Civil War Pensions for Union Army Veterans

Race and Disability: Preliminary Findings

Peter Blanck & Chen Song

Presentation at the Early Indicators Meeting Sponsored by NBER April 23, 2004

Objectives of Study

Compare African American and White Union Army Troops in areas of:

Social/Economic Background

Military Experiences

Pension Application Features

Pension Access and Awards

 Detect these differences as a function of primary claimed disabilities

Background and Prior Findings

- Extra-disability forces and discrimination in the pension system
- Historical study of then new-category of disabled and relevance to the evolution of disability policy and law
- Birth of medical model, administrative state, and organized legal bar
- Prior Studies, Blanck & Song
 - 1) Stigma (premium for claims for more visible impairment, 8% improved probability for pension increase)
 - 2) Nativity (no disparity once accepted, but 19%-27% less likelihood in applying for pension for foreign-born)
 - 3) Gettysburg Cohort (10%-17% more likelihood in receiving an increase)
 - 4) Politics (Republican state premium, \$1.35 for pension awards, 6% premium for probability of increase for GSWs)
 - 5) Pension Attorneys (across disabilities, lower probability of pension increase with attorneys)
 - 6) Pension Attorney George Lemon (biography in progress)

Background of African American Soldiers in the UA

- African American soldiers faced racial prejudice in military assignments
- African American UA soldiers distinguished themselves in battles -- one-third of African Americans who enlisted lost their lives, compared to one-fifth of white soldiers.

Background of African American UA Soldiers

• Population:

180,000 soldiers, 163 units served, comprised 10% of the UA.

• Our Sample:

Recruits: Random sample of 35,594 white, and 6,026 African American UA veterans

Claims: 7,985 claims from African American soldiers, and 78,341 claims from white soldiers.

UA Data for Whites and African Americans

Variables

- (1) demographic (birth, ethnicity, age)
- (2) social class (occupation, military rank)
- (3) pension application (application year, attorney assistance)
- (4) disability (claim type, severity)

Socioeconomic Background Birth Information for 6,026 African American and 35,594 White Recruits

	African American %	White %
Birth Region		
Missing	8.63%	<u>29.52%</u>
Mid-West	7.62%	27.36%
Northeast	6.94%	<u>34.80%</u>
South	76.68%	8.12%
West	0.13%	0.21%

Socioeconomic Background (Continued) Birth Information for 6,026 African American and 35,594 White Recruits

<u>Afri</u>	can American %	White %
Birth Cohort		
Missing		
Born before 1840	<u>45.47%</u>	<u>51.95%</u>
Born b/w 1840 and 1845	34.68%	39.69%
Born after 1845	19.85%	8.35%
Nativity		
Missing	7.65%	3.87%
Foreign-born	0.88%	25.61%
Native-born	91.47%	<u>70.52%</u>

Socioeconomic Background (Continued) Enlistment Information for 6,026 African American and 35,594 White Recruits

African American % White %

Enlistment Region

Missing	5.33%	0.16%
Mid-West	11.27%	<u>50.24%</u>
Northeast	12.66%	<u>39.90%</u>
South	70.73%	7.81%
West	0.02%	1.89%

Socioeconomic Background (Continued) Enlistment Information for 6,026 African American and 35,594 White Recruits

	African American %	White %
Enlistment Year		
1861	1.00%	25.63%
1862	1.28%	33.88%
1863	41.07%	6.78%
1864	43.13%	22.85%
1865	13.52%	10.86%

Socioeconomic Background (Continued) Enlistment Information for 6,026 African American and 35,594 White Recruits

	African American %	White %
Enlistment Occupa	<u>ation</u>	
Laborer	36.47%	16.85%
Artisan	3.39%	20.55%
Semi-Skilled	4.10%	5.07%
Farmer	54.47%	49.78%
Professional	1.58%	7.75%
Initial Military Ra	<u>nk</u>	
Private	94.45%	92.34%
Officer	5.55%	7.66%

