ANALYSIS
OF
Wisconsin Income

FRANK A. HANNA
JOSEPH A. PECHMAN
AND SIDNEY M. LERNER

NATIONAL BUREAU OF ECONOMIC RESEARCH, INC.
NEW YORK
STUDIES IN

Income and Wealth

VOLUME NINE
National Bureau of Economic Research, Inc.

OFFICERS
C. Reinold Noyes, Chairman  
Boris Shishkin, President  
W. W. Riefler, Vice-President  
George B. Roberts, Treasurer  
W. J. Carson, Executive Director  
Martha Anderson, Editor

DIRECTORS AT LARGE
Chester I. Barnard, Chairman, New Jersey Bell Telephone Company  
Arthur F. Burns, Columbia University  
W. L. Crum, University of California  
Oswald W. Knauth, New York City  
Simon Kuznets, University of Pennsylvania  
H. W. Laidler, Executive Director, League for Industrial Democracy  
Shepard Morgan, Vice-President, Chase National Bank  
C. Reinold Noyes, New York City  
George B. Roberts, Vice-President, National City Bank  
Beardsley Ruml, Chairman, Board of Directors, R. H. Macy & Company  
Harry Scherman, President, Book-of-the-Month Club  
George Soule, New York City  
N. I. Stone, Consulting Economist  
J. Raymond Walsh, WMCA Broadcasting Co.  
Leo Wolman, Columbia University

DIRECTORS BY UNIVERSITY APPOINTMENT
E. Wight Bakke, Yale  
C. C. Balderston, Pennsylvania  
C. D. Edwards, Northwestern  
G. A. Elliott, Toronto  
H. M. Groves, Wisconsin  
Gottfried Haberler, Harvard  
W. W. Riefler, Institute for Advanced Study  
T. O. Yntema, Chicago

DIRECTORS APPOINTED BY OTHER ORGANIZATIONS
Percival F. Brundage, American Institute of Accountants  
Arthur H. Cole, Economic History Association  
Frederick C. Mills, American Statistical Association  
Boris Shishkin, American Federation of Labor  
Warren C. Waite, American Farm Economic Association  
Donald H. Wallace, American Economic Association

RESEARCH STAFF
Arthur F. Burns, Director of Research  
Moses Abramovitz  
Harold Barger  
Morris A. Copeland  
Daniel Creamer  
Solomon Fabricant  
Milton Friedman  
Millard Hastay  
W. Braddock Hickman  
F. F. Hill  
Thor Hultgren  
Simon Kuznets  
Clarence D. Long  
Ruth P. Mack  
Frederick C. Mills  
Wesley C. Mitchell  
Geoffrey H. Moore  
Raymond J. Saulnier  
George J. Stigler  
Leo Wolman
Relation of the Directors to the Work and Publications of the National Bureau of Economic Research

1. The object of the National Bureau of Economic Research is to ascertain and to present to the public important economic facts and their interpretation in a scientific and impartial manner. The Board of Directors is charged with the responsibility of ensuring that the work of the National Bureau is carried on in strict conformity with this object.

2. To this end the Board of Directors shall appoint one or more Directors of Research.

3. The Director or Directors of Research shall submit to the members of the Board, or to its Executive Committee, for their formal adoption, all specific proposals concerning researches to be instituted.

4. No report shall be published until the Director or Directors of Research shall have submitted to the Board a summary drawing attention to the character of the data and their utilization in the report, the nature and treatment of the problems involved, the main conclusions and such other information as in their opinion would serve to determine the suitability of the report for publication in accordance with the principles of the Bureau.

5. A copy of any manuscript proposed for publication shall also be submitted to each member of the Board. For each manuscript to be so submitted a special committee shall be appointed by the President, or at his designation by the Executive Director, consisting of three Directors selected as nearly as may be one from each general division of the Board. The names of the special manuscript committee shall be stated to each Director when the summary and report described in paragraph (4) are sent to him. It shall be the duty of each member of the committee to read the manuscript. If each member of the special committee signifies his approval within thirty days, the manuscript may be published. If each member of the special committee has not signified his approval within thirty days of the transmittal of the summary and report, the Director of Research shall then notify each member of the Board, requesting approval or disapproval of publication, and thirty additional days shall be granted for this purpose. The manuscript shall then not be published unless at least a majority of the entire Board and a two-thirds majority of those members of the Board who shall have voted on the proposal within the time fixed for the receipt of votes on the publication proposed shall have approved.

