

This PDF is a selection from an out-of-print volume from the National Bureau of Economic Research

Volume Title: A Retrospective on the Bretton Woods System: Lessons for International Monetary Reform

Volume Author/Editor: Michael D. Bordo and Barry Eichengreen, editors

Volume Publisher: University of Chicago Press

Volume ISBN: 0-226-06587-1

Volume URL: <http://www.nber.org/books/bord93-1>

Conference Date: October 3-6, 1991

Publication Date: January 1993

Chapter Title: Front matter, A Retrospective on the Bretton Woods System

Chapter Author: Michael D. Bordo, Barry Eichengreen

Chapter URL: <http://www.nber.org/chapters/c6865>

Chapter pages in book: (p. -16 - 0)

# A Retrospective on the Bretton Woods System

Lessons for International  
Monetary Relations



*Edited by* **Michael D. Bordo**  
*and* **Barry Eichengreen**

**NBER**  
National  
Bureau of  
Economic  
Research

This Page Intentionally Left Blank

---

# A Retrospective on the Bretton Woods System



A National Bureau  
of Economic Research  
Project Report

---

# A Retrospective on the Bretton Woods System

Lessons for International  
Monetary Reform

Edited by

Michael D. Bordo  
and Barry Eichengreen



The University of Chicago Press

*Chicago and London*

---

MICHAEL D. BORDO is professor of economics at Rutgers University.  
BARRY EICHENGREEN is professor of economics at the University of California, Berkeley. Both are research associates of the National Bureau of Economic Research.

The University of Chicago Press, Chicago 60637  
The University of Chicago Press, Ltd., London

© 1993 by the National Bureau of Economic Research  
All rights reserved. Published 1993  
Printed in the United States of America

02 01 00 99 98 97 96 95 94 93 1 2 3 4 5

ISBN: 0-226-06587-1 (cloth)

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data  
A Retrospective on the Bretton Woods system : lessons for international  
monetary reform / edited by Michael D. Bordo and Barry Eichengreen.  
p. cm.—(A National Bureau of Economic Research project report)  
Includes bibliographical references and index.

1. International finance—History. 2. Monetary policy.  
I. Bordo, Michael D. II. Eichengreen, Barry J. III. Series.  
HG3881.R425 1993  
332.4'556—dc20

92-30913  
CIP

⊗ The paper used in this publication meets the  
minimum requirements of the American National Standard  
for Information Sciences—Permanence of Paper for  
Printed Library Materials, ANSI Z39.48-1984.

---

## National Bureau of Economic Research

### Officers

George T. Conklin, Jr., *chairman*  
Paul W. McCracken, *vice chairman*  
Martin Feldstein, *president and chief executive officer*

Geoffrey Carliner, *executive director*  
Charles A. Walworth, *treasurer*  
Sam Parker, *director of finance and administration*

### Directors at Large

John H. Biggs	Martin Feldstein	Peter G. Peterson
Andrew Brimmer	George Hatsopoulos	Douglas D. Purvis
Carl F. Christ	Lawrence R. Klein	Robert V. Roosa
George T. Conklin, Jr.	Franklin A. Lindsay	Richard N. Rosett
Don R. Conlan	Paul W. McCracken	Bert Seidman
Kathleen B. Cooper	Leo Melamed	Eli Shapiro
Jean A. Crockett	Robert T. Parry	Donald S. Wasserman
George C. Eads		

### Directors by University Appointment

Jagdish Bhagwati, <i>Columbia</i>	James L. Pierce, <i>California, Berkeley</i>
William C. Brainard, <i>Yale</i>	Andrew Postlewaite, <i>Pennsylvania</i>
Glen G. Cain, <i>Wisconsin</i>	Nathan Rosenberg, <i>Stanford</i>
Franklin Fisher, <i>Massachusetts Institute of Technology</i>	Harold T. Shapiro, <i>Princeton</i>
Saul H. Hymans, <i>Michigan</i>	Craig Swan, <i>Minnesota</i>
Marjorie B. McElroy, <i>Duke</i>	Michael Yoshino, <i>Harvard</i>
	Arnold Zellner, <i>Chicago</i>

