

This PDF is a selection from an out-of-print volume from the National Bureau of Economic Research

Volume Title: The Nature and Tax Treatment of Capital Gains and Losses

Volume Author/Editor: Lawrence Howard Seltzer, assisted by Selma F. Goldsmith and M. Slade Kendrick

Volume Publisher: NBER

Volume ISBN: 0-870-14119-8

Volume URL: <http://www.nber.org/books/selt51-1>

Publication Date: 1951

Chapter Title: Front matter to "The Nature and Tax Treatment of Capital Gains and Losses"

Chapter Author: Lawrence Howard Seltzer, Selma F. Goldsmith, M. Slade Kendrick

Chapter URL: <http://www.nber.org/chapters/c4473>

Chapter pages in book: (p. -23 - 0)

THE NATURE AND
TAX TREATMENT OF
CAPITAL GAINS AND LOSSES

LAWRENCE H. SELTZER
Professor of Economics, Wayne University

With the assistance of

SELMA F. GOLDSMITH

and

M. SLADE KENDRICK

NATIONAL BUREAU OF ECONOMIC RESEARCH, INC.

Copyright, 1951, by

National Bureau of Economic Research, Inc.

1819 Broadway, New York 23

All Rights Reserved

Composition by Oscar Leventhal, Inc.

Presswork and binding by H. Wolff

**RELATION OF THE DIRECTORS
TO THE WORK AND PUBLICATIONS
OF THE NATIONAL BUREAU OF ECONOMIC RESEARCH**

1. The object of the National Bureau of Economic Research is to ascertain and to present to the public important economic facts and their interpretation in a scientific and impartial manner. The Board of Directors is charged with the responsibility of ensuring that the work of the National Bureau is carried on in strict conformity with this object.

2. To this end the Board of Directors shall appoint one or more Directors of Research.

3. The Director or Directors of Research shall submit to the members of the Board, or to its Executive Committee, for their formal adoption, all specific proposals concerning researches to be instituted.

4. No report shall be published until the Director or Directors of Research shall have submitted to the Board a summary drawing attention to the character of the data and their utilization in the report, the nature and treatment of the problems involved, the main conclusions and such other information as in their opinion would serve to determine the suitability of the report for publication in accordance with the principles of the National Bureau.

5. A copy of any manuscript proposed for publication shall also be submitted to each member of the Board. For each manuscript to be so submitted a special committee shall be appointed by the President, or at his designation by the Executive Director, consisting of three Directors selected as nearly as may be one from each general division of the Board. The names of the special manuscript committee shall be stated to each Director when the summary and report described in paragraph (4) are sent to him. It shall be the duty of each member of the committee to read the manuscript. If each member of the special committee signifies his approval within thirty days, the manuscript may be published. If each member of the special committee has not signified his approval within thirty days of the transmittal of the report and manuscript, the Director of Research shall then notify each member of the Board, requesting approval or disapproval of publication, and thirty additional days shall be granted for this purpose. The manuscript shall then not be published unless at least a majority of the entire Board and a two-thirds majority of those members of the Board who shall have voted on the proposal within the time fixed for the receipt of votes on the publication proposed shall have approved.

6. No manuscript may be published, though approved by each member of the special committee, until forty-five days have elapsed from the transmittal of the summary and report. The interval is allowed for the receipt of any memorandum of dissent or reservation, together with a brief statement of his reasons, that any member may wish to express; and such memorandum of dissent or reservation shall be published with the manuscript if he so desires. Publication does not, however, imply that each member of the Board has read the manuscript, or that either members of the Board in general, or of the special committee, have passed upon its validity in every detail.

7. A copy of this resolution shall, unless otherwise determined by the Board, be printed in each copy of every National Bureau book.

*(Resolution adopted October 25, 1926 and revised
February 6, 1933 and February 24, 1941)*

OFFICERS

1951

Boris Shishkin, *Chairman*
Harry Scherman, *President*
C. C. Balderston, *Vice-President*
George B. Roberts, *Treasurer*
W. J. Carson, *Executive Director*
Martha Anderson, *Editor*

DIRECTORS AT LARGE

D. R. Belcher, *American Telephone & Telegraph Co.*
Oswald W. Knauth, *Beaufort, South Carolina*
Simon Kuznets, *University of Pennsylvania*
H. W. Laidler, *Executive Director, League for Industrial Democracy*
Shepard Morgan, *New York City*
C. Reinold Noyes, *Princeton, New Jersey*
George B. Roberts, *Vice-President, National City Bank*
Beardsley Ruml, *New York City*
Harry Scherman, *Chairman, Book-of-the-Month Club*
George Soule, *Bennington College*
N. I. Stone, *Consulting Economist*
J. Raymond Walsh, *WMCA Broadcasting Co.*
Leo Wolman, *Columbia University*
Theodore O. Yntema, *Vice President-Finance, Ford Motor Company*

DIRECTORS BY UNIVERSITY APPOINTMENT

E. Wight Bakke, *Yale*
C. C. Balderston, *Pennsylvania*
Arthur F. Burns, *Columbia*
G. A. Elliott, *Toronto*
Frank W. Fetter, *Northwestern*
H. M. Groves, *Wisconsin*
Gottfried Haberler, *Harvard*
Clarence Heer, *North Carolina*
R. L. Kozelka, *Minnesota*
Paul M. O'Leary, *Cornell*
T. W. Schultz, *Chicago*

DIRECTORS APPOINTED BY OTHER ORGANIZATIONS

Percival F. Brundage, *American Institute of Accountants*
Thomas C. Cochran, *Economic History Association*
Frederick C. Mills, *American Statistical Association*
S. H. Ruttenberg, *Congress of Industrial Organizations*
Murray Shields, *American Management Association*
Boris Shishkin, *American Federation of Labor*
Donald H. Wallace, *American Economic Association*
Frederick V. Waugh, *American Farm Economic Association*