Socioeconomic Background (Continued) Death Information for 6,026 African American and 35,594 White Recruits

	African American %	White %
Death Period		
During War	<u>35.42%</u>	21.16%
After War	64.58%	78.84%
Death Region		
Missing	51.36%	46.27%
Mid-West	6.55%	<u>22.96%</u>
Northeast	3.57%	12.20%
South	<u>37.90%</u>	15.49%
West	0.61%	3.07%

Population Representation of Claims

African American **White**

Number of Recruits

6,026

35,594

White Divided by African American = 5.91 Times

Number of Claims

7,985

78,341

White Divided by African American = 9.81 Times

Number of Unique

Recruits Ever Filed a Claim

1,984

18,870

White Divided by African American = 9.51 Times

% Ever Filed a Claim 33% = 1,984/6,026

53% = 18,870/35,594

Pension Application

7,985 Claims from African American, and 78,341 Claims from White Recruits

African American %White %

Application Period

1862 General Law	1.23%	3.34%
1873 Consolidation Act	0.92%	2.97%
1879 Arrears Act	10.43%	21.81%
1890 Disability Pension	57.09%	38.66%
1907 Age Pension	11.09%	10.22%
1912 Age & Service	19.24%	22.99%

Pension Application (Continued) 7,985 Claims from African American, and 78,341 Claims from White Recruits

	African American %	White %
Ruling Decision		
Missing	18.62%	16.44%
Decrease	1.39%	1.02%
Increase	<u>39.84%</u>	<u>55.79%</u>
Reject	<u>40.15%</u>	<u>26.75%</u>
Represented by Atto	<u>rney</u>	
Without Attorney Ho	elp 35.00%	40.75%
With Attorney Help	<u>65.00%</u>	<u>59.25%</u>

Pension Application (Continued)

Recorded 1st Claimed Disability Applications from 1862 to 1932 7,985 Claims from African American and 78,341 Claims from White Recruits

	African American	White %
Musculo-Skeletal	<u>36.94%</u>	20.40%
Injury and GSW	21.57%	26.45%
Ear Diseases	5.18%	6.32%
Respiratory Diseases	5.02%	6.19%
Eye Diseases	4.92%	3.90%
Hernias	4.67%	4.11%
General Appearance	4.11%	2.39%
Diarrhea	<u>4.01%</u>	13.97%
Nervous Disorder	3.34%	2.35%
Infectious Diseases	3.04%	3.90%

Pension Application (Continued)

Recorded 1st Claimed Disability Applications from 1862 to 1932 7,985 Claims from African American and 78,341 Claims from White Recruits (Continued)

	African American %	White %
Genito-Urinary	1.88%	2.32%
Hemmorroid	1.49%	1.77%
Gastro-Intestinal	1.19%	1.59%
Rectum Diseases	0.76%	0.98%
Neoplasm	0.55%	0.87%
Liver Diseases	0.53%	0.72%
Varicose Veins	0.35%	1.38%
Skin and Tissue	0.13%	0.22%
Cardiovascular	0.11%	0.05%
Edocrine	0.11%	0.03%
Blood	0.05%	0.03%
Accident	0.04%	0.02%

Pension Application (Continued) Average Pension Outcome Measures For All Applications 1,984 African American and 18,870 White Recruits Who Applied for Pension at Least Once

African American		White	
Average (Avg.) Outcome			
Avg. Amount (Avg. of Avg.)***	\$12.56	\$14.16	
Avg. % Increases of All Apps***	43.61%	65.86%	
% Decreases of All Apps***	1.90%	1.32%	
% Rejected of All Apps***	54.49%	32.83%	
Other Averages			
Avg. 1st Year of Application***	1888	1884	
Avg. % Apps with Attorney***	72.17%	64.97%	

^{***}Differences between African American and White Recruits are Statistically Significant at the 1% level.

