

This PDF is a selection from an out-of-print volume from the National Bureau of Economic Research

Volume Title: Income Inequality: Regional Analyses within a Human Capital Framework

Volume Author/Editor: Barry R. Chiswick

Volume Publisher: NBER

Volume ISBN: 0-870-14264-X

Volume URL: <http://www.nber.org/books/chis74-1>

Publication Date: 1974

Chapter Title: Front matter, Income Inequality: Regional Analyses within a Human Capital Framework

Chapter Author: Barry R. Chiswick

Chapter URL: <http://www.nber.org/chapters/c3668>

Chapter pages in book: (p. -16 - 0)

INCOME INEQUALITY
Regional Analyses
within a Human Capital Framework

NATIONAL BUREAU OF ECONOMIC RESEARCH
Human Behavior and Social Institutions 4

Income Inequality

Regional Analyses within a Human Capital Framework

Barry R. Chiswick
National Bureau of Economic Research
and Queens College, C.U.N.Y.



National Bureau of Economic Research
New York
1974
Distributed by Columbia University Press
New York and London

Copyright © 1974 by the National Bureau of Economic Research

All Rights Reserved

Library of Congress card no.: 73—88509

ISBN: 0—87014—264—X

Printed in the United States of America

NATIONAL BUREAU OF ECONOMIC RESEARCH

OFFICERS

Arthur F. Burns, *Honorary Chairman*
Walter W. Heller, *Chairman*
J. Wilson Newman, *Vice Chairman*
John R. Meyer, *President*
Thomas D. Flynn, *Treasurer*
Douglas H. Eldridge, *Vice President-
Executive Secretary*
Victor R. Fuchs, *Vice President-Research;
Co-director NBER-West*

Edwin Kuh, *Director, Computer Research
Center*
Hal B. Lary, *Vice President-Research*
Robert E. Lipsey, *Vice President-Research*
Sherman J. Maisel, *Co-director NBER-West*
Geoffrey H. Moore, *Vice President-Research*
Edward K. Smith, *Vice President*

DIRECTORS AT LARGE

Atherton Bean, *International Multifoods
Corporation*
Joseph A. Beirne, *Communications
Workers of America*
Arthur F. Burns, *Board of Governors of
the Federal Reserve System*
Wallace J. Campbell, *Foundation for
Cooperative Housing*
Erwin D. Canham, *Christian Science
Monitor*
Emilio G. Collado, *Exxon Corporation*
Solomon Fabricant, *New York University*
Eugene P. Foley, *Montrose Securities, Inc.*
David L. Grove, *International Business
Machines Corporation*
Walter W. Heller, *University of Minnesota*
Vivian W. Henderson, *Clark College*
John R. Meyer, *Harvard University*

J. Irwin Miller, *Cummins Engine Company,
Inc.*
Geoffrey H. Moore, *National Bureau of
Economic Research*
J. Wilson Newman, *Dun & Bradstreet, Inc.*
James J. O'Leary, *United States Trust
Company of New York*
Alice M. Rivlin, *Brookings Institution*
Robert V. Roosa, *Brown Brothers Harriman & Co.*
Eli Shapiro, *The Travelers Corporation*
Boris Shishkin, *Washington, D.C.*
Arnold M. Soloway, *Jamaicaway Tower,
Boston, Massachusetts*
Lazare Teper, *International Ladies' Garment
Workers' Union*
Donald B. Woodward, *Riverside, Connecticut*
Theodore O. Yntema, *Oakland University*

DIRECTORS BY UNIVERSITY APPOINTMENT

Moses Abramovitz, *Stanford*
Gardner Ackley, *Michigan*
Charles H. Berry, *Princeton*
Francis M. Boddy, *Minnesota*
Otto Eckstein, *Harvard*
Walter D. Fisher, *Northwestern*
R. A. Gordon, *California*
Robert J. Lampman, *Wisconsin*

Maurice W. Lee, *North Carolina*
Almarin Phillips, *Pennsylvania*
Lloyd G. Reynolds, *Yale*
Robert M. Solow, *Massachusetts Institute of
Technology*
Henri Theil, *Chicago*
William S. Vickrey, *Columbia*
Thomas A. Wilson, *Toronto*

DIRECTORS BY APPOINTMENT OF OTHER ORGANIZATIONS

Eugene A. Birnbaum, *American Management
Association*
Thomas D. Flynn, *American Institute of
Certified Public Accountants*
Nathaniel Goldfinger, *American Federation
of Labor and Congress of Industrial
Organizations*
Harold G. Halcrow, *American Agricultural
Economics Association*
Walter E. Hoadley, *American Finance
Association*

