Industrial Banking Companies
and Their Credit Practices

By Raymond J. Saulnier

Financial Research Program
Studies in Consumer Instalment Financing 4

NATIONAL BUREAU OF ECONOMIC RESEARCH
Industrial Banking Companies
and Their Credit Practices

This book presents a factual study of industrial banking companies as agencies of consumer instalment credit. It provides information on:

the quantitative importance of industrial banking company credit;

the company—its organization, sources and uses of funds, operating methods and collection experience, income, expenses, profits;

legal status—minimum capital requirements, lending privileges and restrictions, maximum legal charges, deposits, sale of investment certificates, reserves, dividend payments, uniform legislation;

lending and non-lending services and customer charges;

borrower and loan characteristics as factors in credit risk;

cooperative relations among industrial banking companies, and competition with other agencies of consumer instalment credit.

The purpose of this survey has been to give a complete and accurate picture of this important institution of consumer instalment financing by presenting facts rather than opinion.

$2.00
OFFICERS

DAVID FRIDAY, Chairman
WILLIAM L. CRUM, President
N. I. STONE, Vice-President
SHEPARD MORGAN, Treasurer
W. J. CARSON, Executive Director
MARTHA ANDERSON, Editor

DIRECTORS AT LARGE

CHESTER I. BARNARD, President,
New Jersey Bell Telephone Company
HENRY S. DENNISON,
Dennison Manufacturing Company
DAVID FRIDAY, Consulting Economist
GEORGE M. HARRISON, President,
Brotherhood of Railway and Steamship Clerks
OSWALD W. KNAUTII, President,
Associated Dry Goods Corporation
HARRY W. LAIDLER, Executive Director,
League for Industrial Democracy
GEORGE O. MAY, Price, Waterhouse and Company
SHEPARD MORGAN, Vice-President, Chase National Bank
GEORGE E. ROBERTS, Economic Adviser, National City Bank
BEARDSLEY RUML, Treasurer, R. H. Macy and Company
GEORGE SOULE, Director, The Labor Bureau, Inc.
N. I. STONE, Consulting Economist
DIRECTORS BY UNIVERSITY APPOINTMENT

William L. Crum, Harvard
E. E. Day, Cornell
Guy Stanton Ford, Minnesota
F. P. Graham, North Carolina

H. M. Groves, Wisconsin
Walton H. Hamilton, Yale
Harry Alvin Millis, Chicago
Wesley C. Mitchell, Columbia
A. H. Williams, Pennsylvania

DIRECTORS APPOINTED BY OTHER ORGANIZATIONS

Frederick M. Feiker, American Engineering Council
Lee Galloway, American Management Association
Malcolm Muir, National Publishers Association
C. Reinold Noyes, American Economic Association
Winfield W. Riefler, American Statistical Association
Matthew Woll, American Federation of Labor

RESEARCH STAFF

Wesley C. Mitchell, Director

Arthur F. Burns
Solomon Fabricant
Milton Friedman
Simon Kuznets

Frederick R. Macaulay
Frederick C. Mills
Raymond J. Saulnier
Leo Wolman

Ralph A. Young
Relation of the Directors to the Work
of the National Bureau of Economic Research

1. The object of the National Bureau of Economic Research is to ascertain and to present to the public important economic facts and their interpretation in a scientific and impartial manner. The Board of Directors is charged with the responsibility of ensuring that the work of the Bureau is carried on in strict conformity with this object.

2. To this end the Board of Directors shall appoint one or more Directors of Research.

3. The Director or Directors of Research shall submit to the members of the Board, or to its Executive Committee, for their formal adoption, all specific proposals concerning researches to be instituted.

4. No study shall be published until the Director or Directors of Research shall have submitted to the Board a summary report drawing attention to the character of the data and their utilization in the study, the nature and treatment of the problems involved, the main conclusions and such other information as in their opinion will serve to determine the suitability of the study for publication in accordance with the principles of the Bureau.

5. A copy of any manuscript proposed for publication shall also be submitted to each member of the Board. If publication is approved each member is entitled to have published also a memorandum of any dissent or reservation he may express, together with a brief statement of his reasons. The publication of a volume does not, however, imply that each member of the Board of Directors has read the manuscript and passed upon its validity in every detail.

