The Role of Health Insurance in the Health Services Sector

A Conference of the Universities-National Bureau Committee for Economic Research

Distributed by
NEALE WATSON
ACADEMIC PUBLICATIONS
New York

NATIONAL BUREAU OF ECONOMIC RESEARCH
New York
1976
NATIONAL BUREAU OF ECONOMIC RESEARCH

OFFICERS

Arthur F. Burns, Honorary Chairman
J. Wilson Newman, Chairman
Moses Abramovitz, Vice Chairman
John B. Meyer, President
Thomas D. Flynn, Treasurer
Douglas H. Eldridge, Executive Secretary
Gary Fromm, Director, NBER-Washington
Victor R. Fuchs, Vice President; Co-director, NBER-West
Edwin Kuh, Vice President and Director, Computer Research Center

Robert E. Lipsey, Director, International and Financial Studies
Harvey J. McAlpine, Vice President-Executive Director
Sherman J. Maisel, Co-director, NBER-West
Geoffrey H. Moore, Director, Business Cycle Research, NBER-Washington
Edward K. Smith, Director, Corporate Planning and Development

DIRECTORS AT LARGE

Atherton Bean, International Multifoods Corporation
Arthur F. Burns, Board of Governors of the Federal Reserve System
Wallace J. Campbell, Foundation for Cooperation Housing
Erwin D. Canham, Christian Science Monitor
Emilio G. Collado, Exxon Corporation
Edward L. Ginzton, Varian Associates
David L. Grove, International Business Machines Corporation
Walter W. Heller, University of Minnesota

John R. Meyer, Harvard University
Geoffrey H. Moore, National Bureau of Economic Research
James J. O'Leary, United States Trust Company of New York
Rudolph A. Oswald, American Federation of Labor and Congress of Industrial Organizations
Robert V. Rossa, Brown Brothers Harriman & Co.
Eli Shapiro, The Travelers Corporation
Lazar Tepfer, International Ladies' Garment Workers' Union
Theodore O. Yntema, Oakland University

DIRECTORS BY UNIVERSITY APPOINTMENT

Moses Abramovitz, Stanford
Gardner Ackley, Michigan
Charles H. Berry, Princeton
Francis M. Boddy, Minnesota
Otto Eckstein, Harvard
Walter D. Fisher, Northwestern
R. A. Gordon, California, Berkeley
J. C. LaForce, California, Los Angeles

Richard M. Bird, Canadian Economics Association
Eugene A. Birnbaum, American Management Associations
Carl F. Christ, American Economic Association
Thomas D. Flynn, American Institute of Certified Public Accountants
Nathan Goldfinger, American Federation of Labor and Congress of Industrial Organizations

Robert J. Lampman, Wisconsin
Maurice W. Lee, North Carolina
Almarit Phillips, Pennsylvania
Lloyd G. Reynolds, Yale
Robert M. Solow, Massachusetts Institute of Technology
Henn Theil, Chicago
William S. Vickrey, Columbia

DIRECTORS BY APPOINTMENT OF OTHER ORGANIZATIONS

Harold G. Halcrow, American Agricultural Economics Association
Walter E. Hoadley, American Finance Association
Philip M. Klutznick, Committee for Economic Development
Paul W. McCracken, American Statistical Association
Roy E. Moore, National Association of Business Economists
Douglas C. North, Economic History Association

DIRECTORS EMERITI

Percival F. Brundage
Frank W. Fetter
Gottfried Haberler

Robert E. Lipsey
Schen J. Maisel
Benno B. Mandellbrot
John R. Meyer
Robert T. Michael
Jacob Mincer
Ilse Mintz
Geoffrey H. Moore
M. Ishak Nadiri
Nancy Ruggles
Richard Ruggles
Anna J. Schwartz
Edward K. Smith
George J. Stigler
Robert J. Willis
Victor Zamowitz
Relation of the National Bureau Directors to Publications Reporting Conference Proceedings

Since the present volume is a record of conference proceedings, it has been exempted from the rules governing submission of manuscripts to, and critical review by, the Board of Directors of the National Bureau.

(Resolution adopted July 6, 1948, as revised November 21, 1949, and April 20, 1968)
This committee is a cooperative venture of universities and the National Bureau. Its guiding objective is the encouragement of economic research on problems susceptible of objective treatment and of sufficiently broad scope to merit attention by institutions serving a scientific and public interest.

Participating universities and their present representatives are:

Brown, Jerome L. Stein  
Buffalo, Daniel Hamberg  
California (Berkeley), Daniel McFadden  
California (Los Angeles), J. C. LaForce  
Carnegie-Mellon, Edward Prescott  
Chicago, Lester C. Telser  
Columbia, Robert Mundell  
Cornell, S. C. Tsiang  
Duke, T. Dudley Wallace  
Harvard, John V. Lintner  
Illinois, George G. Judge  
Indiana, Franz Gehrels  
Iowa State, Dudley G. Luckett  
Johns Hopkins, Carl F. Christ  
Maryland, Barbara Bergman  
Massachusetts Institute of Technology, Richard S. Eckaus  
McGill, Alex G. Vicas  
Michigan, Harold T. Shapiro  
Michigan State, Victor Smith  
Minnesota, James M. Henderson  
New School for Social Research, Thomas Vietoriz  
New York, M. Ishaq Nadiri  
North Carolina, Henry A. Latané  
Northwestern, Robert Eisner  
Ohio State, Jon Cunningham  
Pennsylvania, Jere R. Behrman  
Pittsburgh, S. H. Chou  
Princeton, Edwin S. Mills  
Purdue, Patric H. Hendershott  
Queen's, Martin F. J. Frachowny  
Rochester, Walter Y. Oi  
Stanford, Moses Abramowitz  
Texas, David A. Kendrick  
Toronto, Richard Bird  
Vanderbilt, Anthony Tang  
Virginia, Richard T. Selden  
Washington (St. Louis), Werner Hochwald  
Washington (Seattle), Richard W. Parks  
Wisconsin, Leonard W. Weiss  
Yale, Richard Ruggles

