Targeting Investments in Children
Targeting Investments in Children
Fighting Poverty When Resources Are Limited

Edited by Phillip B. Levine and David J. Zimmerman

The University of Chicago Press
Chicago and London
National Bureau of Economic Research

Officers

John S. Clarkeson, chairman
Kathleen B. Cooper, vice-chairman
James M. Poterba, president and chief executive officer
Robert Mednick, treasurer

Kelly Horak, controller and assistant corporate secretary
Alterra Milone, corporate secretary
Gerardine Johnson, assistant corporate secretary

Directors at Large

Peter C. Aldrich
Elizabeth E. Bailey
Richard B. Berner
John H. Biggs
John S. Clarkeson
Don R. Conlan
Kathleen B. Cooper
Charles H. Dallara
George C. Eads
Jessica P. Einhorn
Mohamed El-Erian
Jacob A. Frenkel
Judith M. Gueron
Karen N. Horn
Laurence H. Meyer

Alicia H. Munnell
Rudolph A. Oswald
Robert T. Parry
James M. Poterba
John S. Reed
Marina v. N. Whitman
Martin B. Zimmerman

Directors by University Appointment

George Akerlof, California, Berkeley
Jagdish Bhagwati, Columbia
Glen G. Cain, Wisconsin
Ray C. Fair, Yale
Franklin Fisher, Massachusetts Institute of Technology
Mark Grinblatt, California, Los Angeles
Saul H. Hymans, Michigan
Marjorie B. McElroy, Duke

Joel Mokyr, Northwestern
Andrew Postlewaite, Pennsylvania
Uwe E. Reinhardt, Princeton
Nathan Rosenberg, Stanford
Craig Swan, Minnesota
David B. Yoffie, Harvard

Arnold Zellner (Director Emeritus), Chicago

Directors by Appointment of Other Organizations

Jean-Paul Chavas, Agricultural and Applied Economics Association
Martin Gruber, American Finance Association
Timothy W. Guinnane, Economic History Association
Arthur B. Kennickell, American Statistical Association
Thea Lee, American Federation of Labor and Congress of Industrial Organizations

William W. Lewis, Committee for Economic Development
Robert Mednick, American Institute of Certified Public Accountants
Angelo Melino, Canadian Economics Association
Harvey Rosenblum, National Association for Business Economics
John J. Siegfried, American Economic Association

Directors Emeriti

Andrew Brimmer
Carl F. Christ
George Hatsopoulos

Lawrence R. Klein
Franklin A. Lindsay
Paul W. McCracken

Peter G. Peterson
Eli Shapiro
Arnold Zellner
Relation of the Directors to the Work and Publications of the National Bureau of Economic Research

1. The object of the NBER is to ascertain and present to the economics profession, and to the public more generally, important economic facts and their interpretation in a scientific manner without policy recommendations. The Board of Directors is charged with the responsibility of ensuring that the work of the NBER is carried on in strict conformity with this object.

2. The President shall establish an internal review process to ensure that book manuscripts proposed for publication DO NOT contain policy recommendations. This shall apply both to the proceedings of conferences and to manuscripts by a single author or by one or more co-authors but shall not apply to authors of comments at NBER conferences who are not NBER affiliates.

3. No book manuscript reporting research shall be published by the NBER until the President has sent to each member of the Board a notice that a manuscript is recommended for publication and that in the President’s opinion it is suitable for publication in accordance with the above principles of the NBER. Such notification will include a table of contents and an abstract or summary of the manuscript’s content, a list of contributors if applicable, and a response form for use by Directors who desire a copy of the manuscript for review. Each manuscript shall contain a summary drawing attention to the nature and treatment of the problem studied and the main conclusions reached.

4. No volume shall be published until forty-five days have elapsed from the above notification of intention to publish it. During this period a copy shall be sent to any Director requesting it, and if any Director objects to publication on the grounds that the manuscript contains policy recommendations, the objection will be presented to the author(s) or editor(s). In case of dispute, all members of the Board shall be notified, and the President shall appoint an ad hoc committee of the Board to decide the matter; thirty days additional shall be granted for this purpose.

5. The President shall present annually to the Board a report describing the internal manuscript review process, any objections made by Directors before publication or by anyone after publication, any disputes about such matters, and how they were handled.

6. Publications of the NBER issued for informational purposes concerning the work of the Bureau, or issued to inform the public of the activities at the Bureau, including but not limited to the NBER Digest and Reporter, shall be consistent with the object stated in paragraph 1. They shall contain a specific disclaimer noting that they have not passed through the review procedures required in this resolution. The Executive Committee of the Board is charged with the review of all such publications from time to time.

7. NBER working papers and manuscripts distributed on the Bureau’s web site are not deemed to be publications for the purpose of this resolution, but they shall be consistent with the object stated in paragraph 1. Working papers shall contain a specific disclaimer noting that they have not passed through the review procedures required in this resolution. The NBER’s web site shall contain a similar disclaimer. The President shall establish an internal review process to ensure that the working papers and the web site do not contain policy recommendations, and shall report annually to the Board on this process and any concerns raised in connection with it.