RESEARCH STAFF

Arthur F. Burns, *Director of Research*
Geoffrey H. Moore, *Associate Director of Research*
Moses Abramovitz
Harold Barger
Morris A. Copeland
Daniel Creamer
David Durand
Solomon Fabricant
Milton Friedman
Millard Hastay
W. Braddock Hickman
Leo Wolman
F. F. Hill
Thor Hultgren
Simon Kuznets
Clarence D. Long
Ruth P. Mack
Frederick C. Mills
Raymond J. Saulnier
Lawrence H. Seltzer
George J. Stigler

NATIONAL BUREAU OF ECONOMIC RESEARCH

Fiscal Studies

1 *Fiscal Planning for Total War*

W. L. Crum, J. F. Fennelly, and Lawrence H. Seltzer

2 *Taxable and Business Income*

Dan Throop Smith and J. Keith Butters

3 *The Nature and Tax Treatment of Capital Gains and Losses*

Lawrence H. Seltzer

Recent Developments in Dominion-Provincial Fiscal Relations
in Canada (*Occasional Paper 25*)

J. A. Maxwell

COMMITTEE ON FISCAL RESEARCH

In the planning and conduct of its fiscal studies the National Bureau benefits from the advice and guidance of its Committee on Fiscal Research. The members of the Committee are:

LAWRENCE H. SELTZER, Chairman
Wayne University; Research Staff, National Bureau of Economic Research

WILLIAM A. BERRIDGE
Economist, Metropolitan Life Insurance Company

ROY BLOUGH
Member, Council of Economic Advisers

W. RANDOLPH BURGESS
Chairman of Executive Committee, National City Bank of New York

ARTHUR F. BURNS
Columbia University
Director of Research, National Bureau of Economic Research

WILLIAM J. CARSON
University of Pennsylvania
Executive Director, National Bureau of Economic Research

GERHARD COLM
Staff, Council of Economic Advisers

W. L. CRUM
University of California

LEWIS W. DOUGLAS
Chairman of the Board, Mutual Life Insurance Company

L. L. ECKER-RACZ
Director, Tax Advisory Staff, U. S. Treasury Department

JOHN F. FENNELLY
Glore, Forgan and Company

ROBERT M. HAIG
Columbia University

ALVIN H. HANSEN
Graduate School of Public Administration, Harvard University

CLARENCE HEER
University of North Carolina

M. SLADE KENDRICK
Cornell University

WALTER LICHTENSTEIN

WESLEY LINDOW
Vice-President and Economist, Irving Trust Company

CARL S. SHOUP
Columbia University

DAN T. SMITH
Graduate School of Business Administration, Harvard University

JOHN H. WILLIAMS
Graduate School of Public Administration, Harvard University
Economic Adviser, Federal Reserve Bank of New York

PREFACE

Whether the profits a man realizes by selling stocks, bonds, land, houses, or other property not a part of his stock-in-trade for more than they cost him should be taxed as income or exempted in whole or in part has long been a moot question in the United States. Broadly known as capital gains, such profits, and the correlative capital losses, have been subjected to frequent changes in tax treatment since the beginning of the federal income tax. At all times the American treatment has differed materially from that of Great Britain and most Continental countries. Wide differences of opinion still exist regarding not only the most desirable policy but also the underlying facts and their interpretation and even the theoretical principles involved.

In view of the continuing public interest in the question, the Conference on Research in Fiscal Policy decided in 1943, under the chairmanship of W. L. Crum, to sponsor an objective investigation of the facts, as far as they could be made accessible, and of the main issues. The Directing Committee consisted of Lawrence H. Seltzer of Wayne University, Chairman, Selma F. Goldsmith, then of the Bureau of Agricultural Economics, now of the Department of Commerce, and M. Slade Kendrick of Cornell University.

While the major portion of the study and the setting down of its findings fell to me, my associates lightened the task considerably. Mrs. Goldsmith not only assembled, coordinated, and refined the figures on capital gains and losses from *Statistics of Income* but also, with great skill and resourcefulness, filled gaps and revealed many significant relations or their absence. Nearly all the statistical appendix is her work. She contributed also a preliminary draft of a substantial segment of Chapter 5, in which the figures are reviewed, as well as related materials used in several other chapters. Her chief assistant was Bella Shapiro; others were Marion Gillim and Merton Miller.

Professor Kendrick supplied several preliminary memoranda, including a survey of the tax treatment of capital gains and losses in other countries before World War II and various materials on real estate and corporations, and made helpful suggestions for refining the language in the final manuscript.

Professor Crum took a continuous active interest in the project from its inception, reading the drafts of every chapter with conscientious care and making numerous fruitful suggestions.

Robert Murray Haig of Columbia University, besides giving me the benefit of his own searching criticism, transmitted comments of members of his graduate seminar in public finance who reviewed the manuscript in the spring of 1949.

In addition, various members of the National Bureau's Research Staff and of its Committee on Fiscal Research read parts or all of the manuscript and offered valuable criticisms and suggestions: Arthur F. Burns, C. Lowell Harriss, Carl S. Shoup, and George J. Stigler of Columbia University; Dan Throop Smith of Harvard University, Milton Friedman of the University of Chicago, and Daniel M. Holland and Geoffrey H. Moore.

Many others have aided the enterprise. In writing Chapter 10 on the tax treatment of capital gains and losses abroad, I had the advantage not only of examining Professor Kendrick's materials on the prewar situation but also a manuscript by Paul Wueller of Pennsylvania State College, covering the same period. In bringing these studies up to date, I received valuable aid from Percival Brundage, senior partner of Price, Waterhouse and Co., who communicated with the foreign offices and correspondents of his firm on my behalf. Officials of various embassies and legations in Washington, and in some instances, their home offices as well, were also very cooperative.

