

This PDF is a selection from an out-of-print volume from the National Bureau of Economic Research

Volume Title: Conference on Business Cycles

Volume Author/Editor: Universities-National Bureau

Volume Publisher: NBER

Volume ISBN: 0-87014-193-7

Volume URL: <http://www.nber.org/books/univ51-1>

Publication Date: 1951

Chapter Title: Table of contents, foreword

Chapter Author: Universities-National Bureau, Gottfried Haberler

Chapter URL: <http://www.nber.org/chapters/c4758>

Chapter pages in book: (p. -11 - 0)

# Conference on Business Cycles

Held under the auspices of

Universities - National Bureau Committee  
for Economic Research

NATIONAL BUREAU OF ECONOMIC RESEARCH, INC.

---

NEW YORK, 1951

Copyright, 1951, by

National Bureau of Economic Research, Inc.

1819 Broadway, New York 23

All Rights Reserved

Typography by Oscar Leventhal, Inc.

Presswork and binding by H. Wolff

*Library of Congress Catalog Card Number: 51-11999*

OFFICERS

1951

Boris Shishkin, *Chairman*  
Harry Scherman, *President*  
C. C. Balderston, *Vice-President*  
George B. Roberts, *Treasurer*  
W. J. Carson, *Executive Director*  
Martha Anderson, *Editor*

DIRECTORS AT LARGE

D. R. Belcher, *American Telephone & Telegraph Co.*  
Oswald W. Knauth, *Beaufort, South Carolina*  
Simon Kuznets, *University of Pennsylvania*  
H. W. Laidler, *Executive Director, League for Industrial Democracy*  
Shepard Morgan, *New York City*  
C. Reinold Noyes, *Princeton, New Jersey*  
George B. Roberts, *Vice-President, National City Bank*  
Beardsley Ruml, *New York City*  
Harry Scherman, *Chairman, Book-of-the-Month Club*  
George Soule, *Bennington College*  
N. I. Stone, *Consulting Economist*  
J. Raymond Walsh, *New York City*  
Leo Wolman, *Columbia University*  
Theodore O. Yntema, *Vice President-Finance, Ford Motor Company*

DIRECTORS BY UNIVERSITY APPOINTMENT

|                                       |                                      |
|---------------------------------------|--------------------------------------|
| E. Wight Bakke, <i>Yale</i>           | H. M. Groves, <i>Wisconsin</i>       |
| C. C. Balderston, <i>Pennsylvania</i> | Gottfried Haberler, <i>Harvard</i>   |
| Arthur F. Burns, <i>Columbia</i>      | Clarence Heer, <i>North Carolina</i> |
| G. A. Elliott, <i>Toronto</i>         | R. L. Kozelka, <i>Minnesota</i>      |
| Frank W. Fetter, <i>Northwestern</i>  | Paul M. O'Leary, <i>Cornell</i>      |
| T. W. Schultz, <i>Chicago</i>         |                                      |

DIRECTORS APPOINTED BY OTHER ORGANIZATIONS

Percival F. Brundage, *American Institute of Accountants*  
Thomas C. Cochran, *Economic History Association*  
Frederick C. Mills, *American Statistical Association*  
S. H. Ruttenberg, *Congress of Industrial Organizations*  
Murray Shields, *American Management Association*  
Boris Shishkin, *American Federation of Labor*  
Donald H. Wallace, *American Economic Association*  
Frederick V. Waugh, *American Farm Economic Association*

RESEARCH STAFF

|  |                     |
|--|---------------------|
| Arthur F. Burns, <i>Director of Research</i>             |                     |
| Geoffrey H. Moore, <i>Associate Director of Research</i> |                     |
| Moses Abramovitz   | F. F. Hill          |
| Harold Barger  | Thor Hultgren       |
| Morris A. Copeland                                       | Simon Kuznets       |
| Daniel Creamer   | Clarence D. Long    |
| David Durand   | Ruth P. Mack        |
| Solomon Fabricant  | Frederick C. Mills  |
| Milton Friedman  | Raymond J. Saulnier |
| Millard Hastay   | Lawrence H. Seltzer |
| W. Braddock Hickman                                      | George J. Stigler   |
| Leo Wolman   |                     |

RELATION OF NATIONAL BUREAU DIRECTORS TO  
PUBLICATIONS REPORTING CONFERENCE PROCEEDINGS

Since the present volume is a record of conference proceedings, it has been exempted from the rules governing submission of manuscripts to, and critical review by, the Board of Directors of the National Bureau. It has, however, been reviewed and accepted for publication by the Director of Research.

