

This PDF is a selection from an out-of-print volume from the National Bureau of Economic Research

Volume Title: The Effect of Education on Efficiency in Consumption

Volume Author/Editor: Robert T. Michael

Volume Publisher: UMI

Volume ISBN: 0-87014-242-9

Volume URL: <http://www.nber.org/books/mich72-1>

Publication Date: 1972

Chapter Title: Front matter, The Effect of Education on Efficiency in Consumption

Chapter Author: Robert T. Michael

Chapter URL: <http://www.nber.org/chapters/c3512>

Chapter pages in book: (p. -12 - 0)

# The Effect of Education on Efficiency in Consumption

ROBERT T. MICHAEL

University of California, Los Angeles

OCCASIONAL PAPER 116



NATIONAL BUREAU OF  
ECONOMIC RESEARCH

*New York 1972*

*Distributed by Columbia University Press*

*New York and London*

Copyright © 1972 by

National Bureau of Economic Research

261 Madison Avenue, New York, N.Y. 10016

All Rights Reserved

Library of Congress Catalog Card Number: 70-160314

ISBN-0-87014-242-9

Printed in the United States of America







# National Bureau of Economic Research

## OFFICERS

Arthur F. Burns, *Honorary Chairman*  
Theodore O. Yntema, *Chairman*  
Walter W. Heller, *Vice Chairman*  
John R. Meyer, *President*  
Thomas D. Flynn, *Treasurer*  
Douglas H. Eldridge, *Vice President-Executive Secretary*  
Victor R. Fuchs, *Vice President-Research*

F. Thomas Juster, *Vice President-Research*  
Hal B. Lary, *Vice President-Research*  
Robert E. Lipsey, *Vice President-Research*  
Edward K. Smith, *Vice President*  
Donald R. Gilmore, *Assistant Vice President*  
Joan R. Tron, *Director of Publications*  
Evan Stephens, *Controller*  
Charlotte Boschan, *Director of Data Processing*

## DIRECTORS AT LARGE

Atherton Bean, *International Multifoods Corporation*  
Joseph A. Beirne, *Communications Workers of America*  
Arthur F. Burns, *Board of Governors of the Federal Reserve System*  
Wallace J. Campbell, *Foundation for Cooperative Housing*  
Erwin D. Canham, *Christian Science Monitor*  
Robert A. Charpie, *The Cabot Corporation*  
Solomon Fabricant, *New York University*  
Frank W. Fetter, *Hanover, New Hampshire*  
Eugene P. Foley, *Dreyfus Corporation*  
Eli Goldston, *Eastern Gas and Fuel Associates*  
Crawford H. Greenewalt, *E. I. du Pont de Nemours & Company*  
David L. Grove, *International Business Machines Corporation*

Walter W. Heller, *University of Minnesota*  
Vivian W. Henderson, *Clark College*  
John R. Meyer, *Yale University*  
J. Irwin Miller, *Cummins Engine Company, Inc.*  
Geoffrey H. Moore, *Bureau of Labor Statistics*  
J. Wilson Newman, *Dun & Bradstreet, Inc.*  
James J. O'Leary, *United States Trust Company of New York*  
Robert V. Roosa, *Brown Brothers Harriman & Co.*  
Boris Shiskin, *Washington, D.C.*  
Lazare Teper, *International Ladies' Garment Workers' Union*  
Donald B. Woodward, *Riverside, Connecticut*  
Theodore O. Yntema, *Oakland University*

## DIRECTORS BY UNIVERSITY APPOINTMENT

Moses Abramovitz, *Stanford*  
Charles H. Berry, *Princeton*  
Francis M. Boddy, *Minnesota*  
Tom E. Davis, *Cornell*  
Otto Eckstein, *Harvard*  
Walter D. Fisher, *Northwestern*  
R. A. Gordon, *California*  
Robert J. Lampman, *Wisconsin*