Among others to whom I am indebted for their counsel and criticism are Harold M. Groves of the University of Wisconsin, Roswell H. Magill of Columbia University, Stanley S. Surrey of Harvard University, J. K. Lasser of J. K. Lasser & Co., George O. May of Price, Waterhouse and Co., Arthur H. Kent of the California Bar, Harry J. Rudick of the New York Bar, and Bayre Levin, Benjamin E. Jaffe, and A. J. Seltzer of the Michigan Bar. Needless to say, none of those mentioned necessarily shares my interpretations or is responsible for any errors.

Martha Anderson, Editor of the National Bureau of Economic Research, did much to smooth the text. H. Irving Forman made the charts.

Although the study lies primarily in the field of tax policy, I hope it will have some value outside. The economic nature of capital gains and losses has hitherto received remarkably little attention in the literature, and the discussion in Chapter 3 may challenge the unqualified acceptance of some widely held views. Students of national income may be interested in this discussion as well as in the continuous series on American capital gains and losses in Appendix Two.

Lawrence H. Seltzer

CONTENTS

CHAPTER

PREFACE

VII

1	BACKGROUND OF THE CONTROVERSY	1
1	What are Capital Gains and Losses?	1
	<i>Capital gains vs. ordinary profits</i>	3
	<i>Realized vs. unrealized capital gains and losses</i>	4
	<i>Distinction between capital gains and ordinary income often blurred</i>	4
2	Capital Gains an Important Source of Private Fortunes	5
	<i>Realized capital gains a major source of large incomes</i>	6
3	Are Capital Gains Income?	8
	<i>Reinvested corporate profits</i>	11
4	Special Treatment of Capital Gains in Income Taxation	12
5	Does the Taxation of Capital Gains have Bad Practical Effects?	16
6	Are the Federal Revenues from Capital Gains Worth Their Administrative Cost?	18
7	Other Issues	19
8	Aim of the Book	19
2	ORIGINS OF THE SPECIAL LEGAL STATUS OF CAPITAL GAINS	25
1	The Harvest Tradition of Income	25
2	Early Judicial Concept of Income Designed for Entailed and Trust Estates	26
3	The Physical Concept of Investment Applied to Securities	27
4	American Conditions Differed	29
5	American Jurisprudence Inherited the British Concepts but was Governed by Different Statutes	30
6	Statutory Provision for Taxing Realized Capital Gains as Income under the 16th Amendment Squarely Upheld	34
7	Accrued but Unrealized Capital Gains and Losses Excluded from Determination of Taxable Income	36
8	Rationale of the Realization Doctrine	38
9	Corporate Reorganizations and the Realization Doctrine	42
10	Congress Possesses Wide Latitude in the Tax Treatment of Capital Gains and Losses	45
3	THE ECONOMIC NATURE OF CAPITAL GAINS AND LOSSES	47
1	From the Standpoint of General Economic Theory	47
2	The Conventional and Legal Concepts	48

CHAPTER		
	3	From the Standpoint of National Income Analysis 49
	4	Capital Gains and Changes in the Price Level 51
	5	Consumption as Income 52
	6	Pure Capital Gains are Windfalls 53
	7	Changes in Expected Net Receipts 54
		<i>Reproduction cost limits the value and sustained yield of capital assets</i> 58
	8	Unexpected Changes in Interest Rates 60
	9	Changes in the Disposition to Face Uncertainties 61
	10	Special Cases 62
	11	Perfect Appraisal of Chances Consistent with Widely Divergent Results by Different Investors 64
	12	Speculation 64
	13	Conventional Capital Gains are Mixtures that Include Ordinary Income 67
	14	Creation of Earning Power without Commensurate Capital Investment 71
	15	Capital Gains and Profits 75
		<i>Operating profits often include capital gains</i> 79
4		ARE CAPITAL GAINS APPROPRIATE ELEMENTS OF TAXABLE INCOME? 83
	1	Do Capital Gains Represent less Taxpaying Capacity? 83
		<i>Effect of the progressive rate schedule</i> 85
	2	Is an Income Tax on Capital Gains Really a Tax on Capital? 86
	3	Some Capital Gains not a Part of Social Income 91
	4	How Real are Capital Gains and Losses due to Changes in Interest Rates? 93
	5	Illusory Capital Gains and Losses from Changes in the Value of Money 98
	6	Special Obstructive Effects of Taxes on Capital Gains 103
5		CAPITAL GAINS AND LOSSES AND THEIR DISTRIBUTION, 1917-1946 109
	1	Nature and Sources of Data 109
	2	Large Amounts of Capital Gains and Losses Excluded from the Data 110
	3	Net Gains Exceeded Net Losses only Moderately during the Period as a Whole 112
	4	Unrealized Gains may have Greatly Exceeded Unrealized Losses 112
	5	Moderate Excess of Total Gains over Losses Conceals Wide Variations in Investors' Experiences 115
	6	Annual Capital Gains and Losses Fluctuate Widely 119
	7	Total Gains and Losses Follow Stock Market Movements 119

