THE COMPARATIVE STUDY
OF ECONOMIC GROWTH
AND STRUCTURE

Suggestions on Research
Objectives and Organization

NATIONAL BUREAU OF ECONOMIC RESEARCH, INC.
1959
NATIONAL BUREAU OF ECONOMIC RESEARCH

1959

OFFICERS
George B. Roberts, Chairman
Arthur F. Burns, President
Theodore W. Schultz, Vice-President
Murray Shields, Treasurer
Solomon Fabricant, Director of Research
Geoffrey H. Moore, Associate Director of Research
William J. Carson, Executive Director

DIRECTORS AT LARGE
Wallace J. Campbell, Director, Cooperative League of the USA
Solomon Fabricant, New York University
Gabriel Hauge, Chairman, Finance Committee, Manufacturers Trust Company
Albert J. Hettinger, Jr., Lazard Frères and Company
Oswald W. Knauth, Beaufort, South Carolina
H. W. Laidler, Executive Director Emeritus, League for Industrial Democracy
Shepard Morgan, Norfolk, Connecticut
George B. Roberts, Larchmont, New York
Beardsley Ruml, New York City
Harry Scherman, Chairman, Book-of-the-Month Club
Boris Shishkin, American Federation of Labor and Congress of Industrial Organizations
George Soule, Professor Emeritus, Bennington College
N. I. Stone, Consulting Economist
J. Raymond Walsh, New York City
Joseph H. Willits, Director, The Educational Survey, University of Pennsylvania
Leo Wolman, Columbia University
Donald B. Woodward, Vick Chemical Company
Theodore O. Yntema, Vice-President-Finance, Ford Motor Company

DIRECTORS BY UNIVERSITY APPOINTMENT
V. W. Bladen, Toronto
Arthur F. Burns, Columbia
Melvin G. de Chazeau, Cornell
Frank W. Fetter, Northwestern
H. M. Groves, Wisconsin
Gottfried Haberler, Harvard
Walter W. Heller, Minnesota
Maurice W. Lee, North Carolina
Lloyd G. Reynolds, Yale
T. W. Schultz, Chicago
Jacob Viner, Princeton
Willis J. Winn, Pennsylvania

DIRECTORS APPOINTED BY OTHER ORGANIZATIONS
Percival F. Brundage, American Institute of Certified Public Accountants
Harold G. Halcrow, American Farm Economic Association
Theodore V. Houser, Committee for Economic Development
Stanley H. Ruttenberg, American Federation of Labor and Congress of Industrial Organizations
Murray Shields, American Management Association
Willard L. Thorp, American Economic Association
W. Allen Wallis, American Statistical Association
Harold F. Williamson, Economic History Association

RESEARCH STAFF
Moses Abramovitz
Gary S. Becker
Gerhard Bry
Arthur F. Burns
Morris A. Copeland
Frank G. Dickinson
James S. Earley
Richard A. Easterlin
Solomon Fabricant
Milton Friedman
Raymond W. Goldsmith
Leo Grebler
Millard Hastay
W. Braddock Hickman
Daniel M. Holland
Thor Hultgren
C. Harry Kahn
John W. Kendrick
Simon Kuznets
Clarence D. Long

Ruth P. Mack
Ilse Mintz
Geoffrey H. Moore
Roger F. Murray
G. Warren Nutter
Lawrence H. Seltzer
Robert P. Shay
George J. Stigler
Leo Wolman
Herbert B. Woolley
Relation of National Bureau Directors to Publications Reporting Conference Proceedings

Since the present volume is a record of conference proceedings, it has been exempted from the rules governing submission of manuscripts to, and critical review by, the Board of Directors of the National Bureau. It has, however, been reviewed and accepted for publication by the Director of Research.

