

This PDF is a selection from an out-of-print volume from the National Bureau of Economic Research

Volume Title: When Public Sector Workers Unionize

Volume Author/Editor: Richard B. Freeman and Casey Ichniowski, eds.

Volume Publisher: University of Chicago Press

Volume ISBN: 0-226-26166-2

Volume URL: <http://www.nber.org/books/free88-1>

Publication Date: 1988

Chapter Title: Front matter, When Public Sector Workers Unionize

Chapter Author: Richard B. Freeman, Casey Ichniowski

Chapter URL: <http://www.nber.org/chapters/c7899>

Chapter pages in book: (p. -14 - 0)



National  
Bureau of  
Economic  
Research

---

# When Public Sector Workers Unionize

Edited by  
**Richard B. Freeman**  
and **Casey Ichniowski**

This Page Intentionally Left Blank

---

# When Public Sector Workers Unionize



A National Bureau  
of Economic Research  
Project Report

---

# When Public Sector Workers Unionize

Edited by **Richard B. Freeman and  
Casey Ichniowski**



The University of Chicago Press

*Chicago and London*

---

RICHARD B. FREEMAN is professor of economics at Harvard University and the Director of Labor Studies at the National Bureau of Economic Research. CASEY ICHNIOWSKI is associate professor at Columbia University Graduate School of Business Administration and a Faculty Research Fellow of the National Bureau of Economic Research.

The University of Chicago Press, Chicago 60637  
The University of Chicago Press, Ltd., London

© 1988 by the National Bureau of Economic Research  
All rights reserved. Published 1988  
Printed in the United States of America  
97 96 95 94 93 92 91 90 89 88 5 4 3 2 1

**Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data**

When public sector workers unionize / edited by Richard B. Freeman and Casey Ichniowski.  
p. cm. — (A National Bureau of Economic Research project report)  
“Papers presented at a conference held in Cambridge, Massachusetts, 11–15 August 1986”—Pref.  
Includes bibliographies and index.  
ISBN 0-226-26166-2  
I. Trade-unions—Government employees—United States—Congresses. 2. Trade-unions—Government employees—Law and legislation—United States—Congresses. 3. Collective bargaining—Government employees—United States—Congresses. I. Freeman, Richard B. (Richard Barry), 1943-. II. Ichniowski, Casey.  
III. Series.  
HD8005.2.U5W48 1988  
331.88'1135'0000—dc19

88-9669  
CIP

---

## National Bureau of Economic Research

### Officers

Richard N. Rosett, *chairman*  
George T. Conklin, Jr., *vice chairman*  
Martin Feldstein, *president and chief executive officer*  
Geoffrey Carliner, *executive director*  
Charles A. Walworth, *treasurer*  
Sam Parker, *director of finance and administration*

### Directors at Large

John H. Biggs	Martin Feldstein	Robert T. Parry
Andrew Brimmer	David L. Grove	Peter G. Peterson
Carl F. Christ	George Hatsopoulos	Robert V. Roosa
George T. Conklin, Jr.	Franklin A. Lindsay	Richard N. Rosett
Kathleen B. Cooper	Paul W. McCracken	Bert Seidman
Jean A. Crockett	Geoffrey H. Moore	Eli Shapiro
George C. Eads	Michael H. Moskow	Harold Shapiro
Morton Ehrlich	James J. O'Leary	Donald S. Wasserman

### Directors by University Appointment

Charles H. Berry, <i>Princeton</i>	Merton J. Peck, <i>Yale</i>
James Duesenberry, <i>Harvard</i>	James L. Pierce, <i>California, Berkeley</i>
Ann F. Friedlaender, <i>Massachusetts Institute of Technology</i>	Andrew Postlewaite, <i>Pennsylvania</i>
Jonathan Hughes, <i>Northwestern</i>	Nathan Rosenberg, <i>Stanford</i>
Saul Hymans, <i>Michigan</i>	James Simler, <i>Minnesota</i>
J. C. LaForce, <i>California, Los Angeles</i>	William S. Vickrey, <i>Columbia</i>
Marjorie McElroy, <i>Duke</i>	Burton A. Weisbrod, <i>Wisconsin</i>
	Arnold Zellner, <i>Chicago</i>

