

This PDF is a selection from an out-of-print volume from the National Bureau of Economic Research

Volume Title: An Appraisal of Short-Term Economic Forecasts

Volume Author/Editor: Victor Zarnowitz

Volume Publisher: UMI

Volume ISBN: 0-87014-445-6

Volume URL: <http://www.nber.org/books/zarn67-1>

Publication Date: 1967

Chapter Title: Front matter, "AN APPRAISAL OF SHORT-TERM ECONOMIC FORECASTS"

Chapter Author: Victor Zarnowitz

Chapter URL: <http://www.nber.org/chapters/c0934>

Chapter pages in book: (p. -14 - 0)

VICTOR ZARNOWITZ
UNIVERSITY OF CHICAGO

AN APPRAISAL OF
SHORT-TERM ECONOMIC
FORECASTS

OCCASIONAL PAPER 104



NATIONAL BUREAU OF ECONOMIC RESEARCH
NEW YORK 1967

Distributed by COLUMBIA UNIVERSITY PRESS
NEW YORK AND LONDON

Copyright © 1967 by

National Bureau of Economic Research, Inc.
261 Madison Avenue, New York, N.Y. 10016

All Rights Reserved

Library of Congress Catalog Card Number: 66-28826

Printed in the United States of America

2,006,212

National Bureau of Economic Research, Inc.

Zarnowitz, Victor, 1910-

An appraisal of short-term economic forecasts. New York, National Bureau of Economic Research; distributed by Columbia University Press, 1967.

viii, 144 p. illus. 24 cm. (National Bureau of Economic Research. Occasional paper, 104)

Bibliographical footnotes.

1. Economic forecasting.
search. II. Title. (Series)

I. National Bureau of Economic Re-

H11.N2432 no. 104

338.54'4

66-28826

HB3730.N3

MATERIAL SUBMITTED BY PUBLISHER.

NATIONAL BUREAU OF ECONOMIC RESEARCH 1966

OFFICERS

Frank W. Fetter, *Chairman*
Arthur F. Burns, *President*
Theodore O. Yntema, *Vice-President*
Donald B. Woodward, *Treasurer*
Geoffrey H. Moore, *Director of Research*

Douglas H. Eldridge, *Executive Director*
Hal B. Lary, *Associate Director of Research*
Victor R. Fuchs, *Associate Director of Research*

DIRECTORS AT LARGE

Joseph A. Beirne, *Communications Workers of America*
Wallace J. Campbell, *Foundation for Cooperative Housing*
Erwin D. Canham, *Christian Science Monitor*
Solomon Fabricant, *New York University*
Marion B. Folsom, *Eastman Kodak Company*
Crawford H. Greenewalt, *E. I. du Pont de Nemours & Company*
Gabriel Hauge, *Manufacturers Hanover Trust Company*
Walter W. Heller, *University of Minnesota*
Albert J. Hettinger, Jr., *Lazard Frères and Company*
Harry W. Laidler, *League for Industrial Democracy*

Geoffrey H. Moore, *National Bureau of Economic Research*
Charles G. Mortimer, *General Foods Corporation*
J. Wilson Newman, *Dun & Bradstreet, Inc.*
George B. Roberts, *Larchmont, New York*
Robert V. Roosa, *Brown Brothers Harriman & Co.*
Harry Scherman, *Book-of-the-Month Club*
Boris Shishkin, *American Federation of Labor and Congress of Industrial Organizations*
George Soule, *South Kent, Connecticut*
Gus Tyler, *International Ladies' Garment Workers' Union*
Joseph H. Willits, *Langhorne, Pennsylvania*
Donald B. Woodward, *A. W. Jones and Company*

DIRECTORS BY UNIVERSITY APPOINTMENT

V. W. Bladen, *Toronto*
Francis M. Boddy, *Minnesota*
Arthur F. Burns, *Columbia*
Lester V. Chandler, *Princeton*
Melvin G. de Chazeau, *Cornell*
Frank W. Fetter, *Northwestern*
R. A. Gordon, *California*

Harold M. Groves, *Wisconsin*
Gottfried Haberler, *Harvard*
Maurice W. Lee, *North Carolina*
Lloyd G. Reynolds, *Yale*
Paul A. Samuelson, *Massachusetts Institute of Technology*
Theodore W. Schultz, *Chicago*

