

This PDF is a selection from an out-of-print volume from the National Bureau of Economic Research

Volume Title: Suggestions for Research in the Economics of Pensions

Volume Author/Editor: Daniel Holland

Volume Publisher:

Volume URL: <http://www.nber.org/books/unkn57-4>

Publication Date: 1957

Chapter Title: Front matter to "Suggestions for Research in the Economics of Pensions"

Chapter Author: Daniel Holland

Chapter URL: <http://www.nber.org/chapters/c4346>

Chapter pages in book: (p. -11 - 0)

Suggestions for
Research
in the Economics
of Pensions

*Report of an Exploratory Survey of the Economic Aspects of
Organized Provision for the Aged and Surviving Dependents*

NATIONAL BUREAU OF ECONOMIC RESEARCH, INC.
1957

Copyright, 1957, by
NATIONAL BUREAU OF ECONOMIC RESEARCH, INC.
261 Madison Avenue, New York 16, N. Y.

All Rights Reserved

Typography by Oscar Leventhal, Inc.
Printing and Binding by the Basso Printing Corporation

Library of Congress catalog card number: 57-8396

Price: \$1.00

RELATION OF THE DIRECTORS
TO THE WORK AND PUBLICATIONS
OF THE NATIONAL BUREAU OF ECONOMIC RESEARCH

1. The object of the National Bureau of Economic Research is to ascertain and to present to the public important economic facts and their interpretation in a scientific and impartial manner. The Board of Directors is charged with the responsibility of ensuring that the work of the National Bureau is carried on in strict conformity with this object.

2. To this end the Board of Directors shall appoint one or more Directors of Research.

3. The Director or Directors of Research shall submit to the members of the Board, or to its Executive Committee, for their formal adoption, all specific proposals concerning researches to be instituted.

4. No report shall be published until the Director or Directors of Research shall have submitted to the Board a summary drawing attention to the character of the data and their utilization in the report, the nature and treatment of the problems involved, the main conclusions, and such other information as in their opinion would serve to determine the suitability of the report for publication in accordance with the principles of the National Bureau.

5. A copy of any manuscript proposed for publication shall also be submitted to each member of the Board. For each manuscript to be so submitted a special committee shall be appointed by the President, or at his designation by the Executive Director, consisting of three Directors selected as nearly as may be one from each general division of the Board. The names of the special manuscript committee shall be stated to each Director when the summary and report described in paragraph (4) are sent to him. It shall be the duty of each member of the committee to read the manuscript. If each member of the special committee signifies his approval within thirty days, the manuscript may be published. If each member of the special committee has not signified his approval within thirty days of the transmittal of the report and manuscript, the Director of Research shall then notify each member of the Board, requesting approval or disapproval of publication, and thirty additional days shall be granted for this purpose. The manuscript shall then not be published unless at least a majority of the entire Board and a two-thirds majority of those members of the Board who shall have voted on the proposal within the time fixed for the receipt of votes on the publication proposed shall have approved.

6. No manuscript may be published, though approved by each member of the special committee, until forty-five days have elapsed from the transmittal of the summary and report. The interval is allowed for the receipt of any memorandum of dissent or reservation, together with a brief statement of his reasons, that any member may wish to express; and such memorandum of dissent or reservation shall be published with the manuscript if he so desires. Publication does not, however, imply that each member of the Board has read the manuscript, or that either members of the Board in general, or of the special committee, have passed upon its validity in every detail.

7. A copy of this resolution shall, unless otherwise determined by the Board, be printed in each copy of every National Bureau book.

*(Resolution adopted October 25, 1926
and revised February 6, 1933 and February 24, 1941)*

NATIONAL BUREAU OF ECONOMIC RESEARCH
1957

OFFICERS

Gottfried Haberler, *Chairman*
Arthur F. Burns, *President*
George B. Roberts, *Vice-President and Treasurer*
Solomon Fabricant, *Director of Research*
Geoffrey H. Moore, *Associate Director of Research*
William J. Carson, *Executive Director*

DIRECTORS AT LARGE

Wallace J. Campbell, *Director, Cooperative League of the USA*
Solomon Fabricant, *New York University*
Albert J. Hettinger, Jr., *Lazard Frères and Company*
Oswald W. Knauth, *Beaufort, South Carolina*
H. W. Laidler, *Executive Director, League for Industrial Democracy*
Shepard Morgan, *Norfolk, Connecticut*
George B. Roberts, *Vice-President, The First National City Bank of New York*
Beardsley Ruml, *New York City*
Harry Scherman, *Chairman, Book-of-the-Month Club*
George Soule, *Bennington College*
N. I. Stone, *Consulting Economist*
J. Raymond Walsh, *New York City*
Joseph H. Willits, *Director, The Educational Survey, University of Pennsylvania*
Leo Wolman, *Columbia University*
Donald B. Woodward, *Vick Chemical Company*
Theodore O. Yntema, *Vice-President-Finance, Ford Motor Company*

