THE STATE OF MONETARY ECONOMICS

A Conference of the Universities—National Bureau Committee for Economic Research

NATIONAL BUREAU OF ECONOMIC RESEARCH
NEW YORK

DISTRIBUTED BY COLUMBIA UNIVERSITY PRESS
NEW YORK AND LONDON
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Arrangements for the Conference on Monetary Economics were made by a committee consisting of James Duesenberry, Milton Friedman, Franco Modigliani, Edward Shaw, James Tobin, and G. L. Bach (chairman). Robert P. Shay of the National Bureau of Economic Research deserves special thanks for his assistance in arranging the Conference and his help with the publication of this volume. This is the sixteenth report in the National Bureau’s Special Conference series growing out of the work of the Universities-National Bureau Committee for Economic Research. Margaret T. Edgar edited the papers and H. Irving Forman drew the charts.

UNIVERSITIES—NATIONAL BUREAU COMMITTEE FOR ECONOMIC RESEARCH

This Committee is a cooperative venture of universities and the National Bureau. Its guiding objective is the encouragement of economic research on problems susceptible of objective treatment and of sufficiently broad scope to merit attention by institutions serving a scientific and public interest.

Rendigs Fels, Chairman
Vanderbilt University
Carl F. Christ, Vice-Chairman
The Johns Hopkins University

Price: $3.00

Copyright, 1963, By the President and Fellows of Harvard College
Originally published in The Review of Economics and Statistics
Manufactured in the United States of America
OFFICERS

Frank W. Fetter, Chairman
Arthur F. Burns, President
Theodore O. Yntema, Vice-President
Donald B. Woodward, Treasurer
William J. Carson, Secretary

Geoffrey H. Moore, Director of Research
Douglas H. Eldridge, Executive Director
Hal B. Lary, Associate Director of Research
Victor R. Fuchs, Associate Director of Research

DIRECTORS AT LARGE

Robert B. Anderson, New York City
Wallace J. Campbell, Foundation for Cooperative Housing
Erwin D. Canham, Christian Science Monitor
Solomon Fabricant, New York University
Marion B. Folsom, Eastman Kodak Company
Crawford H. Greenewalt, E. I. du Pont de Nemours & Company
Gabriel Hauge, Manufacturers Hanover Trust Company
A. J. Hayes, International Association of Machinists
Walter W. Heller, University of Minnesota
Albert J. Hettinger, Jr., Lazard Frères and Company
Donald B. Woodward, A. W. Jones and Company

H. W. Laidler, League for Industrial Democracy
Geoffrey H. Moore, National Bureau of Economic Research
Charles G. Mortimer, General Foods Corporation
J. Wilson Newman, Dun & Bradstreet, Inc.
George B. Roberts, Larchmont, New York
Harry Schimer, Book-of-the-Month Club
Boris Shishkin, American Federation of Labor and Congress of Industrial Organizations
George Soule, South Kent, Connecticut
Gus Tyler, International Ladies' Garment Workers' Union
Joseph H. Willits, Langhorne, Pennsylvania

DIRECTORS BY UNIVERSITY APPOINTMENT

V. W. Bladen, Toronto
Francis M. Boddy, Minnesota
Arthur F. Burns, Columbia
Lester V. Chandler, Princeton
Melvin G. de Chazeau, Cornell
Frank W. Fetter, Northwestern
R. A. Gordon, California

Harold M. Groves, Wisconsin
Gottfried Haberler, Harvard
Maurice W. Lee, North Carolina
Lloyd G. Reynolds, Yale
Paul A. Samuelson, Massachusetts Institute of Technology
Theodore W. Schultz, Chicago

DIRECTORS BY APPOINTMENT OF OTHER ORGANIZATIONS

Percival F. Brundage, American Institute of Certified Public Accountants
Nathaniel Goldfinger, American Federation of Labor and Congress of Industrial Organizations
Harold G. Halcrow, American Farm Economic Association
Murray Shields, American Management Association

Willard L. Thorp, American Economic Association
W. Allen Wallis, American Statistical Association
Harold F. Williamson, Economic History Association
Theodore O. Yntema, Committee for Economic Development