Willis J. Winn, *Pennsylvania*

DIRECTORS BY APPOINTMENT OF OTHER ORGANIZATIONS

Percival F. Brundage, *American Institute of Certified Public Accountants*
Nathaniel Goldfinger, *American Federation of Labor and Congress of Industrial Organizations*
Harold G. Halcrow, *American Farm Economic Association*
Walter E. Hoadley, *American Finance Association*

Murray Shields, *American Management Association*
Willard L. Thorp, *American Economic Association*
W. Allen Wallis, *American Statistical Association*
Harold F. Williamson, *Economic History Association*

Theodore O. Yntema, *Committee for Economic Development*

DIRECTORS EMERITI

Shepard Morgan, *Norfolk, Connecticut*

Jacob Viner, *Princeton, New Jersey*

RESEARCH STAFF

Moses Abramovitz	Milton Friedman	John W. Kendrick	Ralph L. Nelson
Gary S. Becker	Victor R. Fuchs	Irving B. Kravis	G. Warren Nutter
Gerhard Bry	H. G. Georgiadis	Hal B. Lary	Richard T. Selden
Arthur F. Burns	Raymond W. Goldsmith	Robert E. Lipsey	Lawrence H. Seltzer
Phillip Cagan	Jack M. Guttentag	Ruth P. Mack	Robert P. Shay
Frank G. Dickinson	Challis A. Hall, Jr.	Jacob Mincer	George J. Stigler
James S. Earley	Daniel M. Holland	Ilse Mintz	Norman B. Ture
Richard A. Easterlin	F. Thomas Juster	Geoffrey H. Moore	Victor Zarnowitz
Solomon Fabricant	C. Harry Kahn	Roger F. Murray	

RELATION OF THE DIRECTORS TO THE WORK AND PUBLICATIONS OF THE NATIONAL BUREAU OF ECONOMIC RESEARCH

1. The object of the National Bureau of Economic Research is to ascertain and to present to the public important economic facts and their interpretation in a scientific and impartial manner. The Board of Directors is charged with the responsibility of ensuring that the work of the National Bureau is carried on in strict conformity with this object.
2. To this end the Board of Directors shall appoint one or more Directors of Research.
3. The Director or Directors of Research shall submit to the members of the Board, or to its Executive Committee, for their formal adoption, all specific proposals concerning researches to be instituted.
4. No report shall be published until the Director or Directors of Research shall have submitted to the Board a summary drawing attention to the character of the data and their utilization in the report, the nature and treatment of the problems involved, the main conclusions, and such other information as in their opinion would serve to determine the suitability of the report for publication in accordance with the principles of the National Bureau.
5. A copy of any manuscript proposed for publication shall also be submitted to each member of the Board. For each manuscript to be so submitted a special committee shall be appointed by the President, or at his designation by the Executive Director, consisting of three Directors selected as nearly as may be one from each general division of the Board. The names of the special manuscript committee shall be stated to each Director when the summary and report described in paragraph (4) are sent to him. It shall be the duty of each member of the committee to read the manuscript. If each member of the special committee signifies his approval within thirty days, the manuscript may be published. If each member of the special committee has not signified his approval within thirty days of the transmittal of the report and manuscript, the Director of Research shall then notify each member of the Board, requesting approval or disapproval of publication, and thirty additional days shall be granted for this purpose. The manuscript shall then not be published unless at least a majority of the entire Board and a two-thirds majority of those members of the Board who shall have voted on the proposal within the time fixed for the receipt of votes on the publication proposed shall have approved.
6. No manuscript may be published, though approved by each member of the special committee, until forty-five days have elapsed from the transmittal of the summary and report. The interval is allowed for the receipt of any memorandum of dissent or reservation, together with a brief statement of his reasons, that any member may wish to express; and such memorandum of dissent or reservation shall be published with the manuscript if he so desires. Publication does not, however, imply that each member of the Board has read the manuscript, or that either members of the Board in general, or of the special committee, have passed upon its validity in every detail.
7. A copy of this resolution shall, unless otherwise determined by the Board, be printed in each copy of every National Bureau book.