8	Distribution of Capital Gains and Losses by Income Groups	122
	<i>Capital gains a small part of aggregate net income but a major source of large incomes</i>	122
	<i>Greater part of capital gains realized by taxpayers in other than the highest income groups</i>	124
	<i>Capital gains unevenly distributed within each income group as well as between income groups but the average amount and the proportion of taxpayers enjoying them rise sharply as we move up the income scale</i>	124
	<i>Many individuals reach higher income levels mainly because of capital gains</i>	125
	<i>But those who receive larger incomes from other sources also realize larger capital gains on the average</i>	128
	<i>Some evidence that the largest net losses in relation to total income are sustained neither by the top nor the bottom group filing income tax returns</i>	128
	<i>Net losses more heavily concentrated than net gains in middle and lower income groups</i>	131
9	Long versus Short Term Gains and Losses	131
	<i>Reasons for differentiating</i>	131
	<i>Importance of short term gains and losses has declined relative to long term in recent years</i>	134
	<i>Short term gains and losses closely reflect stock market fluctuations</i>	136
	<i>Long term gains account for an increasing proportion of total net gains as we ascend the income scale</i>	139
	<i>Short term losses constitute a large fraction of the total losses of the upper income groups</i>	140
	<i>Average gains larger the longer the asset is held and the larger the net income</i>	142
	<i>Gains and losses as percentages of original cost varied directly with holding period in sample of returns for 1930 and 1932</i>	144
10	Relative Importance of Securities, Real Estate and Other Assets as Sources of Capital Gains and Losses	145
	<i>Common stocks the chief source of capital gains and losses</i>	145
	<i>Real estate losses exceed gains in 1936</i>	145
	<i>Some reasons why real estate is a smaller direct source of capital gains and losses than it is a constituent of total private wealth</i>	146
	<i>Capital gains and losses from real estate are unlikely to cancel for most investors because diversification of risks is difficult</i>	149
	<i>Cleveland</i>	150
	<i>Manhattan</i>	151
11	Special Studies of Continuing Groups of Individuals with Large Incomes	152
	<i>Aggregate figures not necessarily representative of particular individuals or groups</i>	152
	<i>45 individuals with 1924 net incomes of \$1 million or more showed continuing high concentration in upper income groups</i>	152

CHAPTER

	<i>Annual fluctuations in their gains and losses more accentuated than in those of all taxpayers</i>	152
	<i>Their transactions in capital assets resulted in a large net gain for the group as a whole but in highly divergent experiences for the individual members</i>	154
	<i>Second sample of high income taxpayers shows characteristics in 1929, 1932, and 1937 similar to those of the 1924 group</i>	154
6	EFFECTS OF THE CHANGING TAX TREATMENT OF CAPITAL GAINS UPON INVESTORS' BEHAVIOR	156
	1 Although in 1917-21 Effective Tax Rates on Long Term Capital Gains were the highest in Our History, Large Net Gains were Realized	157
	2 Big Cuts in Effective Tax Rates in 1922-33 were Followed by Both the Fattest and Leanest Years of Capital Gains and of Tax Revenues	158
	3 Most Capital Gains Reported in 1922-33 were Subject to Ordinary Income Tax Rates, which Reached the Lowest Levels since 1917	161
	4 Nontax Factors were of Transcendent Importance in the Boom of the 'Twenties	162
	5 Did the 12½ Per Cent Rate on Long Term Gains of the Upper Income Groups Obstruct the Liquidation of Securities in the 1928-29 Boom?	165
	6 Strong Evidence that the Unusually High Tax Rates on Medium Term Gains of Upper Bracket Incomes and the Large Discounts Offered for Continued Holding in 1934-37 Postponed Liquidation	167
	7 Sharp Advance in Tax Rates since 1942 Accompanied by Substantial Increases in Realized Capital Gains	172
	8 Is the Absolute or the Relative Level of Capital Gains Taxes more Significant?	175
7	EFFECTS OF THE CHANGING TREATMENT OF CAPITAL LOSSES AND OF SHORT TERM TRANSACTIONS	181
	1 Allowances for Capital Losses have Moderated the Deterrent Influences of Capital Gains Taxes on Incentives to Make New and Liquidate Old Commitments	181
	<i>Reasons for parallel treatment of gains and losses</i>	182
	2 Even Limited Loss Allowance is of Great Value in Reducing Deterrents to New Commitments and to Realization	183
	3 Large Investors can Take Better Advantage of Loss Allowances than Small but the Usual Limitations are Harder on the Latter	184
	4 Chief Aims of Severe Limitations on Loss Allowances in Recent Years: To Prevent Excessive Tax Avoidance and to Maintain Revenues	185
	5 Statistics Reveal no Close Relation Between the Changing Tax Treatment of Capital Losses and the Totals Realized	189

CHAPTER

6	The Law Treated Losers less Liberally than Gainers in 1934-46, but the Net Results were Favorable for Upper Income Groups and Unfavorable for Lower	190
	<i>The \$2,000 limit accounted for about a third of aggregate disallowed net losses, and the statutory percentages, for two-thirds, in 1934-37</i>	192
	<i>The \$2,000 limit on the deductibility of net capital losses hurt lower and middle income groups chiefly</i>	192
	<i>Because of their divergent investment experience, the top income groups continued to enjoy a net advantage, and the others, a net disadvantage, from the tax treatment of capital gains and losses in 1938-41</i>	193
	<i>Heavy loss realization in 1938-41 does not seem to have been due primarily to removal of \$2,000 limit</i>	194
	<i>5 year carryover of net capital losses since 1942 mitigates effect of \$1,000 limit on annual deductibility from other income</i>	196
7	Effects of the Tax Treatment of Short Term Gains	197
	<i>Outstanding importance of stock market activity</i>	198
	<i>Some short and medium term transactions are adversely affected</i>	200
8	EFFECTS OF THE CHANGING TAX TREATMENT UPON FEDERAL REVENUES	203
1	Revenues Highly Erratic	203
2	Would a Low Tax Rate Increase the Revenue Yield?	206
3	Revenues from Capital Gains and Their Administrative Cost	209
9	TAX AVOIDANCE THROUGH CAPITAL GAINS	211
1	Uncertain Border between Investors and Dealers	212
	<i>Dealings in real estate and in securities regarded differently</i>	214
2	Promoters and Organizers	216
3	Transforming Current Investment Income into Capital Gains through the Personal Holding Company	217
4	Transforming Corporate Profits into Capital Gains by Reinvesting Them	221
5	The Undistributed Profits Tax	227
6	Closely Held Operating Corporations	231
7	Distributing Corporate Earnings by Redeeming Securities	233
8	Collapsible Corporations	234
9	Partnership Liquidations	237
10	Stock Purchase Options as Personal Compensation	237
11	Deferred Compensation, Pension, Stock-Bonus, and Profit-Sharing Plans	241
12	Other Rights to Future Income	245
13	Converting Interest into Capital Gains	247
	<i>Purchasing obligations at a discount</i>	247

