

Production and Productivity in the Service Industries

VICTOR R. FUCHS, *Editor*

NATIONAL BUREAU OF ECONOMIC RESEARCH

Studies in Income and Wealth

VOLUME THIRTY-FOUR

*by the Conference on Research
in Income and Wealth*



NATIONAL BUREAU OF ECONOMIC RESEARCH

NEW YORK

Distributed by COLUMBIA UNIVERSITY PRESS

NEW YORK AND LONDON 1969

*Copyright © 1969 by the
National Bureau of Economic Research, Inc.
All rights reserved
L. C. CARD: 69-18895*

*Second Printing, 1975
Printed in the United States of America*

Production and Productivity
in the Service Industries

NATIONAL BUREAU OF ECONOMIC RESEARCH

*CONFERENCE ON RESEARCH IN INCOME
AND WEALTH*

NATIONAL BUREAU OF ECONOMIC RESEARCH

OFFICERS

Arthur F. Burns, *Honorary Chairman*
 Theodore O. Yntema, *Chairman*
 Walter W. Heller, *Vice Chairman*
 John R. Meyer, *President*
 Donald B. Woodward, *Treasurer*
 Victor R. Fuchs, *Vice President-Research*

F. Thomas Juster, *Vice President-Research*
 Douglas H. Eldridge, *Vice President-Administration*
 Hal B. Lary, *Director of International Studies*
 Donald S. Shoup, *Director of Research Services and Planning*

DIRECTORS AT LARGE

Joseph A. Beirne, *Communications Workers of America*
 Wallace J. Campbell, *Foundation for Cooperative Housing*
 Erwin D. Canham, *Christian Science Monitor*
 Robert A. Charpie, *Bell & Howell Company*
 Solomon Fabricant, *New York University*
 Frank W. Fetter, *Hanover, New Hampshire*
 Eugene P. Foley, *International Ore and Fertilizer Corporation*
 Marion B. Folsom, *Eastman Kodak Company*
 Eli Goldston, *Eastern Gas and Fuel Associates*
 Crawford H. Greenewalt, *E. I. du Pont de Nemours & Company*
 Gabriel Hauge, *Manufacturers Hanover Trust Company*

Walter W. Heller, *University of Minnesota*
 Vivian W. Henderson, *Clark College*
 Albert J. Hettinger, Jr., *Lazard Frères and Company*
 John R. Meyer, *Yale University*
 J. Irwin Miller, *Cummins Engine Company, Inc.*
 Geoffrey H. Moore, *Bureau of Labor Statistics*
 J. Wilson Newman, *Dun & Bradstreet, Inc.*
 George B. Roberts, *Larchmont, New York*
 Robert V. Roosa, *Brown Brothers Harriman & Co.*
 Boris Shishkin, *AFL-CIO*
 Gus Tyler, *ILGWU*

Donald B. Woodward, *A. W. Jones and Company*
 Theodore O. Yntema, *Oakland University*

DIRECTORS BY UNIVERSITY APPOINTMENT

Moses Abramovitz, *Stanford*
 Francis M. Boddy, *Minnesota*
 Arthur F. Burns, *Columbia*
 Lester V. Chandler, *Princeton*
 Tom E. Davis, *Cornell*
 Otto Eckstein, *Harvard*
 Walter D. Fisher, *Northwestern*
 R. A. Gordon, *California*

Douglas G. Hartle, *Toronto*
 Robert J. Lampman, *Wisconsin*
 Maurice W. Lee, *North Carolina*
 Lloyd G. Reynolds, *Yale*
 Robert M. Solow, *Massachusetts Institute of Technology*
 Henri Theil, *Chicago*
 Willis J. Winn, *Pennsylvania*

DIRECTORS BY APPOINTMENT OF OTHER ORGANIZATIONS

Emilio G. Collado, *Committee for Economic Development*
 Thomas D. Flynn, *American Institute of Certified Public Accountants*
 Nathaniel Goldfinger, *American Federation of Labor and Congress of Industrial Organizations*
 Harold G. Halcrow, *American Agricultural Economics Association*
 Walter E. Hoadley, *American Finance Association*