Philip M. Klutznick, *Committee for
Economic Development*
Roy E. Moor, *National Association of
Business Economists*
Douglass C. North, *Economic History
Association*
Willard L. Thorp, *American Economic
Association*
W. Allen Wallis, *American Statistical
Association*
Robert M. Will, *Canadian Economics
Association*

DIRECTORS EMERITI

Percival F. Brundage
Frank W. Fetter
Gottfried Haberler

Albert J. Hettinger, Jr.
George B. Roberts

Murray Shields
Joseph H. Willits

SENIOR RESEARCH STAFF

Gary S. Becker
Charlotte Boechan
Phillip Cagan
Stanley Diller
Solomon Fabricant
Milton Friedman
Gary Fromm
Victor R. Fuchs
J. Royce Ginn

Raymond W. Goldsmith
Michael Gort
Michael Grossman
F. Thomas Juster
John F. Kain
John W. Kendrick
Irving B. Kravis
Edwin Kuh
William M. Landes

Hal B. Lary
Robert E. Lipsey
Sherman J. Maisel
Benoit B. Mandelbrot
John R. Meyer
Robert T. Michael
Jacob Mincer
Ilse Mintz
Geoffrey H. Moore

M. Ishaq Nadiri
Nancy Ruggles
Richard Ruggles
Anna J. Schwartz
Robert P. Shay
Edward K. Smith
George J. Stigler
Victor Zarnowitz

**Relation of the Directors
to the Work and Publications
of the
National Bureau of Economic Research**

1. The object of the National Bureau of Economic Research is to ascertain and to present to the public important economic facts and their interpretation in a scientific and impartial manner. The Board of Directors is charged with the responsibility of ensuring that the work of the National Bureau is carried on in strict conformity with this object.

2. The President of the National Bureau shall submit to the Board of Directors, or to its Executive Committee, for their formal adoption all specific proposals for research to be instituted.

3. No research report shall be published until the President shall have submitted to each member of the Board the manuscript proposed for publication, and such information as will, in his opinion and in the opinion of the author, serve to determine the suitability of the report for publication in accordance with the principles of the National Bureau. Each manuscript shall contain a summary drawing attention to the nature and treatment of the problem studied, the character of the data and their utilization in the report, and the main conclusions reached.

4. For each manuscript so submitted, a special committee of the Directors (including Directors Emeriti) shall be appointed by majority agreement of the President and Vice Presidents (or by the Executive Committee in case of inability to decide on the part of the President and Vice Presidents), consisting of three Directors selected as nearly as may be one from each general division of the Board. The names of the special manuscript committee shall be stated to each Director when the manuscript is submitted to him. It shall be the duty of each member of the special manuscript committee to read the manuscript. If each member of the manuscript committee signifies his approval within thirty days of the transmittal of the manuscript, the report may be published. If at the end of that period any member of the manuscript committee withholds his approval, the President shall then notify each member of the Board, requesting approval or disapproval of publication, and thirty days additional shall be granted for this purpose. The manuscript shall then not be published unless at least a majority of the entire Board who shall have voted on the proposal within the time fixed for the receipt of votes shall have approved.

5. No manuscript may be published, though approved by each member of the special manuscript committee, until forty-five days have elapsed from the transmittal of the report in manuscript form. The interval is allowed for the receipt of any memorandum of dissent or reservation, together with a brief statement of his reasons, that any member may wish to express; and such memorandum of dissent or reservation shall be published with the manuscript if he so desires. Publication does not, however, imply that each member of the Board has read the manuscript, or that either members of the Board in general or the special committee have passed on its validity in every detail.

6. Publications of the National Bureau issued for informational purposes concerning the work of the Bureau and its staff, or issued to inform the public of activities of Bureau staff, and volumes issued as a result of various conferences involving the National Bureau shall contain a specific disclaimer noting that such publication has not passed through the normal review procedures required in this resolution. The Executive Committee of the Board is charged with review of all such publications from time to time to ensure that they do not take on the character of formal research reports of the National Bureau, requiring formal Board approval.

7. Unless otherwise determined by the Board or exempted by the terms of paragraph 6, a copy of this resolution shall be printed in each National Bureau publication.

*(Resolution adopted October 25, 1926, and revised February 6, 1933,
February 24, 1941, April 20, 1968, and September 17, 1973)*

*To my mother,
and the memory of my father*

The Committee on the Distribution of Income is in process of organization to meet a growing demand for a scientific determination of the distribution of national income among individuals . . . A knowledge of this distribution is of vital consequence in the consideration of almost every important political and social problem . . .

