Copyright, 1951, by

National Bureau of Economic Research, Inc.

1819 Broadway, New York 23

All Rights Reserved

Manufactured in the U. S. A. by

The Riverside Press, Cambridge
OFFICERS

Boris Shishkin, Chairman
Harry Scherman, President
C. C. Balderston, Vice-President
George B. Roberts, Treasurer
W. J. Carson, Executive Director
Martha Anderson, Editor

DIRECTORS AT LARGE

D. R. Belcher, American Telephone & Telegraph Co.
Oswald W. Knauth, Beaufort, South Carolina
Simon Kuznets, University of Pennsylvania
H. W. Laidler, Executive Director, League for Industrial Democracy
Shepard Morgan, New York City
C. Reinold Noyes, Princeton, New Jersey
George B. Roberts, Vice-President, National City Bank
Beardsley Ruml, New York City
Harry Scherman, Chairman, Book-of-the-Month Club
George Soule, Bennington College
N. I. Stone, Consulting Economist
J. Raymond Walsh, WMCA Broadcasting Co.
Leo Wolman, Columbia University
Theodore O. Yntema, Vice President-Finance, Ford Motor Company

DIRECTORS BY UNIVERSITY APPOINTMENT

E. Wight Bakke, Yale
C. C. Balderston, Pennsylvania
Arthur F. Burns, Columbia
G. A. Elliott, Toronto
Frank W. Fetter, Northwestern
T. W. Schultz, Chicago

DIRECTORS APPOINTED BY OTHER ORGANIZATIONS

Percival F. Brundage, American Institute of Accountants
Thomas C. Cochran, Economic History Association
Frederick C. Mills, American Statistical Association
S. H. Ruttenberg, Congress of Industrial Organizations
Murray Shields, American Management Association
Boris Shishkin, American Federation of Labor
Donald H. Wallace, American Economic Association
Frederick V. Waugh, American Farm Economic Association

RESEARCH STAFF

Arthur F. Burns, Director of Research
Geoffrey H. Moore, Associate Director of Research
Moses Abramovitz
Harold Barger
Morris A. Copeland
Daniel Creamer
David Durand
Solomon Fabricant
Milton Friedman
Millard Hastay
W. Braddock Hickman
Leo Wolman

H. M. Groves, Wisconsin
Gottfried Haberler, Harvard
Clarence Heer, North Carolina
R. L. Kozelka, Minnesota
Paul M. O'Leary, Cornell
Relation of National Bureau Directors to Publications Reporting Conference Proceedings

Since the present volume is a record of Conference proceedings, it has been exempted from the rules governing submission of manuscripts to, and critical review by, the Board of Directors of the National Bureau. It has, however, been reviewed and accepted for publication by the Director of Research.

(Resolution adopted July 6, 1948 and revised November 21, 1949)
## Contents

**Foreword**

**Part I  Research on the Size Distribution of Income, by Dorothy S. Brady**

A  Present Status  
B  Inequality  
   1  The Reference Base and the Recipient Unit  
   2  The Definition of Income  
   3  Economic Implications  
   4  The Period  
   5  The Price Level  
C  Income Level  
   1  Equivalence  
   2  The Recipient Unit  
   3  Recording Income  
D  Poverty  
   1  The Reference Base  
   2  The Recipient Unit  
   3  Income Determinants  
   4  The Period  
   5  The Universe and the Price Level  
   6  The Definition of Income  
E  Parity  
   1  Meaning of the Comparison  
   2  The Definition of Income  
   3  The Income Recipient  
   4  The Accounting Period  
   5  Comparative Living Costs  
F  The Consumption Function  
   1  Framework for Analysis  
   2  The Definition of Income  
   3  The Recipient Unit  
   4  Type of Community  
G  Development of Research  

**COMMENT**

Milton Friedman
## Part II: Postwar Changes in the Income of Identical Consumer Units, by George Katona and Janet A. Fisher

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>Distribution of Changes in Income and their Relation to its Size</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td>Changes in Income and Demographic Characteristics</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1 Age</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2 Occupation</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3 Type of Community</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4 Veteran Status</td>
<td>87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5 Size of Spending Unit</td>
<td>87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>6 Education</td>
<td>88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>7 Conclusions</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td>Subjective Evaluation of Income Changes</td>
<td>91</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D</td>
<td>Income Changes, Durable Goods Expenditures, and Saving</td>
<td>93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1 Durable Goods Expenditures</td>
<td>97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2 Saving</td>
<td>97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E</td>
<td>Methodological Note</td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Appendix Tables | 101

