The Transportation Industries
1889-1946
A Study of Output
Employment, and Productivity

by Harold Barger
Columbia University

National Bureau of
Economic Research, Inc.

NEW YORK 1951
As its subtitle indicates, this book deals with the output of transportation services, with the draft upon the labor force required to produce this output, and with the changing relationship between traffic and employment. Like others issued by the National Bureau, the volume reviews a segment of the American economy and reports upon the progress that has been made in physical efficiency since the end of last century. Concerned with global magnitudes and long-range tendencies, it complements an earlier volume focused on cyclical fluctuations, Thor Hultgren's American Transportation in Prosperity and Depression (NBER, 1948).

My desire has been to play no favorites, yet in the outcome the attention given to different kinds of transportation varies greatly. To some readers the choice of topics for discussion may seem arbitrary. A few words of explanation are in place.

The three chapters in Part One profess to cover the entire field of commercial or for-hire transportation, excluding only the operations of the private passenger car and the privately owned truck. Yet data for taxicabs, local trucking, and contract air carriers are not included. Failure to cover these activities, which undoubtedly fall within the scope of the study, is due simply and solely to lack of data.

In Part Two, five industries are chosen for individual consideration. The principle of selection was to treat in the body of the text only those industries for which both output and employment indexes could be constructed, so that trends in productivity might be assessed. Because no employment indexes could be constructed for buslines or for motor trucking, these two industries do not
figure in Part Two. However, motor trucking is discussed in Appendix F.

The five chapters dealing with individual industries in Part Two are of very unequal length. The scope of the discussion in each case was influenced partly by the complexity of the industry and partly by availability of data. Thus ample data and a rich technical literature prompted extended consideration of steam railroads, despite the fact that — structurally and technologically — they are relatively homogeneous. Electric railways, pipelines, and airlines are also — in their separate spheres — somewhat homogeneous; for each the data are sparse, though for the two latter now rapidly becoming more ample. For these three industries our standard measures of output, employment, and output per worker are presented; but lengthy discussion did not seem rewarding, and the chapters dealing with them are consequently brief. Waterways, on the other hand, offer the investigator a mass of material, much of it poorly organized. Moreover, waterways are in many respects far less homogeneous than the other agencies considered. These factors made for a somewhat fuller treatment of waterways.

Reference has freely been made to technological changes, wherever they seemed to illuminate trends in productivity. The neglect of technological change in water transportation is deliberate, and results from the partial character of our employment and productivity indexes in this field. Since it was impossible to measure shore employment before 1929, our index of output per worker on waterways does not reflect the advances in waterway terminals — one of the most interesting technological developments in waterway transportation. Moreover, vessel employment could not be distributed among individual waterways, whose technological characteristics differ widely. It would therefore have been quite impossible to relate technological changes to advances in productivity, as we were able to do, for instance, in the case of steam railroads.

The Appendices include basic series on output and employment for all industries considered, detailed discussion of certain points of methodology, and an analysis of the motor trucking industry which (for reasons mentioned above) was not treated in the text.
OFFICERS
Boris Shishkin, Chairman
Harry Scherman, President
C. C. Balderston, Vice-President
George B. Roberts, Treasurer
W. J. Carson, Executive Director
Martha Anderson, Editor

DIRECTORS AT LARGE
D. R. Belcher, American Telephone & Telegraph Co.
Oswald W. Knauth, New York City
Simon Kuznets, University of Pennsylvania
H. W. Laidler, Executive Director, League for Industrial Democracy
Shepard Morgan, New York City
C. Reinold Noyes, Princeton, New Jersey
George B. Roberts, Vice-President, National City Bank
Beardsley Ruml, New York City
Harry Scherman, Chairman, Book-of-the-Month Club
George Soule, Bennington College
N. I. Stone, Consulting Economist
J. Raymond Walsh, WMCA Broadcasting Co.
Leo Wolman, Columbia University
Theodore O. Yntema, Vice President-Finance, Ford Motor Company

DIRECTORS BY UNIVERSITY APPOINTMENT
E. Wight Bakke, Yale
C. C. Balderston, Pennsylvania
Arthur F. Burns, Columbia
G. A. Elliott, Toronto
Frank W. Fetter, Northwestern
H. M. Groves, Wisconsin
G. C. Balderston, Pennsylvania
Clarence Heer, North Carolina
R. L. Kozelka, Minnesota
T. W. Schultz, Chicago

