Improving the Measurement of Consumer Expenditures
Improving the Measurement of Consumer Expenditures

Edited by Christopher D. Carroll, Thomas F. Crossley, and John Sabelhaus

The University of Chicago Press

Chicago and London
Christopher D. Carroll is professor of economics at Johns Hopkins University and the chief economist of the Consumer Financial Protection Bureau. He is a former research associate of the NBER. Thomas F. Crossley is professor in the Department of Economics at the University of Essex. John Sabelhaus is an economist and chief of the Microeconomic Surveys Section at the Federal Reserve Board in Washington, DC.
National Bureau of Economic Research

Officers

Martin B. Zimmerman, chairman
Karen N. Hor, vice chairman
James M. Poterba, president and chief executive officer
Robert Mednick, treasurer
Kelly Horak, controller and assistant corporate secretary
Alterra Milone, corporate secretary
Denis Healy, assistant corporate secretary

Directors at Large

Peter C. Aldrich
Elizabeth E. Bailey
John H. Biggs
John S. Clarkeson
Don R. Conlan
Kathleen B. Cooper
Charles H. Dallara
George C. Eads
Jessica P. Einhorn
Mohamed El-Erian
Linda Ewing
Jacob A. Frenkel
Judith M. Gueron
Robert S. Hamada
Peter Blair Henry
Karen N. Horn
John Lipsky
Laurence H. Meyer
Michael H. Moskow
Alicia H. Munnell
Robert T. Parry
James M. Poterba
John S. Reed
Marina v. N. Whitman
Martin B. Zimmerman

Directors by University Appointment

Jagdish Bhagwati, Columbia
Timothy Bresnahan, Stanford
Alan V. Deardorff, Michigan
Ray C. Fair, Yale
Edward Foster, Minnesota
John P. Gould, Chicago
Mark Grinblatt, California, Los Angeles
Bruce Hansen, Wisconsin–Madison
Benjamin Hermalin, California, Berkeley
Marjorie B. McElroy, Duke
Joel Mokyr, Northwestern
Andrew Postlewaite, Pennsylvania
Cecilia Rouse, Princeton
Richard L. Schmalensee, Massachusetts Institute of Technology
David B. Yoffie, Harvard

Directors by Appointment of Other Organizations

Jean-Paul Chavas, Agricultural and Applied Economics Association
Martin Gruber, American Finance Association
Ellen L. Hughes-Cromwick, National Association for Business Economics
Arthur Kennickell, American Statistical Association
William W. Lewis, Committee for Economic Development
Robert Mednick, American Institute of Certified Public Accountants
Alan L. Olmstead, Economic History Association
Peter L. Rousseau, American Economic Association
Gregor W. Smith, Canadian Economics Association
William Spriggs, American Federation of Labor and Congress of Industrial Organizations
Bart van Ark, The Conference Board

Directors Emeriti

George Akerlof
Glen G. Cain
Carl F. Christ
Franklin Fisher
George Hatsopoulos
Saul H. Hymans
Rudolph A. Oswald
Peter G. Peterson
Nathan Rosenberg
John J. Siegfried
Craig Swan
Relation of the Directors to the
Work and Publications of the
National Bureau of Economic Research

1. The object of the NBER is to ascertain and present to the economics profession, and to the public more generally, important economic facts and their interpretation in a scientific manner without policy recommendations. The Board of Directors is charged with the responsibility of ensuring that the work of the NBER is carried on in strict conformity with this object.

2. The President shall establish an internal review process to ensure that book manuscripts proposed for publication DO NOT contain policy recommendations. This shall apply both to the proceedings of conferences and to manuscripts by a single author or by one or more co-authors but shall not apply to authors of comments at NBER conferences who are not NBER affiliates.

3. No book manuscript reporting research shall be published by the NBER until the President has sent to each member of the Board a notice that a manuscript is recommended for publication and that in the President’s opinion it is suitable for publication in accordance with the above principles of the NBER. Such notification will include a table of contents and an abstract or summary of the manuscript’s content, a list of contributors if applicable, and a response form for use by Directors who desire a copy of the manuscript for review. Each manuscript shall contain a summary drawing attention to the nature and treatment of the problem studied and the main conclusions reached.

4. No volume shall be published until forty-five days have elapsed from the above notification of intention to publish it. During this period a copy shall be sent to any Director requesting it, and if any Director objects to publication on the grounds that the manuscript contains policy recommendations, the objection will be presented to the author(s) or editor(s). In case of dispute, all members of the Board shall be notified, and the President shall appoint an ad hoc committee of the Board to decide the matter; thirty days additional shall be granted for this purpose.

5. The President shall present annually to the Board a report describing the internal manuscript review process, any objections made by Directors before publication or by anyone after publication, any disputes about such matters, and how they were handled.

6. Publications of the NBER issued for informational purposes concerning the work of the Bureau, or issued to inform the public of the activities at the Bureau, including but not limited to the NBER Digest and Reporter, shall be consistent with the object stated in paragraph 1. They shall contain a specific disclaimer noting that they have not passed through the review procedures required in this resolution. The Executive Committee of the Board is charged with the review of all such publications from time to time.