6. No manuscript may be published, though approved by each member of the special committee, until forty-five days have elapsed from the transmittal of the summary and report. The interval is allowed for the receipt of any memorandum of dissent or reservation, together with a brief statement of his reasons, that any member may wish to express; and such memorandum of dissent or reservation shall be published with the manuscript if he so desires. Publication does not, however, imply that each member of the Board has read the manuscript, or that either members of the Board in general, or of the special committee, have passed upon its validity in every detail.

7. A copy of this resolution shall, unless otherwise determined by the Board, be printed in each copy of every National Bureau Book.

(Resolution adopted October 25, 1926 and revised February 6, 1933 and February 24, 1941)
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

The studies in this volume could not have been undertaken without the initial support and continuing interest of the members of the Executive Committee of the Conference. Not only were they helpful in creating favorable circumstances for the necessary work, but their comments and suggestions on preliminary and revised plans were helpful in pointing out fruitful avenues of investigation. The suggestions of Simon Kuznets, Robert R. Nathan, Milton Friedman, and Morris A. Copeland deserve special mention.

The development, progress, and preliminary results of each study were subjected to the critical scrutiny of a University of Wisconsin faculty committee on Wisconsin income, consisting of Harold M. Groves, Chairman, Don Anderson, James S. Earley, E. A. Gaumnitz, and L. E. Pfankuchen. This group, in a series of meetings, discussed these studies with the authors at every stage. While the more direct results of these discussions, which we each vividly recall, were substantial, these studies were probably improved even more by the hints and suggestions whose value was not immediately appreciated. During his stay at the University of Wisconsin, Milton Friedman was a consultant and helped us all with many technical problems.

The interest of Simon Kuznets and Harold M. Groves from the time of starting the tabulations of Wisconsin income tax returns through every phase of the study was always a source of inspiration. Without their continuing interest and support these studies would never have been completed.

We are indebted, also, to W. L. Crum, Solomon Fabricant, C. Lowell Harriss, Frederick C. Mills, and Geoffrey H. Moore for
uncovering many ambiguities in the manuscript and for other valuable suggestions.

We are grateful to Martha Anderson for her careful editing of the manuscript and to H. Irving Forman for preparing the excellent charts.

FRANK A. HANNA
SIDNEY M. LERNER
JOSEPH A. PECHMAN
CONTENTS

Acknowledgments vii
Foreword by Milton Friedman 1

Part I

INCOME RECEIVED IN WISCONSIN, 1936

FRANK A. HANNA, JOSEPH A. PECHMAN, AND SIDNEY M. LERNER

A Income of Farmers 23
1 Net Farm Income 23
2 Nonfarm Income of Farmers 26
   Value of produce consumed on the farm 26
   Number receiving wages and wages received 26
   Other sources of income 28
   Interest paid by farmers as a business expense 28

B Income of Nonagricultural Entrepreneurs 29
1 Number of Entrepreneurs 29
   Census data 30
   Filers and nonfilers 33
2 Entrepreneurial Income 33
3 Other Income of Nonagricultural Entrepreneurs not Filing Returns 34
4 Interest Paid or Payable by Entrepreneurs 34

C Income of Wage Earners 35
1 Number of Wage Earners 35
   Covered industries 35
   Noncovered industries 37
2 Wages 40
   Covered industries 40
   Noncovered industries 40
3 Total Income of Wage Earners 42
CONTENTS

D Method of Combining Estimates 44
E Reliability of Estimates 45
  1 Amount of Income 45
    Comparison with 'Income Payments' 48
  2 Number of Recipients 49
Appendix 50
  1 Definition of Terms 50
    Income 50
    Deductions 55
    Aggregates 57
  2 Filing Requirements 58

