Doctors and Their Workshops

Economic Models of Physician Behavior

Mark V. Pauly
Doctors are obviously influential in determining the costs of their services. But even more important, many believe, is the influence physicians have over the use and cost of nonphysician health-care resources and services. *Doctors and Their Workshops* is the first comprehensive attempt to use economic analysis to understand some of the physician effects on nonphysician aspects of health care.

The author investigates the effect of physician input on hospital productivity and shows how doctors, as providers of some elements of medical care, may affect the productivity of other providers. He explores the ways in which physicians can affect demand for their own and other services by altering the advice they give patients. He examines the assumed relationship between the supply of physicians in a hospital and the use of their own and other medical services—the "availability effect."

Pauly finds that availability effects are not uniform or pervasive. There are availability effects for physician visits, but these are found mainly among the poorly educated in large, doctor-rich cities. For others, and for hospital admissions and inpatient surgery, no availability effect is discernible. The ability and willingness of physicians to generate demands for their services is far more limited than is commonly supposed.

*Doctors and Their Workshops* is a significant contribution to the economics of health care. It will (Continued on back flap)
Doctors and
Their Workshops
A National Bureau of Economic Research Monograph
Mark V. Pauly is professor of economics at Northwestern University.
National Bureau of Economic Research

Arthur F. Burns, honorary chairman
James J. O'Leary, chairman
Eli Shapiro, vice-chairman
Martin S. Feldstein, president
Charles E. McLure, Jr., vice-president
Charles A. Walworth, treasurer
Sam Parker, director of finance and administration

Directors at Large

Moses Abramovitz
Arthur F. Burns
George T. Conklin, Jr.
Morton Ehrlich
Solomon Fabricant
Martin S. Feldstein
Edward L. Ginzton
David L. Grove
Walter W. Heller
Walter E. Hoadley
Roy E. Moor
Geoffrey H. Moore
Michael H. Moskow
James J. O'Leary
Peter G. Peterson
Robert V. Roosa
Richard N. Rosett
Bert Seidman
Eli Shapiro
Stephen Stamas
Lazare Teper
Donald S. Wasserman

Directors by University Appointment

Gardner Ackley, Michigan
George Leland Bach, Stanford
Charles H. Berry, Princeton
Otto Eckstein, Harvard
Walter D. Fisher, Northwestern
John H. Kareken, Minnesota
J. C. LaForce, California, Los Angeles
Almarin Phillips, Pennsylvania

James L. Pierce, California, Berkeley
Lloyd G. Reynolds, Yale
Robert M. Solow, Massachusetts Institute of Technology
Robert R. Sterling, Rice
Henri Theil, Chicago
William S. Vickrey, Columbia
Burton A. Weisbrod, Wisconsin

Directors by Appointment of Other Organizations

Eugene A. Birnbaum, American Management Associations
Carl F. Christ, American Economic Association
Stephan F. Kaliski, Canadian Economics Association
Franklin A. Lindsay, Committee for Economic Development
Albert G. Matamoros, National Association of Business Economists
Paul W. McCracken, American Statistical Association

Douglass C. North, Economic History Association
Rudolph A. Oswald, American Federation of Labor and Congress of Industrial Organizations
G. Edward Schuh, American Agricultural Economics Association
James C. Van Horne, American Finance Association
Charles A. Walworth, American Institute of Certified Public Accountants

Directors Emeriti

Emilio G. Collado
Frank Fetter
Thomas D. Flynn
Gottfried Haberler
Albert J. Hettinger, Jr.
George B. Roberts
Murray Shields
Boris Shishkin
Willard Thorp
Theodore O. Yntema
Relation of the Directors to the
Work and Publications of the
National Bureau of Economic Research

1. The object of the National Bureau of Economic Research is to ascertain and to present
to the public important economic facts and their interpretation in a scientific and impartial
manner. The Board of Directors is charged with the responsibility of ensuring that the work
of the National Bureau is carried on in strict conformity with this object.