CHAPTER		
	<i>Raising the selling price in lieu of interest</i>	248
	<i>Switching out of securities with high book yields</i>	248
14	Rents	249
15	Converting Capital Losses into Ordinary Losses	250
16	Devices to Postpone or Avoid Technical Realization of Capital Gains	251
10	THE TAX TREATMENT OF CAPITAL GAINS AND LOSSES IN OTHER COUNTRIES	254
	1 Great Britain	256
	2 Canada	262
	3 Australia	264
	4 New Zealand	265
	5 South Africa	266
	6 France	267
	7 Belgium	270
	8 The Netherlands	271
	9 Sweden	272
	10 Norway	273
	11 Denmark	274
	12 Finland	275
	13 Switzerland	275
	14 Germany	276
	15 Czechoslovakia	277
	16 Hungary	278
	17 Greece	279
11	COMPETING PROPOSALS FOR THE TAX TREATMENT OF CAPITAL GAINS AND LOSSES	281
	1 General Case for Excluding Capital Gains and Losses from Taxable Income or Treating Them Differently	282
	2 General Case against Excluding Capital Gains and Losses or Treating Them Differently	285
	3 Full Annual Recognition of Both Accrued and Realized Gains and Losses	289
	<i>Other effects and difficulties</i>	291
	<i>Constitutional difficulties of taxing unrealized appreciation</i>	294
	4 Cumulative Averaging of Incomes and Tax Liabilities	295
	5 Unrealized Capital Gains and Losses Embodied in Property Transferred by Gift or at Death	299
	<i>Transfer of basis</i>	303
	6 Averaging Devices	304
	7 Optional Periodic Averaging of Capital Gains and Losses	306

CHAPTER

8	Proration of Capital Gains and Losses	306
	<i>Backward proration over a fixed number of years</i>	306
	<i>Backward proration over the number of years the asset was held</i>	307
	<i>Backward proration with tax or credit determined by current income and rates</i>	307
	<i>Forward proration over a fixed number of years</i>	308
	<i>Forward proration with tax or credit determined by current income and rates</i>	309
	<i>Deferred tax charges and credits easier to administer but less equitable than direct offsetting of gains and losses</i>	309
9	Desirable Length of the Averaging Period	310
10	Carrying Capital Losses Back and Forward Solely against Capital Gains	312
11	Controlling Influence of Market Effects upon Evolution of Capital Gains Tax Treatment in the U.S.	313
	<i>Exclusion of short term gains and losses from special treatment</i>	316

APPENDIX

One	SOURCES AND METHODS	320
Two	Tables as listed below	361

I BASIC DATA FOR 1917-1946

Federal Individual and Taxable Fiduciary Income Tax Returns

TABLE

A Aggregate Net Capital Gains and Losses, 1917-1946

1	Annual Totals	367
2	Distribution by Statutory Net Income Groups	368
3	Percentage Distribution by Statutory Net Income Groups	372
4	Net Capital Gain-Loss Ratio by Statutory Net Income Groups, 1926-1946	374
5	As Percentages of Net Income Reported on All Returns, by Statutory Net Income Groups	375
6	Gains as Percentages of Net Income and of Property Income Reported on All Returns: 3 Statutory Net Income Groups, Total for Period, 1917-1946	377
7	Aggregate Net Capital Gains and Dividends: Percentage Distribution by Statutory Net Income Groups and Percentages of Net Income Reported on All Returns, 1924, 1928, 1941, 1943	377

B Long and Short Term Net Capital Gains and Losses, 1922-1946

8	Annual Totals	378
---	---------------	-----

TABLE

9	Distribution by Statutory Net Income Groups Long and Short Term Gains, 1922-1946 Long Term Losses, 1924-1946 Short Term Losses, 1924-1937, 1942-1946	380
10	Long and Short Term Gains and Losses by Statutory Net Income Groups, 1933	384
11	Percentage Distribution by Statutory Net Income Groups Long and Short Term Gains, 1922-1946 Long Term Losses, 1924-1946 Short Term Losses, 1924-1937, 1942-1946	386
12	As Percentages of Net Income Reported on All Returns, by Statutory Net Income Groups Long and Short Term Gains, 1922-1946 Long Term Losses, 1924-1946 Short Term Losses, 1924-1937, 1942-1946	389
13	As Percentage of Total Gain and Loss, by Statutory Net Income Groups Long and Short Term Gains, 1922-1946 Long Term Losses, 1924-1937, 1942-1946 Short Term Losses, 1924-1937, 1942-1946	392
14	Distribution by Size (Returns with Net Incomes of \$5,000 and Over), Amounts and Percentages Gains, 1927-1933 Losses, 1929-1933	395
15	Shares Traded, New York Stock Exchange, Stock Price Index, and Arithmetic Sum of Short Term Net Capital Gains and Losses, 1917-1946	397
 <i>C Net Capital Gains and Losses in 5 Holding Periods, 1934-1937</i>		
16	Annual Totals Returns with Statutory Net Incomes or Deficits Returns with Statutory Net Incomes	398
17	Percentage Distribution by Holding Period Returns with Statutory Net Incomes or Deficits Returns with Statutory Net Incomes	400
18	Distribution by Statutory Net Income Groups Returns with Statutory Gains or Losses Returns with Gains Returns with Losses	402
19	Net Capital Gains from Assets Held Longer than 10 Years as Percentages of Total, by Statutory Net Income Groups, 1934-1937	409
 <i>D Disallowed, Statutory, and Total Realized Net Capital Gains and Losses, 1917-1946</i>		
20	Total Realized and Statutory Net Capital Gains and Losses, 1917-1946	410
21	Distribution by Statutory Net Income Groups, 1932 and 1933	412
22	Annual Totals: 1934-37, 1938-41, and 1942-46	413
23	Distribution by Statutory Net Income Groups: 1934-37, 1938-41, and 1942-46	416

