The Ownership of Tax-Exempt Securities, 1913–1953

GEORGE E. LENT

OCCASIONAL PAPER 47

NATIONAL BUREAU OF ECONOMIC RESEARCH, INC.
1955
NATIONAL BUREAU OF ECONOMIC RESEARCH

OFFICERS, 1954
Harry Scherman, President
Gottfried Haberler, Vice President
George B. Roberts, Treasurer
W. J. Carson, Executive Director

DIRECTORS AT LARGE
Donald R. Belcher, Assistant Director, Bureau of the Budget
Wallace J. Campbell, Director, Cooperative League of the USA
Solomon Fabricant, New York University
Albert J. Hettinger, Jr., Lazard Frères and Company
Oswald W. Knauth, Beaufort, South Carolina
H. W. Laidler, Executive Director, League for Industrial Democracy
Shepard Morgan, Norfolk, Connecticut
George B. Roberts, Vice President, The National City Bank of New York
Beardsley Ruml, New York City
Harry Scherman, Chairman, Book-of-the-Month Club
George Soule, Bennington College
N. I. Stone, Consulting Economist
J. Raymond Walsh, New York City
Leo Wolman, Columbia University
Theodore O. Yntema, Vice President—Finance, Ford Motor Company

DIRECTORS BY UNIVERSITY APPOINTMENT
E. Wight Bakke, Yale
Arthur F. Burns, Columbia
Melvin G. de Chazeau, Cornell
G. A. Elliott, Toronto
Frank W. Fetter, Northwestern
H. M. Groves, Wisconsin
Gottfried Haberler, Harvard
Clarence Heer, North Carolina
R. L. Kozelka, Minnesota
T. W. Schultz, Chicago
Jacob Viner, Princeton

DIRECTORS APPOINTED BY OTHER ORGANIZATIONS
Percival F. Brundage, American Institute of Accountants
S. H. Ruttenberg, Congress of Industrial Organizations
Murray Shields, American Management Association
Boris Shishkin, American Federation of Labor
W. Allen Wallis, American Statistical Association
Frederick V. Waugh, American Farm Economic Association
John H. Williams, American Economic Association
Harold F. Williamson, Economic History Association

RESEARCH STAFF
Solomon Fabricant, Director of Research
Geoffrey H. Moore, Associate Director of Research
Moses Abramovitz
Harold Barger
Morris A. Copeland
David Durand
Milton Friedman
Raymond W. Goldsmith
Millard Hastay
W. Braddock Hickman
F. F. Hill
Daniel M. Holland

Herbert B. Woolley
1. The object of the National Bureau of Economic Research is to ascertain and to present to the public important economic facts and their interpretation in a scientific and impartial manner. The Board of Directors is charged with the responsibility of ensuring that the work of the National Bureau is carried on in strict conformity with this object.

2. To this end the Board of Directors shall appoint one or more Directors of Research.

3. The Director or Directors of Research shall submit to the members of the Board, or to its Executive Committee, for their formal adoption, all specific proposals concerning researches to be instituted.

4. No report shall be published until the Director or Directors of Research shall have submitted to the Board a summary drawing attention to the character of the data and their utilization in the report, the nature and treatment of the problems involved, the main conclusions, and such other information as in their opinion would serve to determine the suitability of the report for publication in accordance with the principles of the National Bureau.

5. A copy of any manuscript proposed for publication shall also be submitted to each member of the Board. For each manuscript to be so submitted a special committee shall be appointed by the President, or at his designation by the Executive Director, consisting of three Directors selected as nearly as may be one from each general division of the Board. The names of the special manuscript committee shall be stated to each Director when the summary and report described in paragraph (4) are sent to him. It shall be the duty of each member of the committee to read the manuscript. If each member of the special committee signifies his approval within thirty days, the manuscript may be published. If each member of the special committee has not signified his approval within thirty days of the transmittal of the report and manuscript, the Director of Research shall then notify each member of the Board, requesting approval or disapproval of publication, and thirty additional days shall be granted for this purpose. The manuscript shall then not be published unless at least a majority of the entire Board and a two-thirds majority of those members of the Board who shall have voted on the proposal within the time fixed for the receipt of votes on the publication proposed shall have approved.