*(Resolution adopted October 25, 1926,
as revised February 6, 1933, and February 24, 1941)*

CONTENTS

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS	xi
INTRODUCTION AND SUMMARY	1
Plan of Study	2
Conclusions	4
1. A COLLECTION OF AGGREGATIVE ECONOMIC FORECASTS	9
2. MEASUREMENT AND PRESENTATION OF BASIC DATA	12
Annual Level Forecasts	12
Recorded and Predicted Changes	16
3. SHORT-RUN VARIATIONS IN FORECASTERS' PERFORMANCE	20
Incidence of Forecasting Errors in Different Periods	20
Year-to-Year Comparisons of Predicted and Actual Changes	21
Forecasting and Business Cycles	27
4. SUMMARY MEASURES AND TYPES OF ERROR	31
Average Errors of Annual Forecasts of GNP and Industrial Production	31
Errors of Levels, Changes, and Base Values	32
Forecasts of Major Expenditure Components of GNP	36
Bias in Forecasting	40
Underestimation of Growth	45
Turning-Point Errors	51
Evaluating the Turning-Point Record of Recent Aggrega- tive Forecasts	56
5. TIME SPAN OF FORECASTS AND PREDICTIVE ACCURACY	60
Average Errors of Forecasts with Different Spans: GNP and Industrial Production	60
Types of Error in Multiperiod Forecasts	62

Intraforecast Changes	64
Multiperiod Forecasts Interpreted as Rate-of-Growth Predictions	70
Directional and Turning-Point Errors in Multiperiod Forecasts	72
Sectoral Forecasts for Different Spans	80
6. YARDSTICKS OF PREDICTIVE PERFORMANCE	83
Extrapolative Models	83
Annual Forecasts vs. Extrapolations	86
Patterns of Errors in Forecasts and Extrapolations	90
Sectoral Forecasts, Extrapolations, and Businessmen's Anticipations	92
Forecasts and Extrapolations over Varying Spans	97
Near-Term Foresight and Accuracy of Annual Predictions	104
Sectoral Forecasts and Extrapolations for Different Spans	111
Turning-Point Errors and Extrapolations	114
7. COMPARATIVE ADVANTAGES OF TYPES OF FORECASTS	121
Advantages of Expertise in Sectoral Forecasts	121
Aggregate and Individual Forecasts	123
Ranking the Forecast Sets	126
Consistency of Forecasters' Performance	130
Size of Predicted Changes and Forecasting Errors	132
8. RELATED STUDIES AND PLANS	135
Further Research	136
INDEX	140

TABLES

1. Eight Sets of Annual Forecasts of GNP: Individual and Average Errors and Comparisons with Simple Extrapolations, 1953-63	13
2. Eight Sets of Forecasts of Annual Changes in GNP: Individual and Average Predictions, Average Errors, and Comparisons with Simple Trend Extrapolations, 1953-63	17
3. Selected Forecasts of GNP and Industrial Production: Mean Errors Classified by Span and Cyclical Characteristics of the Forecast Period, 1947-62	28
4. Annual Forecasts of GNP and Industrial Production: Average Actual and Predicted Changes and Average Errors of Forecasts of Levels, Changes, and Base Values, 1951-63	33
5. Forecasts of Relative Changes in Major Components of GNP: Summary Measures of Error, 1953-63	37
6. Summary Measures of Error in Two Sets of Forecasts of Absolute Changes in Major Components of GNP and Investment, 1953-63	40
7. Forecasts of Annual Changes in Four Comprehensive Aggregates: Distribution by Type of Change and Type of Error, 1952-63	49
8. Frequency of Turning Points and Errors in Annual Forecasts of GNP and Industrial Production, 1947-63	54
9. Average Errors in Forecasts of Changes in GNP and Industrial Production for Spans from Three to Eighteen Months, 1947-63	61
10. Forecasts of GNP and Industrial Production with Different Spans: Distribution by Type of Change and Type of Error, 1947-63	63
11. Forecasts of GNP and Industrial Production with Spans of Under and Over Six Months: Distribution by Type of Change and Type of Error, 1947-63	65