6. The results of an inquiry shall not be published except with the approval of at least a majority of the entire Board and a two-thirds majority of all those members of the Board who shall have voted on the proposal within the time fixed for the receipt of votes on the publication proposed. The limit shall be forty-five days from the date of the submission of the synopsis and manuscript of the proposed publication unless the Board extends the limit; upon the request of any member the limit may be extended for not more than thirty days.

7. A copy of this resolution shall, unless otherwise determined by the Board, be printed in each copy of every Bureau publication.

(Resolution of October 25, 1926, revised February 6, 1933)
Financial Research Program: Committee

In the conduct of this and other studies under its program of research in finance the National Bureau of Economic Research has benefited from the advice and guidance of its Committee on Research in Finance. The functions of this committee are to review and supervise the specific research plans of the staff of the Financial Research Program. The membership includes:

Winfield W. Riefler, Chairman—Institute for Advanced Study

Ralph A. Young, Secretary—University of Pennsylvania; Director, Financial Research Program

William J. Carson—University of Pennsylvania; Executive Director, National Bureau of Economic Research

Thomas Jefferson Coolidge—Chairman, United Fruit Company

David Friday—Chairman, National Bureau of Economic Research; Consulting Economist

E. A. Goldenweiser—Director, Division of Research and Statistics, Board of Governors of the Federal Reserve System

F. Cyril James—Principal and Vice-Chancellor, McGill University

Wesley C. Mitchell—Columbia University; Director of Research, National Bureau of Economic Research

Shepard Morgan—Vice-President, Chase National Bank; Treasurer, National Bureau of Economic Research

Raymond J. Saulnier—Barnard College, Columbia University; Research Staff, National Bureau of Economic Research

Donald S. Thompson—Chief, Division of Research and Statistics, Federal Deposit Insurance Corporation

Robert B. Warren—Institute for Advanced Study

John H. Williams—Littauer School, Harvard University; Vice-President, Federal Reserve Bank of New York

Leo Wolman—Columbia University; Research Staff, National Bureau of Economic Research

Donald Woodward—Research Assistant to the President, Mutual Life Insurance Company
Industrial Banking Companies and Their Credit Practices

BY RAYMOND J. SAULNIER

Financial Research Program
Studies in Consumer Instalment Financing

NATIONAL BUREAU OF ECONOMIC RESEARCH
Preface

This study of Morris Plan and other industrial banking companies as agencies of consumer instalment credit is the fourth of a series dealing with the important institutions that participate in the instalment financing of consumers. Other studies included in the series cover personal finance companies, sales finance companies, the personal loan departments of commercial banks, and government agencies of consumer instalment credit (the Federal Housing Administration and the Electric Home and Farm Authority). All of these studies were undertaken in conjunction with the investigation of consumer instalment finance, inaugurated in 1938 by the National Bureau of Economic Research as the initial phase of a broad program of financial research under grants from the Association of Reserve City Bankers and the Rockefeller Foundation.

The industrial banking company cannot be described or analyzed easily. Although it engages in a number of consumer financing activities, some of its operations are not immediately associated with consumer credit. This type of financing agency may be classified, however, in terms of certain distinguishing operating features, and thus an industrial banking company may be defined as an institution which specializes in consumer instalment financing and obtains part of its working funds from customer deposits, the sale of investment certificates of small denominations, or both. A firm of this type organizes the savings of one group of customers as a supply fund out of which it extends loans to another group of customers. The two customer groups served are drawn
largely from the wage-earning and salaried classes, so that the industrial banking company functions as an intermediary between the savings and credit needs of these classes.

In the preparation of the present study, we have gathered data from many sources. From this information Dr. Saulnier has created an institutional picture that is detailed in content yet characterized by the perspective of an outside observer. Dr. Saulnier also collaborated in preparing our studies on consumer financing activities and credit practices of personal finance companies and commercial banks, and thus obtained an insight into the mechanism of consumer instalment financing which has been of great value to this study.

