THE NATIONAL ECONOMIC ACCOUNTS
OF THE UNITED STATES

REVIEW, APPRAISAL, AND RECOMMENDATIONS

BY THE

NATIONAL ACCOUNTS REVIEW COMMITTEE OF THE
NATIONAL BUREAU OF ECONOMIC RESEARCH

EXTRACT

FROM

HEARINGS BEFORE THE SUBCOMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC
STATISTICS OF THE JOINT ECONOMIC COMMITTEE,
CONGRESS OF THE UNITED STATES,
EIGHTY-FIFTH CONGRESS,
FIRST SESSION

(Not printed at Government expense)

UNITED STATES
GOVERNMENT PRINTING OFFICE
WASHINGTON : 1958
JOINT ECONOMIC COMMITTEE
(Created pursuant to sec. 5 (a) of Public Law 304, 79th Cong.)

WRIGHT PATMAN, Representative from Texas, Chairman
JOHN SPARKMAN, Senator from Alabama, Vice Chairman

HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES
RICHARD BOLLING, Missouri
WILBUR D. MILLS, Arkansas
HENRY O. TALLE, Iowa
THOMAS B. CURTIS, Missouri
CLARENCE E. KILBURN, New York

SENATE
PAUL H. DOUGLAS, Illinois
J. W. FULBRIGHT, Arkansas
JOSEPH C. O'MAHONEY, Wyoming
RALPH E. FLANDERS, Vermont
ARTHUR V. WATKINS, Utah
BARRY GOLDWATER, Arizona

JOHN W. LEHMAN, Acting Executive Director

SUBCOMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC STATISTICS
RICHARD BOLLING, Missouri, Chairman
HENRY O. TALLE, Iowa
JOHN SPARKMAN, Alabama
JAMES W. KNOWLES, Economist
EXECUTIVE OFFICE OF THE PRESIDENT,
BUREAU OF THE BUDGET,
Washington, D. C., October 29, 1957.

Hon. RICHARD BOLLING,
Chairman, Subcommittee on Economic Statistics, Joint Economic Committee, Washington, D. C.

MY DEAR MR. BOLLING: In accordance with your request, I am transmitting herewith a copy of The National Economic Accounts of the United States: Review, Appraisal, and Recommendations for inclusion in the printed hearings on the report by the Subcommittee on Economic Statistics. This is the official report of the National Accounts Review Committee as submitted to the Bureau of the Budget by the National Bureau of Economic Research.

Sincerely yours,

RAYMOND T. BOWMAN,
Assistant Director for Statistical Standards.

NATIONAL BUREAU OF ECONOMIC RESEARCH, INC.,
New York, N. Y., August 9, 1957.

Dr. RAYMOND T. BOWMAN,
Director, Office of Statistical Standards,
Bureau of the Budget, Washington, D. C.


There will be differences of opinion on particular findings and recommendations of the committee, some of which are indicated in the body of the report and in the notes attached to it. The report as a whole, however, deserves—and we may expect will command—the serious attention of all who recognize the importance of the national economic accounts in the management of public and private economic affairs.

Arrangements between the National Bureau and the Office of Statistical Standards of the Bureau of the Budget for the preparation of the report were concluded on November 2, 1956. We are deeply grateful to the public-spirited members of the National Accounts Review Committee, all of whom devoted a substantial portion of their time and energy during the next 8 months to the difficult task of preparing the report; and to the many persons inside and outside the Federal Government who participated in the discussions, provided essential information, and reviewed drafts of the report.
The report was approved by the board of directors of the National Bureau, in accordance with its usual procedure, as meeting the objectives of the National Bureau—"to ascertain and to present to the public important economic facts and their interpretation in a scientific and impartial manner." As the resolution of the board governing the relation of the directors to the work and publications of the National Bureau states, approval by the board does not, however, imply that each member of the board has read the report, or has passed upon its validity in every detail.

The subject of national income and related economic accounts has long been of interest to the National Bureau. We are glad to add the present report to the series of reports in this area which began in 1921 with the publication of the first National Bureau volume on income in the United States.

On behalf of the National Bureau, I would like to express our appreciation to the Office of Statistical Standards of the Bureau of the Budget for this opportunity to be of service.

Sincerely yours,

Solomon Fabricant,
Director of Research.

