DETERMINANTS OF EXPENDITURES FOR PHYSICIANS' SERVICES IN THE UNITED STATES 1948-68

VICTOR R. FUCHS
City University of New York
Mount Sinai School of Medicine
National Bureau of Economic Research

MARCIA J. KRAMER
National Bureau of Economic Research

NATIONAL CENTER FOR HEALTH SERVICES RESEARCH AND DEVELOPMENT

DHEW Publication No. (HSM) 73-3013
Department of Health, Education and Welfare
Health Services and Mental Health Administration
December 1972

National Bureau of Economic Research
OCCASIONAL PAPER 117
OFFICERS
Arthur F. Burns, Honorary Chairman
Walter W. Heller, Chairman
J. Wilson Newman, Vice Chairman
John R. Meyer, President
Thomas D. Flynn, Treasurer
Douglas H. Eldridge, Vice President-
Executive Secretary

Victor R. Fuchs, Vice President-Research
Edwin Kuh, Director, Computer Research
Center
Hal B. Lary, Vice President-Research
Robert E. Lipsey, Vice President-Research
Geoffrey H. Moore, Vice President-Research
Edward K. Smith, Vice President

DIRECTORS AT LARGE
Atherton Bean, International Multifoods
Corporation
Joseph A. Beirne, Communications Workers
of America
Arthur F. Burns, Board of Governors of the
Federal Reserve System
Wallace J. Campbell, Foundation for
Cooperative Housing
Erwin D. Canham, Christian Science Monitor
Solomon Fabricant, New York University
Frank W. Fetter, Hanover, New Hampshire
Eugene P. Foley, James A. Reed & Co., Ltd.
Eli Goldston, Eastern Gas and Fuel
Associates
David L. Grove, international Business
Machines Corporation
Walter W. Heller, University of Minnesota
Vivian W. Henderson, Clark College
John R. Meyer, Yale University
J. Irwin Miller, Cummins Engines Company, Inc.
Geoffrey H. Moore, National Bureau of
Economic Research
J. Wilson Newman, Dun & Bradstreet, Inc.
James J. O'Leary, United States Trust
Company of New York
Alice M. Rivlin, Brookings Institution
Robert V. Roosa, Brown Brothers Harriman & Co.
Boris Shishkin, Washington, D.C.
Arnold M. Soloway, Jamaica Way Tower,
Boston, Massachusetts
Lazare Teper, International Ladies' Garment
Workers' Union
Donald B. Woodward, Riverside, Connecticut
Theodore O. Yntema, Oakland University

DIRECTORS BY UNIVERSITY APPOINTMENT
Moses Abramovitz, Stanford
Gardner Ackley, Michigan
Charles H. Berry, Princeton
Francis M. Boddy, Minnesota
Otto Eckstein, Harvard
Walter D. Fisher, Northwestern
R. A. Gordon, California
Robert J. Lampman, Wisconsin
Kelvin J. Lancaster, Columbia
Maurice W. Lee, North Carolina
Almarin Phillips, Pennsylvania
Lloyd G. Reynolds, Yale
Robert M. Solow, Massachusetts Institute of
Technology
Henri Theil, Chicago
Thomas A. Wilson, Toronto

DIRECTORS BY APPOINTMENT OF OTHER ORGANIZATIONS
Eugene A. Birnbaum, American Management
Association
Emilio G. Collado, Committee for Economic
Development
Thomas D. Flynn, American Institute of
Certified Public Accountants
Nathaniel Goldfinger, American Federation of
Labor and Congress of Industrial
Organizations
Harold G. Halcrow, American Agricultural
Economics Association
Walter E. Hoadley, American Finance
Association
Douglas C. North, Economic History
Association
Charles B. Reeder, National Association of
Business Economists
Willard L. Thorp, American Economic
Association
W. Allen Wallis, American Statistical
Association
Robert M. Will, Canadian Economics
Association

DIRECTORS EMERITI
Percival F. Brundage
Gottried Haberler
Albert J. Hettinger, Jr.
George B. Roberts
Murray Shields
Joseph H. Willits

SENIOR RESEARCH STAFF
Gary S. Becker
Charlotte Boschan
Phillip Cagan
Solomon Fabricant
Milton Friedman
Victor R. Fuchs
Raymond W. Goldsmith
Michael Gort
F. Thomas Juster
John F. Kain
John W. Kendrick
Irving B. Kravis
Edwin Kuh
Hal B. Lary
Robert E. Lipsey
Benoit B. Mandelbrot
John R. Meyer
Jacob Mincer
Ilse Mintz
Geoffrey H. Moore
M. Ishaq Nadiri
Nancy Ruggles
Richard Ruggles
Anna J. Schwartz
Robert P. Shay
Carl S. Shoup†
George J. Stigler
Victor Zarnowitz
Geoffrey H. Moore
M. Ishaq Nadiri
Nancy Ruggles
Richard Ruggles
Anna J. Schwartz
Robert P. Shay
Carl S. Shoup†
George J. Stigler
Victor Zarnowitz

† Special consultant.
PREFACE

This paper was prepared at the National Bureau of Economic Research at the request of and with financial assistance provided by the National Center for Health Services Research and Development, U.S. Department of Health, Education, and Welfare.

Our principal objective is to gain a better understanding of the factors that determine expenditures for physicians' services in the United States. We attempt to do this through analyses of trends over time and of variations across states at a given point in time. The statistical decomposition of the time series was largely the work of Fuchs, while Kramer assumed primary responsibility for the econometric cross-section analysis. The complete paper, however, represents a collaborative effort for which both authors take full responsibility.