We welcome the opportunity to acknowledge our indebtedness to many firms and their officers for providing materials for our use and for imparting to us an accurate understanding of the techniques and problems of the business. We are also indebted for special information to The Morris Plan Corporation of America, the Morris Plan Bankers Association, and the American Industrial Bankers Association. We were supplied with samples of loan applications by two large Morris Plan banks and by eight industrial banking companies that are members of the American Industrial Bankers Association. The Federal Deposit Insurance Corporation generously aided us by furnishing comprehensive tabulations covering the earnings, expenses, assets and liabilities of the 71 industrial banking companies whose deposits are insured by the Corporation. The banking departments of the several states cooperated in answering numerous letters of inquiry regarding the status of industrial banking under their jurisdiction and also furnished information regarding legislation affecting the operations of industrial banking companies. Although the help of all of the above was invaluable in the preparation of this study, the organizations are, of course, in no sense responsible for the findings presented herein.
Dr. Saulnier has been assisted in the preparation of this volume by various members of the financial research staff.

Ralph Wood, formerly of the staff, made the initial exploration of available materials.

Pauline Arkus assisted in the preparation of statistical tabulations and aided in writing many sections of the text.

David Durand made the analysis of risk factors affecting industrial lending contained in Chapter 6.

The editing of the first draft of this study was done by Bettina Sinclair, the final editing for publication by Elizabeth Todd, and Dorothy Wescott guided the material through the press. The manuscript has benefited greatly by their careful work.

RALPH A. YOUNG

Director, Financial Research Program

September 1940
Author's Acknowledgments

Many individuals and a number of private and public agencies have cooperated generously in the preparation of this volume. J. P. Christianson, Treasurer of The Morris Plan Corporation of America, advised me on many occasions and made available certain data which form an important part of the study's statistical basis. Richard Stout and his associates in the Morris Plan Bankers Association consulted with me on certain aspects of Morris Plan lending operations. I am especially grateful to T. C. Boushall of the Morris Plan Bank of Virginia and to C. T. Miller of the Morris Plan Bank of New York for having provided important statistical materials.

Throughout the entire study, the American Industrial Bankers Association has rendered invaluable assistance. Myron R. Bone, Executive Secretary of the Association, has generously advised me on many aspects of the activities of industrial banking companies, and with W. E. Yeager, Chairman of the Statistical Committee of the Association, has given me access to a large body of data on industrial banking company operations. Also, I have benefited greatly from the cooperation and wise counsel of many individual members of the Association.

I am also personally indebted to Donald S. Thompson of the Federal Deposit Insurance Corporation for advising me regarding the use of special tabulations covering insured industrial banking companies. Rolf Nugent of the Russell Sage Foundation and Margaret Grobben of the Consumer Credit Institute of America have been very helpful at many stages of the work.
AUTHOR'S ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

I am deeply indebted to Ralph A. Young, Director of the Financial Research Program of the National Bureau of Economic Research, under whose general supervision this volume was prepared. The initial exploratory work of the study done under Dr. Young's direction by Ralph A. Wood, formerly of the staff of the Financial Research Program, provided me with a well organized body of data indispensable to subsequent stages of the work.

Grateful acknowledgment is made to the members of the staff of the National Bureau of Economic Research who assisted me in my work, particularly to Pauline Arkus who aided in the statistical tabulations and in planning and writing the text, and to David Durand who made the analysis of credit risk presented in Chapter 6. To Bettina Sinclair who did all the editorial work on the first draft of this manuscript, to Elizabeth Todd who edited the final version for publication, and to Dorothy Wescott who guided the manuscript through the press, I owe special thanks.

RAYMOND J. SAULNIER,
Financial Research Staff
(National Bureau of Economic Research)
and
Barnard College, Columbia University
Table of Contents

**Preface**
- ix

**Author's Acknowledgments**
- xii

**List of Tables**
- xix

**Summary Survey**
- 1

1. **Nature and Scope of Industrial Lending**
   (12-28)
   - The Problem of Definition
     - 12
   - Systems of Industrial Banking Companies
     - 15
       - *The Morris Plan System*
       - 15
       - *Other Systems*
       - 23
   - Quantitative Importance of Industrial Banking Company Credit
     - 25

