Education, Skills, and Technical Change
Education, Skills, and Technical Change
Implications for Future US GDP Growth

Edited by Charles R. Hulten
and Valerie A. Ramey

The University of Chicago Press
Chicago and London
National Bureau of Economic Research

Officers
Karen N. Horn, chair
John Lipsky, vice chair
James M. Poterba, president and chief executive officer
Robert Mednick, treasurer
Kelly Horak, controller and assistant corporate secretary
Alterra Milone, corporate secretary
Denis Healy, assistant corporate secretary

Directors at Large
Peter C. Aldrich
Elizabeth E. Bailey
John H. Biggs
John S. Clarkenson
Kathleen B. Cooper
Charles H. Dallara
George C. Eads
Jessica P. Einhorn
Mohamed El-Erian
Jacob A. Frenkel
Robert S. Hamada
Karen N. Horn
Lisa Jordan
John Lipsky
Laurence H. Meyer
Karen Mills
Michael H. Moskow
Alicia H. Munnell
Robert T. Parry
James M. Poterba
John S. Reed
Marina v. N. Whitman
Martin B. Zimmerman

Directors by University Appointment
Timothy Bresnahan, Stanford
Pierre-André Chiappori, Columbia
Alan V. Deardorff, Michigan
Ray C. Fair, Yale
Edward Foster, Minnesota
John P. Gould, Chicago
Mark Grinblatt, California, Los Angeles
Bruce Hansen, Wisconsin–Madison
Benjamin Hermalin, California, Berkeley
George Mailath, Pennsylvania
Marjorie B. McElroy, Duke
Joel Mokyr, Northwestern
Cecilia Rouse, Princeton
Richard L. Schmalensee, Massachusetts Institute of Technology
Ingo Walter, New York
David B. Yoffie, Harvard

Directors by Appointment of Other Organizations
Jean-Paul Chavas, Agricultural and Applied Economics Association
Martin J. Gruber, American Finance Association
Philip Hoffman, Economic History Association
Arthur Kennickell, American Statistical Association
Jack Kleinhenz, National Association for Business Economics
Robert Mednick, American Institute of Certified Public Accountants
Peter L. Rousseau, American Economic Association
Gregor W. Smith, Canadian Economics Association
William Spriggs, American Federation of Labor and Congress of Industrial Organizations
Bart van Ark, The Conference Board

Directors Emeriti
George Akerlof
Jagdish Bhagwati
Don R. Conlan
Franklin Fisher
George Hatsopoulos
Saul H. Hymans
Rudolph A. Oswald
Andrew Postlewaite
John J. Siegfried
Craig Swan

You are reading copyrighted material published by University of Chicago Press. Unauthorized posting, copying, or distributing of this work except as permitted under U.S. copyright law is illegal and injures the author and publisher.
Relation of the Directors to the
Work and Publications of the
National Bureau of Economic Research

1. The object of the NBER is to ascertain and present to the economics profession, and to the
public more generally, important economic facts and their interpretation in a scientific manner
without policy recommendations. The Board of Directors is charged with the responsibility of
ensuring that the work of the NBER is carried on in strict conformity with this object.

2. The President shall establish an internal review process to ensure that book manuscripts pro-
posed for publication DO NOT contain policy recommendations. This shall apply both to the
proceedings of conferences and to manuscripts by a single author or by one or more co-authors
but shall not apply to authors of comments at NBER conferences who are not NBER affiliates.

3. No book manuscript reporting research shall be published by the NBER until the President
has sent to each member of the Board a notice that a manuscript is recommended for publica-
tion and that in the President’s opinion it is suitable for publication in accordance with the above
principles of the NBER. Such notification will include a table of contents and an abstract or
summary of the manuscript’s content, a list of contributors if applicable, and a response form
for use by Directors who desire a copy of the manuscript for review. Each manuscript shall
contain a summary drawing attention to the nature and treatment of the problem studied and
the main conclusions reached.

4. No volume shall be published until forty-five days have elapsed from the above notifi-
cation of intention to publish it. During this period a copy shall be sent to any Director request-
it, and if any Director objects to publication on the grounds that the manuscript contains
policy recommendations, the objection will be presented to the author(s) or editor(s). In case
of dispute, all members of the Board shall be notified, and the President shall appoint an ad
hoc committee of the Board to decide the matter; thirty days additional shall be granted for
this purpose.