DIRECTORS EMERITI

Shepard Morgan, Norfolk, Connecticut
N. I. Stone, New York City
Jacob Viner, Princeton, New Jersey

RESEARCH STAFF

Moses Abramovitz
Gary S. Becker
William H. Brown, Jr.
Gerhard Bry
Arthur F. Burns
Phillip Cagan
Frank G. Dickinson
James S. Earley
Richard A. Easterlin
Solomon Fabricant

Albert Fishlow
Milton Friedman
Victor R. Fuchs
H. G. Georgiadis
Raymond W. Goldsmith
Jack M. Guttentag
Challis A. Hall, Jr.
Daniel M. Holland
Thor Hultgren
F. Thomas Juster

C. Harry Kahn
John W. Kendrick
Irving B. Kravis
Hal B. Lary
Robert E. Lipsey
Ruth P. Mack
Jacob Mincer
Ilse Mintz
Geoffrey H. Moore
Roger F. Murray

Ralph L. Nelson
G. Warren Nutter
Richard T. Selden
Lawrence H. Seltzer
Robert P. Shay
George J. Stigler
Norman B. Ture
Herbert B. Woolley
Victor Zarnowitz
Relation of National Bureau Directors to Publications Reporting Conference Proceedings

Since the present volume is a record of conference proceedings, it has been exempted from the rules governing submission of manuscripts to, and critical review by, the Board of Directors of the National Bureau. It has, however, been reviewed and accepted for publication by the Director of Research.

(Resolution adopted July 6, 1948, as revised November 21, 1949)
CONTENTS

Introduction ..................................................... G. L. Bach 3

PART I: MONETARY ECONOMICS

The Portfolio Approach to the Demand for Money and
Other Assets .................................................. James S. Duesenberry 9
Money and Business Cycles ..................................... Milton Friedman and
Anna J. Schwartz 32
The Monetary Mechanism and Its Interaction with
Real Phenomena ............................................. Franco Modigliani 79

PART II: THE REPORT AND STAFF PAPERS OF THE
COMMISSION ON MONEY AND CREDIT

Panel on Processes and Responses in Monetary Control
A Sample Survey of the Commission on Money
and Credit Research Papers .............................. Martin Bronfenbrenner 111
Processes and Responses in Monetary Control .................. G. L. Bach 129
Don't Be Too Hard on the C.M.C. ............................. Henry C. Wallich 135

Panel on Monetary Objectives, Potentialities, and Achievements
Objectives, Monetary Standards, and Potentialities ............ Harry G. Johnson 137
Short-Run Objectives of Monetary Policy ...................... Guy E. Noyes 147

COMMENT ON THE PAPERS

On Duesenberry's The Portfolio Approach to the Demand
for Money and Other Assets .............................. Kenneth J. Arrow 24
Irwin Friend 29
Phillip Cagan 27
On Friedman's and Schwartz' Money and Business Cycles .... Hyman P. Minsky 64
Arthur M. Okun 72
Clark Warburton 77

On Bach's Processes and Responses in Monetary Control ........ Warren Smith 131
On Johnson's Objectives, Monetary Standards, and
Potentialities ................................................. Abba P. Lerner 144
On Noyes' Short-Run Objectives of Monetary Policy .......... Herbert Stein 149
Joseph Conard 152
Carl F. Christ 154
National Bureau of Economic Research.
The State of monetary economics; a conference of
the Universities-National Bureau Committee for
Economic Research. New York, National
Bureau of Economic Research; distributed by
Columbia University Press (1963)
155 p. illus. (National Bureau's Special
Conference series [no. 16])
"Originally published in The review of.
economics and statistics, v. 45, supplement:
Feb. 1963, no. 1, pt. 2."
Bibliographical footnotes,
1. Monetary policy. 2. Money. I. Conference
on Monetary Economics, Carnegie Institute of
Technology, 1962. II. Universities—National
Bureau Committee for Economic Research.
III. Review of economics and statistics. IV. Series
Material submitted by publisher.