ECONOMETRIC MODELS OF CYCLICAL BEHAVIOR

Volume I
ECONOMETRIC MODELS OF CYClical BEHAVIOR
EDITED BY BERT G. HICKMAN
STANFORD UNIVERSITY

Studies in Income and Wealth • NUMBER THIRTY-SIX
by the Conference on Research in Income and Wealth

Volume I

Cosponsored by the National Bureau of Economic Research and the Social Science Research Council Committee on Economic Stability

DISTRIBUTED BY COLUMBIA UNIVERSITY PRESS
NEW YORK AND LONDON 1972
PREFATORY NOTE

This volume of *Studies in Income and Wealth* contains the papers presented at the Conference on Econometric Models of Cyclical Behavior held at Harvard University on November 14 and 15, 1969, under the joint sponsorship of the SSRC Committee on Economic Stability and the NBER Conference on Research in Income and Wealth. We are indebted to the National Science Foundation for its support. The Program Committee consisted of Bert G. Hickman, Chairman, Zvi Griliches, Lawrence R. Klein, and Geoffrey H. Moore. This group also served as the Editorial Committee, with Bert Hickman as Conference editor. Our thanks are due to Ruth Ridler who prepared the proceedings for press and to H. Irving Forman for his fine charting.

*Executive Committee, 1970-71*

Dale W. Jorgenson, *Chairman*
Edward C. Budd
Jean B. Crockett
Terry Gigantes
W. Lee Hansen
F. Thomas Juster
Maurice Liebenberg
Joel Popkin
Stephen P. Taylor
Nestor E. Terleckyj
Mildred E. Courtney, *Secretary*
INTRODUCTION

PART I. BUSINESS

SHORT- AND ECONOMETRIC EQUATIONS WITH MACROECONOMIC MEASURES

Discussion

Reply:

SHORT-RUN EFFECTS OF GOVERNMENT POLICIES ON THE ECONOMY

R. Klein, a

D. McCarth

Discussion

SHORT- AND LONG-RUN IMPACTS OF INFLATION ON BUSINESS CYCLES

George R.

Discussion

BUSINESS CYCLES AND ECONOMIC POLICIES

Geoffrey H

Discussion

APPENDIX

VARIABLES

NOVEMBER

and Robert
NATIONAL BUREAU OF ECONOMIC RESEARCH

OFFICERS
Arthur F. Burns, Honorary Chairman
Walter W. Heller, Chairman
J. Wilson Newman, Vice Chairman
John R. Meyer, President
Thomas D. Flynn, Treasurer
Douglas H. Eldridge, Vice President-Executive Secretary
Victor R. Fuchs, Vice President-Research

F. Thomas Juster, Vice President-Research
Hal B. Lary, Vice President-Research
Robert E. Lipsey, Vice President-Research
Edward K. Smith, Vice President
Joan R. Tron, Director of Publications
Charlotte Boschan, Director of Data Processing
Evan Stephens, Controller

DIRECTORS AT LARGE
Atherton Bean, International Multifoods Corporation
Joseph A. Beirne, Communications Workers of America
Arthur F. Burns, Board of Governors of the Federal Reserve System
Wallace J. Campbell, Foundation for Cooperative Housing
Erwin D. Canham, Christian Science Monitor
Solomon Fabricant, New York University
Frank W. Fetter, Hanover, New Hampshire
Eugene P. Foley, James A. Reed & Co., Ltd.
Eli Goldston, Eastern Gas and Fuel Associates
David L. Grove, International Business Machines Corporation
Walter W. Heller, University of Minnesota

Theodore O. Yntema, Oakland University

DIRECTORS BY UNIVERSITY APPOINTMENT
Moses Abramovitz, Stanford
Gardner Ackley, Michigan
Charles H. Berry, Princeton
Francis M. Biddy, Minnesota
Otto Eckstein, Harvard
Watler D. Fisher, Northwestern
R. A. Gordon, California
Robert J. Lampman, Wisconsin

Kelvin J. Lancaster, Columbia
Maurice W. Lee, North Carolina
Almarine Phillips, Pennsylvania
Lloyd G. Reynolds, Yale
Robert M. Solow, Massachusetts Institute of Technology
Henri Theil, Chicago
Thomas A. Wilson, Toronto

DIRECTORS BY APPOINTMENT OF OTHER ORGANIZATIONS
Eugene A. Birnbaum, American Management Association
Emilio G. Collado, Committee for Economic Development
Thomas D. Flynn, American Institute of Certified Public Accountants
Nathaniel Goldfinger, American Federation of Labor and Congress of Industrial Organizations
Harold G. Halsey, American Agricultural Economics Association

Douglas G. Hartle, Canadian Economics Association
Walter E. Headley, American Finance Association
Douglas C. North, Economic History Association
Charles B. Reeder, National Association of Business Economists
Willard L. Thorp, American Economic Association

DIRECTORS EMERITI
Percival F. Brundage
Gustafried Haberler

Albert J. Hettinger, Jr.
George B. Roberts

Murray Shields
Joseph H. Willits

SENIOR RESEARCH STAFF
Gary S. Becker
Charlotte Bochan
Phillip Cagan
James S. Earley
Solomon Fabricant
Milton Friedman
Victor R. Fuchs

Raymond W. Goldsmith
Jack M. Guentensberg
Daniel M. Holland
F. Thomas Juster
C. Harry Kahn
John F. Kin
John W. Kendrick

Irving B. Kravis
Hal B. Lary
Robert E. Lipsey
John R. Meyer
Jacob Minzer
Ilse Mintz
Geoffrey H. Moore *

* On leave.