(Resolution adopted July 6, 1948 and revised November 21, 1949)
PREFACE

Last year the National Bureau brought together two distinguished groups of economists and government officials to exchange views on the direction and organization of research in the important area of comparative national economic growth and structure.¹

This report makes available to the many persons concerned with this significant area of research the ideas and information gathered together in the conferences and in subsequent less formal discussions among individuals. The first part is based largely, though not exclusively, on the discussion at the conferences, and on memoranda prepared by a number of participants for use at the conferences. The value of this publication is greatly enhanced by the inclusion of these memoranda in a second part, printed here with the kind permission of the authors. It should be recognized that the memoranda are informal statements prepared under considerable pressure of time, but the reader will, I am sure, find in them many interesting suggestions that could be incorporated only briefly or not at all in Part I.

The problem area on which the discussion was focused was defined broadly to include differences as well as similarities among countries in patterns of growth and structure, and the related factors. It was felt also that an exploration of this general area should concern itself with the methods and data needed to deal with the scientific problems involved; take note of work already done and in progress; and consider the research needs and possibilities with an eye to their ultimate contribution to the resolution of significant questions.

As with other exploratory reports issued by the National Bureau,² the object of the report is to help stimulate interest and guide research activity in the important area covered by it. It should be regarded simply as suggestive, and not as a formal program of research or statement on research principles, methods, or organization.

To avoid misinterpretation, it may be desirable to underscore the informal character of this report by noting, first, that an exploration —

¹One meeting was held in Princeton on June 27-28, 1958; the other, in Washington on July 21, 1958. The list of participants follows this preface.

²A Program of Financial Research (1937); Research in Securities Markets (1946); Research in the Capital and Securities Markets (1954); Suggestions for Research in the Economics of Pensions (1957).
especially when carried on under pressure of time — cannot be expected to yield suggestions that are always consistent. The reader will find it worth his while to contrast certain of the positions taken. Second, it is natural for enthusiasts — and in substantial degree, those whose views are presented here — to dwell on the merits of the particular problems, procedures, and forms of organization that appeal to them. When it comes to the practical problem of making a choice, alternative programs within and outside the field covered in the present exploration that are mentioned only cursorily here, or are not discussed at all, will need to be brought within the range of consideration. Third, suggestions such as are set forth here can be of assistance mainly in choosing a program. Those who set up an organization or embark on a project will want to formulate more adequately than was done here the course to be followed. Fourth, no one method, approach, or mode of organization to deal with the problems discussed here can be considered necessarily superior to others. It is hoped that scholars and institutions with various opinions on these matters will find the report useful in planning their research.

A further word might be added about method. One of the points brought out in some of the memoranda and in the discussions at the meetings is the importance of qualitative considerations in studying the origins and process of economic growth. Since a good deal of emphasis was also placed on quantitative studies, there might appear to have been a fundamental difference in attitudes toward methodology. But in this respect the views are not, I think, inconsistent. Quantitative and qualitative analyses are complementary: to make sense of what figures show, qualitative considerations must always enter; and the import of qualitative factors is better seen in the light of measurement of their effects.

One suggestion made at the meetings relates to the formation of a standing Conference on Comparative Economic Growth and Structure, which might hold meetings to discuss both methodological and substantive questions. Comments and suggestions from individual scholars and organizations here and abroad on the desirability of such a conference will be welcome. So, also, will information on research under way or in prospect.

We are greatly indebted to the participants in the conferences, all of whom joined in the discussion and many of whom critically reviewed the report. No one of them, of course, is to be held responsible for all the views and opinions set forth. I should mention, also, that because the present volume is primarily a record of conference papers and proceedings, it has not been submitted to the Board of Directors of the National Bureau for approval.

Special acknowledgment is made to the authors of the memoranda reproduced in Part II of this report; to Raymond W. Goldsmith, who organized the meetings and prepared Part I of the report; to Walther P. Michael, who served as secretary of the conferences and assisted in the preparation of parts of the report; to Simon Kuznets, who gave wise
counsel and advice in many ways; to the Ford Foundation, which provided the funds needed for the meetings and for the preparation and publication of this report; and to the Board of Governors of the Federal Reserve System, which made its conference room available for one of the meetings.