### Directors by Appointment of Other Organizations

Richard Easterlin, <i>Economic History Association</i>	Eric Kruger, <i>The Conference Board</i>
Edgar Fiedler, <i>National Association of Business Economists</i>	Rudolph A. Oswald, <i>American Federation of Labor and Congress of Industrial Organizations</i>
Robert S. Hamada, <i>American Finance Association</i>	Douglas D. Purvis, <i>Canadian Economics Association</i>
Robert C. Holland, <i>Committee for Economic Development</i>	Dudley Wallace, <i>American Statistical Association</i>
James Houck, <i>American Agricultural Economics Association</i>	Charles A. Walworth, <i>American Institute of Certified Public Accountants</i>
David Kendrick, <i>American Economic Association</i>	

### Directors Emeriti

Moses Abramovitz	Frank W. Fetter	George B. Roberts
Emilio G. Collado	Thomas D. Flynn	Willard L. Thorp
Solomon Fabricant	Gottfried Haberler	



---

## **Relation of the Directors to the Work and Publications of the National Bureau of Economic Research**

1. The object of the National Bureau of Economic Research is to ascertain and to present to the public important economic facts and their interpretation in a scientific and impartial manner. The Board of Directors is charged with the responsibility of ensuring that the work of the National Bureau is carried on in strict conformity with this object.

2. The President of the National Bureau shall submit to the Board of Directors, or to its Executive Committee, for their formal adoption all specific proposals for research to be instituted.

3. No research report shall be published by the National Bureau until the President has sent each member of the Board a notice that a manuscript is recommended for publication and that in the President's opinion it is suitable for publication in accordance with the principles of the National Bureau. Such notification will include an abstract or summary of the manuscript's content and a response form for use by those Directors who desire a copy of the manuscript for review. Each manuscript shall contain a summary drawing attention to the nature and treatment of the problem studied, the character of the data and their utilization in the report, and the main conclusions reached.

4. For each manuscript so submitted, a special committee of the Directors (including Directors Emeriti) shall be appointed by majority agreement of the President and Vice Presidents (or by the Executive Committee in case of inability to decide on the part of the President and Vice Presidents), consisting of three Directors selected as nearly as may be one from each general division of the Board. The names of the special manuscript committee shall be stated to each Director when notice of the proposed publication is submitted to him. It shall be the duty of each member of the special manuscript committee to read the manuscript. If each member of the manuscript committee signifies his approval within thirty days of the transmittal of the manuscript, the report may be published. If at the end of that period any member of the manuscript committee withholds his approval, the President shall then notify each member of the Board, requesting approval or disapproval of publication, and thirty days additional shall be granted for this purpose. The manuscript shall then not be published unless at least a majority of the entire Board who shall have voted on the proposal within the time fixed for the receipt of votes shall have approved.

5. No manuscript may be published, though approved by each member of the special manuscript committee, until forty-five days have elapsed from the transmittal of the report in manuscript form. The interval is allowed for the receipt of any memorandum of dissent or reservation, together with a brief statement of his reasons, that any member may wish to express; and such memorandum of dissent or reservation shall be published with the manuscript if he so desires. Publication does not, however, imply that each member of the Board has read the manuscript, or that either members of the Board in general or the special committee have passed on its validity in every detail.

6. Publications of the National Bureau issued for informational purposes concerning the work of the Bureau and its staff, or issued to inform the public of activities of Bureau staff, and volumes issued as a result of various conferences involving the National Bureau shall contain a specific disclaimer noting that such publication has not passed through the normal review procedures required in this resolution. The Executive Committee of the Board is charged with review of all such publications from time to time to ensure that they do not take on the character of formal research reports of the National Bureau, requiring formal Board approval.