THE NATIONAL ECONOMIC ACCOUNTS OF THE UNITED STATES

Review, Appraisal, and Recommendations

A report to the Office of Statistical Standards, Bureau of the Budget, prepared by the National Accounts Review Committee of the National Bureau of Economic Research, June 1957

National Bureau of Economic Research, 1957

Officers

Gottfried Haberler, Chairman
Arthur F. Burns, President
George B. Roberts, Vice President and Treasurer
Solomon Fabricant, Director of Research
Geoffrey H. Moore, Associate Director of Research
William J. Carson, Executive Director

Directors at Large

Wallace J. Campbell, director, Cooperative League of the United States of America
Solomon Fabricant, New York University
Albert J. Hettinger, Jr., Lazard Frères & Co.
Oswald W. Knauth, Beaufort, S. C.
H. W. Laidler, executive director, League for Industrial Democracy
Shepard Morgan, Norfolk, Conn.
George B. Roberts, vice president, the First National City Bank of New York
Beardsley Ruml, New York City
Harry Scherman, chairman, Book-of-the-Month Club
Boris Shishkin, American Federation of Labor and Congress of Industrial Organizations
George Soule, Bennington College
N. I. Stone, consulting economist
J. Raymond Walsh, New York City
Joseph H. Willits, director, the Educational Survey, University of Pennsylvania
Leo Wolman, Columbia University
Donald B. Woodward, Vick Chemical Co.
Theodore O. Yntema, vice president, finance, Ford Motor Co.

DIRECTORS BY UNIVERSITY APPOINTMENT

E. Wight Bakke, Yale
Arthur F. Burns, Columbia
Melvin G. de Chazeau, Cornell
Frank W. Fetter, Northwestern
H. M. Groves, Wisconsin
Gottfried Haberler, Harvard
Clarence Heer, North Carolina
R. L. Kozelka, Minnesota
C. Arthur Kulp, Pennsylvania
T. W. Schultz, Chicago
Jacob Viner, Princeton

DIRECTORS APPOINTED BY OTHER ORGANIZATIONS

Percival F. Brundage, American Institute of Accountants
Harold G. Halcrow, American Farm Economic Association
S. H. Ruttenberg, American Federation of Labor and Congress of Industrial Organizations
Murray Shields, American Management Association
Willard L. Thorp, American Economic Association
W. Allen Wallis, American Statistical Association
Harold F. Williamson, Economic History Association

RESEARCH STAFF

Moses Abramovitz
Arthur F. Burns
Morris A. Copeland
David Durand
Richard A. Easterlin
Solomon Fabricant
Milton Friedman
Raymond W. Goldsmith
Leo Grebler
Millard Hastay
W. Braddock Hickman
Daniel M. Holland
Thor Hultgren
John W. Kendrick
Simon Kuznets
Clarence D. Long
Ruth P. Mack
Ilse Mintz
Geoffrey H. Moore
G. Warren Nutter
Lawrence H. Seltzer
George J. Stigler
Leo Wolman
Herbert B. Woolley

RELATION OF THE DIRECTORS TO THE WORK AND PUBLICATIONS OF THE NATIONAL BUREAU OF ECONOMIC RESEARCH

1. The object of the National Bureau of Economic Research is to ascertain and to present to the public important economic facts and their interpretation in a scientific and impartial manner. The board of directors is charged with the responsibility of insuring that the work of the National Bureau is carried on in strict conformity with this object.

2. To this end the board of directors shall appoint one or more directors of research.
3. The director or directors of research shall submit to the members of the board, or to its executive committee, for their formal adoption, all specific proposals concerning researches to be instituted.

4. No report shall be published until the director or directors of research shall have submitted to the board a summary drawing attention to the character of the data and their utilization in the report, the nature and treatment of the problems involved, the main conclusions and such other information as in their opinion would serve to determine the suitability of the report for publication in accordance with the principles of the National Bureau.

5. A copy of any manuscript proposed for publication shall also be submitted to each member of the board. For each manuscript to be so submitted a special committee shall be appointed by the President, or at his designation by the Executive Director, consisting of 3 directors selected as nearly as may be, 1 from each general division of the Board. The names of the special manuscript committee shall be stated to each Director when the summary and report described in paragraph (4) are sent to him. It shall be the duty of each member of the committee to read the manuscript. If each member of the special committee signifies his approval within 30 days, the manuscript may be published. If each member of the special committee has not signified his approval within 30 days of the transmittal of the report and manuscript, the director of research shall then notify each member of the board, requesting approval or disapproval of publication, and 30 additional days shall be granted for this purpose. The manuscript shall then not be published unless at least a majority of the entire board and a two-thirds majority of those members of the board who shall have voted on the proposal within the time fixed for the receipt of votes on the publication proposed shall have approved.

6. No manuscript may be published, though approved by each member of the special committee, until 45 days have elapsed from the transmittal of the summary and report. The interval is allowed for the receipt of any memorandum of dissent or reservation, together with a brief statement of his reasons, that any member may wish to express; and such memorandum of dissent or reservation shall be published with the manuscript if he so desires. Publication does not, however, imply that each member of the board has read the manuscript, or that either members of the board in general, or of the special committee, have passed upon its validity in every detail.

