Education as an Industry
Education as an Industry

A Conference of the Universities-National Bureau Committee for Economic Research

NATIONAL BUREAU OF ECONOMIC RESEARCH

OFFICERS

Arthur F. Burns, Honorary Chairman
James J. O’Leary, Chairman
Moses Abramovitz, Vice Chairman
Martin S. Feldstein, President
Thomas D. Titman, Treasurer
Douglas H. Eldridge, Executive Secretary
Victor R. Fuchs, Vice President, Co-director, NBER-West
David T. Krieger, Director, Energy and Environmental Research
Edwin Kuh, Vice President and Director, Computer Research Center
Robert E. Lipsey, Director, International Studies
Sherman J. Markel, Co-director, NBER-West
Gottfried Haberler, Director, Business Cycle Research
Joel Popkin, Director, NBER-Washington
Edward K. Smith, Director, Corporate Planning and Development

DIRECTORS AT LARGE

Alberton Bean, International Multifoods Corporation
Andrew F. Brimmer, Brimmer & Company, Inc.
Otis F. Brubaker, United Steelworkers of America
Arthur P. Burns, Board of Governors of the Federal Reserve System
Wallace J. Campbell, Foundation for Cooperative Housing
Emilio G. Collado, Adels Investment Company, S.A.
Solomon Fabricant, New York University
Martin S. Feldstein, Harvard University
Eugene P. Foley, Pan American Building, New York
Edward L. Gostton, Varion Associates
David L. Grove, International Business Machines Corporation
Walter W. Heller, University of Minnesota

DIRECTORS BY APPOINTMENT OF OTHER ORGANIZATIONS

Moses Abramovitz, Stanford
Gardner Ackley, Michigan
Charles H. Berry, Princeton
Otto Eckstein, Harvard
Walter D. Fisher, Northwestern
John H. Karchen, Massachusetts
J. C. LaForce, California, Los Angeles
Robert J. Lampman, Wisconsin
Walter E. Hoadley, Bank of America
Roy E. Moore, Becker Securities Corporation
Geoffrey H. Moore, National Bureau of Economic Research
J. Wilson Newman, Dain & Breeden, Inc.
James J. O'Leary, United States Trust Company of New York
Rudolph A. Orwald, American Federation of Labor and Congress of Industrial Organizations
Peter C. Peterson, Lehman Brothers
Robert V. Roos, Brown Brothers Harriman & Co.
Eli Shapiro, The Travellers Corporation
Arnold M. Schlower, Jamaica Tower, Boston, Massachusetts
Lazarus Teper, International Ladies' Garment Workers Union

DIRECTORS BY UNIVERSITY APPOINTMENT

Paul W. McCracken, American Statistical Association
Eugene A. Birnbaum, American Management Associations
Carl F. Christ, American Economic Association
Robert G. Dederick, National Association of Business Economists
Thomas D. Flynn, American Institute of Certified Public Accountants
Franklin A. Lindsay, Committee for Economic Development

DIRECTORS EMERITI

Perceval F. Brandwe
Frank W. Fetter
Gottfried Haberler

SENIOR RESEARCH STAFF

Gary S. Becker
Charlotte Benchman
Phillip Cagan
Staakey Diller
Solomon Fabricant
Martin S. Feldstein
Milton Friedman
Victor R. Fuchs
J. Royce Cinn

Raymond W. Goldsmith
Michael Gert
Michael Grossman
John F. Klein
John W. Kendrick
Irving B. Kravis
Anne O. Krueger
David T. Krieger
Edwin Kuh

William M. Landes
Robert E. Lipsey
Sherman J. Matsu
Beatrix B. Mandelbrot
John B. Meyer
Robert T. Michael
Jacob Miner
Ihle Mintz
Geoffrey H. Moore

M. Ishaq Nadiri
Joel Popkin
Richard Posner
Nancy Ruggles
Rudolph A. Orwald
Anna J. Schwartz
Edward K. Smith
Robert J. Willis
Victor Zarnowitz,
Relation of the National Bureau Directors to Publications Reporting Conference Proceedings

Since the present volume is a record of conference proceedings, it has been exempted from the rules governing submission of manuscripts to, and critical review by, the Board of Directors of the National Bureau.