June 4, 1917 memorandum of the Committee on the Distribution of Income, which evolved into the National Bureau of Economic Research in 1920.



Contents

	Page
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xv
Part A: Introduction	
1. <i>Introduction and Summary</i>	3
Outline of the Book	5
Summary of Findings	7
2. <i>A Nontechnical Analysis of the Distribution of Income</i>	11
Equalizing Wage Differentials and Nonmoney Aspects of Jobs	11
Seasonality and Annual Income	15
Human Capital	16
One Period of Training	18
Schooling Model of Income Inequality	21
Migration and the Rate of Return from Schooling	22
Postschool Training and Income Distribution	23
Postschool Training and Employment	24
Analysis of Level of Income	26
Analysis of Inequality of Income	28
Part B: Income as a Function of Schooling	
3. <i>The Schooling Model</i>	33
The Theoretical Model	35
Statistical Implementation of the Model	40
4. <i>Interregional Applications</i>	48
The United States	49
South versus Non-South	51
Interstate Analysis	55
Canada	73
The Netherlands	77
Summary	79

	Page
5. <i>International Applications</i>	83
A Four-Country Analysis	83
Earnings Inequality and Economic Growth	89
Mass Migration and Income Inequality in Israel	97
Great Britain versus the United States	101
Part C: Income as a Function of Schooling and Market Experience	
6. <i>The Expanded Human Capital Model</i>	107
Investment in Training	107
Weeks Worked	109
Empirical Formulation	111
Racial Differences in the Age-Income Profile	116
7. <i>The Level of Income</i>	119
Statistical Implementation of the Model	120
Empirical Application	120
U.S. Males	128
U.S. White Males	133
U.S. Nonwhite Males	135
Canada	138
Summary	139
8. <i>The Dispersion of Income</i>	143
Statistical Implementation of the Model	144
Empirical Application	158
U.S. Males	158
U.S. White Males	163
U.S. Nonwhite Males	168
Canada	173
Summary	175
<i>Appendix A: Data Sets</i>	179
A-1: Data for Part B: United States and Canada	179
A-2: Data for Part C: United States and Canada	188
A-3: Mexican Wage Earners Sample	193
<i>Appendix B: Comparative Empirical Results</i>	194
B-1: Effect of Including Nonwhites on Intrastate and Interstate Parameters	194
B-2: Effect of Including the Aged and Property Income on the U.S. Parameters	196
<i>Bibliography</i>	199
<i>Index</i>	205

Tables

	Page
1-1 Means and Standard Deviations Across States of the Level and Inequality of Income and Earnings for Males	7
3-1 Annual Earnings during and after Training	34
4-1 Regression of Natural Log of Earnings on Schooling: Males, Twenty-five to Sixty-four, South versus Non-South, 1959	50
4-2 Calculated Rates of Return for Adult Males in the United States and Canada	53
4-3 Matrix of Correlation Coefficients for Fifty-one States	56
4-4 Regression Analysis of U.S. Data for Fifty-one States	58
4-5 The Explanatory Power of Schooling in the United States and Canada	59
4-6 Matrix of Correlation Coefficients, All Males, Seventeen Southern States	60
4-7 Matrix of Correlation Coefficients, All Males, Thirty-four Non-Southern States	62
4-8 Matrix of Correlation Coefficients, Whites, Seventeen Southern States	63
4-9 Matrix of Correlation Coefficients, Whites, Thirty-four Non-Southern States	64
4-10 Correlation Matrix for Males in Fifty-one States, Income and Earnings Inequality, Regression and Overtaking Age Rates of Return	66
4-11 Income Inequality and Average Level of Schooling for the United States and Canada	72

	Page
4-12 Matrix of Correlation Coefficients, Eleven Provinces of Canada	76
4-13 Netherlands: Cross-Sectional Regressions on Concentration Ratio (C), by Region	78
4-14 Netherlands: Cross-Sectional Regressions on Regional Mean Income per Taxpayer \bar{T}	80
5-1 Results from Regressing the Natural Log of Earnings on Schooling for Males, Twenty-five to Sixty-four, in the United States and Canada	84
5-2 Results from Regressing the Natural Log of Income on Schooling for Males, Twenty-five and over, in Puerto Rico, the United States, and Canada	86
5-3 Results from Regressing the Natural Log of Earnings on Schooling and Experience for Males in Urban Mexico	87
5-4 International Explanatory Power of Schooling	89
5-5 Analysis of $P(5)$ and $P(10)$	95
5-6 Analysis of $P(75)$	96
5-7 Distribution of the Labor Force by Years of Schooling in the United States and the United Kingdom	102
6-1 Income of Nonwhite Males as Percentage of Income of White Males, 1949, 1959, and 1969	118
7-1 Regression Results, Log of Geometric Mean of Income or Earnings of All Males	129
7-2 Regression Results, Log of Geometric Mean of Income or Earnings of All Males	131
7-3 Regression Results, Log of Geometric Mean of Income or Earnings of White Males	133
7-4 Regression Results, Log of Geometric Mean of Income or Earnings of Nonwhite Males	135
7-5 Mean Values of the Log of Geometric Means for Income and Earnings, Observed versus Predicted, Thirty-nine States	137
7-6 Regression Results, Log of Geometric Mean of Income in Canada	138
8-1 Regression Results, Income Inequality, All Males, with Regression Estimate of Rate of Return (r_c)	159