## Part III: Distribution of Nonmoney Income, by Margaret G. Reid

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>Types of Income in Kind, their Trend and Relative Size</td>
<td>124</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td>Sources</td>
<td>126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1 Effect of Nonmoney Income on the Distribution of Income</td>
<td>127</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2 The Income Unit</td>
<td>138</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3 Confusion of Nonmoney Income in the Accounting Process</td>
<td>142</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4 Coverage</td>
<td>144</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5 The Schedule</td>
<td>145</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td>Methods of Implying Value to Income in Kind</td>
<td>146</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1 Conceptual Bases</td>
<td>147</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2 Home-produced Food</td>
<td>147</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>a Prices used to value home-produced food</td>
<td>148</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>b Valuation of home-produced food</td>
<td>150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>c From gross to net value of home-produced food</td>
<td>153</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3 Owner-occupied Dwellings</td>
<td>154</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>a Nonfarm</td>
<td>154</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>b Farm</td>
<td>159</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4 Wages in Kind</td>
<td>159</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5 Relief in Kind</td>
<td>164</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>6 Gifts in Kind</td>
<td>166</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D</td>
<td>Improving the Method of Evaluating Income in Kind</td>
<td>167</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Comment

Milton Friedman

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>119</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Contents

1 Income in Kind usually Excluded from Income Distributions 168
2 Income in Kind Provided by Government without a Means Test 168
3 Medical Services 171
4 'Other' Durable Goods 172
5 Services Rendered by and for Members of Consuming Units 173
E Improving the Measurement of Nonmoney Income 177
   1 Purposes of Measuring the Distribution of Nonmoney Income 177
   2 Concluding Observations 178

COMMENT
Edward F. Denison 180

REPLY 183

Part IV Distribution of Income Before and After Federal Income Taxes, 1941 and 1947, by Joseph A. Pechman 186
A Definitions 189
B Methods (see App. A) 191
C Changes in the Distributions, 1941—1947 193
   1 Income Before Tax 193
   2 Income After Tax 197
Appendix
A Methods 200
   1 1941 200
      a Distribution of income before tax 201
      b Distribution of income after tax 206
   2 1947 208
   3 Quintile Distribution of Income Before and After Tax 210
B Federal Individual Income Tax Exemptions and Rates, 1941 and 1947 211

COMMENT
George Garvy 214

Part V Size Distribution of Farm Operators' Income in 1946, by Nathan M. Kofsky and Jeanne E. Lear 220
A Concepts of Farm Family Income 222
B The Income Unit 223
C The BAE Sample and Its Expansion 224
D Size Distribution of Gross Cash Farm Income 226
E Gross Farm Income and Production Expenses 229
F Adjustment of Gross and Net Cash Farm Income Distributions 232
G  Adjustment of Net Cash Total Income  236
H  Effect of Including the Value of Inventory Changes on the
    Distribution of Net Farm Income, Illinois  240
I  Adjustment for Nonmoney Income  242
J  Summary of Comparisons  245
K  Concluding Remarks  248
Appendix
A  Reconciliation of Survey Income Data with BAE Official
    Estimates  249
B  Statistical Procedures for Adjusting the Distributions  255

COMMENTS
Harold Barger  259
A. Ross Eckler  262
Clark Warburton  263

Part VI  Appraisal of Basic Data Available for Constructing Income
        Size Distributions, by Selma F. Goldsmith  266
A  Basic Income Series  267
1  Sample Field Surveys  268
2  Individual Income Tax Returns  270
3  Workers with Wage Credits under OASI  273
4  National Income Division Estimates of Personal Income  274
5  Census Bureau Estimates of Number of Families and
    Single Individuals  274
B  Aggregate Income Covered by Field Surveys, Income Tax
    Returns, OASI Records, and NID Series  275
1  Derivation of Estimates of Consumer Money Income by
    Source from NID Estimates of Personal Income  275
   a  Adjustments for conceptual differences  276
   b  Adjustments for practical limitations  281
   c  Transfer of income items to match field survey cate-
       gories  282
2  Aggregate Income Covered by Field Surveys  283
   a  Total consumer money income  283
   b  Consumer money income by source  288
   c  Number of families reporting income from different
       sources  293
   d  $10,000 and over income class  296
   e  Percentage distribution of income missing from field
       surveys, by source  298
   f  Lorenz curves for the distribution of income from
       field surveys  296
3  Aggregate Income Covered by Individual Income Tax
    Returns  301
4  Aggregate Wages and Salaries Covered by Income Tax
    Returns and OASI Records  305
Contents

a Income tax returns 305
b OASI records 306
C Number of Civilian Earners Accounted for by Surveys, Income Tax Returns, and Our Estimate 306
1 Estimated Number of Civilian Earners 307
2 Field Surveys 311
3 Income Tax Returns 314
D Size Distributions from Field Surveys, Income Tax Returns, and OASI Records 317
E Integrating Basic Series on Income Size Distributions 322