Douglass C. North, *Economic History Association*
 Murray Shields, *American Management Association*
 George Cline Smith, *National Association of Business Economists*
 Willard L. Thorp, *American Economic Association*
 W. Allen Wallis, *American Statistical Association*

DIRECTORS EMERITI

Percival F. Brundage
 Harold M. Groves

Gottfried Haberler
 Harry W. Laidler

Harry Scherman
 George Soule

Jacob Viner
 Joseph H. Willits

SENIOR RESEARCH STAFF

Moses Abramovitz
 Gary S. Becker
 Arthur F. Burns
 (on leave)
 Phillip Cagan
 Alfred H. Conrad
 James S. Earley
 Solomon Fabricant
 Milton Friedman
 Victor R. Fuchs
 Raymond W. Goldsmith
 Jack M. Guttentag
 Daniel M. Holland
 F. Thomas Juster

C. Harry Kahn
 John W. Kendrick
 Irving B. Kravis
 Hal B. Lary
 Robert E. Lipsey
 Jacob Mincer
 Ilse Mintz

Geoffrey H. Moore
 (on leave)
 Nancy Ruggles
 Richard Ruggles
 Robert P. Shay
 George J. Stigler
 Victor Zarnowitz

*Relation of the National Bureau Directors to
Publications Reporting Conference Proceedings*

Since the present volume is a record of conference proceedings, it has been exempted from the rules governing submission of manuscripts to, and critical review by, the Board of Directors of the National Bureau.

*(Resolution adopted July 6, 1948,
as revised November 21, 1949,
and April 20, 1968)*

Prefatory Note

THIS volume of *Studies in Income and Wealth* contains the papers presented at the Conference on Production and Productivity in the Service Industries, held at the Dominion Bureau of Statistics. We are indebted to DBS for serving as host for these sessions, and to the Program Committee consisting of Richard A. Easterlin, John W. Kendrick, and Victor R. Fuchs who served as chairman and conference editor.

Executive Committee, 1969-70

Harold W. Watts, *Chairman*

Jean B. Crockett

Morris R. Goldman

Zvi Griliches

W. Lee Hansen

F. Thomas Juster

Irving B. Kravis

Herman P. Miller

Stephen P. Taylor

Malcolm C. Urquhart

Mildred E. Courtney, *Secretary*

Contents

Introduction and Summary	<i>Victor R. Fuchs</i>	1
Measuring Real Output for Industries Providing Services: OBE Concepts and Methods	<i>Martin L. Marimont</i>	15
DISCUSSION	<i>Gordon J. Garston and John W. Kendrick</i>	41
COMMENT	<i>Nestor E. Terleckyj</i>	49
REPLY	<i>Marimont</i>	50
What Is Output? Problems of Concept and Measurement		
<i>Arthur B. Treadway</i>		53
DISCUSSION	<i>Irving B. Kravis and Ta-Chung Liu</i>	84
Some Problems in the Measurement of Productivity in the Medical Care Industry	<i>M. W. Reder</i>	95
DISCUSSION	<i>Herbert E. Klarman and Martin S. Feldstein</i>	132
COMMENTS	<i>Solomon Fabricant and Werner Z. Hirsch</i>	146
REPLY	<i>Reder</i>	148
Alternative Measures of the Real Output and Productivity of Commercial Banks	<i>John A. Gorman</i>	155
DISCUSSION	<i>Donald R. Hodgman</i>	189
COMMENTS	<i>Nestor E. Terleckyj and Solomon Fabricant</i>	195
The Growth of Sales Per Man-Hour in Retail Trade, 1929-1963		
<i>David Schwartzman</i>		201
DISCUSSION	<i>Yoram Barzel</i>	230
REPLY	<i>Schwartzman</i>	233

Contents

ix

The Service Industries in Canada, 1946-66	<i>David A. Worton</i>	237
DISCUSSION	<i>Nestor E. Terleckyj</i>	282
The Service Industries in the Nineteenth Century		
	<i>Robert E. Gallman and Thomas J. Weiss</i>	287
DISCUSSION	<i>Richard A. Easterlin and Stanley Lebergott</i>	352
COMMENTS	<i>Solomon Fabricant and O. J. Firestone</i>	368
REPLY	<i>Gallman and Weiss</i>	372
Index		383

Production and Productivity
in the Service Industries

