Fiscal Policy after the Financial Crisis



A National Bureau of Economic Research Conference Report



Edited by Alberto Alesina and Francesco Giavazzi

The University of Chicago Press

Chicago and London

ALBERTO ALESINA is the Nathaniel Ropes Professor of Political Economy at Harvard University, and a research associate and director of the Political Economy Program at the National Bureau of Economic Research. Francesco Giavazzi is professor of economics at Bocconi University, Italy, and visiting professor of economics at the Massachusetts Institute of Technology. He is a research associate of the National Bureau of Economic Research.

The University of Chicago Press, Chicago 60637
The University of Chicago Press, Ltd., London
© 2013 by the National Bureau of Economic Research
All rights reserved. Published 2013.
Printed in the United States of America

22 21 20 19 18 17 16 15 14 13 1 2 3 4 5 ISBN-13: 978-0-226-01844-7 (cloth) ISBN-13: 978-0-226-01858-4 (e-book)

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Fiscal policy after the financial crisis / edited by Alberto Alesina and Francesco Giavazzi.

pages; cm. — (National Bureau of Economic Research conference report)
Includes bibliographical references and index.
ISBN 978-0-226-01844-7 (cloth: alkaline paper) —

ISBN 978-0-226-01858-4 (e-book) 1. Fiscal policy—Congresses. 2. Fiscal policy—United States—Congresses. I. Alesina, Alberto. II. Giavazzi, Francesco. III. Series: National Bureau of Economic Research conference report.

HJ192.5.F5687 2013 339.5'2—dc23

2012028694

[⊚] This paper meets the requirements of ANSI/NISO Z39.48-1992 (Permanence of Paper).

National Bureau of Economic Research

Officers

Kathleen B. Cooper, chairman Martin B. Zimmerman, vice chairman James M. Poterba, president and chief executive officer

Robert Mednick, treasurer

Kelly Horak, controller and assistant corporate secretary Alterra Milone, corporate secretary Gerardine Johnson, assistant corporate secretary

Michael H. Moskow

Alicia H. Munnell

James M. Poterba

Marina v. N. Whitman

Martin B. Zimmerman

Robert T. Parry

John S. Reed

Directors at Large

Peter C. Aldrich Mohamed El-Erian Elizabeth E. Bailev Linda Ewing John H. Biggs Jacob A. Frenkel John S. Clarkeson Judith M. Gueron Don R. Conlan Robert S. Hamada Kathleen B. Cooper Peter Blair Henry Charles H. Dallara Karen N. Horn George C. Eads John Lipsky

Jessica P. Einhorn Laurence H. Meyer

Directors by University Appointment

George Akerlof, California, Berkeley Jagdish Bhagwati, Columbia Timothy Bresnahan, Stanford Alan V. Deardorff, Michigan Ray C. Fair, Yale Franklin Fisher, Massachusetts Institute of Technology

Edward Foster, Minnesota

John P. Gould, Chicago
Mark Grinblatt, California, Los Angeles
Bruce Hansen, Wisconsin–Madison
Marjorie B. McElroy, Duke
Joel Mokyr, Northwestern
Andrew Postlewaite, Pennsylvania
Uwe E. Reinhardt, Princeton
David B. Yoffie, Harvard

Directors by Appointment of Other Organizations

Bart van Ark, *The Conference Board* Christopher Carroll, *American Statistical Association*

Jean-Paul Chavas, Agricultural and Applied Economics Association

Martin Gruber, American Finance Association

Ellen L. Hughes-Cromwick, National Association for Business Economics Thea Lee, American Federation of Labor

and Congress of Industrial Organizations

William W. Lewis, Committee for Economic Development

Robert Mednick, American Institute of Certified Public Accountants Alan L. Olmstead, Economic History

Peter L. Rousseau, American Economic Association

Association

Gregor W. Smith, Canadian Economics Association

Directors Emeriti

Glen G. Cain Lawrence R. Klein
Carl F. Christ Rudolph A. Oswald
George Hatsopoulos Peter G. Peterson
Saul H. Hymans Nathan Rosenberg

John J. Siegfried Craig Swan

Relation of the Directors to the Work and Publications of the National Bureau of Economic Research