Appendix
A Notes to Table 1 327
B Notes to Table 2 336
C Notes to Table 3 340
D Notes to Table 4 345
E Notes to Table 6 355
F Notes to Table 8 356
G Notes to Table 9 362
H Notes to Table 10 363
I Notes to Table 11 370
J Notes to Table 12 372

COMMENT
Stanley Lebergott 373

Part VII An Income Size Distribution from Income Tax and Survey Data, 1944, by Maurice Liebenberg and Hyman Kaitz 378
A Methods of Deriving Adjusted Income Size Distributions 380
1 Simple Transformations 381
a Constant Lorenz curve 381
b Source pattern transformation 383
2 Supplementing Survey Results by Means of Tax Data 387
a Reasons for partial results 387
b Changing the unit of classification and the income concept 388
3 Method Involving the Segregation of Earner Groups 391
B Major Differences in Methodology between Present and Earlier Studies 394
1 Cross-tabulations 394
2 Supplementing Tax Returns before Combination into Family Units 399
3 Segregation and Combination of Subfamilies 401
4 Family Supplementary Income Recipients 402
C Description of Procedures Used in Constructing a Family Income Size Distribution for 1944 403
1 Adjustment to Remove Net Taxable Capital Gains and Losses 403
Contents

1 Constructing a cross-tabulation for capital gains by income level 405
2 Constructing a cross-tabulation for capital losses by income level 407
3 Results 408
d Removing capital gains and losses from different types of return 411
2 Matching and Combining Separate Returns of Husbands and Wives 411
3 Separating Returns into Categories of Family Membership 414
a Separation of income tax returns 416
b Census Bureau and derived BIR distributions for similar units 417
c Splicing of derived BIR to Census distributions 420
4 Allocating Population Groups to Categories of Family Attachment 421
a Population in categories of family attachment 421
b Income size distributions for categories of family attachment 423
5 Combining Income Distributions for Family Member Groups into Family Units 425
a Income relationships among groups of family members 425
b Combining family member groups into family units 429
6 Adjusting the Income Distributions of Families and Single Individuals to Include Military Income 430
D Frequency Distributions of Families and Single Individuals by Income Level in 1944 432
Appendix
A Transformation Used in Estimating the Capital Gains Conditional Distributions 439
B Estimating Capital Loss Conditional Distributions 440
C Adjusting Cell Frequencies when a Population Has Shifted 440
D Adjusting an Income Distribution for Excessive Dispersion from the Mode 441
E Some Formulas Used in Constructing Our Estimates 442
1 Formulas to Approximate Averages in the Intervals of a Distribution 442
2 Formulas for Adding and Subtracting Two Variables in a Cross-tabulation 445
3 Interpolation Formulas 449
F Obtaining Percentage Patterns Required to Separate Income Tax Returns into Various Categories of Family Membership 452
1 Adjusting Census Bureau Earnings Distributions for Differences in Income Concept 452
2 Distribution of Members of Subfamilies 455
## Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Topic</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3 Distribution of Husbands and Wives in Normal Main Families from Census Data</td>
<td>457</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Distribution of Individuals in Normal Subfamilies</td>
<td>459</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G Allocating Population Groups to Categories of Family Attachment</td>
<td>461</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 Number of Family Members 14 and Older in Normal and Broken Families</td>
<td>461</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Subfamily Groups Included in Normal Families</td>
<td>462</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Part VIII Coordination of Old-Age and Survivors Insurance Wage Data with Those from Other Sources, by Benjamin J. Mandel 464

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A Need for Coordination Studies</td>
<td>465</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B General Methods of Wage Reconciliation Studies</td>
<td>467</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C Recent Experience</td>
<td>467</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 Census and Old-Age and Survivors Insurance Study, 1944</td>
<td>468</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Identification of Veterans in Old-Age and Survivors Insurance Files</td>
<td>468</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Census and Old-Age and Survivors Insurance Pilot Study, 1946</td>
<td>469</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a Identification of individuals</td>
<td>469</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b Comparison of wage and salary data</td>
<td>470</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c Adjusting Census wage distributions</td>
<td>474</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Income Tax and Old-Age and Survivors Insurance Wage Coordination Study, 1944</td>
<td>476</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a Identification of individuals</td>
<td>476</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b Comparing wages</td>
<td>477</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c Evaluation of results</td>
<td>478</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 California Employment Security and Old-Age and Survivors Insurance Wage Data, 1947</td>
<td>478</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a Identification of individuals</td>
<td>479</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b Extent of agreement on wages</td>
<td>479</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