	Page
8-2 Effect of Including Race and Region Variables on the Unadjusted (R^2) and Adjusted (\bar{R}^2) Coefficients of Determination for All Males	161
8-3 Regression Results, Income Inequality, All Males, with Overtaking Age Estimate of Rate of Return	162
8-4 Regression Results, Income Inequality, White Males	164
8-5 Regression Results, Income Inequality, White Males, with Race and Region Variables	166
8-6 Regression Results, Income Inequality, Nonwhite Males	170
8-7 Predicted Values of Nonwhite Income Inequality under Alternative Assumptions	173
8-8 Regression Results, Income Inequality, Canada	174
8-9 Correlation Matrix for Canada	175
A-1 Results from Regressing the Natural Log of Income in 1959 on Schooling for Males of Twenty-five and Over in the United States	180
A-2 Results from Regressing the Natural Log of Income in 1959 on Schooling for White Males of Twenty-five and Over in Seventeen States	183
A-3 Results from Regressing the Natural Log of Income in 1960 on Schooling for Nonfarm Males, Twenty-five to Sixty-four, in the Provinces of Canada	184
A-4 Earnings Inequality, Estimated Overtaking Age Rate of Return and Three Estimates of Schooling's Explanatory Power for the Fifty-one States	186
A-5 Means, Standard Deviations, and Coefficients of Variation of the Parameters for the Fifty-one States and Eleven Provinces	188
B-1 Matrix of Correlation Coefficients for the Fifty-one States, with Seventeen Excluding Nonwhites	195
B-2 Results from Regressing the Natural Log of Earnings and Income in 1959 on Schooling for Males in the United States	196

Figures

	Page
2-1 Supply and Demand for Labor—Homogeneous Tastes	13
2-2 Supply and Demand for Labor—Heterogeneous Tastes	15
2-3 One Period of Training	20
2-4 One Period of Training—An Increase in the Differential	20
6-1 Hypothetical Cross-Section and Cohort Age-Income Profiles for Males	117

Acknowledgments

I am greatly indebted to Gary Becker and Jacob Mincer for their encouragement and constructive criticism during the gestation period of this book. Comments received from the staff reading committee—V. K. Chetty, Sherwin Rosen, and Finis Welch—and from the Board of Directors' reading committee—Robert Lampman, Lloyd Reynolds, Alice Rivlin, and Robert Will—were also most helpful. In addition, comments by Victor Fuchs, John Meyer, Robert Michael, and Carmel Ullman, as well as those received at seminars at the National Bureau, Columbia University, the University of Chicago, the University of California, Los Angeles, and Queens College C.U.N.Y., aided in sharpening my analysis and exposition.

Financial support was provided primarily by the National Bureau of Economic Research through grants from the Carnegie Corporation of New York for studies on education, and the Economic Development Administration, Department of Commerce for regional studies. Additional aid was provided by a Ford Foundation fellowship, a visiting research appointment at Princeton University's Industrial Relations section, and by the research facilities of Columbia University, the University of California, Los Angeles, the University of Chicago, Queens College, and the Graduate Center of the City University of New York.

I wish to thank Martin Carnoy for lending me his sample data on Mexican wage earners, and Jennie Podoluk and Statistics Canada (formerly the Dominion Bureau of Statistics), for access to unpublished census data.

Martha Jones Lichtenstein's initial help in the processing of the data, and research assistance from Irene Abramson, Neville Beharie, and Hope Wong were invaluable. Hedy D. Jellinek's skillful editing is also appreciated.

Part B is primarily a revision of the income inequality chapters in my doctoral dissertation, "Human Capital and the Personal Distribution of Income," Columbia University, 1967. The section on earnings inequality and economic growth in Chapter 5 is based on my "Earnings Inequality and Economic Development," *Quarterly Journal of Economics*, February 1971.

Barry R. Chiswick