Federal Grants
and the
Business Cycle

JAMES A. MAXWELL
Clark University

NATIONAL BUREAU OF ECONOMIC RESEARCH, Inc.
OFFICERS
1952
Harry Scherman, Chairman
C. C. Balderston, President
Percival F. Brundage, Vice-President
George B. Roberts, Treasurer
W. J. Carson, Executive Director

DIRECTORS AT LARGE
Donald R. Belcher, American Telephone and Telegraph Company
Oswald W. Knauth, Beaufort, South Carolina
Simon Kuznets, University of Pennsylvania
H. W. Laidler, Executive Director, League for Industrial Democracy
Shepard Morgan, New York City
C. Reinold Noyes, Princeton, New Jersey
George B. Roberts, Vice-President, National City Bank
Beardsley Ruml, New York City
Harry Scherman, Chairman, Book-of-the-Month Club
George Soule, Bennington College
N. I. Stone, Consulting Economist
J. Raymond Walsh, New York City
Leo Wolman, Columbia University
Theodore O. Yntema, Vice President-Finance, Ford Motor Company

DIRECTORS BY UNIVERSITY APPOINTMENT
E. Wight Bakke, Yale
C. C. Balderston, Pennsylvania
Arthur F. Burns, Columbia
G. A. Elliott, Toronto
Frank W. Fetter, Northwestern
H. M. Groves, Wisconsin
Gottfried Haberler, Harvard
Clarence Heer, North Carolina
R. L. Kozelka, Minnesota
T. W. Schultz, Chicago

DIRECTORS APPOINTED BY OTHER ORGANIZATIONS
Percival F. Brundage, American Institute of Accountants
Frederick C. Mills, American Statistical Association
S. H. Ruttenberg, Congress of Industrial Organizations
Murray Shields, American Management Association
Boris Shishkin, American Federation of Labor
Donald H. Wallace, American Economic Association
Frederick V. Waugh, American Farm Economic Association
Harold F. Williamson, Economic History Association

RESEARCH STAFF
Arthur F. Burns, Director of Research
Geoffrey H. Moore, Associate Director of Research
Moses Abramovitz
Harold Barger
Morris A. Copeland
Daniel Creamer
David Durand
Solomon Fabricant
Milton Friedman
Millard Hastay
W. Braddock Hickman
Leo Wolman

Frederick C. Mills
Simon Kuznets
Clarence D. Long
Ruth P. Mack
Frederick C. Mills
Raymond J. Saulnier
Lawrence H. Seltzer
George J. Stigler
RELATION OF THE DIRECTORS
TO THE WORK AND PUBLICATIONS
OF THE NATIONAL BUREAU OF ECONOMIC RESEARCH

1. The object of the National Bureau of Economic Research is to ascertain and to present to the public important economic facts and their interpretation in a scientific and impartial manner. The Board of Directors is charged with the responsibility of ensuring that the work of the National Bureau is carried on in strict conformity with this object.

2. To this end the Board of Directors shall appoint one or more Directors of Research.

3. The Director or Directors of Research shall submit to the members of the Board, or to its Executive Committee, for their formal adoption, all specific proposals concerning researches to be instituted.

4. No report shall be published until the Director or Directors of Research shall have submitted to the Board a summary drawing attention to the character of the data and their utilization in the report, the nature and treatment of the problems involved, the main conclusions and such other information as in their opinion would serve to determine the suitability of the report for publication in accordance with the principles of the National Bureau.

5. A copy of any manuscript proposed for publication shall also be submitted to each member of the Board. For each manuscript to be so submitted a special committee shall be appointed by the President, or at his designation by the Executive Director, consisting of three Directors selected as nearly as may be one from each general division of the Board. The names of the special manuscript committee shall be stated to each Director when the summary and report described in paragraph (4) are sent to him. It shall be the duty of each member of the committee to read the manuscript. If each member of the special committee signifies his approval within thirty days, the manuscript may be published. If each member of the special committee has not signified his approval within thirty days of the transmittal of the report and manuscript, the Director of Research shall then notify each member of the Board, requesting approval or disapproval of publication, and thirty additional days shall be granted for this purpose. The manuscript shall then not be published unless at least a majority of the entire Board and a two-thirds majority of those members of the Board who shall have voted on the proposal within the time fixed for the receipt of votes on the publication proposed shall have approved.

6. No manuscript may be published, though approved by each member of the special committee, until forty-five days have elapsed from the transmittal of the summary and report. The interval is allowed for the receipt of any memorandum of dissent or reservation, together with a brief statement of his reasons, that any member may wish to express; and such memorandum of dissent or reservation shall be published with the manuscript if he so desires. Publication does not, however, imply that each member of the Board has read the manuscript, or that either members of the Board in general, or of the special committee, have passed upon its validity in every detail.

7. A copy of this resolution shall, unless otherwise determined by the Board, be printed in each copy of every National Bureau book.