Regression Analysis of Avg. \$ Amount per Month – Model 1 Controlling for Race and Application Variables 1,984 African American, and 18,870 White Recruits Who Applied for Pension at Least Once

	Coefficient	Statistical
	Estimate	Significance
Intercept	\$21.22	***
Black Recruits	-\$1.09	***
Avg. % Apps. with Attorney	-\$10.34	***
1st App. General Law Period	-\$1.84	***
1st App. Consolidation Act Period	-\$1.26	***
1st App. Arrears Act Period	-\$0.05	
1st App. Age Act Period	\$0.47	
1st App. Age & Service Act Period	\$9.66	***
Adjusted R2	22.95%	

Note: Omitted Category: 1st App. Disability Act Period

Regression Analysis of Avg.\$ Amount per Month – Model 2 Controlling for Race, Application Variables, and Interaction of Ethnicity and Application Variables

CoefficientStatisticalEstimateSignificance

Statistically Significant Interaction Terms

Black * 1st App. General Law \$1.67

Black * 1st App. Age & Service Law -\$5.02

Adjusted R2 22.98%

** Statistical Significance at the 5% level

Regression Analysis of Avg. % Increase – Model 1 Controlling for Race and Application Variables 1,984 African American, and 18,870 White Recruits Who Applied for Pension at Least Once

	Coefficient	Statistical
	Estimate	Significance
Intercept	0.87	***
Black Recruits	-0.21	***
Avg. % Apps. with Attorney	-0.27	***
1st App. General Law Period	-0.04	***
1st App. Consolidation Act Period	-0.05	***
1st App. Arrears Act Period	-0.04	***
1st App. Age Act Period	-0.01	
1st App. Age & Service Act Period	-0.13	***
Adjusted R2	13.25%	

Note: Omitted Category: 1st App. Disability Act Period

Regression Analysis of Avg. % Increase – Model 2 Controlling for Race, Application Variables, and Interaction of Race and Application Variables

CoefficientStatisticalEstimateSignificance

Statistically Significant Interaction Terms

Black	-0.08	***
Black * Attorney	-0.20	***
Black * 1st App. General Law	0.11	***

Adjusted R2 13.59%

Regression Analyses of Avg. % Reject Demonstrate Almost Exactly the Opposite Results as those in Regression Analyses of Avg. % Increase

-- Controlling for Race, Application Variables (Model 1), and Interactions of Race and Application Variables (Model 2)

Study of Disability and Race Injury and GSW 1st Application Population and Sub-Samples

	African American	White
1st Application GSW	459	4,283
% of Population 1st Apps	(23.71%)	(23.45%)
1st Application GSW &		
1st Applied under 1862		
General Law	72	1,582
% of Sub-Sample 1st Apps	(71.29%)	(61.56%)
1st Application GSW &		
1st Applied under 1890		
Disability Pension Act	177	608
% of Sub-Sample 1st Apps	(14.89%)	(8.84%)

Regression Analysis of Avg. \$ Amount per Month – Model 3 Controlling for Race, Disability, Attorney, and Interactions 101 African American, and 2,570 White Recruits Whose First Applications Were Filed During the 1862 General Law Period

	Coefficient	Statistical
	Estimate	Significance
Intercept	\$17.09	***
Black Recruits	\$2.33	
1 st App. = Injury & GSW	-\$0.34	
Avg. % Apps. with Attorney	-\$6.58	***
Black*1st App. = Injury & GSW	-\$0.18	
Black*Avg. % Apps. With Attorney	-\$2.56	
Adjusted R2	7.87%	

Regression Analysis of Avg. % Increase – Model 3 Controlling for Race, Disability, Attorney, and Interactions 101 African American, and 2,570 White Recruits Whose First Applications Were Filed During the 1862 General Law Period