D Summary and Conclusions 480

### Part IX Field Surveys of Consumer Income: An Appraisal, by Robert Wasson, Abner Hurwitz, and Irving Schweiger 482

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A Summary of Concepts and Procedures</td>
<td>484</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B Evaluation of Survey Results</td>
<td>487</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 Census and BLS Data</td>
<td>487</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Census and FRB Data</td>
<td>493</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 1946 Census-BAE Rural Farm Data</td>
<td>503</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C Field Surveys as a Technique for Constructing Income Size Distributions</td>
<td>508</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 Universe</td>
<td>510</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Income-receiving Unit</td>
<td>510</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Family Reconstruction</td>
<td>511</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contents</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------</td>
<td>------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Date of Interview</td>
<td>515</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 Income Reporting</td>
<td>515</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 Nonreporting</td>
<td>516</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7 Census 1946 and 1947 Inflation Techniques</td>
<td>521</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8 Substitution</td>
<td>522</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9 Income Questions</td>
<td>523</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a Wage and salary income</td>
<td>523</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b Farm income</td>
<td>525</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c Global estimates</td>
<td>525</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10 Probes and Checks</td>
<td>526</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A Definitions</td>
<td>528</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 Units</td>
<td>528</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Urban-Rural Classification</td>
<td>531</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Income</td>
<td>532</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Universe</td>
<td>535</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B Techniques</td>
<td>535</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 Sample Design</td>
<td>535</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Income Questions</td>
<td>538</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Collection and Editing Procedures</td>
<td>541</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Inflation of Sample Data</td>
<td>551</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**COMMENTS**

William Vickrey 554
A. Ross Eckler 557

**Part X**  Estimating the Number of Earners for Income Size Distribution Analysis, by Emmett H. Welch 560

A Evidence of Underreporting of the Number of Earners in Income Surveys 562
B Employment Questions in the Current Population Survey 564
C Yearly Number of Earners Estimated from Monthly Employment 569
D Necessity for Preparing a Separate Income Size Distribution for Earners not Reporting Earnings in Surveys 570

**Index** 573
Foreword

In this, the thirteenth volume of *Studies in Income and Wealth*, are published the papers read and discussed at the April 1949 meeting of the Conference on Research in Income and Wealth. Although that meeting was the first at which the distribution of income recipients by size of income was the sole topic, several papers dealing with the size distribution of income had been presented at preceding meetings (see *Studies in Income and Wealth, Volumes Three, Eight, and Ten*). Moreover, the Conference had sponsored and published a systematic summary and review of income size distributions in the United States (*Volume Five, Parts I and II*), a report on changes in income distribution during the Great Depression (*Volume Seven*), and an analysis of Wisconsin income concerned, in large part, with its size distribution (*Volume Nine*).

Usually treated under the heading 'size distribution of income' are the structure of the income distribution; the factors accounting for change in this structure, including change in the position of families within the distribution; and the influence of the income distribution and its changes on economic behavior, especially savings and consumption. That these topics bear on many problems of policy and are therefore important is obvious. That the papers in this volume contribute to our scientific knowledge of these topics the reader will discover for himself. He will find, also, that they raise many interesting questions and open leads to further research.

Indeed, so numerous and interesting were the questions raised by the papers and discussion at the 1949 meeting that the Executive Committee of the Conference agreed on the desirability of following it as soon as possible with another meeting devoted exclusively to income size distributions. The meeting was held at the University of Illinois last June. Anyone who takes the time to examine this book carefully will find himself
awaiting with interest the volume in this series, which will contain the papers and discussion of the Illinois meeting.

The Conference is deeply indebted to Hildegarde Kneeland, who arranged the April 1949 meeting and saw it through to a successful conclusion. In a very real sense this book is a product of her wide knowledge and experience in the field of income distribution and of her enthusiastic interest in extending its borders. Thanks are due also Lillian Epstein and Martha Anderson who had the arduous task of editing the papers and comments. An inadequate measure of their work and our debt to them is the simple count of the authors and discussants who had to be wrestled with.

This occasion may be taken to report the expected appearance, next spring, of an international bibliography of publications on other subjects usually included in the broad field of national income and wealth as well as those covered here. The Bibliography on Income and Wealth, 1937-1947 is to be published in England by Bowes and Bowes, Ltd., Cambridge, for the International Association for Research in Income and Wealth. Later volumes will carry the bibliography beyond 1947. The bibliography for the United States was contributed by the Conference on Research in Income and Wealth.

**EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE, 1950-1591**

Solomon Fabricant, *Chairman*

Martin R. Gainsbrugh  
Selma F. Goldsmith  
George Jaszi  
Simon Kuznets  
Franco Modigliani  
Richard Ruggles  
Kenneth B. Williams  
Lillian Epstein, *Secretary*