Part II
PATTERNS OF INCOME

JOSEPH A. PECHMAN

CHAPTER

1 Summary 61
  A Composition and Size of Individual Incomes 63
  B Patterns of Income 64
  C Stability of Income Composition 66
  D Relation between Income Composition and its Size Distribution 67
    Changes in income composition associated with changes in its absolute distribution 69
    Changes in income composition associated with changes in its relative distribution 70
  E Changes in the Relative Distribution of Income 71
    Size distributions of types of receipt 71
    Effect of changes in the relative distribution of receipts on that of total income 72
    Effect of changes in aggregate receipts on the size distribution of total income 73
  F Conclusion 74

2 Composition and Patterns of Income 76
  A Composition of Income in Each Income Group 76
  B The Heterogeneity of Incomes at Specific Income Levels 79
CONTENTS

CHAPTER

C A Functional Classification of Income Recipients 83
D Homogeneity of Functional Categories 86
   Number of receipts 87
   Secondary receipts 87
   Composition of the income of wage earners, entrepreneurs, and investors 90
   Relative distributions 91
E Evaluation of a Functional Classification of Income Recipients 92

3 Stability of Composition and Patterns of Income 94
A Stability of an Individual’s Income Pattern 95
B Stability of Income Patterns at Specific Income Levels 97
C Stability of Income Composition at Specific Income Levels 98

4 Composition and Distribution of Income 106
A Effect of Changes in the Aggregate and Distribution of Income on its Composition 111

5 Distribution of Income by Size 117
A Size Distributions of Income Receipts 117
B Effect of Changes in the Size Distribution of Receipts on the Size Distribution of Total Income 124
C Effect of Changes in Aggregate Receipts on the Size Distribution of Total Income 128
D Changes in the Relative Distribution of Total Income 130

APPENDIX

A Basic Tables 132
B Methods Used to Determine Effects of Changes in the Absolute and Relative Distributions of Total Income upon Its Composition 140
   1 Calculating the Basic Frequency Distribution 140
      Interpolation below $3,000 142
      Interpolation above $3,000 143
   2 Transforming the Basic Frequency Distribution 143
      Proportionate increase in aggregate income 143
      Moving the Lorenz curve toward the line of equal distribution 145
C Methods Used to Determine Effects of Changes in the Size Distributions of Receipts upon the Size Distribution of Total Income 147
Part III

THE ACCOUNTING PERIOD AND THE DISTRIBUTION OF INCOME

FRANK A. HANNA

CHAPTER

1 The Question and a Partial Answer 155
   A Characteristics of the Sample 157
   B Annual Variations in the Distributions of Each Receipt 159
   C Distribution based on Annual and on Longer Accounting Periods 161
   D Relation Between Annual Accounting Periods 163

2 Families in the Sample of Identical Taxpayers 165
   A How the Families were Selected 165
   B The Basic Tabulations 166
   C Average Income Reported 168
   D Distribution of Incomes 168
   E Composition of Income 174
   F Patterns of Income 179
   G Marital Status 182
   H Geographic Distribution 184

3 The Seven Annual Accounting Periods 186
   A The Concept of the Annual Accounting Period 186
   B Volume of Income 187
   C Average Receipts 188
   D Composition of Income 191
   E Distribution of Net Taxable Income 191
   F Distributions by Economic Income 196
   G Distribution of Receipts by Size 198

4 Relation of Annual to Longer Accounting Periods 203
   A The 'Average' Distribution of 'Annual' Income 204
      A method of averaging Lorenz curves 205
      Characteristics of average Lorenz curves 207
   B The Distribution of Income for Longer Accounting Periods 209
      Net taxable income 209
      Capital gains 216
   C Relation of the Two- to the Three-Year Distributions of Net Taxable Income 224
CONTENTS

CHAPTER

5 Relations between Annual Accounting Periods 229
   A Coefficients of Correlation 230
      Correlation with 1929 234
      Correlation with 1935 236
      Correlations of pairs of consecutive years 238
      Capital gains and capital losses 240
   B Is the Regression Linear? 241
      The problem of groups 248
   C Coefficients of Partial Correlation 250
   D Coefficients of Variation 253