DIRECTORS APPOINTED BY OTHER ORGANIZATIONS
Percival F. Brundage, American Institute of Accountants
Thomas C. Cochran, Economic History Association
Frederick C. Mills, American Statistical Association
S. H. Ruttenberg, Congress of Industrial Organizations
Murray Shields, American Management Association
Boris Shishkin, American Federation of Labor
Donald H. Wallace, American Economic Association

RESEARCH STAFF
Arthur F. Burns, Director of Research
Geoffrey H. Moore, Associate Director of Research

Moses Abramovitz
Harold Barger
Morris A. Copeland
Daniel Creamer
David Durand
Solomon Fabricant
Milton Friedman
Millard Hastay
W. Braddock Hickman
Leo Wolman

F. F. Hill
Thor Hultgren
Simon Kuznets
Clarence D. Long
Ruth P. Mack
Frederick C. Mills
Raymond J. Saulnier
Lawrence H. Seltzer
George J. Stigler
RELATION OF THE DIRECTORS
TO THE WORK AND PUBLICATIONS
OF THE NATIONAL BUREAU OF ECONOMIC RESEARCH

1. The object of the National Bureau of Economic Research is to ascertain and to present to the public important economic facts and their interpretation in a scientific and impartial manner. The Board of Directors is charged with the responsibility of ensuring that the work of the National Bureau is carried on in strict conformity with this object.

2. To this end the Board of Directors shall appoint one or more Directors of Research.

3. The Director or Directors of Research shall submit to the members of the Board, or to its Executive Committee, for their formal adoption, all specific proposals concerning researches to be instituted.

4. No report shall be published until the Director or Directors of Research shall have submitted to the Board a summary drawing attention to the character of the data and their utilization in the report, the nature and treatment of the problems involved, the main conclusions and such other information as in their opinion would serve to determine the suitability of the report for publication in accordance with the principles of the National Bureau.

5. A copy of any manuscript proposed for publication shall also be submitted to each member of the Board. For each manuscript to be so submitted a special committee shall be appointed by the President, or at his designation by the Executive Director, consisting of three Directors selected as nearly as may be one from each general division of the Board. The names of the special manuscript committee shall be stated to each Director when the summary and report described in paragraph (4) are sent to him. It shall be the duty of each member of the committee to read the manuscript. If each member of the special committee signifies his approval within thirty days, the manuscript may be published. If each member of the special committee has not signified his approval within thirty days of the transmittal of the report and manuscript, the Director of Research shall then notify each member of the Board, requesting approval or disapproval of publication, and thirty additional days shall be granted for this purpose. The manuscript shall then not be published unless at least a majority of the entire Board and a two-thirds majority of those members of the Board who shall have voted on the proposal within the time fixed for the receipt of votes on the publication proposed shall have approved.

6. No manuscript may be published, though approved by each member of the special committee, until forty-five days have elapsed from the transmittal of the summary and report. The interval is allowed for the receipt of any memorandum of dissent or reservation, together with a brief statement of his reasons, that any member may wish to express; and such memorandum of dissent or reservation shall be published with the manuscript if he so desires. Publication does not, however, imply that each member of the Board has read the manuscript, or that either members of the Board in general, or of the special committee, have passed upon its validity in every detail.

7. A copy of this resolution shall, unless otherwise determined by the Board, be printed in each copy of every National Bureau book.

(Resolution adopted October 25, 1926 and revised February 6, 1933 and February 24, 1941)
Publications of the National Bureau of Economic Research, Inc.