TABLE

24	Totals for 1934-37, 1938-41, and 1942-46	420
25	Disallowed Net Capital Losses Due to Application of Statutory Percentages and to \$2,000 Limitation, by Statutory Net Income Groups, 1934-1937	421
26	Gains and Losses from Sales of Depreciable Assets, by Statutory Net Income Groups: 1938-41 and 1942-46	422
27	Net Capital Loss Carryover by Statutory Net Income Groups: 1938-41 and 1942-46	423
28	Disallowed Short Term and Total Realized Net Capital Losses, by Statutory Net Income Groups, 1938	424
E	<i>Number of Returns with Net Capital Gains or Losses, 1927-1946 (Net Incomes of \$5,000 and Over)</i>	
29	Annual Totals	425
30	Distribution by Net Capital Gain or Loss Groups Returns with Net Capital Gains, 1927-1933 Returns with Net Capital Losses, 1929-1933	426
31	Distribution by Statutory Net Income Groups: 1934-37, 1938-41, and 1942-46	427
32	As Percentage of Total Returns Filed, by Statutory Net Income Groups: 1934-37, 1938-41, and 1942-46	430
33	Returns with Alternative Tax Treatment, by Statutory Net Income Groups: 1938-41 and 1942-46	432
34	Distribution by 5 Holding Periods, by Statutory Net Income Groups, 1934-1937	433
35	Distribution by Net Capital Gain or Loss and by Statutory Net Income Groups: 1930 (Returns with Losses Only), 1935-1941	434
F	<i>Average Net Capital Gain or Loss Per Return, 1927-1946 (Returns with Net Incomes of \$5000 and Over)</i>	
36	Annual Averages	438
37	By Statutory Net Income Groups: 1934-37, 1938-41, and 1942-46	439
38	By 5 Holding Periods, by Statutory Net Income Groups, 1934-1937	442
G	<i>Statutory Net Capital Gains and Losses Segregated for Alternative Tax Treatment, by Statutory Net Income Groups, 1938-1946</i>	
39	Statutory Long Term Gains and Losses, 1938-1941	444
40	Excess of Statutory Long Term Gains Over Short Term Losses, 1942-1946	445
H	<i>Net Income Reported on All Returns, by Statutory Net Income Groups, 1917-1946</i>	
41	Annual Totals	446

TABLE

II SAMPLE DATA FOR 1930, 1932, AND 1933

Federal Individual Income Tax Returns

A *Capital Gains and Losses from Various Types of Sale*

42	Number of Returns, Gross Capital Gains and Losses, and Gross Receipts, by Statutory Net Income Groups	449
43	Number of Sales of Securities, by Statutory Net Income Groups: 1930 and 1932	450
44	Average Gross Capital Gain or Loss and Average Gross Receipts, by Statutory Net Income Groups	451
45	Sales of Securities Reported on Returns Classified as Market Traders and on Other Returns: Gross Capital Gains and Losses, Gross Receipts, and Number of Sales, 1930 and 1932	452
46	Capital Gains and Losses Segregated and Not Segregated at 12½ %, and Subject or Not Subject to Statutory Limitation on Losses	453
47	Sales Subject and Not Subject to Statutory Limitation on Losses by Type of Sale: 1932 and 1933	455
48	Disallowed Short Term Net Losses, by Statutory Net Income Groups: Amounts Reported on Sample Returns, 1932 and 1933	458
49	Disallowed Short Term Net Losses, by Statutory Net Income Groups: Estimated Amount for All Returns, 1932 and 1933	459
50	Sales of Stocks and of Bonds: 1930 and 1932	460
51	Sales of Securities by Month of Sale: Gross Capital Gains and Losses, Gross Receipts, and Number of Sales, 1930 and 1932	462
52	Sales of Securities by Number of Months Held: Gross Capital Gains and Losses, Gross Receipts, and Number of Sales, 1930 and 1932	468
53	Sales of Stocks by Number of Months Held: Percentage Distribution of Gross Capital Gains and Losses, 1930 and 1932	472
54	Sales of Stocks by Number of Months Held: Gross Capital Gains and Losses as Percentage of Estimated Cost, 1930 and 1932	473
55	Sales of Stocks by Number of Months Held: Average Gross Capital Gain or Loss and Average Gross Receipts, 1930 and 1932	474
56	Sales of Securities by 5 Holding Periods: Gross Capital Gains and Losses by Statutory Net Income Groups, 1930 and 1932	475
B <i>Capital Gains and Losses from Sales of Assets: Returns with Over-all Realized Net Capital Gains or Losses</i>		
57	Segregated and Not Segregated at 12½ %, and Subject or Not Subject to Statutory Limitation on Losses	478
58	Distribution by Gross Receipts, 1930	480
59	Distribution by Realized Net Gain or Loss Groups, 1930	481
60	Distribution by Statutory Net Income Groups, 1933	482
61	Percentage Distribution by Statutory Net Income Groups, 1933	483

