Other NBER publications must confine themselves to analyzing the effects of policies and strictly eschew recommending one course of action over another. Some of the papers in this volume were originally written for other purposes and do take policy positions. Rather than omit any of these papers, we decided instead to make an exception to the Bureau's rule.

I would like to thank Michael D. Bordo and Milton Friedman for selecting these articles and for organizing the conference honoring Anna. Without their initiative and hard work, this volume would not have been published. Mark Fitz-Patrick of NBER gave valuable guidance in preparing the manuscript and able research assistance was provided by Ivan Marcotte. I would also like to thank the Alex C. Walker Educational and Charitable Foundation and the Earhart Foundation for their generous financial support of the conference and the publication.

Martin Feldstein
This Page Intentionally Left Blank
Acknowledgments

The author and the University of Chicago Press wish to thank the original publishers of the essays in this volume for permission to reprint them and to thank Michael Bordo, Phillip Cagan, and Milton Friedman for permission to reprint the essays that they coauthored.


Chapter 8. "Has the Growth of Money Substitutes Hindered Monetary Policy?" by Phillip Cagan and Anna J. Schwartz, Journal of Money, Credit, and Banking (May 1975), 137–159. Copyright 1975 by Ohio State University Press. Reprinted by permission of the Ohio State University Press. All rights reserved.


Introduction
Michael D. Bordo and Milton Friedman

Background

Our collaboration with Anna Jacobson Schwartz has been a rare and wonderful experience—spanning more than three decades for Friedman, over a decade for Bordo.

As an economic historian and monetary economist, Anna is dedicated to accuracy, precision, and thoroughness—qualities present even in the earliest of her papers reprinted in this volume, a fascinating account of the beginning of competitive banking in Philadelphia (Chapter 1). That dedication, repeatedly demonstrated during the course of our collaboration, has guaranteed a solid scholarly foundation for our joint publications.

As a friend and colleague, Anna is a thoughtful, considerate, uniformly helpful, and warm human being with firm principles and wide-ranging tolerance—as demonstrated by the remarkable fact that we cannot recall any episode involving acrimony in our many years of collaboration. Disagreement, frank criticism, discussion, strongly held views, yes; acrimony, personal recrimination, pettiness, never. That has been the common experience of the several persons of widely different temperaments and personalities who have been privileged to collaborate with her closely at one time or another.

Born Anna Jacobson on November 11, 1915, in New York City, Anna received a B.A. from Barnard College in 1934, an M.A. and Ph.D.
from Columbia University in 1936 and 1964, respectively. Married to Isaac Schwartz in 1936, she did not let her marriage, or the loving care she and Isaac lavished on their four children, all now grown and living independently, interfere with the pursuit of a demanding professional career, devoted primarily to research, though with occasional forays into teaching (at Brooklyn College 1952, Baruch College 1959–60, Hunter College 1967–68, and New York University 1969–70).

A year at the U.S. Department of Agriculture in 1936 was followed by five years at Columbia University’s Social Science Research Council, where she collaborated with A. D. Gayer and W. W. Rostow on a study of *The Growth and Fluctuation of the British Economy, 1790–1850*, published in 1953 in two volumes under that title. Although the study has become something of a classic in British economic history, and was republished in a second edition in 1975, Anna’s later work led her to revise her views on the role of monetary forces in British economic history, as she explains in a new preface to the second edition. Anna’s interest in and profound understanding of British institutions and British economic history have continued ever since. Two examples are the papers on secular price change and on British interest rates that are reprinted in Chapters 3 and 5 of this book. So also, on a larger scale, is her contribution to *Monetary Trends in the United States and the United Kingdom*, authored jointly with Friedman (1982).

In 1941, Anna joined the National Bureau of Economic Research and has remained with the bureau ever since, becoming an emeritus research associate in 1985.

In 1981–82, Anna performed a major public service when she served as staff director of the U.S. Gold Commission, in which capacity she wrote volume 1 of the Report of the Gold Commission. Once again, her scientific and personal qualities stood her in good stead. Despite the controversy surrounding the role of gold, and the highly political nature of the commission, Anna was able to work effectively and congenially with all the members of the commission to gain their respect and trust and to produce a report that will long serve as an invaluable source document for anyone interested in the gold standard. Her interest in the gold standard also led to an NBER conference that she helped to organize in 1982, and her “Introduction” to the resulting volume, *A Retrospective on the Classical Gold Standard, 1921–1931* (1984).