Number 51

The Transportation Industries, 1889–1946: A Study of Output, Employment, and Productivity
Other National Bureau reports in this series dealing with production, employment, and productivity in American industry are:

**BOOKS**

*The Output of Manufacturing Industries, 1899-1937* (1940)  
Solomon Fabricant

*Employment in Manufacturing, 1899-1939: An Analysis of Its Relation to the Volume of Production* (1942)  
Solomon Fabricant

Solomon Fabricant

Solomon Fabricant

*Output and Productivity in the Electric and Gas Utilities, 1899-1942* (1946)  
J. M. Gould

*Trends in Output and Employment* (1947)  
George J. Stigler

**OCCASIONAL PAPERS**

*Manufacturing Output, 1929-1937* (1940)  
Solomon Fabricant

*The Relation between Factory Employment and Output since 1899* (1941)  
Solomon Fabricant

*Productivity of Labor in Peace and War* (1942)  
Solomon Fabricant

Solomon Fabricant

*Domestic Servants in the United States, 1900-1940* (1946)  
George J. Stigler

*The Rising Trend of Government Employment* (1949)  
Solomon Fabricant

*Employment and Compensation in Education* (1950)  
George J. Stigler

* Out of print.
Author’s Acknowledgments

My principal obligation is to my co-worker Jacob M. Gould, formerly of the National Bureau staff, now with the Econometric Institute. Mr. Gould undertook much of the basic research; he is the author of Appendix C; and he was responsible for initial drafts of the first half of Chapter 4, Chapter 7, and Appendix F. To Solomon Fabricant I owe a mounting debt for encouragement and helpful criticism, a debt that runs all the way back to the start of the project, now more than ten years ago. Particularly in its final stages, the work benefited greatly from discussions with Geoffrey H. Moore and Thor Hultgren.

For unpublished tabulations, information, or advice I have to thank: Edward F. Denison, Walther Lederer, Robert L. Sammons, Charles F. Schwartz, and Herbert A. Wilkinson, of the Bureau of Foreign and Domestic Commerce; Daniel Creamer, formerly of the Bureau of Foreign and Domestic Commerce, now with the National Bureau; Charles W. Caswell of the Interstate Commerce Commission; Henry L. Deimel, Jr. (now with the Department of State) and Admiral Emory S. Land, formerly of the Maritime Commission; Herbert A. Breakey, formerly of the Bureau of Mines, now with the Munitions Board; Herbert S. Fairbank, John T. Lynch, and Robert E. Royall, of the Public Roads Administration; Colonel R. G. Powell, formerly of the War Department; Eugene B. McCaul and the late Edmund J. Murphy, of the American Transit Association; Julius H. Parmelee of the Association of American Railroads; O. P. Pearson of the Automobile Manufacturers Association; Carl W. Stocks of Bus Transportation; and G. C. Buzby of the Commercial Car Journal.

The manuscript was read, in whole or in part, and useful comments were made by C. Canby Balderston, G. A. Elliott,
Oswald W. Knauth, and Frederick C. Mills, Directors of the National Bureau; by J. Steele Gow of The Maurice and Laura Falk Foundation; by Ernest W. Williams, Jr. of Columbia University; by H. S. Davis of the University of Pennsylvania; and by Alden F. Bixby of the Railroad Retirement Board.

I have still further obligations. Irving H. Siegel, formerly of the National Bureau and now with the Veterans Administration, worked on the project in its early stages. H. Irving Forman drew the charts with his customary skill. Roselyn Silverman checked the manuscript in proof. Finally, Martha Anderson suggested numerous textual improvements, and steered the book through the press.

The study upon which this volume and the previously issued reports are based was made possible by funds granted by The Maurice and Laura Falk Foundation of Pittsburgh. The Falk Foundation is not, however, the author, publisher or proprietor of this publication, and is not to be understood as approving or disapproving by virtue of its grant any of the statements made or views expressed therein.
Contents

Preface vii
Acknowledgments ix
Summary 1

Part One: The Transportation Industries as a Whole

1 The Transportation Industries at the Outbreak of World War II 9
   Relative Size of the Industries 12
   The Major Industries 14
   Passenger Traffic 17
   Freight Traffic 19

2 Growth and Decline of Traffic Since 1889 24
   Weighted and Unweighted Indexes 24
   Passenger and Freight Traffic Combined 27
   Passenger Traffic 29
   Freight Traffic 38
   Some Further Comparisons 43
   How Did Total Transportation Behave? 49

3 Trends in Employment and Productivity 52
   Individual Industries 57

Part Two: Individual Transportation Industries

4 Steam Railroads 63
   The Concept of Physical Output 64
   Passenger Traffic 68
   Freight Traffic 75
   Railroad Traffic as a Whole 92
   Employment and Productivity 93
   The Amount of Equipment 98
   Changes in Technology and Their Effects 100
   Some Technological Advances 103
   Technology and Output per Worker 110
CHAPTER