### Directors by Appointment of Other Organizations

Marcel Boyer, <i>Canadian Economics Association</i>	Charles Lave, <i>American Economic Association</i>
Rueben C. Buse, <i>American Agricultural Economics Association</i>	Rudolph A. Oswald, <i>American Federation of Labor and Congress of Industrial Organizations</i>
Richard A. Easterlin, <i>Economic History Association</i>	Dean P. Phipers, <i>Committee for Economic Development</i>
Gail Fosler, <i>The Conference Board</i>	James F. Smith, <i>National Association of Business Economists</i>
A. Ronald Gallant, <i>American Statistical Association</i>	Charles A. Walworth, <i>American Institute of Certified Public Accountants</i>
Robert S. Hamada, <i>American Finance Association</i>	

### Directors Emeriti

Moses Abramovitz	Gottfried Haberler	George B. Roberts
Emilio G. Collado	Geoffrey H. Moore	William S. Vickrey
Thomas D. Flynn	James J. O'Leary	



---

## **Relation of the Directors to the Work and Publications of the National Bureau of Economic Research**

1. The object of the National Bureau of Economic Research is to ascertain and to present to the public important economic facts and their interpretation in a scientific and impartial manner. The Board of Directors is charged with the responsibility of ensuring that the work of the National Bureau is carried on in strict conformity with this object.

2. The President of the National Bureau shall submit to the Board of Directors, or to its Executive Committee, for their formal adoption all specific proposals for research to be instituted.

3. No research report shall be published by the National Bureau until the President has sent each member of the Board a notice that a manuscript is recommended for publication and that in the President's opinion it is suitable for publication in accordance with the principles of the National Bureau. Such notification will include an abstract or summary of the manuscript's content and a response form for use by those Directors who desire a copy of the manuscript for review. Each manuscript shall contain a summary drawing attention to the nature and treatment of the problem studied, the character of the data and their utilization in the report, and the main conclusions reached.

4. For each manuscript so submitted, a special committee of the Directors (including Directors Emeriti) shall be appointed by majority agreement of the President and Vice Presidents (or by the Executive Committee in case of inability to decide on the part of the President and Vice Presidents), consisting of the three Directors selected as nearly as may be one from each general division of the Board. The names of the special manuscript committee shall be stated to each Director when notice of the proposed publication is submitted to him. It shall be the duty of each member of the special manuscript committee to read the manuscript. If each member of the manuscript committee signifies his approval within thirty days of the transmittal of the manuscript, the report may be published. If at the end of that period any member of the manuscript committee withholds his approval, the President shall then notify each member of the Board, requesting approval or disapproval of publication, and thirty days additional shall be granted for this purpose. The manuscript shall then not be published unless at least a majority of the entire Board who shall have voted on the proposal within the time fixed for the receipt of votes shall have approved.

5. No manuscript may be published, though approved by each member of the special manuscript committee, until forty-five days have elapsed from the transmittal of the report in manuscript form. The interval is allowed for the receipt of any memorandum of dissent or reservation, together with a brief statement of his reasons, that any member may wish to express; and such memorandum of dissent or reservation shall be published with the manuscript if he so desires. Publication does not, however, imply that each member of the Board has read the manuscript, or that either members of the Board in general or the special committee have passed on its validity in every detail.

6. Publications of the National Bureau issued for informational purposes concerning the work of the Bureau and its staff, or issued to inform the public of activities of Bureau staff, and volumes issued as a result of various conferences involving the National Bureau shall contain a specific disclaimer noting that such publication has not passed through the normal review procedures required in this resolution. The Executive Committee of the Board is charged with review of all such publications from time to time to ensure that they do not take on the character of formal research reports of the National Bureau, requiring formal Board approval.

7. Unless otherwise determined by the Board or exempted by the terms of paragraph 6, a copy of this resolution shall be printed in each National Bureau publication.

*(Resolution adopted October 25, 1926, as revised through September 30, 1974)*

---

# Contents

Preface	xi
Michael D. Bordo and Barry Eichengreen	
<b>I. OVERVIEWS AND ORIGINS</b>	
<b>1. The Bretton Woods International Monetary System: A Historical Overview</b>	3
Michael D. Bordo	
<i>Comment:</i> Rudiger Dornbusch	
<i>Comment:</i> Richard N. Cooper	
<i>General Discussion</i>	
<b>2. Bretton Woods and Its Precursors: Rules versus Discretion in the History of International Monetary Regimes</b>	109
Alberto Giovannini	
<i>Comment:</i> Anna J. Schwartz	
<i>Comment:</i> Charles Wyplosz	
<i>General Discussion</i>	
<b>3. The Political Origins of Bretton Woods</b>	155
G. John Ikenberry	
<i>Comment:</i> John S. Odell	
<i>Comment:</i> L. S. Pressnell	
<i>General Discussion</i>	
<b>II. BRETTON WOODS IN OPERATION</b>	
<b>4. The Adjustment Mechanism</b>	201
Maurice Obstfeld	
<i>Comment:</i> Robert Z. Aliber	