M. Ishaq Nadiri
Nancy Ruggles
Richard Ruggles
Anna J. Schwartz
Robert P. Shay
George J. Stigler
Victor Zarnowitz
SOCIAL SCIENCE RESEARCH COUNCIL COMMITTEE
ON ECONOMIC STABILITY, 1969-70

Bert G. Hickman, Chairman
Martin Bronfenbrenner
James S. Duesenberry
Otto Eckstein
R. A. Gordon
Zvi Griliches

Lawrence R. Klein
Franco Modigliani
Geoffrey H. Moore
Arthur Okun
Rudolf R. Rhomberg
Charles L. Schultze

Since the press it has been estimated that some 1,000 manuscripts treated of the Nation...
Since the present volume is a record of conference proceedings, it has been exempted from the rules governing submission of manuscripts to, and critical review by, the Board of Directors of the National Bureau.

(Resolution adopted July 6, 1948, as revised November 21, 1949, and April 20, 1968)
PREFACE

THIS volume of Score presented at the Conference held at Harvard University in joint sponsorship of the NBER Conference Committee and the National Bureau of Economic Research. Lawrence A. Klein served as the Editor. Our thanks to the Dean for press and editorial support.

[Continued on next page]
CONTENTS

INTRODUCTION AND SUMMARY  Bert G. Hickman  1

PART I. BUSINESS-CYCLE SIMULATIONS

SHORT- AND LONG-TERM SIMULATIONS WITH THE OBE ECONOMETRIC MODEL  George R. Green, in association with Maurice Liebenberg and Albert A. Hirsch  25

Discussion: Guy H. Orcutt and Thomas H. Naylor  123

Reply:  Green  137

SHORT-RUN PREDICTION AND LONG-RUN SIMULATION OF THE WHARTON MODEL  Michael K. Evans, Lawrence R. Klein, and Mitsuo Saito, with Appendix by Michael D. McCarthy  139

Discussion: Frank de Leeuw and Bridger M. Mitchell  191

SHORT- AND LONG-TERM SIMULATIONS WITH THE BROOKINGS MODEL  Gary Fromm, Lawrence R. Klein, and George R. Schink  201

Discussion: Ralph B. Bristol and Robert J. Gordon  293

BUSINESS CYCLE ANALYSIS OF ECONOMETRIC MODEL SIMULATIONS  Victor Zarnowitz, Charlotte Boschan, and Geoffrey H. Moore, assisted by Josephine Su  311

Discussion: Irma G. Adelman and Saul H. Hymans  534

APPENDIX TO PART I: EQUATIONS AND DEFINITIONS OF VARIABLES FOR THE FRB-MIT-PENN ECONOMETRIC MODEL, NOVEMBER, 1969  Albert Ando, Franco Modigliani, and Robert Rasche  543
PART II. OTHER DYNAMIC STUDIES

DYNAMIC PROPERTIES OF A CONDENSED VERSION OF THE WHARTON MODEL  •  E. Philip Howrey 601

Discussion: Charles C. Holt and Emanuel Parzen 663

EFFECTS OF AGGREGATION OVER TIME ON DYNAMIC CHARACTERISTICS OF AN ECONOMETRIC MODEL  •  Robert F. Engle and Ta-Chung Liu 673

Discussion: Phoebus J. Dhrymes and Zvi Griliches 729

AN ECONOMETRIC MODEL OF BUSINESS CYCLES  •  Gregory C. Chow and Geoffrey H. Moore, assisted by An-loh Lin 739

Discussion: Robert A. Gordon and Martin Feldstein 781
Reply: Chow and Moore 800

PART III. EVALUATION OF FORECASTS

THE PREDICTIVE PERFORMANCE OF QUARTERLY ECONOMETRIC MODELS OF THE UNITED STATES  •  Ronald L. Cooper 813

Discussion: Stephen M. Goldfeld and Michael D. McCarthy 926
Comment: George R. Green, Maurice Liebenberg, and Albert A. Hirsch 938
Reply: Cooper 943

AN ANALYSIS OF THE FORECASTING PROPERTIES OF U.S. ECONOMETRIC MODELS  •  Michael K. Evans, Yoel Haitovsky, and George I. Treyz, assisted by Vincent Su 949

Discussion: Alvin J. Karchere and H. O. Stekler 1140
FORECASTING WITH STATISTICAL INDICATORS
D. J. Daly 1159

Discussion: O. J. Firestone and Herman I. Liebling 1184
Reply: Daly 1204

CONTRIBUTED COMMENTS

COMMENTS ON THE MEETING  R. Agarwala 1209

A NOTE ON SCIENTIFIC METHOD IN FORECASTING
V Lewis Bassie 1211

AUTHOR INDEX  1219

SUBJECT INDEX  1223
ECONOMETRIC MODELS OF CYCLICAL BEHAVIOR
Volume I
INTROD
BERT G. H
\nIN ONE sense the exception, the construct econ translations. of pose was to sp:
eses about the to integrate the of determining known, or assu:
the dynamic pr investigation.
theory of the c
term forecasting
In anothe reported at the literature on be contained syst specified in mu:
or may not have values assume:
may not, exhibit
Since modern usually necess:
mathematical sim:
ulation ex:
properties as model.
The four planned as a u:
was the semin:
ties of the Kl