7. Unless otherwise determined by the Board or exempted by the terms of paragraph 6, a copy of this resolution shall be printed in each National Bureau publication.

*(Resolution adopted October 25, 1926, as revised through September 30, 1974)*

---

# Contents

Preface	xi
<b>Introduction: The Public Sector Look of American Unionism</b>	1
Richard B. Freeman and Casey Ichniowski	
<b>I. THE ROLE OF PUBLIC SECTOR LABOR LAW</b>	
<b>1. Public Sector Union Growth and Bargaining Laws: A Proportional Hazards Approach with Time-Varying Treatments</b>	19
Casey Ichniowski	
<i>Comment: John M. Abowd</i>	
<b>2. Public Sector Bargaining Laws Really Matter: Evidence from Ohio and Illinois</b>	41
Gregory M. Saltzman	
<i>Comment: William T. Dickens</i>	
<b>3. The Effects of Public Sector Labor Laws on Labor Market Institutions and Outcomes</b>	81
Richard B. Freeman and Robert G. Valletta	
<i>Comment: Harvey S. Rosen</i>	
<b>4. Arbitrator Behavior in Public Sector Wage Disputes</b>	107
David E. Bloom	
<i>Comment: Morris A. Horowitz</i>	

<b>5. The Evolution of Public Sector Bargaining Laws</b>	129
Henry S. Farber	
<b>II. THE EFFECTS OF PUBLIC SECTOR BARGAINING ON WAGES</b>	
<b>6. Union/Nonunion Wage Gaps in the Public Sector</b>	169
H. Gregg Lewis	
<i>Comment: Zvi Griliches</i>	
<b>7. Employer Size, Pay, and the Ability to Pay in the Public Sector</b>	195
Charles C. Brown and James L. Medoff	
<i>Comment: Daniel S. Hamermesh</i>	
<b>8. Are Public Sector Workers Paid More than their Alternative Wage? Evidence from Longitudinal Data and Job Queues</b>	217
Alan B. Krueger	
<i>Comment: Lisa M. Lynch</i>	
<b>III. EFFECTS ON NONWAGE OUTCOMES</b>	
<b>9. On Estimating the Effects of Increased Aid to Education</b>	245
Ronald G. Ehrenberg and Richard P. Chaykowski	
<i>Comment: Richard J. Murnane</i>	
<b>10. Unions and Job Security in the Public Sector</b>	271
Steven G. Allen	
<i>Comment: Joseph G. Altonji</i>	
<b>11. Unionism and Licensing of Public School Teachers: Impact on Wages and Educational Output</b>	305
Morris M. Kleiner and Daniel L. Petree	
<i>Comment: Randall W. Eberts and Joe A. Stone</i>	
<b>12. The Effects of Public Sector Unionism on Pay, Employment, Department Budgets, and Municipal Expenditures</b>	323
Jeffrey Zax and Casey Ichniowski	
<i>Comment: Harry J. Holzer</i>	

<b>Appendix A. Collective Organization of Labor in the Public Sector</b>	365
Richard B. Freeman, Casey Ichniowski, and Jeffrey Zax	
<b>Appendix B. The NBER Public Sector Collective Bargaining Law Data Set</b>	399
Robert G. Valletta and Richard B. Freeman	
List of Contributors	421
Author Index	423
Subject Index	426

This Page Intentionally Left Blank

---

# Preface

This volume consists of papers presented at a conference held in Cambridge, Massachusetts, 11–15 August 1986, and is part of the National Bureau of Economic Research Labor Studies Program. Support for the project came from the Alfred P. Sloan Foundation. We are grateful to Jane Konkel for assistance in shepherding the volume through the editorial process.

Any opinions expressed in this volume are those of the respective authors and do not necessarily reflect the views of the National Bureau of Economic Research or the sponsoring organization.

This Page Intentionally Left Blank