DIRECTORS BY UNIVERSITY APPOINTMENT

E. Wight Bakke, *Yale*
Arthur F. Burns, *Columbia*
Melvin G. de Chazeau, *Cornell*
G. A. Elliott, *Toronto*
Frank W. Fetter, *Northwestern*
H. M. Groves, *Wisconsin*
Gottfried Haberler, *Harvard*
Clarence Heer, *North Carolina*
R. L. Kozelka, *Minnesota*
C. Arthur Kulp, *Pennsylvania*
T. W. Schultz, *Chicago*
Jacob Viner, *Princeton*

DIRECTORS APPOINTED BY OTHER ORGANIZATIONS

Percival F. Brundage, *American Institute of Accountants*
Harold G. Halcrow, *American Farm Economic Association*
S. H. Ruttenberg, *Congress of Industrial Organizations*
Murray Shields, *American Management Association*
Boris Shishkin, *American Federation of Labor*
Willard L. Thorp, *American Economic Association*
W. Allen Wallis, *American Statistical Association*
Harold F. Williamson, *Economic History Association*

RESEARCH STAFF

Moses Abramovitz
Arthur F. Burns
Morris A. Copeland
David Durand
Richard A. Easterlin
Solomon Fabricant
Milton Friedman
Raymond W. Goldsmith
Millard Hastay
W. Braddock Hickman
Daniel M. Holland
Herbert B. Woolley
Thor Hultgren
John W. Kendrick
Simon Kuznets
Clarence D. Long
Ruth P. Mack
Ilse Mintz
Geoffrey H. Moore
G. Warren Nutter
Lawrence H. Seltzer
George J. Stigler
Leo Wolman

ADVISORY COMMITTEE

E. GORDON KEITH, Chairman — *Wharton School, University of Pennsylvania*
SAMUEL N. AIN, *Samuel N. Ain & Associates*

ROBERT M. BALL, *Bureau of Old-Age and Survivors Insurance, Department of Health, Education, and Welfare*

GEORGE B. BUCK, JR., *Consulting Actuary*

F. F. FAURI, *School of Social Work, University of Michigan*

EDMUND FITZGERALD, *Northwestern Mutual Life Insurance Co.*

GEORGE GARVY, *Federal Reserve Bank of New York*

CHALLIS A. HALL, JR., *Department of Economics, Yale University*

REINHARD A. HOHAUS, *Metropolitan Life Insurance Co.*

BENJAMIN B. KENDRICK, *Life Insurance Association of America*

C. ARTHUR KULP, *Wharton School, University of Pennsylvania*

JOHN H. MILLER, *Monarch Life Insurance Co.*

ROGER F. MURRAY, *Graduate School of Business, Columbia University*

ROBERT J. MYERS, *Social Security Administration, Department of Health, Education, and Welfare*

VITO NATRELLA, *Division of Trading and Exchanges, Securities and Exchange Commission*

JAMES J. O'LEARY, *Life Insurance Association of America*

JOSEPH A. PECHMAN, *Committee for Economic Development*

RAY M. PETERSON, *Equitable Life Assurance Society*

LAWRENCE H. SELTZER, *Department of Economics, Wayne University*

SUMNER SLICHTER, *Department of Economics, Harvard University*

SEYMOUR L. WOLFBEIN, *Division of Manpower and Employment Statistics, Bureau of Labor Statistics*

LEO WOLMAN, *Faculty of Political Science, Columbia University*



PREFACE

When an institution takes on the size and potentialities of growth that organized provision for the aged and their dependents has assumed in this country in less than a generation, it becomes a significant object of scrutiny by students of the social scene. How well does it meet the need for which it was designed? What role does it play in other aspects of social and economic life? What does it "cost," directly and also indirectly? In what directions are its scope and services increasing? What may it be expected to "cost" in the future? The establishment of old age and survivors insurance (OASI) and related governmental provisions, and the rapid development of private pension systems, have placed these and other questions before all who are concerned with the structure and drift of our economy. Interest in them has been sharpened by strong differences of opinion concerning the relative roles of governmental action on the one hand and private action on the other, in the move toward greater security for the aged. A new and important problem area has been opened up: the economics of pensions.

A considerable amount of research has already been done on various economic aspects of pensions — by governmental bureaus, academic scholars, research institutes, and business organizations. We lack, however, the comprehensive knowledge which is needed, knowledge of the various types of organized provision for the aged and survivors viewed as a whole and analyzed with particular reference to their growth possibilities and economic effects. A major reason for this lack is clear: our present system of pensions and related institutions has grown like a mushroom and we have hardly been able to keep up with it. We need to take stock of where we are and where we are going. The present exploration is a step in this direction.