6. No manuscript may be published, though approved by each member of the special committee, until forty-five days have elapsed from the transmittal of the summary and report. The interval is allowed for the receipt of any memorandum of dissent or reservation, together with a brief statement of his reasons, that any member may wish to express; and such memorandum of dissent or reservation shall be published with the manuscript if he so desires. Publication does not, however, imply that each member of the Board has read the manuscript, or that either members of the Board in general, or of the special committee, have passed upon its validity in every detail.

7. A copy of this resolution shall, unless otherwise determined by the Board, be printed in each copy of every National Bureau book.

(Resolution adopted October 25, 1926 and revised February 6, 1933 and February 24, 1941)
Contents

INTRODUCTION  

The Volume of Wholly Tax-Exempt Securities  2  
Who Owns Wholly Tax-Exempt Securities?  2  
Trends in Individual Holdings  3  
The Interest Differential and Investment Policies  4

CHAPTER

1. A CONSPECTUS  6  
Gross Tax-Exempt Securities Outstanding,  
1913–1953  6  
Government Holdings of Tax-Exempt Obligations  11  
Institutional Holdings  12  
Holdings of Individuals  14

2. THE VOLUME AND COMPOSITION OF TAX-EXEMPT 
SECURITIES OUTSTANDING, 1913–1953  15  
State and Local Securities  15  
Tax-Exempt Securities Issued under the Federal 
Farm Loan System  27  
Federal Tax-Exempt Securities  31

3. GOVERNMENT HOLDINGS OF TAX-EXEMPT SECURITIES  43  
Government Holdings of State and Local Securities  43  
Government Holdings of Federal Farm Loan Bonds  50  
Holdings of Federal Obligations: Direct and 
Guaranteed  51

4. INSTITUTIONAL HOLDINGS OF TAX-EXEMPT SECURITIES  56  
Commercial-Bank Holdings  57  
Other Taxable Corporations  66  
Legal Reserve Life Insurance Companies  69  
Fire, Marine, and Casualty Insurance Companies  73  

v
5. **Individual Holdings of Tax-Exempt Securities**
   - Federal Obligations
   - Farm Loan Bonds
   - State and Local Obligations
   - Tax Rates and the Relative Value of Tax Exemption to Different Income Groups
   - Concentration in Individual Ownership
   - The Shifting Pattern of Investment
   - Summary

**APPENDIX**

A. Table A-1: Gross Amount of Wholly Tax-Exempt Securities Outstanding, Government Holdings and Total Private Holdings, 1913–1953
   - 121
   Table A-2: Gross Amount of Partially Tax-Exempt Securities Outstanding, Government Holdings and Total Private Holdings, 1918–1953
   - 126

B. Table B-1: Institutional Holdings of State and Local Securities, June 30, 1913–June 30, 1953
   - 128
   Table B-2: Institutional Holdings of Federal Wholly and Partially Tax-Exempt Securities, June 30, 1913–June 30, 1953
   - 130

C. Table C-1: Estimated Individual Holdings of Tax-Exempt Securities, 1913–1953
   - 132

D. Table D-1: Total Amount of Interest-Bearing Non-guaranteed Securities of Federal Instrumentalities Outstanding, June 30, 1918–June 30, 1949
   - 134