5. The President shall present annually to the Board a report describing the internal manu-
script review process, any objections made by Directors before publication or by anyone after
publication, any disputes about such matters, and how they were handled.

6. Publications of the NBER issued for informational purposes concerning the work of the
Bureau, or issued to inform the public of the activities at the Bureau, including but not limited
to the NBER Digest and Reporter, shall be consistent with the object stated in paragraph 1.
They shall contain a specific disclaimer noting that they have not passed through the review
procedures required in this resolution. The Executive Committee of the Board is charged with
the review of all such publications from time to time.

7. NBER working papers and manuscripts distributed on the Bureau’s web site are not deemed
to be publications for the purpose of this resolution, but they shall be consistent with the object
stated in paragraph 1. Working papers shall contain a specific disclaimer noting that they have
not passed through the review procedures required in this resolution. The NBER’s web site
shall contain a similar disclaimer. The President shall establish an internal review process to
ensure that the working papers and the web site do not contain policy recommendations, and
shall report annually to the Board on this process and any concerns raised in connection with it.

8. Unless otherwise determined by the Board or exempted by the terms of paragraphs 6
and 7, a copy of this resolution shall be printed in each NBER publication as described in
paragraph 2 above.
# Contents

Prefatory Note ix

**Introduction**

Charles R. Hulten and Valerie A. Ramey 1

I. The Macroeconomic Link between Education and Real GDP Growth

1. Educational Attainment and the Revival of US Economic Growth 23
   Dale W. Jorgenson, Mun S. Ho, and Jon D. Samuels

2. The Outlook for US Labor-Quality Growth 61
   Canyon Bosler, Mary C. Daly, John G. Fernald, and Bart Hobijn
   *Comment on Chapters 1 and 2:*
   Douglas W. Elmendorf

3. The Importance of Education and Skill Development for Economic Growth in the Information Era 115
   Charles R. Hulten

II. Jobs and Skills Requirements

4. Underemployment in the Early Careers of College Graduates following the Great Recession 149
   Jaison R. Abel and Richard Deitz
5. The Requirements of Jobs: Evidence from a Nationally Representative Survey 183
   Maury Gittleman, Kristen Monaco, and Nicole Nestoriak

III. Skills, Inequality, and Polarization

6. Noncognitive Skills as Human Capital 219
   Shelly Lundberg
   Comment: David J. Deming

7. Wage Inequality and Cognitive Skills: Reopening the Debate 251
   Stijn Broecke, Glenda Quintini, and Marieke Vandeweyer
   Comment: Frank Levy

8. Education and the Growth-Equity Trade-Off 293
   Eric A. Hanushek

9. Recent Flattening in the Higher Education Wage Premium: Polarization, Skill Downgrading, or Both? 313
   Robert G. Valletta
   Comment: David Autor

IV. The Supply of Skills

10. Accounting for the Rise in College Tuition 357
    Grey Gordon and Aaron Hedlund
    Comment: Sandy Baum

11. Online Postsecondary Education and Labor Productivity 401
    Caroline M. Hoxby
    Comment: Nora Gordon

    Gordon H. Hanson and Matthew J. Slaughter
    Comment: John Bound
Prefatory Note


We gratefully acknowledge the financial support for this conference provided by the Bureau of Economic Analysis. Support for the general activities of the Conference on Research in Income and Wealth is provided by the following agencies: Bureau of Economic Analysis, Bureau of Labor Statistics, Bureau of the Census, Board of Governors of the Federal Reserve System, Statistics of Income/Internal Revenue Service, and Statistics Canada.

We thank Charles R. Hulten and Valerie A. Ramey, who served as conference organizers and as editors of the volume.

Executive Committee, December 2016

John M. Abowd
Katharine Abraham (chair)
Susanto Basu
Andrew Bernard
Ernst R. Berndt
Carol A. Corrado
John C. Haltiwanger
Michael W. Horrigan
Ronald Jarmin

Barry Johnson
André Loranger
Brian Moyer
Valerie A. Ramey
Mark J. Roberts
Peter Schott
Daniel Sichel
William Wascher