Conference on Business Cycles

Held under the auspices of
Universities-National Bureau Committee for Economic Research

NATIONAL BUREAU OF ECONOMIC RESEARCH, INC.

NEW YORK, 1951
OFFICERS
1951
Boris Shishkin, Chairman
Harry Scherman, President
C. C. Balderston, Vice-President
George B. Roberts, Treasurer
W. J. Carson, Executive Director
Martha Anderson, Editor

DIRECTORS AT LARGE
D. R. Belcher, American Telephone & Telegraph Co.
Oswald W. Knauth, Beaufort, South Carolina
Simon Kuznets, University of Pennsylvania
H. W. Laidler, Executive Director, League for Industrial Democracy
Shepard Morgan, New York City
C. Reinold Noyes, Princeton, New Jersey
George B. Roberts, Vice-President, National City Bank
Beardsley Ruml, New York City
Harry Scherman, Chairman, Book-of-the-Month Club
George Soule, Bennington College
N. I. Stone, Consulting Economist
J. Raymond Walsh, New York City
Leo Wolman, Columbia University
Theodore O. Yntema, Vice President-Finance, Ford Motor Company

DIRECTORS BY UNIVERSITY APPOINTMENT
E. Wight Bakke, Yale  H. M. Groves, Wisconsin
C. C. Balderston, Pennsylvania  Gottfried Haberler, Harvard
Arthur F. Burns, Columbia  Clarence Heer, North Carolina
G. A. Elliott, Toronto  R. L. Kozelka, Minnesota
Frank W. Fetter, Northwestern  Paul M. O’Leary, Cornell
T. W. Schultz, Chicago

DIRECTORS APPOINTED BY OTHER ORGANIZATIONS
Percival F. Brundage, American Institute of Accountants
Thomas C. Cochran, Economic History Association
Frederick C. Mills, American Statistical Association
S. H. Ruttenberg, Congress of Industrial Organizations
Murray Shields, American Management Association
Boris Shishkin, American Federation of Labor
Donald H. Wallace, American Economic Association
Frederick V. Waugh, American Farm Economic Association

RESEARCH STAFF
Arthur F. Burns, Director of Research
Geoffrey H. Moore, Associate Director of Research
Moses Abramovitz  F. F. Hill
Harold Barger  Thor Hultgren
Morris A. Copeland  Simon Kuznets
Daniel Creamer  Clarence D. Long
David Durand  Ruth P. Mack
Solomon Fabricant  Frederick C. Mills
Milton Friedman  Raymond J. Saulnier
Millard Hastay  Lawrence H. Seltzer
W. Braddock Hickman  George J. Stigler
Leo Wolman
Relational of National Bureau Directors to Publications Reporting Conference Proceedings

Since the present volume is a record of conference proceedings, it has been exempted from the rules governing submission of manuscripts to, and critical review by, the Board of Directors of the National Bureau. It has, however, been reviewed and accepted for publication by the Director of Research.

(Resolution adopted July 6, 1948 and revised November 21, 1949)
Special Conference Series

1 Problems in the Study of Economic Growth

2 Conference on Business Cycles
UNIVERSITIES-NATIONAL BUREAU COMMITTEE FOR ECONOMIC RESEARCH

This Committee is a cooperative venture of universities and the National Bureau. Its guiding objective is the encouragement of economic research on problems susceptible of objective treatment and of sufficiently broad scope to merit attention by institutions serving a scientific and public interest.

SIMON KUZNETS, Chairman
University of Pennsylvania

MOSES ABRAMOVITZ, Stanford University
V. LEWIS BASSIE, University of Illinois
JOHN D. BLACK, Harvard University
FRANCIS M. BODDY, University of Minnesota
ARTHUR F. BURNS, National Bureau of Economic Research
JAMES S. EARLEY, University of Wisconsin
G. HEBERTON EVANS, JR., The Johns Hopkins University
R. A. GORDON, University of California
ALBERT G. HART, Columbia University
MILTON S. HEATH, University of North Carolina
RICHARD B. HEFLEBOWER, Northwestern University
BENJAMIN H. HIGGINS, McGill University
M. SLADE KENDRICK, Cornell University
ADOLPH LOWE, New School for Social Research
D. C. MACGREGOR, University of Toronto
OSKAR MORGENSTERN, Princeton University
WILLIAM G. MURRAY, Iowa State College of Agriculture and Mechanic Arts
LLOYD G. REYNOLDS, Yale University
PAUL A. SAMUELSON, Massachusetts Institute of Technology
THEODORE W. SCHULTZ, University of Chicago
I. L. SHARPMAN, University of Michigan
HAROLD M. SOMERS, University of Buffalo
JOSEPH J. SPENGLER, Duke University
EMANUEL STEIN, New York University
GEORGE W. STOCKING, Vanderbilt University
JOHN R. STOCKTON, University of Texas
M. C. URQUHART, Queen's University
RUTLEDGE VNING, University of Virginia
FOREWORD