Kelvin J. Lancaster, *Columbia*  
Maurice W. Lee, *North Carolina*  
Lloyd G. Reynolds, *Yale*  
Robert M. Solow, *Massachusetts Institute of Technology*  
Henri Theil, *Chicago*  
Thomas A. Wilson, *Toronto*  
Willis J. Winn, *Pennsylvania*

## DIRECTORS BY APPOINTMENT OF OTHER ORGANIZATIONS

Emilio G. Collado, *Committee for Economic Development*  
Thomas D. Flynn, *American Institute of Certified Public Accountants*  
Nathaniel Goldfinger, *American Federation of Labor and Congress of Industrial Organizations*  
Harold G. Halcrow, *American Agricultural Economics Association*  
Douglas G. Hartle, *Canadian Economics Association*

Walter E. Hoadley, *American Finance Association*  
Douglass C. North, *Economic History Association*  
Charles B. Reeder, *National Association of Business Economists*  
Murray Shields, *American Management Association*  
Willard L. Thorp, *American Economic Association*  
W. Allen Wallis, *American Statistical Association*

## DIRECTORS EMERITI

Percival F. Brundage  
Gottfried Haberler

Albert J. Hettinger, Jr.

George B. Roberts  
Joseph H. Willits

## SENIOR RESEARCH STAFF\*

Gary S. Becker  
Charlotte Boschan  
Phillip Gagan  
James S. Earley  
Solomon Fabricant  
Milton Friedman  
Victor R. Fuchs

Raymond W. Goldsmith  
Jack M. Guttentag  
Daniel M. Holland  
F. Thomas Juster  
C. Harry Kahn  
John F. Kain  
John W. Kendrick

Irving B. Kravis  
Hal B. Lary  
Robert E. Lipsey  
John R. Meyer  
Jacob Mincer  
Ilse Mintz  
Geoffrey H. Moore\*

M. Ishaq Nadiri  
Nancy Ruggles  
Richard Ruggles  
Anna J. Schwartz  
Robert P. Shay  
George J. Stigler  
Victor Zarnowitz

\* On leave.

RELATION OF THE DIRECTORS TO THE WORK AND PUBLICATIONS  
OF THE NATIONAL BUREAU OF ECONOMIC RESEARCH

1. The object of the National Bureau of Economic Research is to ascertain and to present to the public important economic facts and their interpretation in a scientific and impartial manner. The Board of Directors is charged with the responsibility of ensuring that the work of the National Bureau is carried on in strict conformity with this object.

2. The President of the National Bureau shall submit to the Board of Directors, or to its Executive Committee, for their formal adoption all specific proposals for research to be instituted.

3. No research report shall be published until the President shall have submitted to each member of the Board the manuscript proposed for publication, and such information as will, in his opinion and in the opinion of the author, serve to determine the suitability of the report for publication in accordance with the principles of the National Bureau. Each manuscript shall contain a summary drawing attention to the nature and treatment of the problem studied, the character of the data and their utilization in the report, and the main conclusions reached.

4. For each manuscript so submitted, a special committee of the Board shall be appointed by majority agreement of the President and Vice Presidents (or by the Executive Committee in case of inability to decide on the part of the President and Vice Presidents), consisting of three directors selected as nearly as may be one from each general division of the Board. The names of the special manuscript committee shall be stated to each Director when the manuscript is submitted to him. It shall be the duty of each member of the special manuscript committee to read the manuscript. If each member of the manuscript committee signifies his approval within thirty days of the transmittal of the manuscript, the report may be published. If at the end of that period any member of the manuscript committee withholds his approval, the President shall then notify each member of the Board, requesting approval or disapproval of publication, and thirty days additional shall be granted for this purpose. The manuscript shall then not be published unless at least a majority of the entire Board who shall have voted on the proposal within the time fixed for the receipt of votes shall have approved.

5. No manuscript may be published, though approved by each member of the special manuscript committee, until forty-five days have elapsed from the transmittal of the report in manuscript form. The interval is allowed for the receipt of any memorandum of dissent or reservation, together with a brief statement of his reasons, that any member may wish to express; and such memorandum of dissent or reservation shall be published with the manuscript if he so desires. Publication does not, however, imply that each member of the Board has read the manuscript, or that either members of the Board in general or the special committee have passed on its validity in every detail.