We are indebted to Barry Chiswick, Martin Feldstein, Michael Grossman, Anne Scitovsky, Christopher Sims, Finis Welch, Robert Willis, and three anonymous National Center reviewers for their constructive comments and suggestions. We are also grateful to Atherton Bean, Charles Berry, and Emilio Collado, NBER directors who provided helpful comments. For their highly valued research assistance, we extend thanks to Carol Breckner, Phyllis Goldberg, and Robert Linn. We are grateful to Terry Battipaglia and Maria Perides for preparation of the manuscript, to Hedy D. Jellinek for her editorial services, and to H. Irving Forman for the figures and charts.

Extensive use is made of the results of surveys conducted by Medical Economics, and we wish to express our appreciation to the editors of that journal for their cooperation. Finally, we should like to acknowledge the valuable assistance of the following members of the NBER Health Economics Advisory Committee: Morton D. Bogdonoff, M.D.; James Brindle; Norton Brown, M.D.; Kurt Deuschle, M.D. (chairman); Marion B. Folsom; Eli Ginzberg; the late George James, M.D.; Richard Kessler, M.D.; and the late David Lyall, M.D.

Victor R. Fuchs

Marcia J. Kramer

ACKNOWLEDGMENT

This monograph, one of three publications* commissioned by the Publications Advisory Board of the National Center for Health Services Research and Development (NCHSRD), was prepared under contract with the authors. The opinions expressed are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect the official position of the NCHSRD, its administrative parent Health Services and Mental Health Administration, or any other agency of the U.S. Government.

PAB Membership:

Dr. Bernard G. Greenberg (CHAIRMAN)  
Mr. Robert E. Toomey  
Dr. Howard E. Freeman  
Dr. Robert J. Haggerty  
Prof. Herbert E. Klarman, Ph.D.  
Mrs. Anne Scitovsky  
Dr. Rosemary Stevens  
Dr. Ralph Straetz  
Dr. Charles R. Wright  
Mr. Domenic A. Fuccillo, Jr. (Secretary)

*The two others are: Martin Feldstein, Rising Cost of Hospital Care; and Ralph Straetz and Marvin Lieberman (eds.), Decision Making and Control.
CONTENTS

Preface and Acknowledgments .............................................. iii
Introduction and Summary ................................................. 1

1. Differences Over Time, 1948-68: A Statistical Decomposition .............................................. 5
   1.1 Expenditures .................................................. 5
   1.2 Price and Insurance ......................................... 7
   1.3 Quantity of Physicians' Services ......................... 10
   1.4 Income ....................................................... 11
   1.5 Demographic Structure .................................... 11
   1.6 Recapitulation: Comparison of 1956-66 with 1948-56 12
   1.7 Technological Change ...................................... 13
   1.8 The Supply of Physicians ................................ 15
   1.9 Quantity per Physician .................................. 17
   1.10 Analysis of Average Price ............................... 18
   1.11 The 1966-68 Subperiod .................................. 18

2. Differences Across States, 1966: An Econometric Analysis .............................................. 21
   2.1 Introduction ................................................ 21
   2.2 A Framework for Analysis ................................ 21
   2.3 Specification of the Model ................................ 22
   2.4 The Data ..................................................... 27
   2.5 Regression Results ........................................ 29
   2.6 The Effect on Health ..................................... 39
   2.7 Conclusion ................................................ 40

Appendix A. Time Series: Sources and Methods .............................................. 43
Appendix B. Time Series: Derivation of Average Price .............................................. 47
Appendix C. Cross Section: Sources and Methods .............................................. 53

TABLES

1. Expenditures for Physicians' Services, 1948-68
2. Rates of Change of Expenditures for Physicians' Services, 1948-68
3. Price Indexes of Physicians' Services and All Goods and Services, 1948-68
4. Rates of Change of Prices of Physicians' Services and All Goods and Services, 1948-68
5. Relative Importance of Insurance for Physicians' Services, 1948-68
6. Rates of Change of Third-Party and Direct Expenditures for Physicians' Services, 1948-68
7. Rates of Change of Quantity of Physicians' Services, Personal Income, and Predicted Expenditures and Visits, 1948-68
8. Predicted Effects of Changes in Age-Sex Structure of Population on Utilization of Physicians' Services, 1948-68
9. Comparison of 1956-66 with 1948-56, Expenditures per Capita and Related Variables
10. Rates of Change of Death Rates and Hospital Use, 1948-68
11. Rates of Change of Dentists' Services, 1948-68
12. U.S. Physicians, by Type, Selected Years, 1949-67
13. Average Annual Rates of Change of Private Practice Physicians, 1949-67
14. Statistical Analysis of Rate of Change in Quantity of Service per Physician, 1948-68
15. Statistical Analysis of Rate of Change in Average Price of Physicians' Services, 1948-68
16. List of Variables
17. Summary Statistics, 33 States, 1966
18. Results of Weighted, Logarithmic Regressions, Second Stage, Interstate Model, 1966
19. Results of Weighted, Logarithmic Health Regressions, Ordinary Least Squares, Interstate Model, 1966

A-1 Public Expenditures and Insurance, 1948-68
A-2 Physicians, by Type of Practice, 1947-68
C-1 Expenditures, Insurance, and Price, 1966
C-2 Physicians, by Type of Practice, 1966
C-3 Weighted Logarithmic Correlation Matrix, 1966

CHARTS

1. Percentage Changes in Expenditures per Capita for Physicians' Services, 1948-68
2. Growth of Third-Party Payment for Physicians' Services, 1948-68
3. Indexes of Health, 1948-68
4. Ratio of Number of Physician Visits by Persons with Family Income Greater than $10,000 to Visits by Persons with Family Income Less than $3,000, by Age and Sex, 1966-67

FIGURES

1. Relationships Among Endogenous Variables, Alternate Specifications
2. Effects of Exogenous Variables on Endogenous Variables