Anna has served at various times as a member of the Board of Editors of the *American Economic Review*, the *Journal of Money, Credit, and Banking*, and the *Journal of Monetary Economics*. She has been a regular participant in the Carnegie Rochester Conference Series on Public Policy and is a founding member of the Shadow Open Market
Committee. She is currently an Honorary Visiting Professor at the City University, London Business School, and will be president of the Western Economic Association in 1987–88.

Scholarly Work

Anna's major scholarly contributions are contained in the impressive body of work that she has written in collaboration with others: the book authored jointly with Gayer and Rostow; the series of books and articles that developed out of her long collaboration with Friedman on the National Bureau of Economic Research's money and business cycle project; her participation with Michael Darby, James Lothian, and others on a bureau study of the international transmission of inflation; her collaboration with Phillip Cagan on two articles on monetary policy; and a series of articles jointly authored with Bordo. (Appendix 1 contains a complete bibliography of her writings.)

Anna's contributions to these publications, as well as to those that she has authored alone or jointly with still other collaborators, are in four related areas: economic statistics, particularly monetary statistics; economic history, particularly monetary history; monetary theory and policy; and international monetary arrangements.

Statistics

The meticulous care she has expended on constructing basic statistical series is exemplified in the British share price index and commodity price index developed in the Gayer-Rostow study; in the monthly estimates of currency holdings in the United States from 1917 to 1944, published jointly with Emma Oliver (1947); in monthly estimates of gross dividends and interest payments by all corporations in the United States in the nineteenth century (1960); and, above all, in the massive collection of monetary and economic statistics for the United States and the United Kingdom contained in three Friedman-Schwartz books (Monetary History of the United States [1963], Monetary Statistics of the United States [1970], and Monetary Trends in the United States and the United Kingdom [1982]). Most of these series have by now become the common stock in trade of economists and historians.

Economic History

A characteristic feature of Anna's work on economic history is its strong quantitative base. Never a compiler of statistical data for its own sake, she has sought to test her interpretations of historical episodes not only with qualitative data but also, whenever possible, with numerical data. The interweaving of descriptive history, economic anal-
ysis, and quantitative evidence is characteristic of all her historical work, whether in the early Gayer-Rostow-Schwartz book on British history, the later Friedman-Schwartz *Monetary History*, or the articles reprinted here in Part I.

In the process, she has helped to construct a sound factual and analytical base for later students of related topics.

**Monetary Policy**

The historical evidence linking economic instability to erratic monetary growth, in turn largely a product of discretionary monetary management, has persuaded Anna of the importance of stable money and of the case for a constant money growth rule. As a consequence, she has devoted much attention in the past two decades to the study of monetary policy in the United States and other countries.

As a founding member of the Shadow Open Market Committee, organized by Allan Meltzer and Karl Brunner in 1971, Anna has been engaged in continuous critical evaluation of the Federal Reserve's performance.

This aspect of her work is reflected in Part II of this book, which reprints seven articles published over a seventeen-year span, dealing with a variety of basic issues of monetary policy.

**International Monetary Arrangements**

Anna's interest in international monetary arrangements began with her collaboration with Michael Darby, James Lothian, and others on a study of the international transmission of inflation, leading, as noted earlier, to her organizing with Bordo a conference on the Gold Standard, and culminating in her role as staff director of the U.S. Gold Commission. Her contribution to the Darby-Lothian study assessing post-war international monetary arrangements is reprinted in Part III as Chapter 14. Her reflections on the Gold Commission Report are summarized in Chapter 13. The final two articles reprinted in Part III provide a wide-ranging survey of the historical development of the gold standard (Chapter 15), and of the lessons that can be drawn from current policy from past attempts at constructing international monetary constitutions (Chapter 16).

**Conclusion**

These brief comments only scratch the surface of a body of work, impressive alike for its scope, its quality, and its adherence to the highest standards of scholarly care and objectivity. The reader who dips further into this collection of essays will enjoy contact with a
subtle mind of wide learning and rare judgment. Unfortunately, he or she will not be able to share our experience of close collaboration with a modest, unassuming, remarkable human being.

Michael D. Bordo
Milton Friedman
This Page Intentionally Left Blank