	<i>Comment: Vittorio U. Grilli</i>	
	<i>General Discussion</i>	
<b>5. The Provision of Liquidity in the Bretton Woods System</b>		269
	Hans Genberg and Alexander K. Swoboda	
	<i>Comment: Stanley W. Black</i>	
	<i>Comment: John Williamson</i>	
	<i>General Discussion</i>	
<b>6. International Transmission under Bretton Woods</b>		317
	Alan C. Stockman	
	<i>Comment: Toru Iwami</i>	
	<i>Comment: Bennett T. McCallum</i>	
	<i>General Discussion</i>	
<b>7. The Role of International Organizations in the Bretton Woods System</b>		357
	Kathryn M. Dominguez	
	<i>Comment: Alberto Alesina</i>	
	<i>Comment: William H. Branson</i>	
	<i>General Discussion</i>	
<b>8. Devaluation Controversies in the Developing Countries: Lessons from the Bretton Woods Era</b>		405
	Sebastian Edwards and Julio A. Santaella	
	<i>Comment: Stanley Fischer</i>	
	<i>Comment: Albert Fishlow</i>	
	<i>General Discussion</i>	
<b>9. The Collapse of the Bretton Woods Fixed Exchange Rate System</b>		461
	Peter M. Garber	
	<i>Comment: Willem H. Buiter</i>	
	<i>General Discussion</i>	
<b>10. Panel Session I: Retrospectives</b>		495
	Michael Mussa, chair	
	Edward M. Bernstein, W. Max Corden, and Robert Solomon	

**III. THE LEGACY OF BRETTON WOODS**

- 11. Interest Differentials under Bretton Woods and the Post-Bretton Woods Float: The Effects of Capital Controls and Exchange Risk** 515  
Richard C. Marston  
*Comment:* Paul Krugman  
*Comment:* Allan H. Meltzer  
*General Discussion*
- 12. Attitudes toward Inflation and the Viability of Fixed Exchange Rates: Evidence from the EMS** 547  
Susan M. Collins and Francesco Giavazzi  
*Comment:* Michele Fratianni  
*Comment:* Niels Thygesen  
*General Discussion*
- 13. Panel Session II: Implications for International Monetary Reform** 587  
Barry Eichengreen, chair  
C. Fred Bergsten, Stanley Fischer, Ronald I. McKinnon, Robert Mundell, and Martin Feldstein

**IV. CONCLUSION**

- 14. Epilogue: Three Perspectives on the Bretton Woods System** 621  
Barry Eichengreen
- Contributors 659  
Author Index 663  
Subject Index 669

This Page Intentionally Left Blank

---

# Preface

In 1944, delegates from forty-four countries assembled at the Mt. Washington Hotel in Bretton Woods, New Hampshire, to negotiate a “new world order” governing exchange rates, foreign lending, and international trade. Among their most notable achievements was the Bretton Woods System of pegged but adjustable exchange rates and a new institution, the International Monetary Fund, to oversee the operation of exchange rates. The quarter century that followed, what came to be known as the “Bretton Woods years,” appears in retrospect as a golden age of exchange rate stability and rapid economic growth. The exchange rates of the major industrial countries remained fixed for extended periods. Inflation was moderate by subsequent standards. World trade expanded buoyantly. National income in the G7 countries rose more rapidly than in any comparable period before or since. It is tempting to assume, as many have done, that the key to this admirable performance lay in the international monetary agreement concluded in 1944.

The beginning of the end of the Bretton Woods era came on 15 August 1971, when U.S. President Richard Nixon shut the gold window, suspending the official convertibility of the dollar into gold at \$35 an ounce and cutting the exchange rate system loose from its moorings. Parities were realigned but stabilized only temporarily. By 1973, the transition to a new regime of floating exchange rates was complete. The real and financial turbulence of the succeeding period far outstripped anything witnessed during the Bretton Woods years.

