The Design and Implementation of US Climate Policy
DON FULLERTON is the Gutgsell Professor in the Department of Finance at the University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign, where he is also a faculty associate at both the Institute of Government and Public Affairs and the Center for Business and Public Policy. He is a research associate and director of the Program on Environmental and Energy Economics at the National Bureau of Economic Research.

CATHERINE WOLFRAM is associate professor of business administration at the Haas School of Business, University of California, Berkeley, where she codirects the Energy Institute at Haas. She is a research associate of the National Bureau of Economic Research.

The University of Chicago Press, Chicago 60637
The University of Chicago Press, Ltd., London
© 2012 by the National Bureau of Economic Research
All rights reserved. Published 2012.
Printed in the United States of America

21 20 19 18 17 16 15 14 13 12 1 2 3 4 5
ISBN-10: 0-226-26914-0 (cloth)

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data
The design and implementation of US climate policy / edited by Don Fullerton and Catherine Wolfram.
Includes bibliographical references and index.
ISBN-10: 0-226-26914-0 (cloth : alkaline paper)
QC903.2.U6D47 2012
363.738’745610973—dc23
2011050604

© This paper meets the requirements of ANSI/NISO Z39.48-1992 (Permanence of Paper).
National Bureau of Economic Research

Officers
Kathleen B. Cooper, chairman
Martin B. Zimmerman, vice-chairman
James M. Poterba, president and chief executive officer
Robert Mednick, treasurer
Kelly Horak, controller and assistant corporate secretary
Alterra Milone, corporate secretary
Gerardine Johnson, assistant corporate secretary

Directors at Large
Peter C. Aldrich
Elizabeth E. Bailey
John H. Biggs
John S. Clarkeson
Don R. Conlan
Kathleen B. Cooper
Charles H. Dallara
George C. Eads
Jessica P. Einhorn
Mohamed El-Erian
Linda Ewing
Jacob A. Frenkel
Judith M. Gueron
Robert S. Hamada
Peter Blair Henry
Karen N. Horn
John Lipsky
Laurence H. Meyer
Michael H. Moskow
Alicia H. Munnell
Robert T. Parry
James M. Poterba
John S. Reed
Marina v. N. Whitman
Martin B. Zimmerman

Directors by University Appointment
George Akerlof, California, Berkeley
Jagdish Bhagwati, Columbia
Timothy Bresnahan, Stanford
Alan V. Deardorff, Michigan
Ray C. Fair, Yale
Franklin Fisher, Massachusetts Institute of Technology
John P. Gould, Chicago
Mark Grinblatt, California, Los Angeles
Bruce Hansen, Wisconsin–Madison
Marjorie B. McElroy, Duke
Joel Mokyr, Northwestern
Andrew Postlewaite, Pennsylvania
Uwe E. Reinhardt, Princeton
Craig Swan, Minnesota
David B. Yoffie, Harvard

Directors by Appointment of Other Organizations
Bart van Ark, The Conference Board
Christopher Carroll, American Statistical Association
Jean-Paul Chavas, Agricultural and Applied Economics Association
Martin Gruber, American Finance Association
Ellen L. Hughes-Cromwick, National Association for Business Economics
Thea Lee, American Federation of Labor and Congress of Industrial Organizations
William W. Lewis, Committee for Economic Development
Robert Mednick, American Institute of Certified Public Accountants
Alan L. Olmstead, Economic History Association
John J. Siegfried, American Economic Association
Gregor W. Smith, Canadian Economics Association

Directors Emeriti
Andrew Brimmer
Glen G. Cain
Carl F. Christ
George Hatsopoulos
Saul H. Hymans
Lawrence R. Klein
Paul W. McCracken
Rudolph A. Oswald
Peter G. Peterson
Nathan Rosenberg
Relation of the Directors to the
Work and Publications of the
National Bureau of Economic Research

1. The object of the NBER is to ascertain and present to the economics profession, and to the public more generally, important economic facts and their interpretation in a scientific manner without policy recommendations. The Board of Directors is charged with the responsibility of ensuring that the work of the NBER is carried on in strict conformity with this object.

2. The President shall establish an internal review process to ensure that book manuscripts proposed for publication DO NOT contain policy recommendations. This shall apply both to the proceedings of conferences and to manuscripts by a single author or by one or more co-authors but shall not apply to authors of comments at NBER conferences who are not NBER affiliates.

3. No book manuscript reporting research shall be published by the NBER until the President has sent to each member of the Board a notice that a manuscript is recommended for publication and that in the President’s opinion it is suitable for publication in accordance with the above principles of the NBER. Such notification will include a table of contents and an abstract or summary of the manuscript’s content, a list of contributors if applicable, and a response form for use by Directors who desire a copy of the manuscript for review. Each manuscript shall contain a summary drawing attention to the nature and treatment of the problem studied and the main conclusions reached.

4. No volume shall be published until forty-five days have elapsed from the above notification of intention to publish it. During this period a copy shall be sent to any Director requesting it, and if any Director objects to publication on the grounds that the manuscript contains policy recommendations, the objection will be presented to the author(s) or editor(s). In case of dispute, all members of the Board shall be notified, and the President shall appoint an ad hoc committee of the Board to decide the matter; thirty days additional shall be granted for this purpose.

5. The President shall present annually to the Board a report describing the internal manuscript review process, any objections made by Directors before publication or by anyone after publication, any disputes about such matters, and how they were handled.