6. Publications of the National Bureau issued for informational purposes concerning the work of the Bureau and its staff, or issued to inform the public of activities of Bureau staff, and volumes issued as a result of various conferences involving the National Bureau shall contain a specific disclaimer noting that such publication has not passed through the normal review procedures required in this resolution. The Executive Committee of the Board is charged with review of all such publications from time to time to ensure that they do not take on the character of formal research reports of the National Bureau, requiring formal Board approval.

7. Unless otherwise determined by the Board or exempted by the terms of paragraph 6, a copy of this resolution shall be printed in each National Bureau publication.

*(Resolution adopted October 25, 1926, and revised February 6, 1933,  
February 24, 1941, and April 20, 1968)*

# Contents

	<i>Page</i>
Acknowledgments	ix
Introduction	3
1. Human Capital and Consumption: The Theoretical Framework	7
The Role of an Environmental Variable	7
The Implied Effects on the Household's Demand	11
2. Education as an Environmental Variable	14
Education and the Neutrality Assumption	14
Empirical Implications of Neutrality	20
3. The Engel Curve	22
The Form of the Function	22
The Variables Considered	26
4. An Empirical Test: The 1960 BLS Consumer Expenditures Survey	33
The Goods-Services Dichotomy	35
The Consumption Pattern	39
The Implied Consumption Income Elasticity	48
5. Detailed Expenditure Items	53
Elasticity Estimates for Detailed Items	57
Elasticity Estimates for Composite and Nondurable Items	63
6. Additional Empirical Evidence	72
1950 BLS Consumer Expenditures Survey	72
Consumption Patterns in Israel	77
Children as a Consumption Item	83
7. Summary	86
Appendix A	92
1. Maximizing the Household's Utility	92
2. The Commodity Price	93
3. The Effect of $H$ on Productivity and the Commodity Price	94
4. The Price Level	96
5. The Demand for the Commodity and the Inputs	96
6. The Productivity Model and Utility	99
7. A "Change in Tastes" Interpretation	102

	<i>Page</i>
<b>Appendix B</b>	<b>105</b>
1. The Structure	105
2. The Estimating Equation	106
3. The Direction of Biases	107
4. The Traditional Engel Curve	111
<b>Appendix C</b>	<b>113</b>
1. Perishables-Nonperishables	113
2. Zero Values	114
3. The Effect of Race	117
4. Education Dummies	120
5. Total Current Consumption Expenditure	123
6. The Elasticity of Consumption Income	126
<b>Appendix D</b>	<b>130</b>
1. An Additional Cross-Classification: by Occupation	130
2. The Gainfully Employed	132
<b>Appendix E: Educational Attainment in Israel</b>	<b>134</b>
<b>Bibliography</b>	<b>136</b>
<b>Index</b>	<b>138</b>

# Tables, Charts, Figures

	<i>Page</i>
1. Regression Equations for Consumption Items, 1960 BLS Data, Constant Elasticities	39
2. Implied Scale Effects of Family Size, by Item	45
3. Elasticity Estimates, Linear Form	46
4. Elasticity Estimates, Form With Highest $\bar{R}^2$	47
5. Overall Residual Sums of Squares, by Values of the Elasticity of Consumption Income $K$	50
6. Detailed Expenditure Items	54
7. Number of Observations With Average Expenditure Under One Dollar on an Expenditure Item	57
8. Point Estimates of Income and Education Elasticities, Linear Form	59
9. Semilog and Linear Elasticity Estimates	60
10. Constant Elasticities	60
11. Point Estimates of Income and Education Elasticities, Double-Log Form With Interaction Effects	61
12. Point Estimates of Income and Education Elasticities, Double-Log Form With the Highest $\bar{R}^2$	62
13. Summary of the Relationship Between Income and Education Elasticities Across Items	64
14. Elasticity Estimates With Zeros Replaced by a Yearly Expenditure of One Dollar	65
15. Definition of the Composite Items	66
16. Elasticity Estimates, Composite Items	66
17. Nondurable Items	68
18. Summary of the Relationship Between Income and Education Elasticities Across Items, Composites and Nondurables	69
19. Overall Residual Sums of Squares of the Detailed Items, by Values of the Elasticity of Consumption Income $K$	70
20. Elasticity Estimates for Goods and Services, 1950 BLS Data, North Region	73
21. Elasticity Estimates, 1950 BLS Data, North Region, Form With Highest $\bar{R}^2$	75