7. NBER working papers and manuscripts distributed on the Bureau’s web site are not deemed to be publications for the purpose of this resolution, but they shall be consistent with the object stated in paragraph 1. Working papers shall contain a specific disclaimer noting that they have not passed through the review procedures required in this resolution. The NBER’s web site shall contain a similar disclaimer. The President shall establish an internal review process to ensure that the working papers and the web site do not contain policy recommendations, and shall report annually to the Board on this process and any concerns raised in connection with it.

8. Unless otherwise determined by the Board or exempted by the terms of paragraphs 6 and 7, a copy of this resolution shall be printed in each NBER publication as described in paragraph 2 above.
Contents

Prefatory Note xi

Introduction 1
Christopher D. Carroll, Thomas F. Crossley, and John Sabelhaus

I. WHAT DO WE ALREADY KNOW ABOUT COLLECTING HOUSEHOLD EXPENDITURE DATA?

1. Asking Households about Expenditures: What Have We Learned? 23
   Thomas F. Crossley and Joachim K. Winter

II. GOALS FOR THE EXPENDITURE SURVEY REDESIGN

2. Constructing a PCE-Weighted Consumer Price Index 53
   Caitlin Blair

3. The Benefits of Panel Data in Consumer Expenditure Surveys 75
   Jonathan A. Parker, Nicholas S. Souleles, and Christopher D. Carroll

   Orazio Attanasio, Erik Hurst, and Luigi Pistaferri
5. Using the CE to Model Household Demand 141
   Laura Blow, Valérie Lechene, and Peter Levell

III. Evaluating the Existing CE Survey

6. Understanding the Relationship:
   CE Survey and PCE 181
   William Passero, Thesia I. Garner, and Clinton McCully

7. The Validity of Consumption Data:
   Are the Consumer Expenditure Interview
   and Diary Surveys Informative? 204
   Adam Bee, Bruce D. Meyer, and James X. Sullivan

8. Is the Consumer Expenditure Survey
   Representative by Income? 241
   John Sabelhaus, David Johnson, Stephen Ash,
   David Swanson, Thesia I. Garner, John Greenlees,
   and Steve Henderson

9. A Comparison of Micro and Macro
   Expenditure Measures across Countries
   Using Differing Survey Methods 263
   Garry Barrett, Peter Levell, and Kevin Milligan

IV. Alternative Approaches to Data Collection

10. Measuring the Accuracy of Survey Responses
    Using Administrative Register Data:
    Evidence from Denmark 289
    Claus Thustrup Kreiner, David Dreyer Lassen,
    and Søren Leth-Petersen

11. Judging the Quality of Survey Data by
    Comparison with “Truth” as Measured by
    Administrative Records: Evidence from Sweden 308
    Ralph Koijen, Stijn Van Nieuwerburgh,
    and Roine Vestman

12. Exploring a Balance Edit Approach in
    the Consumer Expenditure Quarterly
    Interview Survey 347
    Scott Fricker, Brandon Kopp, and Nhien To
   Michael D. Hurd and Susann Rohwedder 365

14. Wealth Dynamics and Active Saving at Older Ages
   Michael D. Hurd and Susann Rohwedder 388

15. Measuring Household Spending and Payment Habits: The Role of “Typical” and “Specific” Time Frames in Survey Questions
   Marco Angrisani, Arie Kapteyn, and Scott Schuh 414

16. The Potential Use of In-Home Scanner Technology for Budget Surveys
   Andrew Leicester 441

Contributors 493
Author Index 497
Subject Index 501
Prefatory Note

This volume contains revised versions of most of the papers presented at the Conference on Research in Income and Wealth entitled “Improving the Measurement of Consumer Expenditures,” held in Washington, DC, on December 2–3, 2011.

We gratefully acknowledge the financial support for this conference provided by the ESRC-funded Centre for Microdata Methods and Practice (ES/I034021/1). Support for the general activities of the Conference on Research in Income and Wealth is provided by the following agencies: Bureau of Economic Analysis, Bureau of Labor Statistics, Census Bureau, Board of Governors of the Federal Reserve System, Internal Revenue Service, and Statistics Canada.

We thank Christopher Carroll, Thomas Crossley, and John Sabelhaus who served as conference organizers and as editors of the volume. Chris, Tom, and John in turn wish to express their thanks to Brett Maranjian and Helena Fitz-Patrick of the NBER, who provided outstanding assistance with the conference and this volume, respectively.

Executive Committee, September 2013

John M. Abowd Michael W. Horrigan
Susanto Basu Charles R. Hulten (chair)
Andrew Bernard Ron Jarmin
Ernst R. Berndt J. Steven Landefeld
Carol A. Corrado Brent Moulton
W. Erwin Diewert Valerie Ramey
Robert C. Feenstra Mark J. Roberts
John Greenlees Daniel Sichel
John C. Haltiwanger William Wascher