*(Resolution adopted July 6, 1948  
and revised November 21, 1949)*

## SPECIAL CONFERENCE SERIES

---

- 1 *Problems in the Study  
of Economic Growth*
- 2 *Conference on Business Cycles*

## UNIVERSITIES-NATIONAL BUREAU COMMITTEE FOR ECONOMIC RESEARCH

This Committee is a cooperative venture of universities and the National Bureau. Its guiding objective is the encouragement of economic research on problems susceptible of objective treatment and of sufficiently broad scope to merit attention by institutions serving a scientific and public interest.

SIMON KUZNETS, *Chairman*  
*University of Pennsylvania*

MOSES ABRAMOVITZ, *Stanford University*

V. LEWIS BASSIE, *University of Illinois*

JOHN D. BLACK, *Harvard University*

FRANCIS M. BODDY, *University of Minnesota*

ARTHUR F. BURNS, *National Bureau of Economic Research*

JAMES S. EARLEY, *University of Wisconsin*

G. HEBERTON EVANS, JR., *The Johns Hopkins University*

R. A. GORDON, *University of California*

ALBERT G. HART, *Columbia University*

MILTON S. HEATH, *University of North Carolina*

RICHARD B. HEFLEBOWER, *Northwestern University*

BENJAMIN H. HIGGINS, *McGill University*

M. SLADE KENDRICK, *Cornell University*

ADOLPH LOWE, *New School for Social Research*

D. C. MACGREGOR, *University of Toronto*

OSKAR MORGENSTERN, *Princeton University*

WILLIAM G. MURRAY, *Iowa State College of Agriculture and Mechanic Arts*

LLOYD G. REYNOLDS, *Yale University*

PAUL A. SAMUELSON, *Massachusetts Institute of Technology*

THEODORE W. SCHULTZ, *University of Chicago*

I. L. SHARPMAN, *University of Michigan*

HAROLD M. SOMERS, *University of Buffalo*

JOSEPH J. SPENGLER, *Duke University*

EMANUEL STEIN, *New York University*

GEORGE W. STOCKING, *Vanderbilt University*

JOHN R. STOCKTON, *University of Texas*

M. C. URQUHART, *Queen's University*

RUTLEDGE VINING, *University of Virginia*

## FOREWORD

by GOTTFRIED HABERLER

The present volume contains the papers presented and the ensuing discussion at the Conference on Business Cycles held in New York, November 25-7, 1949. Since no stenographic record of the discussion from the floor was taken, only those contributions to the debate which were submitted in writing are printed. The authors were given a chance to revise their papers and to append replies to their critics — an opportunity of which most speakers availed themselves.

The Conference grew out of a recommendation by the Universities-National Bureau Committee for Economic Research, and its program was prepared by a committee consisting of Moses Abramovitz, R. A. Gordon, Simon Kuznets, Jacob Marschak, Geoffrey Moore, Hans Neisser, Arthur Smithies, and myself as chairman.

The purpose of the Conference was to afford the participants, about 70 in number, an opportunity to discuss thoroughly some of the major problems and results of business cycle research. The highly successful Conferences on Research in Income and Wealth were the obvious model for the Business Cycles Conference. I am afraid we have not been able to do for business cycle research as much as the Income Conferences have been able to do for income analysis. The reasons are fairly evident: business cycle research is a broader field; the basic cleavages in approach are much deeper, reaching down to the very philosophical foundations of scientific analysis of social phenomena; hence the scholars interested in our subject are not such a closely knit group as those engaged in income analysis.

I believe, nevertheless, that it was the common opinion of the participants that the Conference was a worthwhile enterprise.

The volume falls into three parts. Part I consists of papers dealing with the major empirical approaches to the study of business cycles, their methods and results.