2. The President of the National Bureau shall submit to the Board of Directors, or to its
Executive Committee, for their formal adoption all specific proposals for research to be
instituted.

3. No research report shall be published by the National Bureau until the President has
sent each member of the Board a notice that a manuscript is recommended for publication
and that in the President's opinion it is suitable for publication in accordance with the
principles of the National Bureau. Such notification will include an abstract or summary of
the manuscript's content and a response form for use by those Directors who desire a copy of
the manuscript for review. Each manuscript shall contain a summary drawing attention to
the nature and treatment of the problem studied, the character of the data and their
utilization in the report, and the main conclusions reached.

4. For each manuscript so submitted, a special committee of the Directors (including
Directors Emeriti) shall be appointed by majority agreement of the President and Vice
Presidents (or by the Executive Committee in case of inability to decide on the part of the
President and Vice Presidents), consisting of three Directors selected as nearly as may be
one from each general division of the Board. The names of the special manuscript commit-
tee shall be stated to each Director when notice of the proposed publication is submitted to
him. It shall be the duty of each member of the special manuscript committee to read the
manuscript. If each member of the manuscript committee signifies his approval within thirty
days of the transmittal of the manuscript, the report may be published. If at the end of that
period any member of the manuscript committee withholds his approval, the President shall
then notify each member of the Board, requesting approval or disapproval of publication,
and thirty days additional shall be granted for this purpose. The manuscript shall then not be
published unless at least a majority of the entire Board who shall have voted on the proposal
within the time fixed for the receipt of votes shall have approved.

5. No manuscript may be published, though approved by each member of the special
manuscript committee, until forty-five days have elapsed from the transmittal of the report
in manuscript form. The interval is allowed for the receipt of any memorandum of dissent or
reservation, together with a brief statement of his reasons, that any member may wish to
express; and such memorandum of dissent or reservation shall be published with the
manuscript if he so desires. Publication does not, however, imply that each member of the
Board has read the manuscript, or that either members of the Board in general or the special
committee have passed on its validity in every detail.

6. Publications of the National Bureau issued for informational purposes concerning the
work of the Bureau and its staff, or issued to inform the public of activities of Bureau staff,
and volumes issued as a result of various conferences involving the National Bureau shall
contain a specific disclaimer noting that such publication has not passed through the normal
review procedures required in this resolution. The Executive Committee of the Board is
charged with review of all such publications from time to time to ensure that they do not take
on the character of formal research reports of the National Bureau, requiring formal Board
approval.

7. Unless otherwise determined by the Board or exempted by the terms of paragraph 6, a
copy of this resolution shall be printed in each National Bureau publication.

(Resolution adopted October 25, 1926, as revised through September 30, 1974)
## Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Acknowledgments</th>
<th>ix</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Physicians as Agents</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Physicians and Hospitals</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Physician Information and the Consumer's Demand for Care</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. The Availability Effect: Empirical Results</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Hospital Beds, Hospital-oriented Physicians, and Hospital Use</td>
<td>91</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Conclusions and Policy Implications</td>
<td>111</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix</td>
<td>119</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes</td>
<td>123</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Index</td>
<td>129</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Acknowledgments

This book summarizes research begun when I was a faculty research fellow at the Center for Economic Analysis of Human Behavior and Social Institutions, National Bureau of Economic Research, Palo Alto, during the academic year 1974–75. Victor Fuchs encouraged me to start and to pursue these topics, and his criticisms and comments were most helpful during the course of the research and writing. I also received helpful comments and advice (though not necessarily agreement with conclusions) from Robert Evans, Barry Friedman, Gerry Goldstein, William Gould, Jerry Green, Michael Grossman, Joseph Newhouse, and Richard Rosett. Jan Platt helped me get started with the empirical work, and special thanks are due to Tryfon Beazoglou for exceptional research assistance.

M. P.