	Coefficient	Statistical
	Estimate	Significance
Intercept	0.72	***
Black Recruits	-0.10	
1 st App. = Injury & GSW	0.02	**
Avg. % Apps. with Attorney	-0.14	***
Black*1st App. = Injury & GSW	0.02	
Black*Avg. % Apps. With Attorney	-0.03	
Adjusted R2	2.90%	

*** Statistical Significance at the 1% level

Regression Analysis of Avg. \$ Amount per Month– Model 4 Controlling for Race, Disability, Attorney, and Interactions 1,189 African American, and 6,875 White Recruits Whose First Applications Were Filed During the 1890 Disability Pension Act Period

	Coefficient	Statistical
	Estimate	Significance
Intercept	\$22.13	***
Black Recruits	-\$0.88	*
1 st App. = Injury & GSW	-\$0.09	
Avg. % Apps. with Attorney	-\$11.80	***
Black*1st App. = Injury & GSW	\$0.05	
Black*Avg. % Apps. With Attorney	-\$0.25	
Adjusted D2	24 070/	
Adjusted R2	34.07%	

*** Statistical Significance at the 1% level

Regression Analysis of Avg. % Increase – Model 4 Controlling for Race, Disability, Attorney, and Interactions 1,189 African American and 6,875 White Recruits Whose First Applications Were Filed During the 1890 Disability Pension Act Period

	Coefficient	Statistical
	Estimate	Significance
Intercept	0.90	***
Black Recruits	-0.04	*
1^{st} App. = Injury & GSW	-0.02	
Avg. % Apps. with Attorney	-0.33	***
Black*1st App. = Injury & GSW	0.00	
Black*Avg. % Apps. With Attorney	-0.24	***
Adjusted R2	20.91%	

^{***} Statistical Significance at the 1% level

Regression Analysis of Avg. \$ Amount per Month– Model 5 Controlling for Race, Disability, Attorney, and Interactions 647 African American, and 4,642 White Recruits Whose First Applications Claimed MSK

	Coefficient Estimate	Statistical Significance
Intercept	\$21.19	***
Black Recruits	-\$0.12	
Avg. % Apps. with Attorney	-\$10.65	***
Black*Avg. % Apps. With Attorney	-\$1.50	*
Adjusted R2	26.03%	

^{***} Statistical Significance at the 1% level

^{*} Statistical Significance at the 10% level

Regression Analysis of Avg. % Increase – Model 5 Controlling for Race, Disability, Attorney, and Interactions 647 African American and 4,642 White Recruits Whose First Applications Claimed MSK

	Coefficient Estimate	Statistical Significance
Intercept	0.86	***
Black Recruits	0.01	
Avg. % Apps. with Attorney	-0.27	***
Black*Avg. % Apps. With Attorney	-0.31	***
Adjusted R2	17.03%	

Regression Analysis of Avg. \$ Amount per Month– Model 6 Controlling for Race, Disability, Attorney, and Interactions 1,832 African American, and 9,068 White Recruits Who were Enlisted between 1863 and 1865

	Coefficient Estimate	Statistical Significance
Intercept	\$21.47	***
Black Recruits	-\$0.99	**
Foreign Recruits	-\$0.88	***
Avg. % Apps. with Attorney	-\$10.01	***
Black*1st Application under 1912 Law	-\$6.71	***
Black*Avg. % Apps. With Attorney	-\$0.46	
Adjusted R2	27.40%	

- *** Statistical Significance at the 1% level
- ** Statistical Significance at the 5% level

Regression Analysis of Avg. \$ Amount per Month– Model 7 Controlling for Race, Disability, Attorney, and Interactions 84 African American, and 11,289 White Recruits Who were Enlisted between 1861 and 1862

	Coefficient	Statistical
	Estimate	Significance
Intercept	\$21.32	***
Black Recruits	-\$1.21	
Foreign Recruits	-\$0.92	***
Avg. % Apps. with Attorney	-\$10.02	***
Black*1st Application under 1862 Law	\$7.03	***
Black*Avg. % Apps. With Attorney	\$1.33	
Adjusted R2	20.43%	