SOLOMON FABRICANT

Director of Research

June 1959
JOHN H. ADLER  
*International Bank for Reconstruction and Development*

SOLOMON FABRICANT  
*National Bureau of Economic Research*

HENRY G. AUBREY  
*National Planning Association*

A. G. B. FISHER  
*International Monetary Fund*

HAROLD J. BARNETT  
*Resources for the Future, Inc.*

THEODORE GEIGER  
*National Planning Association*

HARRY BELL  
*State Department, Division of Functional Intelligence*

RAYMOND W. GOLDSMITH  
*National Bureau of Economic Research*

EDWARD M. BERNSTEIN  

EVERETT E. HAGEN  
*Massachusetts Institute of Technology*

ROBERT B. BLACK  
*International Cooperation Administration*

ARTHUR B. HERSEY  
*Board of Governors of the Federal Reserve System*

CARL P. BLACKWELL  
*Bureau of Foreign Commerce*

A. O. HIRSCHMAN  
*Columbia University*

RAYMOND T. BOWMAN  
*Bureau of the Budget*

WILLIAM O. JONES  
*Stanford University*

HOLLIS B. CHENERY  
*Stanford University*

ALEXANDRE KAFKA  
*United Nations*

COLIN G. CLARK  
*Econometric Institute*

JAMES W. KNOWLES  
*Joint Economic Committee*

ANSLEY COALE  
*Princeton University*

SIMON KUZNETS  
*Johns Hopkins University*

GERHARD COLM  
*National Planning Association*
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Preface</td>
<td>v</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participants</td>
<td>vii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Part 1. EXPLORATORY REPORT,</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>by Raymond W. Goldsmith</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Summary</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Current Empirical Work on Comparative Economic Growth and Structure</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Past Empirical Work on Comparative Economic Growth and Structure</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Current Empirical Work by International Agencies</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Current Empirical Work in the United States</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Concept and Importance of Comparative Study of Economic Growth and Structure</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Concept and Measurement of Economic Growth and Structure</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Comparative Approach to the Problems of Economic Growth and Structure</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. The Basic Approach to the Comparative Study of Economic Growth and Structure</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Concentration on Economic Factors</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Concentration on Measurable Aspects of Economic Growth and Structure</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research or Policy Orientation</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Need for Further Work on Comparative Economic Growth and Structure</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. A Catalog of Problems</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>General Considerations</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>General Problems</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Natural Resources</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Human Resources and Attitudes</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Capital ................................................. 47
Economic Organization ............................ 48
Saving and Finance ................................. 50
International Economic Relations ............... 52

6. Selection of Countries for Comparative Study .... 53

7. Selection of Periods ................................. 61
   How Far Back Can We Go? ....................... 61
   Continuous Series vs. Benchmark Data ........ 64

8. The Methods of Comparative Study of Economic Growth and Structure .... 66
   The National Income Approach .................. 67
   The Input-Output Approach ...................... 71
   Economic and Econometric Growth Models .... 75

9. Needed Improvements in the Techniques of Comparison ......................... 79
   Comparison over Time and between Countries .. 79
   Development of Indicators of Economic Growth 84

10. Organization of Research in Comparative Economic Growth and Structure ... 89
    A Center for Comparative Quantitative Study of Economic Growth .......... 90
    A Standing Conference on Comparative Economic Growth and Structure .... 96

Part II. SUPPLEMENTARY MEMORANDA

1. Quality into Quantity? The Need for New Indicators in Comparing Economic Growth
   by Henry G. Aubrey .................................. 103

2. Research on Comparative Economic Growth
   by A. K. Cairncross .................................. 106

   by Gerhard Colm and Theodore Geiger .............. 110
4. Financial Structure and Development as a Subject for International Comparative Study
   by Raymond W. Goldsmith ........................................ 114

   by Everett E. Hagen ............................................. 124

6. Some Suggestions for Research on Comparative Development
   by Albert O. Hirschman ......................................... 142

7. On Historical Comparisons in the Study of Economic Growth
   by Bert F. Hoselitz ............................................. 145

   by Simon Kuznets .............................................. 162

   by Lloyd G. Reynolds ......................................... 177

10. Some Notes on Research Possibilities
    by Joseph J. Spengler ...................................... 185

11. Comparative Studies of Economic Growth
    by Jan Tinbergen ............................................. 193