- 1. The object of the NBER is to ascertain and present to the economics profession, and to the public more generally, important economic facts and their interpretation in a scientific manner without policy recommendations. The Board of Directors is charged with the responsibility of ensuring that the work of the NBER is carried on in strict conformity with this object.
- 2. The President shall establish an internal review process to ensure that book manuscripts proposed for publication DO NOT contain policy recommendations. This shall apply both to the proceedings of conferences and to manuscripts by a single author or by one or more co-authors but shall not apply to authors of comments at NBER conferences who are not NBER affiliates.
- 3. No book manuscript reporting research shall be published by the NBER until the President has sent to each member of the Board a notice that a manuscript is recommended for publication and that in the President's opinion it is suitable for publication in accordance with the above principles of the NBER. Such notification will include a table of contents and an abstract or summary of the manuscript's content, a list of contributors if applicable, and a response form for use by Directors who desire a copy of the manuscript for review. Each manuscript shall contain a summary drawing attention to the nature and treatment of the problem studied and the main conclusions reached.
- 4. No volume shall be published until forty-five days have elapsed from the above notification of intention to publish it. During this period a copy shall be sent to any Director requesting it, and if any Director objects to publication on the grounds that the manuscript contains policy recommendations, the objection will be presented to the author(s) or editor(s). In case of dispute, all members of the Board shall be notified, and the President shall appoint an ad hoc committee of the Board to decide the matter; thirty days additional shall be granted for this purpose.
- 5. The President shall present annually to the Board a report describing the internal manuscript review process, any objections made by Directors before publication or by anyone after publication, any disputes about such matters, and how they were handled.
- 6. Publications of the NBER issued for informational purposes concerning the work of the Bureau, or issued to inform the public of the activities at the Bureau, including but not limited to the NBER Digest and Reporter, shall be consistent with the object stated in paragraph 1. They shall contain a specific disclaimer noting that they have not passed through the review procedures required in this resolution. The Executive Committee of the Board is charged with the review of all such publications from time to time.
- 7. NBER working papers and manuscripts distributed on the Bureau's web site are not deemed to be publications for the purpose of this resolution, but they shall be consistent with the object stated in paragraph 1. Working papers shall contain a specific disclaimer noting that they have not passed through the review procedures required in this resolution. The NBER's web site shall contain a similar disclaimer. The President shall establish an internal review process to ensure that the working papers and the web site do not contain policy recommendations, and shall report annually to the Board on this process and any concerns raised in connection with it.
- 8. Unless otherwise determined by the Board or exempted by the terms of paragraphs 6 and 7, a copy of this resolution shall be printed in each NBER publication as described in paragraph 2 above.

Contents

	Acknowledgments	ix
	Introduction Alberto Alesina and Francesco Giavazzi	1
1.	Government Spending and Private Activity Valerie A. Ramey Comment: Roberto Perotti	19
2.	Fiscal Multipliers in Recession and Expansion Alan J. Auerbach and Yuriy Gorodnichenko <i>Comment:</i> Robert E. Hall	63
3.	The Household Effects of Government Spending Francesco Giavazzi and Michael McMahon <i>Comment:</i> Lawrence J. Christiano	103
4.	The Role of Growth Slowdowns and Forecast Errors in Public Debt Crises William Easterly Comment: Indira Rajaraman	151
5.	Game Over: Simulating Unsustainable Fiscal Policy Richard W. Evans, Laurence J. Kotlikoff, and Kerk L. Phillips Comment: Douglas W. Elmendorf	177
6.	How Do Laffer Curves Differ across Countries? Mathias Trabandt and Harald Uhlig Comment: Jaume Ventura	211

•••	~
VIII	Contents

7.	Perceptions and Misperceptions of Fiscal Inflation Eric M. Leeper and Todd B. Walker Comment: Jordi Galí	255		
8.	The "Austerity Myth": Gain without Pain? Roberto Perotti Comment: Philip R. Lane			
9.	Can Public Sector Wage Bills Be Reduced? Pierre Cahuc and Stéphane Carcillo Comment: Paolo Pinotti			
10.	Entitlement Reforms in Europe: Policy Mixes in the Current Pension Reform Process Axel H. Börsch-Supan Comment: David A. Wise	405		
11.	"Fiscal Devaluation" and Fiscal Consolidation: The VAT in Troubled Times Ruud de Mooij and Michael Keen Comment: James M. Poterba	443		
12.	Fiscal Rules: Theoretical Issues and Historical Experiences Charles Wyplosz Comment: Lucio R. Pench	495		
13.	The Electoral Consequences of Large Fiscal Adjustments Alberto Alesina, Dorian Carloni, and Giampaolo Lecce Comment: Thomas Romer	531		
	Contributors Author Index Subject Index	573 577 583		

Acknowledgments

This project was made possible by a generous grant from the Smith Richardson Foundation to the NBER. We thank Jim Poterba for his encouragement, support, and substantive comments throughout this project.

For their well-known impeccable efficiency, we thank the conference department of the NBER and in particular Carl Beck, Helena Fitz-Patrick, and Rob Shannon. We also thank Università Bocconi and its (then) rector, Guido Tabellini, for providing the venue for the conference in December 2011. Laura Salini at Bocconi performed her usual miracles to run an extremely smooth conference.

Two referees greatly helped us improve the introduction of the volume to make it more coherent. We are grateful to the University of Chicago Press and in particular David Pervin for help throughout the publication process.