8. Unless otherwise determined by the Board or exempted by the terms of paragraphs 6 and 7, a copy of this resolution shall be printed in each NBER publication as described in paragraph 2 above.
Contents

Preface ix

I. PROLOGUE

Introduction 3
Phillip B. Levine and David J. Zimmerman

1. Issues in Implementation 13
Phillip B. Levine and David J. Zimmerman

II. EARLY CHILDHOOD INTERVENTIONS

2. Child Development 27
Greg J. Duncan, Jens Ludwig, and Katherine A. Magnuson

3. Child Care 59
Patricia M. Anderson

4. Child Health 77
Lara Shore-Sheppard

III. MIDDLE CHILDHOOD INTERVENTIONS

5. After-School Care 123
Phillip B. Levine and David J. Zimmerman

6. Education Reforms 145
Susanna Loeb and Patrick J. McEwan
### IV. ADOLESCENT INTERVENTIONS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Author(s)</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Preventing Drug Use</td>
<td>Beau Kilmer and Rosalie Liccardo Pacula</td>
<td>181</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Teen Pregnancy Prevention</td>
<td>Melissa Schettini Kearney</td>
<td>221</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Dropout Prevention and College Prep</td>
<td>Bridget Terry Long</td>
<td>249</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>College Aid</td>
<td>David Deming and Susan Dynarski</td>
<td>283</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Neighborhood and Community Initiatives</td>
<td>Julia Burdick-Will and Jens Ludwig</td>
<td>303</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Vocational Training</td>
<td>Robert LaLonde and Daniel Sullivan</td>
<td>323</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### V. EPILOGUE

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Author(s)</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Synthesizing the Results</td>
<td>Phillip B. Levine and David J. Zimmerman</td>
<td>353</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>Conclusions</td>
<td>Phillip B. Levine and David J. Zimmerman</td>
<td>377</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Contributors 383
Author Index 385
Subject Index 393
Unlike many academic exercises, this project did not start out primarily as an intellectual inquiry, but rather as a practical one. We were first approached by the Robin Hood Foundation in 2003 and asked to provide input regarding their spending decisions. The charity, based in New York City, spends $100 million or more each year in the city to promote the goal of fighting poverty. A hallmark of Robin Hood’s pioneering approach is to evaluate potential antipoverty strategies in much the same way that a financial manager would choose investments with an eye to maximizing profits. The objectives differ, but the need to carefully assess benefits and costs is the same. Robin Hood reached out to us at the time seeking additional input into the procedures that formed the backbone of its “Metrics Project.”¹ That initial contact led to a relationship that is still ongoing and was the genesis of this volume.

Throughout our relationship, we have shared a common vision that money should be spent in a manner that delivers the most return on the investment made. In this instance, if the only policy objective is poverty reduction, then money spent attempting to reduce poverty should generate the most poverty reduction possible. If not, it can be spent more efficiently. If resources dedicated to one program can be reallocated to another program and reduce poverty by more, it should be done.

The question then becomes how one does that. The contents of this volume provide an indication of our thoughts on this. Clearly, we favor a strongly evidence-based approach. Promise is one thing, but results are another. This does not mean that we should never experiment with new programs, but that is a different goal. That said, all evidence is not created

¹. This approach is well-formulated in their publication, *Measuring Success: How Robin Hood Estimates the Impact of Grants*, which was written in 2009 by Michael M. Weinstein with the assistance of Cynthia Esposito Lamy.
equal; the approach we describe in this book emphasizes our preference to rely on the strongest evidence possible.

After a number of years of working with Robin Hood, we felt the desire to broaden the reach of our work. We proposed that we organize a conference, bringing some of the leading scholars on each topical area together. We proposed that this conference would lead to this edited volume, summarizing all of the thinking and synthesizing the results. Robin Hood strongly supported our vision, and we are extremely grateful for its support, both financial and otherwise, in seeing this project through to fruition.

We are particularly grateful to Michael Weinstein, the senior vice president at Robin Hood. We have worked effectively with Michael throughout our relationship with Robin Hood. He has always challenged us to go that one additional step in thinking through the issues, both in our work for the charity and in the execution of this project. This work would not have been possible without his contributions. Cindy Esposito Lamy is a member of Robin Hood’s staff of experts who also contributed to the effort; we would like to express our thanks to her.

No project of this nature can be undertaken without the help and support of many other people. Marty Feldstein and Jim Poterba, the former and current presidents of the National Bureau of Economic Research (NBER), were big supporters of this project from its inception. The NBER conference department did an outstanding job organizing both a preconference in Cambridge and the final conference in New York City. David Pervin at the University of Chicago Press helped guide the book through their review and production processes, and Helena Fitz-Patrick helped coordinate the production of the book at the NBER. Finally, we recognize the contributions that our families have made in providing the supportive environment that enabled us to complete this work. Our thanks to all.