5 Electric Railways
   All Electric Railways 112
   Intercity Electric Railways 113
   Urban Electric Railways 121

6 Pipelines 123

7 Waterways
   Waterways in 1939 127
   The Growth of Waterway Traffic 135
   Employment and Productivity 148
   The Amount of Equipment 150

8 Airlines 153

APPENDICES

A On the Measurement of the Physical Output of Public Utilities 163
   Concepts 163
   Units 165
   Value as a Common Denominator 168
   The Logic of the Value Concept 171
   The Characteristics of Market Valuation 172
   The Combination of Industries 180

B Steam Railroads: Basic Series 183

C Steam Railroads: How Would a Weighted Ton-Mile Index Behave?
   Can We Measure the Bias in a Weighted Index of Tons Originated? 192
   The Bias in an Unweighted Index of Ton-Miles 194

D Electric Railways: Basic Series 215

E Highways—Buslines, City and Intercity: Basic Series 219

F Highways—The Motor Trucking Industry 221
   Structure of the Industry 221
   The Number of Trucks 225
   The Output of Intercity Motor Trucking in 1940 229
   Characteristics of Truck Traffic 232
   The Growth of Intercity Motor Trucking 237
   Relation of Output to Employment 244

G Oil Pipelines: Basic Series 249

H Waterways: Basic Series 253

I Airlines: Basic Series 265

INDEX 267
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Text Table</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>The Transportation Industries, 1939-1940</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>The Transportation Industries, Leading Statistics, 1939</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Passenger Traffic, 1939</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Freight Traffic, 1939</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Indexes of Transportation Output, 1889-1946</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Ratios of Passenger to Combined Passenger and Freight Traffic, 1889-1946</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Indexes of Passenger Traffic, 1889-1946</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Indexes of Freight Traffic, 1889-1946</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Per Capita Use of Transportation Facilities, 1889-1946</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Output Trends in Transportation and Other Industries, 1889-1946</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Employment in the Transportation Industries, 1889-1946</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>All Transportation: Output, Employment, and Productivity, 1889-1946</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Average Annual Rates of Change in Output Per Worker in Transportation and Other Industries</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>Product (in 1939 Prices) Per Worker in the Transportation Industries</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>Steam Railroads: Value of Product and Number of Employees, 1939</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>Steam Railroads: Passenger Traffic, 1939</td>
<td>68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>Steam Railroads: Indexes of Passenger, Freight, and Total Traffic, 1890-1946</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>Steam Railroads: Indexes of Freight Traffic, 1890-1940</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>Steam Railroads: Distribution of Ton-Miles by Revenue Per Ton-Mile, 1932</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>Steam Railroads: Distribution of Freight Tonnage Originated by Length of Haul, 1932</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>Steam Railroads: Freight Traffic, by Commodities, 1932</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>Steam Railroads: Average Hauls, 1929 and 1939, as Computed from 1932 Data and as Actually Observed</td>
<td>89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td>Steam Railroads: Output, Employment, and Productivity, 1890-1946</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td>Railroad Traffic and Employment, 1923-1939</td>
<td>101</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26</td>
<td>Electric Railways, Urban and Interurban: Output, Employment, and Productivity, 1890-1946</td>
<td>114</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### TEXT TABLES

27 Electric Railways: Urban and Interurban Segments, Census Years 1922-1937  
28 Interurban Electric Railways: Output, Employment, and Productivity, 1902-1946  
29 Oil Pipelines: Output, Employment, and Productivity, 1921-1946  
30 Waterways: Passenger and Freight Traffic, 1939  
31 Composition of Coastwise Freight Traffic, 1939  
32 Water-Borne Freight Traffic Between the United States and Foreign Countries, by Flag of Vessel, 1929, 1939, and 1946  
33 Waterways: Indexes of Traffic, 1889 and 1920-1946  
34 Waterways: American-Flag International Freight Traffic, by Continental Regions, 1939  
35 All Waterways: Output, Employment, and Productivity, 1889-1946  
36 Waterways: Output, Employment, and Gross Tonnage of Vessels, 1889-1946  
37 Airlines: Output, Employment, and Productivity, 1926-1946  
38 Domestic Airlines: Passenger-Miles, Seat-Miles, and Plane-Miles Per Worker, 1929-1946