6. Publications of the NBER issued for informational purposes concerning the work of the Bureau, or issued to inform the public of the activities at the Bureau, including but not limited to the NBER Digest and Reporter, shall be consistent with the object stated in paragraph 1. They shall contain a specific disclaimer noting that they have not passed through the review procedures required in this resolution. The Executive Committee of the Board is charged with the review of all such publications from time to time.

7. NBER working papers and manuscripts distributed on the Bureau’s web site are not deemed to be publications for the purpose of this resolution, but they shall be consistent with the object stated in paragraph 1. Working papers shall contain a specific disclaimer noting that they have not passed through the review procedures required in this resolution. The NBER’s web site shall contain a similar disclaimer. The President shall establish an internal review process to ensure that the working papers and the web site do not contain policy recommendations, and shall report annually to the Board on this process and any concerns raised in connection with it.

8. Unless otherwise determined by the Board or exempted by the terms of paragraphs 6 and 7, a copy of this resolution shall be printed in each NBER publication as described in paragraph 2 above.
Contents

Acknowledgments xi

Introduction and Summary 1
Don Fullerton and Catherine Wolfram

I. Climate Policy in the Broader Context

1. Distributional Impacts in a Comprehensive Climate Policy Package 21
Gilbert E. Metcalf, Aparna Mathur, and Kevin A. Hassett
Comment: Hilary Sigman

2. Climate Policy and Labor Markets 37
Olivier Deschênes
Comment: Matthew E. Kahn

3. Limiting Emissions and Trade: Some Basic Ideas 53
Kala Krishna
Comment: Meredith Fowlie

4. Regulatory Choice with Pollution and Innovation 65
Charles D. Kolstad
Comment: V. Kerry Smith
5. Spillovers from Climate Policy to Other Pollutants  
   Stephen P. Holland  
   Comment: Charles D. Kolstad  

6. Markets for Anthropogenic Carbon within the Larger Carbon Cycle  
   Severin Borenstein  
   Comment: Wolfram Schlenker

II. INTERACTIONS WITH OTHER POLICIES

7. Interactions between State and Federal Climate Change Policies  
   Lawrence H. Goulder and Robert N. Stavins  
   Comment: Arik Levinson

8. Belts and Suspenders: Interactions among Climate Policy Regulations  
   Arik Levinson  
   Comment: Gilbert E. Metcalf

9. Climate Policy and Voluntary Initiatives: An Evaluation of the Connecticut Clean Energy Communities Program  
   Matthew J. Kotchen  
   Comment: Lucas W. Davis

    Meredith Fowlie  
    Comment: Lawrence H. Goulder

III. DESIGN FEATURES OF CLIMATE POLICY

11. Upstream versus Downstream Implementation of Climate Policy  
    Erin T. Mansur  
    Comment: Roberton C. Williams III

12. The Economics of Carbon Offsets  
    James B. Bushnell  
    Comment: Kala Krishna

13. Monitoring and Enforcement of Climate Policy  
    Hilary Sigman  
    Comment: Severin Borenstein
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>V. Kerry Smith</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Comment:</em> Erin T. Mansur</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15.</td>
<td>Setting the Initial Time-Profile of Climate Policy: The Economics of Environmental Policy Phase-Ins</td>
<td>245</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Roberton C. Williams III</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Comment:</em> Stephen P. Holland</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV.</td>
<td>Sector-Specific Issues</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16.</td>
<td>Urban Policy Effects on Carbon Mitigation</td>
<td>259</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Matthew E. Kahn</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Comment:</em> Christopher R. Knittel</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.</td>
<td>Is Agricultural Production Becoming More or Less Sensitive to Extreme Heat? Evidence from US Corn and Soybean Yields</td>
<td>271</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Michael J. Roberts and Wolfram Schlenker</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Comment:</em> James B. Bushnell</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Christopher R. Knittel and Ryan Sandler</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Comment:</em> Matthew J. Kotchen</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Lucas W. Davis</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Comment:</em> Olivier Deschênes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Contributors 319
Author Index 323
Subject Index 327
Acknowledgments

This book contains the proceedings of an NBER conference held in Washington, DC, on May 13–14, 2010. Recent political developments in Washington might make adoption of comprehensive climate policy unlikely in the near term, but economics research must take a longer view. The conference was held in Washington, DC, because we hope that the various topics covered in this book will be useful to economists and policymakers contemplating future climate policy, whether that may include direct approaches such as a cap-and-trade system or indirect policies such as tax credits, clean energy subsidies, or renewable fuel standards.

We are very grateful for the generous financial support of the Smith Richardson Foundation, for intellectual encouragement from Jim Poterba, and for terrific organizational support from the wonderful people within NBER, including efficient conference organizing by Carl Beck and Rob Shannon, effective production of the book by Helena Fitz-Patrick, and timely budget assistance from Denis Healy, Alterra Milone, and Alison Oaxaca. We received excellent substantive suggestions from two anonymous reviewers. We also benefited from panel presentations at the conference by three Washington practitioners, including Joseph Aldy, Nathaniel Keohane, and Al McGartland. Several policymakers generously provided written comments and extended conversations that helped us refine the set of topics the book covered. These include Terry Dinan, Doug Elmendorf, Jud Jaffe, Jeff Liebman, and Billy Pizer. We also want to express our extreme gratitude to the chapter authors. They not only undertook new research on challenging topics and wrote the chapters, but each author also served as a discussant for one of the other presentations. This interchange was interesting and helpful enough that we decided to publish each discussant’s comments along with the corresponding chapter in the book.