by GOTTFRIED HABERLER

The present volume contains the papers presented and the ensuing discussion at the Conference on Business Cycles held in New York, November 25-7, 1949. Since no stenographic record of the discussion from the floor was taken, only those contributions to the debate which were submitted in writing are printed. The authors were given a chance to revise their papers and to append replies to their critics — an opportunity of which most speakers availed themselves.

The Conference grew out of a recommendation by the Universities-National Bureau Committee for Economic Research, and its program was prepared by a committee consisting of Moses Abramovitz, R. A. Gordon, Simon Kuznets, Jacob Marschak, Geoffrey Moore, Hans Neisser, Arthur Smithies, and myself as chairman.

The purpose of the Conference was to afford the participants, about 70 in number, an opportunity to discuss thoroughly some of the major problems and results of business cycle research. The highly successful Conferences on Research in Income and Wealth were the obvious model for the Business Cycles Conference. I am afraid we have not been able to do for business cycle research as much as the Income Conferences have been able to do for income analysis. The reasons are fairly evident: business cycle research is a broader field; the basic cleavages in approach are much deeper, reaching down to the very philosophical foundations of scientific analysis of social phenomena; hence the scholars interested in our subject are not such a closely knit group as those engaged in income analysis.

I believe, nevertheless, that it was the common opinion of the participants that the Conference was a worthwhile enterprise.

The volume falls into three parts. Part I consists of papers dealing with the major empirical approaches to the study of business cycles, their methods and results.

Wesley C. Mitchell had agreed to open the Conference and to unveil for the first time in public some of the results of his book, *What Happens during Business Cycles*, which has since been published by the National Bureau. Unfortunately, he did not live to carry out his plan, but his unfinished manuscript was circulated to the conferees and Arthur F. Burns read...
a report on it. The book was commented on by Jacob Marschak, and Burns wrote a reply for the present volume.

Next comes a lengthy soul-searching paper by Carl Christ of the Cowles Commission, which exemplifies the econometric approach to the cycle. Incisive comments follow by Milton Friedman and Lawrence Klein, the latter drawing forth a reply by Christ. Some further brief comments on Christ's paper were contributed by Geoffrey Moore and Jan Tinbergen.

Tinbergen's paper on the testing of business cycle theories was commented on by Tjalling Koopmans who took the occasion to make some remarks also on the previous discussion. David McCord Wright presents some reflections on the broader philosophical aspects raised by the National Bureau of Economic Research and the Cowles Commission.

Schumpeter's essay on the historical approach to business cycles is an unrevised draft which he distributed to the Conference and which he intended to revise later; but he was not able to do so before his death in January 1950. As usual, he spoke without notes, with great vigor and temperament. His paper gave Simon Kuznets an opportunity to state his views on the functions of the historical method in business cycle research.

R. A. Gordon's progress report on his extensive study of cyclical experience in the interwar period and Hans Neisser's comment round out the discussion concerning methods of business cycle research.

Part II of the present volume deals with the behavior of profits, investment and inventories in the cycle. The papers by Thor Hultgren and Moses Abramovitz have grown out of National Bureau investigations while Lawrence Klein's extensive study, although actually written during his stay with the National Bureau, is in the econometric, Cowles Commission, style. The comments by Irwin Friend, James W. Angell, Wassily Leontief and Lloyd Metzler give the reader an idea of the lively discussion evoked by the three papers.

Part III deals with broader questions. Ashley Wright's paper discusses business cycle research from the point of view of business policy, while Arthur Smithies' paper deals with government policy and the cycle. My own paper tries to answer the question whether there would be a cycle in partially planned economies — leaving out the case of completely planned economies of the Russian type, a gap which is filled by Abram Bergson's discussion.