7. A copy of this resolution shall, unless otherwise determined by the board, be printed in each copy of every National Bureau book. (Resolution adopted October 26, 1926, and revised February 6, 1933, and February 24, 1941.)

June 21, 1957.

Dr. Solomon Fabricant,
Director of Research,
National Bureau of Economic Research,
New York, N. Y.

Dear Dr. Fabricant: The National Accounts Review Committee, organized by the National Bureau in November of last year, hereby submits its report with accompanying appendixes, as adopted at today's meeting.
The committee has attempted to review the major questions in the field of national economic accounting. It has not undertaken, however, to prepare a comprehensive treatise on the subject. The scope and limits of the committee’s report as well as the principles that guided the committee are described in chapter III.

The committee wants to thank the numerous representatives of United States Government agencies, business, labor and academic organizations, many individual economists, the Statistical Office of the United Nations and the Statistical Offices of Denmark, the Netherlands and Norway, who have aided the committee’s inquiries, often by the supply of detailed memorandums. The committee also appreciates the assistance of the nearly 100 respondents to its questionnaires. The committee had the full cooperation of the agencies engaged in the preparation of the national economic accounts, primarily the National Income Division of the Office of Business Economics of the Department of Commerce and the Flow-of-Funds Section of the Division of Research and Statistics of the Board of Governors of the Federal Reserve System. Morris Copeland, Edward F. Denison, George Jaszi, and Simon Kuznets read an early draft of the report and made many helpful suggestions. Many others—too numerous to mention—reviewed drafts of individual sections of the report and contributed their expert knowledge on many technical problems. The committee, however, takes full and sole responsibility for the findings and recommendations of the report.

Mr. Stanley Lebergott, designated by the Office of Statistical Standards, Bureau of the Budget, to keep in touch with the committee, attended all its meetings and in many ways expedited the progress of our work. The committee finally wants to express its appreciation to Mrs. Alice Hanson Jones, who took over the difficult task of secretary early in the committee’s operations.

Sincerely yours,

(Signed)  
RAYMOND W. GOLDSMITH, Chairman.
V. LEWIS BASSIE.
GERHARD COLM.
RICHARD A. EASTERLIN.
EDWIN B. GEORGE.
JOSEPH A. PECHMAN.
ROY L. REIERSON.
RICHARD RUGGLES.
LAZARE TEPER.

CONTENTS

Chapter I. Summary of findings and recommendations.

2. Findings.
3. Recommendations.
   (a) Improvements in basic data.
   (b) Changes in the structure of the system of national economic accounts.
   (c) Improvements in the national income and product accounts.
   (d) Improvements in estimates of other segments of national economic accounts.
   (e) Organization of national economic accounting work.
4. Costs, timing, and priorities of recommendations.
Chapter II. Organization and activities of committee.
1. Terms of reference of committee.
2. Activities of the committee.
3. A survey of users' needs.

Chapter III. Guiding considerations.

Chapter IV. Present status of national accounts.
1. United States of America.
   (a) National income and product accounts.
   (b) Flow-of-funds statements.
   (c) Balance of payments tables.
   (d) Input-output tables.
   (e) National balance sheets.
2. Outside the United States.
3. Organization of national accounting work within the Federal Government.
   (a) Enlargement of National Income Division.
   (b) Research section within National Income Division.
   (c) Liaison between National Income Division and Flow-of-Funds Section of Federal Reserve Board.
   (d) Administrative coordination.

Chapter V. Objectives of national economic accounts and their implications for the general form of the accounts.
   (a) National income and product accounts.
   (b) Input-output tables.
   (c) Flow-of-funds statements.
   (d) Balance of payments tables.
   (e) National balance sheets.
2. National economic accounts and the formulation of economic policy.
   (a) Economic policy and the availability of resources.
   (b) Economic policy and the operation of the economy.
   (c) Economic policy and its quantitative effect.
   (d) Use of national economic accounts by business and labor.
3. The present system of national income and product accounts in the United States.
   (a) General form of the accounts.
   (b) Valuation and imputation.
   (c) The national total: net or gross.
   (a) Need for integration of national economic accounts.
   (b) Difficulties of integration.
   (c) Basic requirements for a system of integrated national economic accounts.
5. Implementation of an integrated system of national accounts.
   (a) The national income and product accounts.
   (b) Relation of the other forms of national economic accounting to the national income and product accounts.
      (1) Value of product table classified by industrial sector.
      (2) Value of product table classified by institutional sector.
      (3) Personal income and outlay table by institutional sector.
      (4) Government receipts and outlay table by governmental unit.
      (5) International trade matrix.
      (6) Saving and investment table by industrial sector.
      (7) Stock of reproducible goods by industrial sector.
      (8) Changes in assets and liabilities table by institutional sector.
      (9) Assets and liabilities table by institutional sector.
   (c) Sector accounts in the integrated national economic accounting system.
      (d) Summary flow tables for the economy
Chapter VI. Constant-dollar estimates.