E. Sources and Methods of Estimating Tax-Exempt Holdings
   - 136
TABLE

1. Gross Tax-Exempt Obligations Compared with Other Public and Private Taxable Obligations, Selected Years, 1913–1952 10
2. Gross Debt of State and Local Governments, Selected Years, 1902–1952 18–19
3. Average Annual Yield on Long-Term Municipal Securities and United States Government Bonds, 1919–1953 46
5. Individual Holdings of Wholly Tax-Exempt Securities, 1924–1941 95
6. Amount and Percentage Distribution by Net Income Class of Wholly Tax-Exempt Interest and Investment Income from Other Sources Reported by Individuals (Excluding Fiduciaries) with Net Income of $5,000 and Over, 1940 98–99
7. State and Local Securities Held by All Individuals (Including Fiduciaries) and Reported by Those in Upper-Income Groups, 1924–1941 102
8. Holdings of State and Local Securities Reported by Individuals (Including Fiduciaries) in Net Income Classes of $5,000 and Over, Selected Years, 1924–1940 105
10. Percentage Composition of Estate Investments, Selected Years, 1922–1950 108
11. Wholly Tax-Exempt Securities Held by Large Estates of Decedents, Selected Years, 1922–1950 112
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chart</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Gross Amount of Tax-Exempt Securities Outstanding, 1913–1953</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Distribution of State and Local Securities by Principal Classes of Holding, 1913–1953</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Distribution of All Federal Tax-Exempt Securities by Principal Classes of Holding, 1913–1953</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Federal Farm Loan Wholly Tax-Exempt Securities Outstanding, 1918–1945</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Percentage Distribution of Institutional and Individual Holdings of Privately Held Federal Tax-Exempt Securities, June 30, 1913–June 30, 1953</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Percentage Distribution of Institutional and Individual Holdings of Privately Held State and Local Securities, June 30, 1913–June 30, 1953</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Individual Holdings of Wholly Tax-Exempt Securities, 1913–1953</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Taxable Equivalent of Average Yield on Tax-Exempt Securities Compared with Actual Average Yield on Corporate Bonds and Stocks, Selected Income Levels</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. Lorenz Distributions of Income from Wholly Tax-Exempt Investments Compared with Income from Other Investments Reported by Individuals with Income over $5,000, 1940</td>
<td>101</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. Lorenz Distribution of State and Local Securities Held by Upper-Income Groups, Selected Years, 1924–1940</td>
<td>104</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. Percentage Distribution of Estate Investments, Selected Years, 1922–1950</td>
<td>111</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
COMMITTEE ON FISCAL RESEARCH

In the planning and conduct of its fiscal studies the National Bureau benefits from the advice and guidance of its Committee on Fiscal Research. The members of the Committee are:

LAWRENCE H. SELTZER, Chairman
Wayne University; Research Staff, National Bureau of Economic Research

WILLIAM A. BERRIDGE, Economist, Metropolitan Life Insurance Company

ROY BLOUGH, Department of Economic Affairs, United Nations

WILLIAM J. CARSON, University of Pennsylvania; Executive Director, National Bureau of Economic Research

GERHARD COLM, Chief Economist, National Planning Association

W. L. CRUM, University of California

LEWIS W. DOUGLAS, Chairman of the Board, Mutual Life Insurance Company

L. L. ECKER-RACZ, Director, Tax Advisory Staff, U.S. Department of the Treasury

SOLOMON FABRICANT, New York University; Director of Research, National Bureau of Economic Research

ALVIN H. HANSEN, Graduate School of Public Administration, Harvard University

CLARENCE HEER, University of North Carolina

WALTER W. HELLER, University of Minnesota

GORDON KEITH, University of Pennsylvania

M. SLADE KENDRICK, Cornell University

WALTER LICHTENSTEIN

WESLEY LINDOW, Vice-President, Irving Trust Company

GEOFFREY H. MOORE, Associate Director of Research, National Bureau of Economic Research

RICHARD A. MUSGRAVE, University of Michigan

GEORGE B. ROBERTS, Vice President, The National City Bank of New York; Treasurer, National Bureau of Economic Research

CARL S. SHOUP, Columbia University

DAN T. SMITH, Graduate School of Business Administration, Harvard University

JOHN H. WILLIAMS, Nathaniel Ropes Professor of Political Economy, Harvard University; Economic Adviser, Federal Reserve Bank of New York

ix
Acknowledgment

This study was initiated and most of the basic work was done while I was a Carnegie research associate at the National Bureau of Economic Research, on leave of absence from the University of North Carolina. Although the study was completed while I was associated with the United States Treasury Department, the views expressed are my own.

I am indebted to several members of the Bureau's staff for their critical reading of preliminary drafts and their suggestions, which helped shape the final analysis. I especially wish to thank Geoffrey H. Moore, Lawrence H. Seltzer, George J. Stigler, David Durand, and Daniel M. Holland. I am also grateful to D. K. Pfeffer of the National City Bank of New York, who read the final manuscript critically and made many pertinent suggestions, and to George Soule, who edited the manuscript and prepared a draft of the introduction. Many others were helpful in furthering the study.

The burden of the statistical work was considerably lightened by the assistance of Carol Joss. H. Irving Forman was principally responsible for the charts.

GEORGE E. LENT