The task of getting together the papers and discussion remarks was distributed among the members of the program committee of the Conference, while the final preparation for publication was in the capable hands of Thor Hultgren and Geoffrey Moore. Martha Anderson contributed her valued services as editor, H. Irving Forman designed the necessary charts, and Regina Sands constructed the index.
Contents

Part One
GENERAL PAPERS

Foreword vii
Gottfried Haberler

Mitchell on What Happens during Business Cycles 3
Arthur F. Burns

COMMENT 14
Jacob Marschak
Reply by Mr. Burns 25

A Test of an Econometric Model for the United States, 1921-1947 35
Carl Christ
1 Econometric Models: General Concepts and Definitions 35
2 Prediction: the Reduced Form of a System of Structural Equations 43
3 Statistical Estimation Procedures: the Structural Parameters 45
4 Statistical Estimation Procedures: the Parameters of the Reduced Form 49
5 Klein’s Model III 50
6 Marshall’s Test of Klein’s Model III 55
7 Revisions of Klein’s Equations 59
8 Description of Tests Used 67
9 Plan of Computations 70
10 Results of Computations 71
11 Discussion of Results of Computations 78
12 Summary and Conclusion 87

Appendix 87
A Time Series B
B Sources of Data and Construction of Time Series 91
C Time Series for 1946-1947 98
D Choice of Predetermined Variables for Estimation by the Abbreviated Variant of the Limited Information Method 103
E Estimation of the Parameters of the Reduced Form 104
F Calculated Disturbances for CLI Limited Information Estimates of Equations 105
G References 105
CONTENTS

COMMENT
Milton Friedman 107
Lawrence R. Klein 114
Reply by Mr. Christ 123
Geoffrey H. Moore 127
Jan Tinbergen 129

Reformulation of Current Business Cycle Theories as Refutable Hypotheses 131
Jan Tinbergen

1 Purpose and Nature of Current Theories 131
2 Methods of Testing 133
3 Critique of These Methods 135
4 Reformulation of Theories 136
5 Models So Far Tested; a Program 139

COMMENT
Tjalling C. Koopmans 141
David McCord Wright 145

Historical Approach to the Analysis of Business Cycles 149
Joseph A. Schumpeter

COMMENT
Simon Kuznets 155

Cyclical Experience in the Interwar Period: the Investment Boom of the Twenties 163
R. A. Gordon

1 Major and Minor Cycles 163
2 The Cycle of 1919-1921 168
3 Beginnings of the Boom 174
4 A Look Back 179
5 Changes in the Composition of Output and Employment 180
6 Nonmonetary Stimuli to Investment 188
7 Monetary, Financial, and International Factors 206
8 The End of the Boom 208
9 Some Tentative Conclusions 210

COMMENT
Hans Neisser 215
Adolph Lowe 222
部份二

利润，投资，和商业周期

《工业公司财富的周期差异》
Thor Hultgren

评论
Irwin Friend
227
答复由Mr. Hultgren
232

《投资行为研究》
Lawrence R. Klein
1 一般投资方面
2 铁路投资在美国
3 电力照明和电力投资在美国

评论
James W. Angell
233
Wassily Leontief
310
答复由Mr. Klein
313

《库存投资对商业周期的影响》
Moses Abramovitz

评论
Lloyd A. Metzler
325
进一步答复由Mr. Abramovitz
333

部份三

商业周期研究和政策

《商业周期研究和商业政策》
C. Ashley Wright
1 商业周期研究和商业政策
2 商业周期预测
3 使用统计指标进行预测

评论
Millard Hastay
368
Ruth P. Mack
370
Geoffrey H. Moore
370
答复由Mr. Wright
372
Business Cycles in a Planned Economy
Gottfried Haberler

COMMENT
Abram Bergson
Adolph Lowe
David McCord Wright
N. I. Stone
Evsey D. Domar
Reply by Mr. Haberler

Business Cycle Analysis and Public Policy
Arthur Smithies
1 Introduction
2 Institutional or Structural Change
3 Direct Control over Endogenous Variables
4 Control of Exogenous Variables — Compensatory Action

COMMENT
J. M. Clark
Leonid Hurwicz
Carl Christ

Index