(Resolution adopted October 25, 1926 and revised
February 6, 1933 and February 24, 1941)
Fiscal Studies

1 *Fiscal Planning for Total War*
   W. L. Crum, J. F. Fennelly, and Lawrence H. Seltzer

2 *Taxable and Business Income*
   Dan Throop Smith and J. Keith Butters

3 *The Nature and Tax Treatment of Capital Gains and Losses*
   Lawrence H. Seltzer

   Recent Developments in Dominion-Provincial Fiscal Relations in Canada (*Occasional Paper 25*)
   James A. Maxwell

4 *Federal Grants and the Business Cycle*
   James A. Maxwell
COMMITTEE ON FISCAL RESEARCH

In the planning and conduct of its fiscal studies the National Bureau benefits from the advice and guidance of its Committee on Fiscal Research. The members of the Committee are:

LAWRENCE H. SELTZER, Chairman
Wayne University; Research Staff, National Bureau of Economic Research

WILLIAM A. BERRIDGE
Economist, Metropolitan Life Insurance Company

ROY BLOUGH
Member, Council of Economic Advisers

W. RANDOLPH BURGESS
Chairman of Executive Committee, National City Bank of New York

ARTHUR F. BURNS
Columbia University
Director of Research, National Bureau of Economic Research

WILLIAM J. CARSON
University of Pennsylvania
Executive Director, National Bureau of Economic Research

GERHARD COLM
Chief Economist, National Planning Association

W. L. CRUM
University of California

LEWIS W. DOUGLAS
Chairman of the Board, Mutual Life Insurance Company

L. L. ECKER-RACZ
Director, Tax Advisory Staff, U. S. Treasury Department

JOHN F. FENNELLY
Glore, Forgan and Company

ROBERT M. HAIG
Columbia University

ALVIN H. HANSEN
Graduate School of Public Administration, Harvard University

CLARENCE HEER
University of North Carolina

M. SLADE KENDRICK
Cornell University

WALTER LICHTENSTEIN

WESLEY LINDOW
Vice-President and Economist, Irving Trust Company

CARL S. SHOUP
Columbia University

DAN T. SMITH
Graduate School of Business Administration, Harvard University

JOHN H. WILLIAMS
Graduate School of Public Administration, Harvard University
Economic Adviser, Federal Reserve Bank of New York
This study is a byproduct of a plan developed in 1947 by the Conference on Research in Fiscal Policy for a study of federal-state fiscal relations in the United States. In 1948 the Council of Economic Advisers to the President indicated an interest in a study of federal grants-in-aid and provided the author with facilities for work and the advice of its staff. Work was begun in the summer of 1948 and continued in the summers of 1949-50.

The present manuscript has gained through suggestions and criticisms from many people. Chapter III owes most to George Bigge and Selma Muskin of the Federal Security Agency. Chapter IV took shape through the help of Robinson Newcomb of the Council of Economic Advisers and G. P. St. Clair of the Bureau of Public Roads. Chester Rightor of the Bureau of the Budget was chiefly responsible for compilation of a consistent series of grant expenditures back to 1929. Other persons in the federal service who were helpful include David Christian, Gerhard Colm, I. M. Labovitz, Hamilton Dearborn, Harry Sheftel. At the National Bureau of Economic Research Arthur F. Burns, Geoffrey H. Moore, Thor Hultgren, George E. Lent and Lawrence H. Seltzer made searching and constructive evaluations of my manuscript. Finally, I am indebted for advice to Clarence Heer, Harold M. Groves, Donald H. Wallace, Haskell Wald, Eugene Oakes, R. M. Haig, Dan T. Smith, P. E. Taylor and Byron L. Johnson.

Martha Anderson edited the manuscript and H. Irving Forman drew the charts.

James A. Maxwell

Clark University
CONTENTS

PREFACE vii

CHAPTER

1 Brief History of Grants 1
   1 Purposes of Recent Grants 2
   2 Generalizations 7
   3 The Problem to be Investigated 9
Appendix: Definitions and Terms 10
   1 Meaning of a Federal Grant 10
   2 Closed vs. Open-end Grants 11
   3 Matching Requirements 12

   1 Federal Grants and Unemployment 15
   2 Contribution of Federal Grants to State-Local Budgets 16
   3 State-Local Financing in Prosperity and Depression 19
      Expenditure 20
      Revenue 22
      Borrowing 23

3 Grants for Public Assistance and the Business Cycle 31
   1 Origin of the Present Program of Categorical Relief 31
   2 Importance of the Assistance Program 32
   3 Cyclical Behavior 33
   4 Defects of Categorical Grants 38
      Interstate Differences in Eligibility 39
      Interstate Variation in Average Payments 39
      Interstate Differences in Grants 42
      Interstate Differences in Effort 46
      Intrastate Distortion 49
   5 General Assistance: Its Present Position 50
   6 Federal Security Administration Proposal of 1949 57
   7 Proposal of the Committee on Federal-State Relations 58
CHAPTER