TABLES

Part I

TABLE

1 Estimated Income Received, Wisconsin, 1936 21
2 Estimated Number of Farmers and their Income, Wisconsin, 1936 24
3 Characteristics of Farms Covered by Sample Survey, Census of Agriculture, and Consumer Purchases Study 27
4 Nonagricultural Entrepreneurs, by Number, Source of Data, and Industry, Wisconsin, 1936 30
5 Entrepreneurs in Selected Industries, Census and State Data 32
6 Estimated Wage Earners and Cash Wages, Wisconsin, 1936 36

Part II

1 Percentage Composition of Income by Income Groups, 1936 77
2 Percentage of Returns in Each Income Group Reporting Selected Receipts, 1936 81
3 Average Receipts by Income Groups, 1936 81
4 Relative Interquartile Differences of Receipts in Four Income Groups, 1936 82
TABLE

5 Distribution of Returns by Largest Receipt, 1936 85
6 Percentage Distribution of Returns in Each Income Group by Largest Receipt, 1936 86
7 Percentage Distribution of Wage Earners, Entrepreneurs, and Investors in Each Income Group by Number of Receipts, 1936 88
8 Wage Earners and Entrepreneurs Classified by Second Largest Receipt, 1936 89
9 Receipts Most Frequently Reported as Second Largest Receipt by Wage Earners and Entrepreneurs in Each Income Group, 1936 90
10 Number in Sample of 13,184 Families that Received Selected Receipts in Two Successive Years, 1929–1935 96
11 Ranks of the Share of Wages in Total Income by Economic Income Bracket, 1929, 1934–36 105
12 Economic Income Reported on Tax Returns and Aggregate Income Payments to all Individuals, 1929, 1934–36 107
13 Distribution of Total Income by Economic Income Bracket, 1935–1936 108
14 Analysis of the Change in the Composition of Income, 1935–1936 109
15 Computed Changes in the 1936 Composition of Income as Total Income is Increased Proportionately 25 and 50 Per cent 114
16 Computed Changes in the 1936 Composition of Income due to Shifting the Lorenz Curve for Total Income 25 and 50 Percent Closer to the Line of Equal Distribution 115
17 Variability of Receipts, 1929, 1935, and 1936 120
18 Cumulative Percentage Distribution of Wages and Business Profits, All Wisconsin Recipients, 1936 121
A 1 Frequency Distribution of Individuals by Largest Receipt, by Number of Receipts, by Second Largest Receipt, and by Income Group, 1936 134
A 2 Percentage Composition of Income by Income Groups, Returns Classified by Largest Receipt, 1936 138
A 3 The Actual and Basic Distribution of Income, 1936 141
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TABLE</th>
<th>CONTENTS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Average Receipt and Deduction, Sample of Identical Taxpayers and All Returns, 1929, 1934, and 1935</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Average Size of Selected Receipts on Individual and Family Basis, Sample of Identical Taxpayers, 1929, 1934, and 1935</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Composition of Income, Sample of Identical Taxpayers and All Returns, 1929, 1934, and 1935</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Income from Earnings as Percentage of Total Income, Classified by Economic Income, Sample of Identical Taxpayers and All Returns, 1929, 1934, and 1935</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>Composition of Income in Each Economic Income Group, Sample of Identical Taxpayers and All Returns, 1929 and 1935</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.</td>
<td>Percentage of Filers Reporting Selected Receipts, Sample of Identical Taxpayers and All Returns, 1929, 1934, and 1935</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.</td>
<td>Percentage of Total Returns Reporting Specified Receipts, Sample of Identical Taxpayers and All Returns, 1929 and 1935</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.</td>
<td>Receipts and Deductions by Years, Sample of Identical Taxpayers, 1929–1935</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.</td>
<td>Number of Families Reporting Selected Receipts by Year, Sample of Identical Taxpayers, 1929–1935</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.</td>
<td>Equality of Distribution of Selected Receipts Ranked by Years, Sample of Identical Taxpayers, 1929–1935</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.</td>
<td>Distribution of Net Taxable Income for 2- and 3-Year Accounting Periods, Sample of Identical Taxpayers, 1929–1931</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.</td>
<td>Cumulative Percentage Distribution of Capital Gains by 2- to 7-Year Accounting Periods, 1,482 Families Reporting Capital Gains, Sample of Identical Taxpayers, 1929–1935</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.</td>
<td>Coefficient of Variation of 3-Year Net Taxable Income in Each 2-Year Group, Sample of Identical Taxpayers, 1929–1931</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15.</td>
<td>Coefficients of Correlation Between Incomes for Various Years, Sample of Identical Taxpayers, 1929–1935</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table

