Social Security Pension Reform in Europe
A National Bureau
of Economic Research
Conference Report
Social Security Pension Reform in Europe

Edited by Martin Feldstein and Horst Siebert

The University of Chicago Press

Chicago and London
Martin Feldstein is the George F. Baker Professor of Economics, Harvard University, and president of the National Bureau of Economic Research. Horst Siebert is president of the Kiel Institute of World Economics, chair of theoretical economics and professor at the Christian-Albrechts University, Kiel, Germany.
National Bureau of Economic Research

Officers

Carl F. Christ, chairman
Kathleen B. Cooper, vice-chairman
Martin Feldstein, president and chief executive officer
Susan Colligan, vice president for administration and budget and corporate secretary
Robert Mednick, treasurer
Kelly Horak, controller and assistant corporate secretary
Gerardine Johnson, assistant corporate secretary

Directors at Large

Peter C. Aldrich
Elizabeth E. Bailey
John H. Biggs
Andrew Brimmer
Carl F. Christ
John S. Clarkeson
Don R. Conlan
Kathleen B. Cooper
George C. Eads
Martin Feldstein
Stephen Friedman
Karen N. Horn
Judy C. Lewent
John Lipsky
Michael H. Moskow
Alicia H. Munnell
Rudolph A. Oswald
Robert T. Parry
Peter G. Peterson
Richard N. Rosett
Kathleen P. Utgoff
Marina v. N. Whitman

Directors by University Appointment

George Akerlof, California, Berkeley
Jagdish Bhagwati, Columbia
William C. Brainard, Yale
Glen G. Cain, Wisconsin
Franklin Fisher, Massachusetts Institute of Technology
Saul H. Hymans, Michigan
Marjorie B. McElroy, Duke
Joel Mokyr, Northwestern
Michael J. Brennan, California, Los Angeles
Andrew Postlewaite, Pennsylvania
Nathan Rosenberg, Stanford
Michael Rothschild, Princeton
Craig Swan, Minnesota
David B. Yoffie, Harvard
Arnold Zellner, Chicago

Directors by Appointment of Other Organizations

Mark Drabenstott, American Agricultural Economics Association
Gail D. Fosler, The Conference Board
A. Ronald Gallant, American Statistical Association
Robert S. Hamada, American Finance Association
Robert Mednick, American Institute of Certified Public Accountants
Angelo Melino, Canadian Economics Association
Richard D. Rippe, National Association for Business Economics
John J. Siegfried, American Economic Association
David A. Smith, American Federation of Labor and Congress of Industrial Organizations
Josh S. Weston, Committee for Economic Development
Gavin Wright, Economic History Association

Directors Emeriti

Thomas D. Flynn
Lawrence R. Klein
Franklin A. Lindsay
Paul W. McCracken
Bert Seidman
Eli Shapiro

Since this volume is a record of conference proceedings, it has been exempted from the rules governing critical review of manuscripts by the Board of Directors of the National Bureau (resolution adopted 8 June 1948, as revised 21 November 1949 and 20 April 1968).
Contents

Acknowledgments xi
Preface xiii

Introduction: An American Perspective
Martin Feldstein 1

Introduction: A European Perspective
Horst Siebert 9

1. Pensions and Contemporary Socioeconomic Change
Assar Lindbeck 19
Discussion Summary

2. Different Approaches to Pension Reform from an Economic Point of View
Jonathan Gruber and David A. Wise 49
Comment: Herbert Hax
Discussion Summary

3. Labor Mobility, Redistribution, and Pension Reform in Europe
Alain Jousten and Pierre Pestieau 85
Comment: Michael Burda
Discussion Summary