TABLE

C Sales of Securities Reported on Matched Groups of Sample Returns, 1930, 1932 and 1933

62	Gross Capital Gains and Losses and Gross Receipts	484
63	Gross Capital Gains and Losses and Gross Receipts, by Statutory Net Income Groups	485
64	Sales of Stocks and of Bonds, 1930 and 1932	486

D Overstatement due to Adding Components, 1933

65	Overstatement in Over-all Net Capital Gains and Losses Due to Adding Components, by Statutory Net Income Groups, 1933	487
----	-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	-----

III ADDITIONAL DATA FOR 1936

Federal Individual and Taxable Fiduciary Income Tax Returns

A Net Capital Gains and Losses Classified by 3 Types of Net Income Group: Statutory Net Income, Net Income Excluding Statutory Net Capital Gain and Loss, Net Income Including Realized but Excluding Statutory Net Capital Gain and Loss

66	Realized and Statutory Net Capital Gains and Losses and Net Income Reported on Returns with Capital Transactions	490
67	Number of Returns with Capital Transactions	492

B Returns with Over-all Realized Net Capital Gains or Losses Classified by Net Income Groups Defined to Exclude Statutory Gain and Loss

68	Realized and Statutory Net Gains and Losses, Number of Returns, and Net Income Reported on Returns with Capital Transactions	493
69	Realized and Statutory Net Gains and Losses from Stocks and Bonds and from All Assets	495
70	Classified by Gross Receipts and by Realized Gain or Loss Groups (Federal income tax returns filed in New York State)	496

C Realized Net Capital Gains and Losses in 5 Holding Periods

71	Gains and Losses, Number of Returns, and Average Gain or Loss per Return	497
72	Distribution by Net Income Groups Defined to Exclude Statutory Net Capital Gain and Loss: All Assets, and Stocks and Bonds	498
73	Number of Returns and Average Realized Net Capital Gain or Loss per Return, by Net Income Groups Defined to Exclude Statutory Net Capital Gain and Loss	501

D Sales of 10 Types of Asset (Federal Income Tax Returns Filed in New York, Pennsylvania, and Illinois)

74	Realized Net Capital Gains and Losses, Number of Returns and Sales, and Gross Receipts	502
----	----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	-----

TABLE

75	Average Realized Net Capital Gain or Loss per Return, Average Gross Receipts per Sale, and Net Gain or Loss as a Percentage of Estimated Cost	504
76	Realized Net Capital Gains and Losses, Number of Returns with Gains or Losses, Number of Sales, Gross Receipts, and Average Realized Gain or Loss per Return, by Net Income Groups Defined to Exclude Statutory Net Capital Gain and Loss (New York State)	505

E *Net Capital Gains and Other Sources of Income*

77	Returns with Statutory Net Capital Gains by Number and Type of Other Sources of Income	513
----	----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	-----

F *Comparison with Basic Data for 1936*

78	Realized and Statutory Net Capital Gains and Losses, 1936: Estimates Based on <i>Statistics of Income</i> and on <i>Statistics of Income Supplement for 1936</i>	514
----	------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	-----

G *Distribution by Statutory Net Incomes Including and Excluding Statutory Net Capital Gain and Loss, 1936*

79	Percentage of Returns with Net Capital Gains and Average Gain per Return	514
80	Average Net Capital Gain per Return, by 5 Holding Periods	515
81	Excluded Net Capital Gain and Disallowed Net Capital Loss	516

IV INDIVIDUAL WITH HIGHEST INCOMES, SELECTED YEARS
Federal Income Tax Returns

A *400 Persons with Net Incomes of \$100,000 and Over in 1916*

82	Capital Gains and Losses by Type of Asset, 1917-1922	518
----	------------------------------------------------------	-----

B *45 Persons with Net Incomes of \$1 Million and Over in 1924*

83	Classified by Statutory Net Income Groups, 1917-1933	518
84	Net Capital Gains and Losses, 1917-1933 as a Whole, by Groups Realizing an Over-all Net Capital Gain or Loss	519
85	Net Capital Gains and Losses, 1917-1933	520

C *141 Persons with Largest Net Incomes in 1929*

86	Net Capital Gains and Losses by Net Income Groups, 1929, 1932, 1937	521
----	---------------------------------------------------------------------	-----

V TAX RATES AND REVENUES

87	Effective Tax Rate on Additional Dollar of Long Term Capital Gains and of Ordinary Income or Short Term Capital Gains: Individuals at 6 Levels of Statutory Net Income, 1917-1949	523
----	-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	-----

TABLE

88	Effective Tax Rate on First Dollar of Long Term Capital Gains as a Percentage of Tax Rate on Ordinary Income: 6 Levels of Statutory Net Income, 1922-1949	525
89	Effective Rate of Tax and of Tax Credit for Long Term Net Capital Gains and Losses, Respectively, of Specified Sizes under Present Law and if Prorated over 3, 5, 10, and 20 Years and Taxed in Full at Ordinary Rates	526
90	Estimated Net Revenue from Tax Treatment of Capital Gains and Losses, 1926-1947	528

VI ASSESSED VALUES OF REAL ESTATE

91	Percentage Changes in Assessed Values of Various Groundsites: New York City, 1909-1942; Cleveland, 1910-1942	529
----	--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	-----

VII BASIC DATA FOR CORPORATIONS, 1928-1947

Federal Income Tax Returns

A *All Corporations and Financial and Nonfinancial Corporations, by Groups Reporting Net Incomes or Deficits, 1928-1947*

