CONSUMER SENSITIVITY TO FINANCE RATES: AN EMPIRICAL AND ANALYTICAL INVESTIGATION

F. THOMAS JUSTER
ROBERT P. SHAY

NATIONAL BUREAU OF ECONOMIC RESEARCH
1964
RELATION OF THE DIRECTORS 
TO THE WORK AND PUBLICATIONS 
OF THE NATIONAL BUREAU OF ECONOMIC RESEARCH

1. The object of the National Bureau of Economic Research is to ascertain 
and to present to the public important economic facts and their interpretation in a 
scientific and impartial manner. The Board of Directors is charged with the re­ 
sponsibility of ensuring that the work of the National Bureau is carried on in strict 
conformity with this object.

2. To this end the Board of Directors shall appoint one or more Directors of 
Research.

3. The Director or Directors of Research shall submit to the members of the 
Board, or to its Executive Committee, for their formal adoption, all specific proposals 
concerning researches to be instituted.

4. No report shall be published until the Director or Directors of Research 
shall have submitted to the Board a summary drawing attention to the character 
of the data and their utilization in the report, the nature and treatment of the 
problems involved, the main conclusions, and such other information as in their 
opinion would serve to determine the suitability of the report for publication in 
accordance with the principles of the National Bureau.

5. A copy of any manuscript proposed for publication shall also be submitted 
to each member of the Board. For each manuscript to be so submitted a special 
committee shall be appointed by the President, or at his designation by the Executive 
Director, consisting of three Directors selected as nearly as may be one from each 
general division of the Board. The names of the special manuscript committee shall 
be stated to each Director when the summary and report described in paragraph (4) 
are sent to him. It shall be the duty of each member of the committee to read the 
manuscript. If each member of the special committee signifies his approval within 
 thirty days, the manuscript may be published. If each member of the special com­ 
mittee has not signified his approval within thirty days of the transmittal of the 
report and manuscript, the Director of Research shall then notify each member of 
the Board, requesting approval or disapproval of publication, and thirty additional 
days shall be granted for this purpose. The manuscript shall then not be published 
unless at least a majority of the entire Board and a two-thirds majority of those 
members of the Board who shall have voted on the proposal within the time 
fixed for the receipt of votes on the publication proposed shall have approved.

6. No manuscript may be published, though approved by each member of the 
special committee, until forty-five days have elapsed from the transmittal of the 
summary and report. The interval is allowed for the receipt of any memorandum 
of dissent or reservation, together with a brief statement of his reasons, that any 
member may wish to express; and such memorandum of dissent or reservation shall 
be published with the manuscript if he so desires. Publication does not, however, 
imply that each member of the Board has read the manuscript, or that either members 
of the Board in general, or of the special committee, have passed upon its validity 
in every detail.

7. A copy of this resolution shall, unless otherwise determined by the Board, 
be printed in each copy of every National Bureau book.

(Resolution adopted October 25, 1926, 
as revised February 6, 1933, and February 24, 1941)
Contents

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS xi

SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS 1

I. CONSUMER SENSITIVITY TO FINANCE RATES 6
   Introduction 6
   Analytical Framework 8
   Design of the Experimental Data 20
   The Empirical Results 28
   Summary 40

II. CONSUMER KNOWLEDGE OF FINANCE RATES 47
   Introduction 47
   Description of Basic Data 49
   The Empirical Results 50
      Estimates of the Extent of Rate Information 53
      Institutional Knowledge 56
      Differences in Rate Information of Rationed and Unrationed Consumers 62
   Consumer Response to Increased Information About Finance Rates 64
      Response Bias 65
   The Empirical Results 66
   Response to Specified and Implicit Rate Differences 68
   Effect of Finance-Rate Information on Demand for Credit 70
   Summary 73
Contents