Wesley C. Mitchell had agreed to open the Conference and to unveil for the first time in public some of the results of his book, *What Happens during Business Cycles*, which has since been published by the National Bureau. Unfortunately, he did not live to carry out his plan, but his unfinished manuscript was circulated to the conferees and Arthur F. Burns read

a report on it. The book was commented on by Jacob Marschak, and Burns wrote a reply for the present volume.

Next comes a lengthy soul-searching paper by Carl Christ of the Cowles Commission, which exemplifies the econometric approach to the cycle. Incisive comments follow by Milton Friedman and Lawrence Klein, the latter drawing forth a reply by Christ. Some further brief comments on Christ's paper were contributed by Geoffrey Moore and Jan Tinbergen.

Tinbergen's paper on the testing of business cycle theories was commented on by Tjalling Koopmans who took the occasion to make some remarks also on the previous discussion. David McCord Wright presents some reflections on the broader philosophical aspects raised by the National Bureau of Economic Research and the Cowles Commission.

Schumpeter's essay on the historical approach to business cycles is an unrevised draft which he distributed to the Conference and which he intended to revise later; but he was not able to do so before his death in January 1950. As usual, he spoke without notes, with great vigor and temperament. His paper gave Simon Kuznets an opportunity to state his views on the functions of the historical method in business cycle research.

R. A. Gordon's progress report on his extensive study of cyclical experience in the interwar period and Hans Neisser's comment round out the discussion concerning methods of business cycle research.

Part II of the present volume deals with the behavior of profits, investment and inventories in the cycle. The papers by Thor Hultgren and Moses Abramovitz have grown out of National Bureau investigations while Lawrence Klein's extensive study, although actually written during his stay with the National Bureau, is in the econometric, Cowles Commission, style. The comments by Irwin Friend, James W. Angell, Wassily Leontief and Lloyd Metzler give the reader an idea of the lively discussion evoked by the three papers.

Part III deals with broader questions. Ashley Wright's paper discusses business cycle research from the point of view of business policy, while Arthur Smithies' paper deals with government policy and the cycle. My own paper tries to answer the question whether there would be a cycle in partially planned economies — leaving out the case of completely planned economies of the Russian type, a gap which is filled by Abram Bergson's discussion.

The task of getting together the papers and discussion remarks was distributed among the members of the program committee of the Conference, while the final preparation for publication was in the capable hands of Thor Hultgren and Geoffrey Moore. Martha Anderson contributed her valued services as editor, H. Irving Forman designed the necessary charts, and Regina Sands constructed the index.

# Contents

## Part One

### GENERAL PAPERS

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| <i>Foreword</i>   | vii |
| Gottfried Haberler  |     |
| <i>Mitchell on What Happens during Business Cycles</i>  | 3   |
| Arthur F. Burns   |     |
| COMMENT   |     |
| Jacob Marschak  | 14  |
| Reply by Mr. Burns  | 25  |
| <i>A Test of an Econometric Model for the United States, 1921-1947</i>  | 35  |
| Carl Christ   |     |
| 1 Econometric Models: General Concepts and Definitions  | 35  |
| 2 Prediction: the Reduced Form of a System of Structural Equations  | 43  |
| 3 Statistical Estimation Procedures: the Structural Parameters  | 45  |
| 4 Statistical Estimation Procedures: the Parameters of the Reduced Form   | 49  |
| 5 Klein's Model III   | 50  |
| 6 Marshall's Test of Klein's Model III  | 55  |
| 7 Revisions of Klein's Equations  | 59  |
| 8 Description of Tests Used   | 67  |
| 9 Plan of Computations  | 70  |
| 10 Results of Computations  | 71  |
| 11 Discussion of Results of Computations  | 78  |
| 12 Summary and Conclusion   | 87  |
| Appendix  |     |
| A Time Series   | 87  |
| B Sources of Data and Construction of Time Series   | 91  |
| C Time Series for 1946-1947   | 98  |
| D Choice of Predetermined Variables for Estimation by the Abbreviated Variant of the Limited Information Method | 103 |
| E Estimation of the Parameters of the Reduced Form  | 104 |
| F Calculated Disturbances for CLI Limited Information Estimates of Equations                                    | 105 |
| G References  | 105 |

## COMMENT

|                     |     |
|---------------------|-----|
| Milton Friedman     | 107 |
| Lawrence R. Klein   | 114 |
| Reply by Mr. Christ | 123 |
| Geoffrey H. Moore   | 127 |
| Jan Tinbergen       | 129 |