Regression Analysis of Avg. % Increase– Model 6 Controlling for Race, Disability, Attorney, and Interactions 1,832 African American, and 9,068 White Recruits Who were Enlisted between 1863 and 1865

	Coefficient	Statistical
	Estimate	Significance
Intercept	0.87	***
Black Recruits	-0.10	***
Foreign Recruits	-0.03	***
Avg. % Apps. with Attorney	-0.25	***
Black*1st Application under 1862 Law	0.13	***
Black*Avg. % Apps. With Attorney	-0.20	***
Adjusted R2	19.49%	

Regression Analysis of Avg. % Increase– Model 7 Controlling for Race, Disability, Attorney, and Interactions 84 African American, and 11,290 White Recruits Who were Enlisted between 1861 and 1862

	Coefficient	Statistical
	Estimate	Significance
	0.0=	district.
Intercept	0.85	***
Black Recruits	0.04	
Foreign Recruits	-0.02	***
Avg. % Apps. with Attorney	-0.26	***
Black*Avg. % Apps. With Attorney	-0.10	***
Adjusted R2	8.21%	

Conclusion

Socioeconomic Background

Compared to a typical white soldier, a typical African American soldier was more likely to be born, enlist, and die in the South; be native, younger, and more likely to be farm laborer or laborer.

Military Experience

Compared to a typical white soldier, a typical African American soldier was more likely to be enlisted after 1862, slightly more likely to have the initial rank of a private, and more likely to die during the War.

Conclusion (Continued)

Pension Claims Background

African American soldiers less likely to have filed a claim. Compared with a typical claim from a white soldier, a typical claim from an African American soldier was more likely to be filed after 1890, with attorney assistance, and with first claimed disability to be musculo-skeletal diseases instead of GSW.

Pension Application Outcome T-test

Compared with a typical ruling outcome for a white soldier, a typical ruling outcome for an African American soldier was more likely to be a lower monthly amount granted, a higher likelihood of a rejection or a decrease, and a lower likelihood of an increase.

Conclusion (Continued)

Pension Application Outcome Regression Results

For all claims, African Americans had a lower probability (0.17 overall for the interactive model, and 0.21 lower for the non-interactive model) in an average % increase.

Applications with attorney assistance fared substantially worse in every model and subsample (0.20 lower probability in average % increase for interactive model, and 0.27 lower probability for non-interactive model)

African Americans fared worse relative to whites when their first applications were filed under 1890 rather than 1862. (Dummy variable indicating GSW received a probability premium in % increase (0.02) under the 1862 Legislation regardless of race.)

African Americans enlisted between 1863 and 1865 fared substantially worse relative to whites enlisted in this period (\$0.88 dollar discount per month, and 0.10 lower probability of receiving an increase). 98% of African Americans enlisted between 1863 and 1865, but only 40% of whites did. White foreign recruits of both earlier and later enlistment periods fared worse (0.88-0.92 dollar discount per month, and 0.02-0.03 lower probability of receiving an increase).

Conclusion (Continued)

Preliminary Findings

Controlling for application features, did African American soldiers face relatively unfavorable outcome? **YES**

What were the sources of differences for African Americans?

- 1) Their claims received worse outcomes if filed under the 1890 Law rather than the 1862 Law. 57% of their claims were filed under the 1890 Law (39% for whites).
- 2) Their claims with attorney assistance received worse outcomes. 65% of their claims were filed with attorneys (59% for whites).
- 3) The most frequent two disabilities claimed by them, MSK (37% of all claims) and GSW (20% of all claims), received statistically equal outcomes as those claimed by whites (20% MSK and 26% GSW).
- 4) If they were enlisted between 1863 and 1865, their claims received worse outcomes. 98% of them were enlisted in the later half of the War, only 40% of the whites did.