8 Grants Based on a 'Standard Effort' and a 'National Minimum' 59

9 Graphic Representation 61

10 Variation in Minimum Level, Number of Recipients, and Standard Effort from Depression to Prosperity 64

11 Application to a Comprehensive Grant Scheme 64

12 Dangers and Difficulties in Countercyclical Adjustment of Grants 68

4 Public Works, Federal Grants, and the Business Cycle 72

1 Public-Private Construction 72

A Depression Shrinkage of State-Local Construction 75

B Types of Public Construction Expenditure 75

Airports 80

Hospitals 81

Housing 81

Highways 81

2 Factors Influencing Timing of Public Works 83

A Influence of War Created Needs 83

B Complementary Nature of Some Public Works 83

C Normal Replacement of Plant 85

D Building vs. Engineering Construction 88

E Limited Expansibility of Public Works 90

F Period Required for Planning and Construction 91

3 Countercyclical Spending after 1930 95

A Relief and Work Relief: FERA and WPA 96

B PWA 97

4 Possible Modifications 100

A Centralization of Federal Construction 100

B Grants for Planning 102

C Construction Grants 104

D Geographical Allocation of Grants 108

E Location of Authority 108

F Authority to Lend 110

INDEX 113
TABLE

1 Total Federal Grants (regular & emergency), Fiscal Years, 1919-1949
2 Grants, Fiscal Years, 1929, 1937, 1945, Percentage Distribution by Purpose
3 Shared Revenues and Payments in Lieu of Taxes, Fiscal Years, 1929-1949
4 Federal Grants and Unemployment, 1919-1949
5 Federal Grants and State and Local Expenditures, 1920-1948
6 Net State and Local Expenditures, 1920-1948
7 Capital Outlay, 1920-1945
8 Expenditure for Operation by Function, Cities with Populations of 100,000 or More, 1923-1940
9 Selected Functional Expenditures for Operation of State Governments, 1919-1945
10 State and Local Tax Collections, and State Sales Tax Collections, 1919-1945
11 Tax-Delinquency Trend, 1930-1946
12 Interest-bearing Debt of State and Local Governments Outstanding June 30, 1919-1949
13 Gross State and Local Borrowing, Long-Term and Temporary, 1929-1939
14 Coupon Rates of State and Municipal Bonds Sold, Percentage Distribution, 1929-1934
15 Average Interest Rates Payable on Debt at End of Calendar Year, 1929-1940
16 Categorical Assistance, Average Monthly Payments per Recipient and Total Payments by Program, 1936-1950
17 Public Assistance Recipients under the Social Security Act, Monthly, 1936-1950
18 Recipient Rates for Old Age Assistance per 1,000 Persons 65 and Older, and for Aid to Dependent Children per 1,000 Persons Under 18 Years, December 1948
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table Number</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>Average Payment to Recipients of Old Age Assistance by States, December 1948</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>Public Assistance: Expenditure per Inhabitant from Federal Funds, 1936-1948</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>Relation of Fiscal Effort to Payments for Categorical Assistance, 1947</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>'Poor' and 'Rich' States According to Expenditure for Categorical Assistance, Fiscal 1947 as Percentage of Income Payments 1946</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td>Ratios of Payments to Recipients of Old Age Assistance to Payments for General Assistance, July 1948</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>General Assistance, Number of Recipients and Expenditures, Monthly, 1936-1950</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td>General Assistance, Average Monthly Payment per Recipient, December 1948</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26</td>
<td>General Assistance, Number of Recipients per 100,000 Estimated Civilian Population, by States, December 1946-1948</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27</td>
<td>New Construction Outlay, 1915-1949</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28</td>
<td>New Public Construction, Federal and Nonfederal, by Source of Funds, 1918-1949</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29</td>
<td>New Public Construction by Type, 1926-1949</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30</td>
<td>Public Construction, Federal Grants, 1918-1949</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32</td>
<td>Building and Engineering Construction, 1936-1940</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33</td>
<td>Construction Employment, 1929-1946</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34</td>
<td>Average Number of Weeks Required to Complete Various Types of Nonfederal Project of Different Size</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35</td>
<td>Average Delay in Months for Low Rent Public Housing Projects</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36</td>
<td>Estimated Duration of Capital Improvements Projects Submitted to the U. S. Public Work Reserve, Percentage Distribution</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37</td>
<td>Hypothetical Variations in Level of Public Construction and Federal Grants from Prosperity to Depression</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHART

1 Federal Grants and Unemployment, 1919-1949

2 Federal Grants as Percentage of State and Local Expenditures, 1929-1948

3 Net State and Local Expenditures, 1920-1948

4 Selected Expenditures of State and City Governments, 1919-1945

5 Number of Recipients of Old Age Assistance, Aid to Dependent Children (children), Aid to the Blind, General Assistance (corrected for seasonal variation), by Months, 1936-1950

6 Recipient Rates for Old Age Assistance per 1,000 Persons 65 and Older, December 1948, and Per Capita Income 1945-1947, by States

7 Average Payments for Old Age Assistance, December 1948, and Per Capita Income, 1945-1947, by States

8 Recipients of General Assistance per 100,000 Estimated Civilian Population, December 1948, and Per Capita Income, 1945-1947, by States

9 Idealized Standard Effort, National Minimum Grants

10 New Construction Outlay, Public and Private, 1915-1950

11 Federal Construction as Percentage of New Public Construction, 1918-1950