### APPENDIX TABLES

B-1 Steam Railroads: Traffic, Revenue, and Employment, 1890-1946  
B-2 Steam Railroads: Passenger Traffic and Revenue by Kind of Passenger, 1911-1921  
B-3 Steam Railroads: Passenger Traffic and Revenue by Kind of Passenger, 1922-1946  
C-1 Steam Railroads: Freight Traffic by Individual Commodities, 1932  
C-2 Steam Railroads: Freight Traffic by Revenue Per Ton-Mile, 1932  
C-3 Steam Railroads: Freight Traffic, Average Haul, 1899-1946  
C-4 Freight Traffic: Maximum Upward Bias in the Unweighted Index, 1919-1932  
C-5 Freight Traffic: Minimum Upward Bias in the Unweighted Index, 1919-1932  
C-6 Freight Traffic: Minimum Downward Bias in the Unweighted Index, 1932-1938
CONTENTS

APPENDIX TABLES

C-7 Freight Traffic: Maximum Downward Bias in the Unweighted Index, 1932-1938 212

D-1 Electric Railways, Urban and Interurban: Passengers Carried and Employees, 1890-1946 216

D-2 Interurban Electric Railways: Passenger and Freight Traffic and Employees, 1902-1946 217

E-1 Buslines: Passenger Traffic, 1925-1946 220

F-1 Motor Truck Registrations, Estimated Distribution, 1940 228

F-2 Truck Traffic on Rural Roads, 1940 231

F-3 Composition of Truck Traffic, 1936-1940 235

F-4 Intercity Motor Trucking: Ton-Mile Estimates, 1925-1946 242

G-1 Oil Pipelines: Derivation of Ton-Miles, and Data for Employment, 1920-1946 251

H-1 Waterways: Freight Traffic Summary 254

H-2 Waterways: Passenger Traffic Summary 256

H-3 Domestic Freight Traffic of 76 Principal Seaports, 1937 257

H-4 Derivation of Coastwise and Intercoastal Ton-Miles, 1937 259

H-5 Derivation of Noncontiguous Ton-Miles, 1939 260

H-6 Derivation of American-Flag International Ton-Miles, 1939 261

H-7 Waterways: Employment 263

I-1 Airlines: Traffic and Employment, 1926-1946 266

CHARTS

1 All Transportation Agencies: Passenger, Freight, and Combined Traffic 28

2 Passenger and Freight Traffic Combined 30

3 Long Distance Agencies: Passenger-Mile Indexes 31

4 Passenger Traffic: Percentage Distribution by Agency 32

5 Local Agencies: Indexes of Passengers Carried 33

6 Long Distance and Local Passenger Traffic: Indexes of Output 37

7 Freight Traffic: Ton-Mile Indexes 39

8 Freight Traffic: Percentage Distribution by Agency 42

9 Output Per Worker in Individual Industries 58

10 Steam Railroads: Passenger, Freight, and Combined Traffic 72
CHARTS

11 Steam Railroads: Passenger Traffic 73
12 Railroad Freight Traffic: Tons Originated and Ton-Miles 79
13 Steam Railroads: Percentage Composition of Freight Traffic 84
14 Railroad Freight Traffic: Length of Haul 87
15 Steam Railroads: Output, Employment, and Productivity 94
16 Steam Railroads: Output Per Worker and Per Manhour 98
17 Electric Railways, Urban and Interurban: Output, Employment, and Productivity 116
18 Interurban Electric Railways: Output, Employment, and Productivity 121
19 Oil Pipelines: Output, Employment, and Productivity 125
20 Waterways: Passenger, Freight, and Combined Traffic 137
21 Waterway Freight Traffic 141
22 Waterways: Output, Employment, and Productivity 151
23 Domestic Airlines: Output, Employment, and Productivity 156
24 American-Flag International Airlines: Output, Employment, and Productivity 156
25 Domestic Airlines: Passenger-Miles, Seat-Miles, and Plane-Miles Per Worker 158