The twentieth anniversary of the suspension of gold convertibility and of the collapse of the pegged-rate system seemed an appropriate time to revisit the Mt. Washington Hotel in order to reassess the lessons of Bretton Woods. In the autumn of 1991, more than sixty academics and policy makers therefore returned to the scene for the conference whose proceedings are published here. This was not the first conference, of course, reassessing Bretton Woods.

But, for a number of reasons, the organizers felt that it might be possible to view Bretton Woods in a new and revealing light. Theoretical advances in economics—for example, work on time consistency and credibility—had begun to build a framework within which the concept of a “Bretton Woods regime” might be systematically analyzed. Ongoing policy problems had added to the nostalgia with which the pegged exchange rates of Bretton Woods were viewed. The exchange rate gyrations of the 1980s had sharpened dissatisfaction with floating exchange rates and heightened interest in the pegged-rate systems of previous years. The European Monetary System, established in 1979, had lent increasing stability to the exchange rates of the participating countries and provoked discussion of exchange rate stabilization over a wider area. In the fall of 1991, the members of the European Community were moving rapidly to unify their currencies—that is, to fix their exchange rates once and for all through the establishment of a common currency and a European central bank. Clearly, arguments to stabilize exchange rates were back in vogue. Simultaneously, economic and political upheavals in Eastern Europe and in the successor states of the Soviet Union, the stagnation of portfolio capital flows to Latin America, and the troubled progress of the Uruguay Round of GATT negotiations combined to produce calls for a new Bretton Woods Agreement to reconstruct international institutions in ways that would address these pressing problems.

It was with these issues in mind that the NBER conference convened to consider what made possible the successful conclusion of the original Bretton Woods Agreement and to analyze its effects. A noteworthy and enjoyable aspect of the meeting was that it assembled in one place three distinct generations of international monetary economists. Among the participants were a number of academics and officials who had been “present at the creation.” Along with a subsequent generation of economists and officials currently at the center of academic and policy debates, they participated in panels and roundtables in which historical issues and policy implications were discussed. Formal papers were presented by a still younger generation of scholars whose professional careers by and large postdate the Bretton Woods era.

The papers, as will be evident from the table of contents to this volume, fall into a number of groups. The first set provides an overview of Bretton Woods from three different vantage points. Chapter 1, by Michael D. Bordo, surveys the literature on Bretton Woods and analyzes its performance in comparative perspective. A companion paper by Alberto Giovannini offers a detailed comparison of the behavior of exchange rates under Bretton Woods and its predecessors. G. John Ikenberry’s chapter then provides a political scientist’s analysis and explanation for the conclusion of the Bretton Woods Agreement.

The next set of chapters addresses first the successful operation of Bretton Woods and then its collapse. Maurice Obstfeld, Hans Genberg and Alexander K. Swoboda, and Alan C. Stockman analyze three central facets of the system’s operation: balance-of-payments adjustment, the international transmis-

sion of business cycles, and the provision of international liquidity. Kathryn M. Dominguez assesses the role of the IMF in Bretton Woods's operation, while Sebastian Edwards and Julio A. Santaella view this and related questions from the vantage point of the developing countries. Finally, Peter M. Garber reassesses the long-standing debate over the causes of Bretton Woods's collapse.

Much as historical experience can shed light on subsequent economic developments, subsequent developments provide an additional lens through which history can be viewed. Chapters by Richard C. Marston and by Susan M. Collins and Francesco Giavazzi therefore compare aspects of the Bretton Woods experience with the post-1973 float and the European Monetary System, respectively. The volume also contains a pair of panel discussions that reflect on the historical experience with Bretton Woods and look forward to the future of the international monetary system. The comments in these panels reflect the personal views of the participants, which may contain policy prescriptions. The volume concludes with an epilogue by Barry Eichengreen summarizing the main findings to emerge from the conference and their implications for international monetary reform.

As with all NBER conferences, as organizers of this one we benefited greatly from the intellectual and logistical support provided by the Bureau. Martin Feldstein and Geoffrey Carliner helped with the scholarly menu, while Kirsten Foss Davis and Ilana Hardesty dealt with the gastronomic one and, with characteristic good humor, managed to ferry the conference participants to northern New Hampshire at the height of the leaf-turning season. Jane Konkel in Cambridge and Julie McCarthy in Chicago shepherded the manuscript into print. The Ford Foundation provided financial support for the research program of which this publication is a part. We are grateful to all of them.

*Michael D. Bordo and Barry Eichengreen*



This Page Intentionally Left Blank