16 Coefficients of Partial Correlation, Sample of Identical Taxpayers, 1929—1935 251
17 Signs of the Coefficients of Partial Correlation, Sample of Identical Taxpayers, 1929—1935 252
18 Coefficients of Variation for 1-, 2-, and 3-Year Accounting Periods, Sample of Identical Taxpayers, 1929—1935 254

Charts

Part I

1 Lorenz Curves for the Distribution of Total Income among Individuals, Wisconsin, 1936 22

Part II

1 Lorenz Curves for the Distribution of Total Income, Wage Earners, Entrepreneurs, and Investors, Individual Income Tax Returns, 1936 91
2 Composition of Total Income by Economic Income Bracket, Individual Income Tax Returns, 1929 and 1934—1936 100
3 Lorenz Curves for Selected Receipts by Their Own Size, Individual Income Tax Returns, 1929, 1935, 1936 118
4 Changes in the Lorenz Curves for Specified Receipts by Their Own Size, Individual Income Tax Returns, 1929, 1935, 1936 119
5 Segments of the Lorenz Curves for Wages and Business Income Received by all Recipients and of Rents Received by Filers, 1936 122
6 Probable Effects on the Distribution of Total Income of Moving the Lorenz Curve for Wages and Dividends 25 Percent Closer to the Line of Equal Distribution, Individual Income Tax Returns, 1936 127
CONTENTS

CHART
7 Probable Effects on the Distribution of Total Income of Reducing Each Wage or Each Dividend Receipt 50 Percent, Individual Income Tax Returns, 1936 129
A 1 Reranking of Individuals when the Lorenz Curve for Wages is Moved 25 Percent Closer to the Line of Equal Distribution 148
A 2 Reranking of Individuals with $500–999 Wages and $3,000–3,999 Total Income when the Lorenz Curve for Wages is Moved 25 Percent Closer to the Line of Equal Distribution 149

Part III

1 Lorenz Curves for the Distribution of Net Taxable Income, Sample of Identical Taxpayers and All Returns, 1929, 1934, and 1935 170
2 Cumulative Percentage Distribution of Returns by Size of Economic Income, Sample of Identical Taxpayers and All Returns, 1929 and 1935 171
3 Selected Receipts, by Type, as Percentage of 1929 Receipts, Sample of Identical Taxpayers, 1929–1935 189
4 Average Selected Receipts, Sample of Identical Taxpayers, 1929–1935 190
5 Selected Items as Percentages of Total Income, Sample of Identical Taxpayers, 1929–1935 192
6 Net Taxable Income, Sample of Identical Taxpayers, 1929–1935 194
7 Cumulative Percentage Distribution of Families by Size of Economic Income, Sample of Identical Taxpayers, 1929–1935 197
8 Lorenz Curves for the Distribution of Selected Family Receipts by Their Own Size, Sample of Identical Taxpayers, 1929–1935 200
9 Lorenz Curves for the Distribution of Net Taxable Income, 2- and 3-Year Accounting Periods, Sample of Identical Taxpayers, 1929–1931 211
10 Lorenz Curves for the Distribution of Capital Gains among Families Reporting Capital Gains in at Least One of the Seven Years, 1929–1935, 2- to 7-Year Accounting Periods, Sample of Identical Taxpayers 218
CONTENTS

CHART

11 Regression of Net Taxable Income for the 3-Year Accounting Period, 1929–1931, on that for the 2-Year Accounting Period, 1929–1930, Sample of Identical Taxpayers 225
12 Correlation of 1929 Incomes with 1930–1935 Incomes, Sample of Identical Taxpayers 235
13 Correlation of 1935 Incomes with 1929–1934 Incomes, Sample of Identical Taxpayers 237
14 Correlation of Incomes in Pairs of Consecutive Years, Sample of Identical Taxpayers, 1929–1935 239
15 Relation of Group Averages to Regression Line, Sample of Identical Taxpayers, 1929–1935 244