1. The problem.

2. Recommendations for the immediate future.
   (a) Development of quarterly estimates.
   (b) Expansion in component detail.
   (c) Distribution of gross national product between Government product, household and institutional product, and business product.

3. Recommendations for the longer run.
   (a) Expansion in detail of constant-dollar expenditure estimates.
   (b) Development of matching constant-dollar and man-hour estimates.
   (c) Development of additional price indexes.

4. Supplementary recommendations relating to constant-dollar estimates.
   (a) Development of constant-dollar income estimates for different groups in the population.
   (b) Constant-dollar estimate of net as well as gross national product.
   (c) Periodic reweighting of the constant-dollar estimates.
   (d) Extension of the constant-dollar estimates back of 1929.
   (e) Preparation of a special supplement on constant-dollar estimates.
   (f) Other proposals.

Chapter VII. Specific problems of main accounts.

1. The personal account.
   (a) Treatment of nonprofit organizations and funds.
   (b) Classification of households.
   (c) Treatment of consumers' durables.
   (d) Treatment of capital gains and losses.

   (a) Conceptual problems.
   (b) Classification of Government expenditures.
   (c) Estimate of Government assets.
   (d) A problem of presentation.

3. The foreign trade and payments account.

4. Treatment of capital expenditures.
   (a) Scope of inquiry.
   (b) Sectoral investment accounts.
   (c) The scope of capital expenditures.

5. Treatment of capital consumption allowances.


Chapter VIII. Short-term estimates.

1. Timing.

2. Accuracy.

3. Desirable detail in the quarterly estimates.

4. Need for new current data.

Chapter IX. Problems of regional estimates.

1. National Income Division estimates.

2. Strengthening the present State income estimates.
   (a) Wages and salaries.
   (b) Nonwage incomes.
   (c) Price data.
   (d) Disposable income.

3. Further extension of data in the national accounts by States or other areas.
   (a) Income estimates for areas smaller than the State.
   (b) Income originating.
   (c) Interstate price differentials.
   (d) Gross regional product.
   (e) Other national accounts.

Chapter X. Size distributions of income.

1. Integration of field survey and tax return data.

2. Correction for understatement of income.

3. Special study for top income tax returns.

4. Source patterns of income from the field surveys of family income.

5. Improved data for farm families.


7. Expenditures and savings by income classes.

8. Income histories.
10. Regional, State, and county distributions.
12. Publication of estimates.
13. Income concept used in size distributions.

Chapter XI. Statistical adequacy of national income and product estimates.
1. General considerations.
   (a) Measurement of error.
   (b) Verification of estimates.
   (c) Revisions.
   (d) Steps toward greater accuracy.
   (e) Improving public understanding.
2. Examination of selected components.
   (a) Unincorporated business profits.
   (b) Inventory changes.
   (c) Capital expenditures.
   (d) Saving.
   (e) State and local governments.

Chapter XII. Flow-of-funds statements within the system of national accounts.
1. The present situation.
   (a) Nature of flow-of-funds statements.
   (b) Present status of work on flow-of-funds statements.
   (c) Relation of flow-of-funds statements to the national income and product account.
   (d) Relation of flow-of-funds statements to national balance sheet.
   (e) Relation of flow-of-funds statements to input-output tables.
2. Recommendations.
3. Integration of flow-of-funds statements and national income and product accounts.

Chapter XIII. Input-output tables.
1. The nature of input-output tables.
2. Historical background.
   (a) United States.
   (b) Abroad.
3. Possible application of input-output tables.
   (a) National defense and survival planning.
   (b) Other Government purposes.
   (c) Business investment programming and market analysis.
   (d) Input-output tables as a check on statistical accuracy.
4. Possibilities and limitations of input-output tabulations.
5. Recommendations.

Chapter XIV. National balance sheet.
1. Function of balance sheets and their present status within the system of national accounts.
2. Concepts.
3. Status of work.
4. Connection with other segments of national accounts.
   (a) With national income and product accounts.
   (b) With moneyflow accounts.
   (c) With input-output statements.
5. Recommendations.

Chapter XV. The challenge of electronic accounting.

Appendix A. Illustrative tables for system of national accounts.
Appendix B. Illustrative quarterly income and product tables.
Appendix C. Replies to questionnaires.
Appendix D. A comparison of national accounting structures in selected countries.
Appendix E. The national income accounts: Future directions of research and suggestions for improving the basic data. Statement prepared by George Jaszi.
Appendix F. Personnel and appropriations for work of National Income Division, Office of Business Economics, United States Department of Commerce.