4. France: The Difficult Path to Consensual Reforms
Didier Blanchet and Florence Legros 109
Comment: Martine Durand
Discussion Summary
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>The German Pension System: Status Quo and Reform Options</td>
<td>137</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Bert Rürup</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Comment:</em> Axel Börsch-Supan</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Discussion Summary</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Edward Palmer</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Comment:</em> Laurence J. Kotlikoff</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Discussion Summary</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.</td>
<td>Italy: A Never-Ending Pension Reform</td>
<td>211</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Daniele Franco</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Comment:</em> Franco Peracchi</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Discussion Summary</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.</td>
<td>Prefunding in a Defined Benefit Pension System: The Finnish Case</td>
<td>263</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Jukka Lassila and Tarmo Valkonen</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Comment:</em> Reijo Vanne</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Discussion Summary</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Jeroen J. M. Kremers</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Comment:</em> A. Lans Bovenberg</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Discussion Summary</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.</td>
<td>The United Kingdom: Examining the Switch from Low Public Pensions to High-Cost Private Pensions</td>
<td>317</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>David Blake</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Comment:</em> Andrew A. Samwick</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Discussion Summary</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.</td>
<td>Poland: Security through Diversity</td>
<td>349</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Jerzy Hausner</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.</td>
<td>The Hungarian Pension Reform: A Preliminary Assessment of the First Years of Implementation</td>
<td>365</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Roberto Rocha and Dimitri Vittas</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.</td>
<td>Romania’s Pension System: From Crisis to Reform</td>
<td>401</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Georges de Menil and Eytan Sheshinski</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Comment (on chaps. 11, 12 and 13):</em> John McHale</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Discussion Summary (for chaps. 11, 12 and 13)</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
14. Recent Developments in Old Age Pension Systems: An International Overview 439
Klaus-Jürgen Gern

Appendix: OECD Statistical and Analytical Information on Aging 479
Contributors 483
Author Index 487
Subject Index 493
This volume is part of a larger series of studies of Social Security reform conducted separately by the National Bureau of Economic Research and by the Kiel Institute. More information on these studies is available on the internet at [www.nber.org/socialsecurity] and [www.uni-kiel.de].

The papers in this volume were presented and discussed at a conference in Berlin in March 2000. The remarks by the discussant of each paper and a summary of the general discussion are also included in the volume. We are grateful to Klaus-Jürgen Gern and Oliver Lorz for preparing the summary of the general discussion.

We are grateful to the Ford Foundation, the Starr Foundation, and the Allianz Versicherungs AG for the financial support that made this project possible. We also want to thank individual staff members of the NBER and of the Kiel Institute for their help with the many aspects of the planning and execution of the research, the conference, and the volume. In addition to the researchers and the research assistants named in the individual papers, we want to thank Kirsten Foss Davis, Helena Fitz-Patrick, Norma MacKenzie, Jutta M. Arpe, and Hannelore Owe for logistic support of the meetings and assistance in the preparation of this volume.
The papers in this volume show the enormous variety of ways in which the European nations are confronting the public pension crisis that has been brought about by the combination of generous promises in the past and a changing demographic structure in the future. Some countries have made radical reforms to reduce the cost of future benefits while maintaining support for future retirees. Others have done very little.

These papers are the result of a project organized jointly by the National Bureau of Economic Research (based in Cambridge, Massachusetts) and the Kiel Institute of World Economics (based in Kiel, Germany). Although the volume makes no explicit recommendations, we think that the evidence on the alternatives pursued by different European countries should be helpful to policy officials and others who are contemplating future reforms in Europe as well as in the United States and elsewhere.

The ten separate country studies provide information on the demographic and economic facts that confront each country in dealing with its aging population; describe the reforms that have been adopted in recent years; and discuss the political and conceptual issues involved in those reforms. In addition, three essays deal with the broader context of social security reform: the economic aspects of reform, the social context of reform, and the implications of the European labor market. Two brief introductory essays—by Martin Feldstein and Horst Siebert—give American and European points of view, respectively. A summary survey of European social security programs written by Klaus-Jürgen Gern and a data appendix prepared by the Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development complete the volume.