2. **Legal Status**
   (29-56)
   - Regulations Regarding Organization
     - 31
   - Minimum Capital Requirements
     - 33
   - Lending Privileges and Restrictions
     - 35
       - *Types of Loans and Investments Permitted*
       - 35
       - *Regulation of Loan Maturities*
       - 36
       - *Regulations Regarding Size of Loans*
       - 37
   - Maximum Legal Charges
     - 39
   - Deposits
     - 41
   - Sale of Investment Certificates
     - 43
   - Reserves
     - 46
   - Dividend Payments
     - 47
   - Branch Banking
     - 48
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TABLE OF CONTENTS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Supervision</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other Features of Industrial Loan Laws</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Uniform Legislation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. FINANCIAL STRUCTURE (57-71)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sources of Funds</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Uses of Funds</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. SERVICES AND CHARGES (72-97)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lending Services</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Types of Loans</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Duration and Size of Loans</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Methods of Loan Repayment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Customer Charges</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-Lending Services</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. OPERATING METHODS AND COLLECTION EXPERIENCE (98-118)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Methods of Obtaining and Handling Business</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Advertising Techniques</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Office Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Credit Procedure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Collection Procedure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Collection Experience</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. CREDIT RISK (119-45)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Procedure in the Analysis of Credit Risk</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Borrower Characteristics as Factors in Credit Risk</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personal Characteristics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vocational Characteristics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Financial Characteristics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Loan Characteristics as Factors in Credit Risk</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. INCOME, EXPENSES, PROFITS (146-68)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Income</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expenses</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Profits</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TABLE OF CONTENTS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. COMPETITIVE AND COOPERATIVE RELATIONS (169-83)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Competition Between Industrial Banking Companies and Other Agencies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cooperative Relations Among Industrial Banking Companies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIST OF INDUSTRIAL LOAN LAWS (184-86)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INDEX</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
List of Tables

1. Sources of Funds of Reporting Morris Plan Banking Companies, 1920-37, in Percent of Total Assets 58
2. Sources of Funds of Insured Industrial Banking Companies, 1934-38, in Percent of Total Assets 60
3. Sources of Funds of Industrial Banking Companies in 15 States, 1938, in Percent of Total Assets 62
4. Sources of Funds of Investment and Non-Investment Types of Industrial Banking Companies, 1936, in Percent of Total Assets 63
5. Percentage Distribution of Total Assets of Insured Industrial Banking Companies, 1934-38, by Size of Company and Type of Asset 67
6. Percentage Distribution of Total Assets of Reporting Members of American Industrial Bankers Association, 1936, by Type of Company 69
7. Percentage Distribution of Total Assets of Insured Industrial Banking Companies and Commercial Banks, 1934-38, by Type of Asset 70
8. Retail Installment Paper Held by Insured Commercial Banks and Industrial Banking Companies, December 31, 1939, by Type of Institution 77
9. Percentage Distribution of Outstanding Loans and Discounts of Insured Industrial Banking Companies, 1934-38, by Type of Loan 78
10. Percentage Distribution of Outstanding Loan Balances of Reporting Members of the Morris Plan Bankers Association, 1936 and 1938, by Type of Loan 79
11. Percentage Distribution of Volume of Loans Made by 3 Large Industrial Banking Companies, 1937, by Type of Loan 80
12. Percentage Distribution of Number and Volume of Loans Made by 8 Indiana Industrial Banking Companies, 1936-38, by Type of Loan 81
13. Percentage Distribution of Volume of Loans Made by a Large Morris Plan Banking Company, 1925-39, by Type of Loan 82
14. Number, Volume and Average Size of Loans Made by 10 Morris Plan Banking Companies, 1929-38 85
15. Average Size of Loans Made by 8 Indiana Industrial Banking Companies, 1936-38, by Type of Loan 86

16. Average Size of Loans Made by a Large Morris Plan Banking Company, 1925-39, by Type of Loan 87

17. Percentage Distribution of Number and Volume of Loans Made by 8 Indiana Industrial Banking Companies, 1937-38, by Size of Loan 88

18. Percentage Distribution of Volume of Loans of $300 or Less Made by Indiana Industrial Banking Companies and Small Loan Companies, 1937-38, by Size of Loan 89