APPENDIXES

A. A Geometrical Model for the Analysis of Consumer Investment Decisions 76

B. Distribution of Response to Variant Question, Consumers Union-NBER Reinterview Sample 90

C. Relation Between Finance Rates and Loan-Size Preferences 93

D. Aspects of Joint Purchase of a Consumer Durable and of Credit from a Single Seller 98
Tables

1. Alternative Finance Plans for Specified Variant Groups 22
2. Fraction Accepting One or More Alternative Finance Plans for Specified Variant Groups, Credit Users Only 29
3. Estimated Finance-Rate and Monthly-Payment Elasticity of Demand for Households Classified as Rationed or Unrationed on the Basis of Family Income and Marital Status 35
4. Estimated Finance-Rate and Monthly-Payment Elasticity of Demand for Households Classified as Rationed or Unrationed on the Basis of Liquid Asset Holdings 38
5. Estimated Finance-Rates and Monthly-Payment Elasticity of Demand for Households Classified as Rationed or Unrationed on the Basis of Attitude Toward the Use of Credit 41
6. Question 25A, Reinterview Questionnaire, May 1960, Consumers Union Members' Panel 50
7. Distribution of Reported and Effective Annual Finance Rates, by Amounts Borrowed 51
8. Estimated Percentage Distribution and Mean Effective Rates of Sample Households, Classified by Rate Information and Loan Size 55
Tables

9. Regression Coefficients for Selected Independent Variables in Relation to Reported and Effective Annual Finance Rates 59

10. Acceptance Ratios and Average Maturity Preferences, Selected Variant Groups 67

B-1. Distribution of Responses to Variant Financing Alternatives Among Consumers Union–NBER Households 91

C-1. Distribution of First Preferences Among Finance Alternatives for Households Accepting at Least One of the Alternatives, Selected Variant Groups 94

C-2. Distribution of Specific Rejections Among Finance Alternatives for Households Accepting at Least One of the Alternatives, Selected Variant Groups 95
Figures

1. Mean Actual and Reported Finance Rates, Given Type of 
   Product Financed and Loan Size 56

2. Optimal Consumer Choice with Perfect Capital Markets 77

3. Optimal Consumer Choice with Imperfect Capital Markets: 
   Unlimited Borrowing and Lending, \( r > i \) 80

4. Optimal Consumer Choice with Imperfect Capital Markets: 
   Absolute Limit to Borrowing, \( r > i \) 83

5. Optimal Consumer Choice with Imperfect Capital Markets: 
   Stepped Borrowing Schedule, Absolute Limit to Borrowing, 
   \( r > i \), Investment Function Discontinuous 85

6. Optimal Consumer Choice with Imperfect Capital Markets: 
   Increasing Marginal Borrowing Costs, Increasing Subjective 
   Yield from Liquid Asset Holdings, Investment Function 
   Discontinuous 88
Acknowledgments

Our indebtedness to those who patiently read the several drafts of this manuscript is great. At the National Bureau, Geoffrey H. Moore, Ilse Mintz, Hyman P. Minsky, Jacob Mincer, Raymond W. Goldsmith, and Gary S. Becker provided us with constructive advice and criticism. Our thanks also go to the reading committee of the Board of Directors: Lester V. Chandler, Marion B. Folsom, and Gottfried Haberler.

This report is part of a broad study of consumer credit being conducted by the National Bureau, made possible by research grants from Associates Investment Company, C.I.T. Financial Corporation, General Motors Acceptance Corporation, and Pacific Finance Corporation. These firms, however, are not responsible for any of the statements made or views expressed in this report.

Members of the Advisory Committee to the Consumer Credit Study gave valuable help by offering comments at different stages of the study. The committee is composed of Paul W. McCracken (chairman), University of Michigan; Gordon E. Areen, Associates Investment Company; Frank Barsalou, Pacific Finance Corporation; Dorothy S. Brady, University of Pennsylvania; John M. Chapman, Columbia University; Mona Dingle, Division of Research and Statistics, Board of Governors of the Federal Reserve System; Bertrand Fox, Harvard University; Raymond W. Goldsmith, Yale University; Robert E. Lewis, First National City Bank of New York; Roger F. Murray, Columbia University; Roland I. Robinson, Michigan State University; Herbert Stein, Committee for Economic Development; Van Buren Thorne, Jr., General Motors Acceptance Corporation; and William L. Wilson, C.I.T. Financial Corporation. Others who formerly served on the Advisory Committee are Willcox Adsit, George Dimmler, George W. Omacht, Sidney E. Rolfe, and LeRoy A. Weller.

In addition, helpful comments were made by Robert W. Johnson, C. R. Warfel, and John C. Dawson. Statistical assistance was capably furnished by Florence Liang, Bette Fishbein, Linda Fulton, and Julia Clones. Margaret T. Edgar edited the manuscript, and H. Irving Forman drew the charts.