(Resolution adopted July 6, 1948, as revised November 21, 1949, and April 20, 1968)
UNIVERSITIES–NATIONAL BUREAU COMMITTEE
FOR ECONOMIC RESEARCH

This committee is a cooperative venture of universities and the National Bureau. Its guiding objective is the encouragement of economic research on problems susceptible of objective treatment and of sufficiently broad scope to merit attention by institutions serving a scientific and public interest.

Participating universities and their present representatives are:

Brown, Jerome L. Stein
California (Berkeley), Daniel McFadden
California (Los Angeles), J. C. La Force
California (San Diego), Richard Attiyeh
Carnegie-Mellon, Edward Prescott
Chicago, Lester G. Telser
Columbia, Robert Mundell
Cornell, S. C. Tsiang
Duke, T. Dudley Wallace
Harvard, John V. Lintner
Illinois, George G. Judge
Indiana, Franz Gehrels
Iowa State, Dudley G. Luckett
Johns Hopkins, Carl F. Christ
Maryland, Barbara Bergman
Massachusetts Institute of Technology, Richard S. Eckaus
McGill, Alex G. Vivas
Michigan, Harold T. Shapiro
Michigan State, Victor Smith
Minnesota, James M. Henderson

New School for Social Research, Thomas Victorisz
New York, M. Ishaq Nadiri
North Carolina, Henry A. Latané
Northwestern, Robert Eisner
Ohio State, Donald O. Parsons
Pennsylvania, Jere R. Behrman
Pittsburgh, S. H. Chou
Princeton, Edwin S. Mills
Purdue, Patric H. Hendershot
Queen’s, Martin F. J. Prachowny
Rochester, Walter Y. Oi
Stanford, Moses Abramovitz
State University of New York (Buffalo), Daniel Hamburg
Texas, Samuel L. Myers, Jr.
Toronto, Richard Bird
Vanderbilt, Anthony M. Tang
Virginia, Richard T. Selden
Washington (St. Louis), Hyman Minsky
Washington (Seattle), Richard W. Parks
Wisconsin, Leonard W. Weiss
Yale, Richard Ruggles

The National Bureau of Economic Research representative is:
Robert E. Lipsey

Members at large are:
Irma Adelman
Bela A. Balassa
Carl E. Beigie
Daniel Creamer
Frank de Leeuw
Walter S. Salant
George J. Stigler

Secretary:
Christine Mortensen

The officers of the Universities–National Bureau Committee are: Edwin S. Mills, Chairman; Leonard W. Weiss, Vice-Chairman; and Christine Mortensen, Secretary. The members of the Executive Committee are: Irma Adelman, Richard Bird, Robert Eisner, Robert E. Lipsey, Dudley G. Luckett, Edwin S. Mills, and Leonard W. Weiss.
Funds for the economic research conference program of the National Bureau of Economic Research are supplied by the National Science Foundation.
Contents

Introduction xi

Part I EDUCATIONAL PRODUCTION

1. The Ph.D. Production Process
   David W. Breneman 3

2. Scholastic Achievement: Its Determinants and Effects in the Education Industry
   Dennis J. Dugan 53
   Comments:
   Barbara L. Heyns 84
   Frank Levy 90

3. Graduation, Graduate School Attendance, and Investments in College Training
   Lewis J. Perl 95
   Comments:
   Leonard Baird 136
   Alvin K. Klevorick 141

4. Concepts of Economic Efficiency and Educational Production
   Henry M. Levin 149
   Comments:
   Eric A. Hanushek 191
   Harold W. Watts 197

Part II COMPENSATORY EDUCATION

5. Cost and Performance of Computer-Assisted Instruction for Education of Disadvantaged Children
Part III HIGHER EDUCATION

   Leonard S. Miller 293
   Comments:
   Stephen A. Hoenack 346

8. Productivity Trends in Higher Education
   June O'Neill 349
   Comments:
   George B. Weathersby 366

9. Instructional Costs of University Outputs
   Robert M. Oliver and David S. P. Hopkins 371
   Comments:
   Colin E. Bell 405
   Estelle James 408

10. Faculty-Student Ratios in U.S. Higher Education
    Roy Radner 415
    Comments:
    Gus Haggstrom 445
    Kenneth D. Roose 450

Part IV POLICY ISSUES

11. Policy Issues in the Education Industry
    Joseph N. Froomkin 455
    Comments:
    Jerry Miner 474
    J. Alan Thomas 478

Index 481