	<i>Page</i>
22. Summary of the Relationship Between Income and Education Elasticities Across Items, 1950 BLS Data, North Region	76
23. Income Elasticities and Relative Levels of Consumption in Israel by Continent of Origin and Duration of Residence	78
24. Income Elasticities in Israel by Continent of Origin, 1963-64 Survey	83
25. Elasticity Estimates on the Demand for Children, 1960 BLS Data	84
C.1 Regression Equations With Zero Values Removed	116
C.2 Expenditure Functions With Race Variable Replacing Education, 1960 BLS Data	118
C.3 Expenditure Functions With Race Variable and Education, 1960 BLS Data	119
C.4 Expenditure Functions With Education Dummy Variables	122
C.5 Simple Correlation Matrix	124
C.6 Total Current Consumption Expenditure	125
C.7 Expenditure Functions With Income Defined as Total Current Consumption Expenditures, Form With Highest $\bar{R}^2$	126
C.8 Relationship Between Income and Education Elasticities Across Items	128
D.1 Regression Equations for Consumption Items, 1950 BLS Data, North Region, 505 Observations	131
D.2 Selected Means and Coefficients of Variation for Subsamples of the 1950 BLS Data, North Region	132
D.3 Regression Equations for Consumption Items, 1950 BLS Data, North Region, Gainfully Employed	133
E.1 Educational Attainment of the Jewish Population, Age Fifteen and Over, in 1954	135
 Chart 1. Scatter Diagram of the Income and the Education Elasticities, Fifteen Observations	 48
 Figure A. Indifference Maps	 103

# Acknowledgments

THIS PAPER is based on my doctoral dissertation submitted to Columbia University in 1969. The research was conducted at the National Bureau as part of the economics of education project funded by the Carnegie Corporation of New York, for whose financial assistance I am very grateful.

My principal indebtedness is to my thesis supervisor, Gary S. Becker. The theoretical chapters rest heavily upon his pioneering contributions to the theory of human capital and the concept of household production functions. In addition, I greatly appreciate the unselfish investment of his time in this project through constructive comments on all aspects of my work and at all stages of its development. The excellent training he offers students in the principles and techniques of economic research is in large measure responsible for my interest in applied economics.

Many individuals at the National Bureau have been very helpful to me. I particularly wish to express my appreciation to Jacob Mincer for several useful substantive suggestions regarding the theoretical framework developed here and its empirical implementation. Other members of the National Bureau's staff reading committee were V. K. Chetty and Finis Welch, both of whom made constructive comments on preliminary drafts of this paper. The members of the Board of Directors' reading committee, Robert A. Charpie, Robert M. Solow, and Henri Theil, also made useful comments for which I am most grateful. Michael Grossman made detailed comments on much of this work, and these as well as the many hours we spent discussing numerous points are much appreciated. I have also benefited from comments by Barry R. Chiswick, Isaac Ehrlich, Victor R. Fuchs, Gilbert R. Ghez, Yoel Haitovsky, F. Thomas Juster, Jacob Paroush, Sherwin Rosen, and members of the Labor Workshop at Columbia University.

I am grateful to Pamela Martens and Susan Sumner for their research assistance and to Sydney Jacobs and Martha Jones for their help in communicating with the computer. I appreciate the work of Hedy D. Jellinek, who carefully edited the manuscript. For research assistance, proofreading, and general encouragement I thank my wife, Nancy.

ROBERT T. MICHAEL