It should be emphasized that this is not a report that sets forth the economics or economic effects of pensions. The report is designed to pose what appear to be the major questions, not to answer them;

and to suggest what are the more fruitful areas for further research.

The report, it should be added, does not present suggestions for research on all the problems of the aged in our society. It is limited to studies of the economic aspects of pensions and closely related matters. Though broad enough, the field covered is narrower than the whole host of problems — demographic, medical, sociological and psychological, as well as economic — that revolve around the aged and their growing importance in our population.

Also, the objective was not a single, integrated agenda for research, the parts of which might be undertaken simultaneously or in some indicated order. As with other programs of research presented on occasion by the National Bureau,¹ the purpose was the modest one of drawing attention to the important problems on which research seems most likely to prove fruitful. Some of these problems could form the subjects of special studies, and a number of these are suggested. Other problems are best considered in a broader context. Pensions are but one of a number of factors involved in economic behavior, and it would not always be efficient in treating certain aspects of wide-ranging subjects like labor mobility, for example, to focus on the effects of pensions alone. Yet no one working on these broad subjects today may safely ignore the influence of pensions.

Finally, it is not presumed that the work proposed here will be undertaken by any single agency. As has already been the case, different organizations and individuals will find the economics of pensions an interesting subject to work on. It is the National Bureau's hope that the present report will stimulate active research in many quarters and that it will help to turn those efforts toward questions that will yield the most useful results.

It is a pleasant duty to acknowledge the help which the National Bureau has received in preparing this survey of research needs. We are appreciative of a generous grant from the Life Insurance Association of America which made the exploration possible; of the services of the Advisory Committee (listed on page v), all of whom gave freely of their time and experience in discussions from which this set of research suggestions developed; and of the cooperation of persons, private organizations, and government bureaus that have done and are now doing research in this field, who permitted us to examine their unpublished reports and memoranda and made comments on particular points in our preliminary draft. Special acknowl-

¹See *A Program of Financial Research* (1937); *Research in Securities Markets* (1946); *Research in the Capital and Securities Markets* (1954).

edgement should be made to those who bore the brunt of the work: Gordon Keith, who acted as Chairman of the Advisory Committee and critically reviewed several drafts of the report; Daniel Holland, who directed the exploration and prepared the report; Marvin K. Bloom and Gladys F. Webbink, both experienced in the field, who worked with Dr. Holland and participated in the discussions of the Advisory Committee; and Mary Phelps, who edited the manuscript.

SOLOMON FABRICANT
Director of Research

December 1956

CONTENTS

| | Page |
|--|------|
| Preface | vii |
| Introduction | 1 |
| A Brief View of the Pension Structure | 3 |
| A Suggested Program of Research | 9 |
| I. Present and Future Scope and Characteristics of Pension Plans | 13 |
| A. The Present | 13 |
| Public programs | 14 |
| Private plans | 15 |
| 1. The scope, characteristics, and financial operations of private pension plans | 15 |
| 2. Historical analysis of the growth of private pensions and the factors affecting their growth | 16 |
| 3. Turnover and future benefit payments | 16 |
| B. The Future | 18 |
| II. Impact of Present and Future Pension Plans on Savings and Investment | 24 |
| A. Pensions and Saving | 25 |
| 1. The net effect of pension program transfer operations on the level of saving | 26 |
| 2. Pension coverage and peoples' spending and saving response thereto | 30 |
| 3. Analysis of pension fund accumulations in the context of statistical explanations of the proportion of income saved | 31 |
| B. Pensions and Investment | 33 |
| III. Relation of Present and Future Pensions to the Level and Distribution of National Income and Product | 40 |

| | Page |
|---|------|
| A. Effect of Pensions on Labor Mobility | 41 |
| 1. A study of the effect of pensions on mobility based on matched samples of firms | 43 |
| 2. Two other studies | 43 |
| B. Redistributive Effects of Pensions | 44 |
| 1. Income class redistributions through pension contributions and benefits: current and future | 44 |
| 2. Redistribution of purchasing power from the working population to the retired aged | 45 |
| IV. Pensions and Stability | 49 |
| V. The Tax Treatment of Pensions and the Aged | 50 |

TABLES

| | |
|---|----|
| 1. Total Payments and Number of Beneficiaries, All Pension Programs, 1940, 1947 and 1955 | 6 |
| 2. Asset Holdings of Pension Funds: 1940, 1947, 1954 and 1955 | 7 |
| 3. Actual and Estimated Public Pension Payments for Selected Years, 1940-1985 | 23 |
| 4. Assets of Self-Administered Private Pension Funds, December 31, 1954, and Change between 1953 and 1954 | 35 |
| 5. Cash and Security Holdings of State and Local Government Employee Retirement Systems: 1955 | 37 |