92	Net Capital Gains and Losses	531
93	Statutory Net Income and Deficit, and Number of Returns with Statutory Net Incomes or Deficits	534
94	Net Capital Gains and Losses as Percentages of Statutory Net Incomes or Deficits, 1928-1945	535
95	Financial Corporations as Percentages of Total: Net Capital Gains and Losses, Statutory Net Income and Deficit, and Number of Returns with Statutory Net Incomes or Deficits	537
96	Net Capital Gains and Losses: Financial Corporations by Type, 1939-1947	538

B *Corporations Submitting Balance Sheets, 1931-1947*

97	Net Capital Gains and Losses and Statutory Net Income: All Corporations and Corporations Submitting and Not Submitting Balance Sheets	540
98	Distribution by Total Assets Groups	541
	Net Capital Gains	
	Net Capital Losses	
	Excess of Capital Gains Over Losses	
	Statutory Net Income or Deficit	
	Number of Corporations Submitting Balance Sheets	

Index	547
-------	-----

CHART

1	Change in Assessed Values of Various Groundsites: New York City, 1909-42; Cleveland, 1910-42	2
2	Net Capital Gains and Losses as Percentages of Net Income, 1917-1946	7

CHART

3	Net Capital Gains as Percentages of Net Income: 3 Statutory Net Income Groups, 1917-1946	9
4	Capital Gains Tax Rate as a Percentage of Tax Rate on Ordinary Income, 3 Income Levels	15
5	Net Capital Gain-Loss Ratio by Statutory Net Income Groups	116
6	45 Persons with Million Dollar and Over Incomes in 1924: Net Capital Gains and Losses as Percentages of Total Incomes, 1917-1933	118
7	Net Capital Gains and Losses, 1917-1946	120
8	Stock Price Index and Excess of Net Capital Gains or Losses, 1917-1946	121
9	Net Capital Gains as Percentages of Net Income by Statutory Net Income Groups	123
10	Net Capital Gains: Shares of 8 Statutory Net Income Groups, 1918-1946	125
11	Capital Gains and Dividends: Shares of 8 Statutory Net Income Groups	126
12	Average Net Capital Gain by Statutory Net Income Groups Including and Excluding Statutory Net Capital Gains and Losses, 1936	127
13	Net Capital Losses as Percentages of Net Income by Statutory Net Income Groups, 1926-1931	129
14	Net Capital Losses: Shares of 8 Statutory Net Income Groups, 1926-1946	130
15	Net Capital Gains and Losses: Shares of 8 Statutory Net Income Groups, 1922-1946	
16	Short Term Net Capital Gains and Losses as Percentages of Total, 1922-1943	135
17	Shares Traded, New York Stock Exchange, and Arithmetic Sum of Short Term Net Capital Gains and Losses, 1924-1946	137
18	Stock Price Index and Short Term Net Capital Gains and Losses, 1924-1943	138
19	Long Term Net Capital Gains as Percentages of Total by Statutory Net Income Groups: Incomes of \$50,000 and Over	140
20	Net Capital Gains from Assets Held more than 10 Years as Percentages of Total by Statutory Net Income Groups, 1934-1937	141
21	Short Term Net Capital Losses as Percentages of Total by Statutory Net Income Groups: Incomes of \$50,000 and Over	142
22	Average Net Capital Gain by Holding Periods and Statutory Net Income Groups, 1934-1937	143
23	45 Persons with Million Dollar and Over Incomes in 1924: Net Capital Gains and Losses and Stock Price Index, 1917-1933	153
24	Effective Tax Rate on an Additional Dollar of Long Term Capital Gains: Individuals at 6 Levels of Statutory Net Income, 1917-1950	157
25	Effective Tax Rate on First Additional Dollar of Ordinary Income or Short Term Capital Gains: Individuals at 6 Levels of Statutory Net Income, 1917-1950	160

6 x 6.5

2,005,988

National Bureau of Economic Research, Inc.

Seltzer, Lawrence Howard

The nature and tax treatment of capital gains and losses
(by, Lawrence H. Seltzer, with the assistance of Selma F.
Goldsmith, and M. Slade Kendrick. (New York, National
Bureau of Economic Research, 1951,
xxii, 534 p. diagrs., tables. 24 cm. (National Bureau of Eco-
nomic Research. Fiscal studies, 3)

1. Capital gains tax—U. S. 1. Title. (Series: National
Bureau of Economic Research. Fiscal policy series, 3)

HJ4653.C3S4

836.243

51-5126

MATERIAL SUBMITTED BY PUBLISHER

2,005,988

National Bureau of Economic Research, Inc.

Seltzer, Lawrence Howard.

The nature and tax treatment of capital gains and losses
(by, Lawrence H. Seltzer, with the assistance of Selma F.
Goldsmith, and M. Slade Kendrick. (New York, National
Bureau of Economic Research, 1951,
xxii, 534 p. diagrs., tables. 24 cm. (National Bureau of Eco-
nomic Research. Fiscal studies, 3)

1. Capital gains tax—U. S. 1. Title. (Series: National
Bureau of Economic Research. Fiscal policy series, 3)

HJ4653.C3S4

836.243

51-5126

MATERIAL SUBMITTED BY PUBLISHER

2,005,988

National Bureau of Economic Research, Inc.

Seltzer, Lawrence Howard.

The nature and tax treatment of capital gains and losses
(by, Lawrence H. Seltzer, with the assistance of Selma F.
Goldsmith, and M. Slade Kendrick. (New York, National
Bureau of Economic Research, 1951,
xxii, 534 p. diagrs., tables. 24 cm. (National Bureau of Eco-
nomic Research. Fiscal studies, 3)

1. Capital gains tax—U. S. 1. Title. (Series: National
Bureau of Economic Research. Fiscal policy series, 3)

HJ4653.C3S4

836.243

51-5126

MATERIAL SUBMITTED BY PUBLISHER