19. Distribution of 29 Industrial Banking Companies, December 31, 1939, by Delinquency Percentage on Loans Delinquent 60 to 90 Days and 90 Days or More 108

20. Delinquency and Net Charge-off Percentages on Loans Made by 10 Morris Plan Banking Companies, 1929-38 110

21. Distribution of 26 Industrial Banking Companies, 1930-36, by Net Charge-off Percentage on Loans 111

22. Gross and Net Charge-off Percentages on Loans Made by Insured Industrial Banking Companies, 1934-38, by Size of Company 112

23. Gross and Net Loss Percentages on Assets Other Than Loans Held by Insured Industrial Banking Companies, 1934-38, by Size of Company 114

24. Total Gross and Net Losses per $100 of Total Assets for Three Groups of Banking Institutions, 1934-38 116-17

25. Total Gross Losses of Insured Industrial Banking Companies in Percent of Total Expenses, 1934-38, by Size of Company 118

26. Percentage Distribution of Good-Loan and Bad-Loan Samples, by Age of Borrower 125

27. Percentage Distribution of Good-Loan and Bad-Loan Samples, by Marital Status and Sex of Borrower 126

28. Percentage Distribution of Good-Loan and Bad-Loan Samples, by Number of Borrower's Dependents 128

29. Percentage Distribution of Good-Loan and Bad-Loan Samples, by Duration of Borrower's Residence 129

30. Percentage Distribution of Good-Loan and Bad-Loan Samples, by Occupation of Borrower 131

31. Percentage Distribution of Good-Loan and Bad-Loan Samples, by Industrial Affiliation of Borrower 133

32. Percentage Distribution of Good-Loan and Bad-Loan Samples, by Duration of Borrower's Employment 135
LIST OF TABLES

33. Percentage Distribution of Good-Loan and Bad-Loan Samples, by Income of Borrower 136
34. Percentage Distribution of Good-Loan and Bad-Loan Samples, by Amount of Note 138
35. Percentage Distribution of Good-Loan and Bad-Loan Samples, by Amount of Note in Percent of Borrower's Annual Income 140
36. Percentage Distribution of Good-Loan and Bad-Loan Samples, by Selected Asset and Liability Items of Borrower 141
37. Percentage Distribution of Good-Loan and Bad-Loan Samples, by Type of Security 142
38. Percentage Distribution of Good-Loan and Bad-Loan Samples, by Length of Loan Contract 144
39. Percentage Distribution of Good-Loan and Bad-Loan Samples, by Intended Use of Funds 145
40. Percentage Distribution of Total Income of North Carolina Industrial Banking Companies, 1928-38, by Source of Income 147
41. Percentage Distribution of Total Income of Insured Industrial Banking Companies, 1934-38, by Size of Company and Source of Income 148-49
42. Percentage Distribution of Total Income of Industrial Banking Companies Reporting to the American Industrial Bankers Association, 1936-37, to the Morris Plan Bankers Association, 1937, and to the Indiana Banking Department, 1937, by Source of Income 151
43. Percentage Distribution of Total Expenses of North Carolina Industrial Banking Companies, 1928-38, by Type of Expense 155
44. Percentage Distribution of Total Expenses of Insured Industrial Banking Companies, 1934-38, by Size of Company and Type of Expense 156-57
45. Percentage Distribution of Total Expenses of Industrial Banking Companies Reporting to the Morris Plan Bankers Association and to the Indiana Banking Department, 1937, by Type of Expense 158
46. Percentage Distribution of Total Expenses of Reporting Members of American Industrial Bankers Association, 1936-37, by Type of Expense 160
47. Net Profits of Reporting Morris Plan Banking Companies, 1922-38, in Dollars and in Percent of Total Equity Account 164
48. Net Profits of Insured Industrial Banking Companies, in Dollars and in Percent of Total Equity Account, 1934-38, by Size of Company 165
49. Selected Expense, Earnings and Profit Items, per $100 of Total Assets, for Insured Industrial Banking Companies and Insured Commercial Banks, 1934-38 167
FINANCIAL RESEARCH PROGRAM OF THE
NATIONAL BUREAU OF ECONOMIC RESEARCH

Studies in Consumer Instalment Financing:
Number Four