The National Bureau of Economic Research representative is: Robert E. Lipsey

Members at large are:

Irma Adelman  
Bela A. Balassa  
Carl E. Beigie  
Daniel Creamer  
Frank de Leeuw  
George J. Stigler  
Walter S. Salant

Secretary: Christine Mortensen

The officers of the Universities-National Bureau Committee are: Edwin S. Mills (Princeton University), Chairman; Leonard W. Weiss (University of Wisconsin), Vice Chairman; and Christine Mortensen (National Bureau of Economic Research), Secretary. The members of the Executive Committee are: Irma Adelman (University of Maryland), Richard Bird (University of Toronto), Robert Eisner (Northwestern University), Robert E. Lipsey (National Bureau of Economic Research), Dudley G. Luckett (Iowa State University), Edwin S. Mills, and Leonard W. Weiss.
Funds for the economic research conference program of the National Bureau of Economic Research are supplied by the National Science Foundation.
## Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Preface</th>
<th>xi</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Part I</strong></td>
<td><strong>THE MARKET FOR HEALTH INSURANCE</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Welfare Analysis of Changes in Health Coinsurance Rates</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kenneth Arrow</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comments</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>William Brock, Isaac Ehrlich</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. The Joint Demand for Health Insurance and Preventive Medicine</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gerald Nordquist and S. Y. Wu</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comments</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Robert L. Berg, Sherwin Rosen</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Group Health Insurance as a Local Public Good</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gerald S. Goldstein and Mark V. Pauly</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comments</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Donald Richter, William Vickrey</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Demand for Reimbursement Insurance</td>
<td>115</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Charles E. Phelps</td>
<td>115</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comments</td>
<td>156</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H. E. Frech III, Lester B. Lave</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Part II</strong></td>
<td><strong>EFFECTS OF HEALTH INSURANCE ON THE MARKET FOR HEALTH SERVICES</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Demand for Health Care Among the Urban Poor, with Special Emphasis on the Role of Time</td>
<td>163</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jan Paul Acton</td>
<td>165</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
6. The Family Provision of Children’s Health: An Economic Analysis
   Robert P. Inman
   Comments
   Lee Benham, David S. Salkever

7. New Estimates of Price and Income Elasticities of Medical Care Services
   Joseph P. Newhouse and Charles E. Phelps
   Comments
   Paul B. Ginsburg, Harold S. Luft

8. Physician Fee Inflation: Evidence from the Late 1960s
   Frank A. Sloan
   Comments
   Lien-fu Huang, Gail Wilensky

Part III NATIONAL HEALTH INSURANCE

9. Mortality, Disability, and the Normative Economics of Medicare
   Bernard Friedman
   Comments
   Stuart H. Altman, Ira Burney, Victor R. Fuchs

10. The Impact of Medicare and Medicaid on Access to Medical Care
    Karen Davis and Roger Reynolds
    Comments
    John Rafferty, Dorothy P. Rice

11. Beyond the Medical Marketplace: Expenditure, Utilization, and Pricing of Insured Health Care in Canada
    Robert G. Evans
    Comments
    Herbert E. Klarman, Anne S. Scitovsky

12. The Effect of National Health Insurance on the Price and Quantity of Medical Care
    Martin Feldstein and Bernard Friedman
    Comments
    Barry R. Chiswick, Michael D. Intriligator
    Reply
    Martin Feldstein and Bernard Friedman

Index
Conferences are sponsored by the Universities—National Bureau Committee for Economic Research in order to focus attention on major new areas of research. The economics of health easily satisfied the criteria for sponsorship. Though empirical and institutional studies of health economics can be found even in the earliest literature on economics, no major economic theorist concerned himself with any of the questions that are peculiar to the field until Kenneth Arrow published "Uncertainty and the Welfare Economics of Medical Care" in 1963. Since then, partly stimulated by rising public interest in national health insurance and partly attracted by the extremely interesting theoretical questions raised by Arrow, economists have increasingly turned their attention to health, applying sophisticated analysis to vast bodies of data newly made available by government agencies and various professional organizations and private survey centers.

Thus, when a committee was formed (consisting of Martin Feldstein, Michael Grossman, and myself) to organize a conference on an extremely important but narrowly defined topic in health economics, it was easy to find a dozen papers for which research was already in progress. Indeed, it would have been almost as easy to find twice that number, and many of the participants who served as discussants are themselves engaged in research that could appropriately have been included.

Michael Grossman and Martin Feldstein did much of the work of selection for the conference and therefore deserve a share of whatever credit or blame derives from it. Finally, Feldstein deserves an additional share for having had some part in the education of fully half the participants.

RICHARD N. ROSETT
The Role of Health Insurance in the Health Services Sector