12. Average Errors of Intraforecast Changes for GNP and Industrial Production, 1947-63	67
13. Frequency of Directional Errors in Forecasts of Semiannual and Quarterly Changes in GNP, 1947-63	74
14. Frequency of Turning Points and Errors in Forecasts of Semiannual and Quarterly Changes in GNP, 1947-63	77
15. Forecasts of Eight Selected Components of GNP: Summary Measures of Error over Spans from Three to Fifteen Months, 1958-63	81
16. Annual Forecasts of GNP and Industrial Production: Comparisons with Four Extrapolative Models, 1953-63	87
17. Forecasts of Relative Changes in Major Components of GNP: Comparisons with Extrapolative Models, 1953-63	94
18. Forecasts of GNP and Industrial Production: Comparisons with Two Extrapolative Models over Spans from Three to Eighteen Months, 1947-63	98
19. Comparisons of Annual <i>Ex-Post</i> Extrapolations and <i>Ex-Ante</i> Forecasts of GNP and Industrial Production, 1953-63	107
20. Forecasts of Eight Selected Components of GNP: Comparisons with Extrapolations over Spans from Three to Eighteen Months, 1958-63	112
21. Directional Errors in Selected Annual Forecasts and Extrapolations of GNP and Components and Industrial Production, 1953-63	118
22. Selected Summary Measures of Error in GNP Forecasts of Fourth Quarter of Following Year, 1955-63 and 1959-63	122
23. Relation Between Predicted Changes and Errors: Selected Individual Forecasters of GNP (1955-63) and Industrial Production (1958-63)	133

CHARTS

1. Eight Sets of Annual Forecasts of GNP, Actual and Predicted Changes and Errors, 1953-63 24
2. Seven Sets of Annual Forecasts of Industrial Production, Actual and Predicted Changes and Errors, 1953-63 26
3. Two Sets of Chain Forecasts of GNP and the Corresponding Actual Values, 1957-62 30
4. Scatter Diagrams of Relations Between Predicted and Actual Changes, Selected Annual Forecasts of Four Aggregative Variables, 1953-63 46
5. Two Types of Extrapolations of Industrial Production and GNP, Actual and Predicted Changes and Errors, 1953-63 91
6. Four Types of *Ex-Post* Extrapolations of GNP and Industrial Production, Actual and Predicted Changes and Errors, 1953-63 109
7. Forty-Seven Individual Forecasts of Levels and Changes of Gross National Product over Spans of Six and Twelve Months (Set D), Comparisons with Mean Forecasts, 1956-63 124

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

THIS is the first report of a study of short-term economic forecasting, supported by grants to the National Bureau from Whirlpool Corporation, General Electric Company, Ford Motor Company Fund, and U.S. Steel Corporation, as well as by other funds of the National Bureau. A grant of electronic computer time to the National Bureau by the International Business Machines Corporation was used for some of the statistical analyses in this report. This study was also supported by the Graduate School of Business of the University of Chicago through provision of ample time and excellent facilities for research. The aid of these institutions is gratefully acknowledged.

I am indebted to the National Bureau staff reading committee—Randigs Fels, Irving B. Kravis, and Ruth P. Mack—for helpful comments on an earlier version of this report. A summary of that paper was presented at the December 1964 meeting of the American Statistical Association, at which Gordon McKinley contributed valuable criticism in the discussion.

My greatest obligation is to Geoffrey H. Moore for his advice and assistance in carrying out this study and for his scrupulous reading of the manuscript. Rosanne Cole supervised the task of data processing and contributed many important suggestions and comments; this report owes much to her untiring aid.

I am grateful to Arthur F. Burns and Solomon Fabricant for their encouragement and help in planning the forecasting study in general. It is also a pleasure to acknowledge my indebtedness to Jacob Mincer, with whom I had many helpful discussions during our collaboration on a related study of methods of forecast evaluation.

I should also like to thank Nathaniel Goldfinger, Maurice W. Lee, and George B. Roberts of the National Bureau's Board of Directors for their review of the manuscript.

We owe a special debt to the many individuals and institutions who provided our forecast materials. Without their cooperation, most of the data could not have been assembled and processed.

In the course of this study, reports on some aspects of it were presented on various occasions to groups of interested economists, notably in the Econometric Workshop at the University of Chicago and at meetings in New York, Rome, Munich, and Bonn. A number of participants provided helpful comments, particularly Zvi Griliches, Wilhelm Krelle, Harry Roberts, Werner Strigel, Lester Telser, and Henri Theil.

Assistants who helped efficiently with the statistical work were Martha Callaghan Bergsten, Micaela Hickey, John Court, Dorothy Finger, and John Wiorkowski. Victor Niederhoffer contributed to the development of the sections on forecasters' consistency and related factors in Chapter 7. Marie-Christine Culbert edited the manuscript, Joan Tron improved its final version and helped in seeing it through the press, Johanna Stern aided in collecting the data, and H. Irving Forman drew the charts.

VICTOR ZARNOWITZ