*Reformulation of Current Business Cycle Theories as Refutable Hypotheses* 131

Jan Tinbergen

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| 1 Purpose and Nature of Current Theories | 131 |
| 2 Methods of Testing                     | 133 |
| 3 Critique of These Methods              | 135 |
| 4 Reformulation of Theories              | 136 |
| 5 Models So Far Tested; a Program        | 139 |

## COMMENT

|                      |     |
|----------------------|-----|
| Tjalling C. Koopmans | 141 |
| David McCord Wright  | 145 |

*Historical Approach to the Analysis of Business Cycles* 149

Joseph A. Schumpeter

## COMMENT

|               |     |
|---------------|-----|
| Simon Kuznets | 155 |
|---------------|-----|

*Cyclical Experience in the Interwar Period: the Investment Boom of the Twenties* 163

R. A. Gordon

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| 1 Major and Minor Cycles                              | 163 |
| 2 The Cycle of 1919-1921                              | 168 |
| 3 Beginnings of the Boom                              | 174 |
| 4 A Look Back   | 179 |
| 5 Changes in the Composition of Output and Employment | 180 |
| 6 Nonmonetary Stimuli to Investment                   | 188 |
| 7 Monetary, Financial, and International Factors      | 206 |
| 8 The End of the Boom                                 | 208 |
| 9 Some Tentative Conclusions                          | 210 |

## COMMENT

|              |     |
|--------------|-----|
| Hans Neisser | 215 |
| Adolph Lowe  | 222 |

## Part Two

## PROFITS, INVESTMENT, AND BUSINESS CYCLES

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| <i>Cyclical Diversities in the Fortunes of Industrial Corporations</i> | 225 |
| Thor Hultgren  |     |
| COMMENT  |     |
| Irwin Friend   | 227 |
| Reply by Mr. Hultgren  | 232 |
| <i>Studies in Investment Behavior</i>                                  | 233 |
| Lawrence R. Klein  |     |
| 1 General Aspects of Investment  | 233 |
| 2 Railroad Investment in the United States                             | 242 |
| 3 Electric Light and Power Investment in the United States             | 277 |
| COMMENT  |     |
| James W. Angell  | 304 |
| Wassily Leontief   | 310 |
| Reply by Mr. Klein   | 313 |
| <i>Influence of Inventory Investment on Business Cycles</i>            | 319 |
| Moses Abramovitz   |     |
| COMMENT  |     |
| Lloyd A. Metzler   | 325 |
| Further Comment by Mr. Abramovitz                                      | 333 |

## Part Three

## BUSINESS CYCLE RESEARCH AND POLICY

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| <i>Business Cycle Research and Business Policy</i> | 339 |
| C. Ashley Wright                                   |     |
| 1 Business Cycle Research and Business Policy      | 339 |
| 2 Business Cycle Forecasting                       | 347 |
| 3 Use of Statistical Indicators in Forecasting     | 356 |
| Appendix Estimation Methods                        | 366 |
| COMMENT  |     |
| Millard Hastay                                     | 368 |
| Ruth P. Mack                                       | 370 |
| Geoffrey H. Moore                                  | 370 |
| Reply by Mr. Wright                                | 372 |

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| <i>Business Cycles in a Planned Economy</i>            | 375 |
| Gottfried Haberler                                     |     |
| COMMENT  |     |
| Abram Bergson  | 387 |
| Adolph Lowe  | 390 |
| David McCord Wright                                    | 396 |
| N. I. Stone  | 398 |
| Evsey D. Domar   | 399 |
| Reply by Mr. Haberler                                  | 400 |
| <i>Business Cycle Analysis and Public Policy</i>       | 405 |
| Arthur Smithies  |     |
| 1 Introduction   | 405 |
| 2 Institutional or Structural Change                   | 406 |
| 3 Direct Control over Endogenous Variables             | 408 |
| 4 Control of Exogenous Variables — Compensatory Action | 409 |
| COMMENT  |     |
| J. M. Clark  | 413 |
| Leonid Hurwicz   | 416 |
| Carl Christ  | 420 |
| <i>Index</i>   | 423 |